

# STATES OF JERSEY



## COMPOSITION AND ELECTION OF THE STATES ASSEMBLY: REFORM – PROPOSAL 2 (P.94/2013) – AMENDMENT (P.94/2013 Amd.) – AMENDMENT

---

Lodged au Greffe on 14th October 2013  
by Deputy E.J. Noel of St. Lawrence

---

STATES GREFFE

COMPOSITION AND ELECTION OF THE STATES ASSEMBLY: REFORM –  
PROPOSAL 2 (P.94/2013) – AMENDMENT (P.94/2013 Amd.) – AMENDMENT

---

**1 PAGE 2, AMENDMENT 1 –**

For the words “45 members” substitute the words “44 members” and for the words “27 Deputies” substitute the words “26 Deputies”.

**2 PAGE 2, AMENDMENT 3 –**

In the Table showing the proposed Deputies’ Constituencies, for the number “6” in the number of Deputies to be returned for Districts 1 and 2 substitute the number “5” and for the number “3” in the number of Deputies to be returned for District 5 substitute the number “4”.

**3 PAGE 2, AMENDMENT 4 –**

For the number “45” substitute the number “44” and for the number “20” substitute the number “19”.

DEPUTY E.J. NOEL OF ST. LAWRENCE

## REPORT

Following Senator L.J. Farnham's example, I will try to avoid repetition of the points made in the reports of his amendments and indeed in the reports of the original propositions of Senator P.F.C. Ozouf (P.93/2013) and Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier (P.94/2013).

One of the fundamental elements of a sound democracy (and included by the Electoral Commission in their October 2012 interim report) is that ALL electors should have the same number of votes.

Senator Farnham's amendments addresses the Electoral Commission principles with the exception of this principle which in my opinion is not addressed satisfactorily.

By including all of the Connétables of each district in the "eligible representative per voter" for each district the data used has, in my opinion, been distorted and has resulted in the "eligible voters per representative by district" to also be distorted. The reason for this distortion is simple and can be explained as follows.

As a resident of St. Lawrence, I only have one Connétable representing the Parish I reside in. Even though the Connétables of St. Ouen, St. Mary and St. John all reside in District 5 they would not (nor would I expect them to) represent me in the States as their role is to be their own Parish representatives.

It would be for the Island wide Senators together with the super district Deputies and my own Parish Connétable to be my political representatives.

For this reason I feel compelled to propose an amendment to Senator Farnham's amendment, to amend this anomaly.

The table in the attached Appendix 1 shows the impact of my proposed amendment to Senator Farnham's original table.

I have also re-worked the figures based on "population" figures instead of using "eligible voters" and the results are extremely similar (see Appendix 2). So in reality it makes little or no difference which method is used the results are the same in trying to achieve the goal of all electors having similar number of votes.

Although some will continue to argue that St. Helier is under represented I believe these tables show that it, in fact, is not.

If one considers that District 3 has both the largest "eligible voters" and the largest "population" but under Senator Farnham's amendment will have fewer votes per constituent when compared to the St. Helier 2 districts. Similarly, the same could be said for District 4 which is larger than St. Helier's No. 2 District but under the current proposals have fewer Deputies.

Admittedly St. Helier's 2 districts will have to share the representation of their Connétable and as such there is a case to increase the Deputy representation by one for each district to accommodate this, even though it will mean that voters in the 2 St. Helier districts will each have one more representative when compared to voters in the other 4 districts.

What is clear is that if my amendment to Senator Farnham's amendment is accepted by the Assembly, then roughly every voter in Jersey will have the opportunity to select one quarter of the Island's Assembly.

I hope that members will support my amendment in order to give great equality to each voter regardless of where they live on our Island.

### **Financial and manpower implications**

If the size of the Assembly is reduced by one member when compared to the proposals of Senator Farnham, then there could be a financial saving of approximately £46,000 per annum as less remuneration and expenses would be payable. There are no direct manpower implications arising from these changes, although the Electoral Commission expressed the view that a smaller Assembly would operate more effectively, and this could lead to indirect savings of officer time across public administration.

APPENDIX 1

BY ELIGIBLE VOTERS

| District No.      | Parish       | Population    | Total pop'n per district | Deputies  | Connétables | Senators | Eligible Rep per voter | Eligible pop'n per rep by district | Difference from average | % deviation from Average |
|-------------------|--------------|---------------|--------------------------|-----------|-------------|----------|------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1                 | St. Helier   | 13,960        | 13,960                   | 5         | 0.5         | 6        | 12                     | 1,163                              | 23                      | 2.03%                    |
| 2                 | St. Helier   | 12,900        | 12,900                   | 5         | 0.5         | 6        | 12                     | 1,075                              | -65                     | -5.71%                   |
| 3                 | St. Clement  | 7,170         | 14,010                   | 4         | 3           | 6        | 11                     | 1,274                              | 133                     | 11.71%                   |
|                   | Grouville    | 3,870         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
|                   | St. Martin   | 2,970         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
| 4                 | St. Saviour  | 10,590        | 12,960                   | 4         | 2           | 6        | 11                     | 1,178                              | 38                      | 3.34%                    |
|                   | Trinity      | 2,370         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
| 5                 | St. Lawrence | 4,280         | 11,100                   | 4         | 4           | 6        | 11                     | 1,009                              | -131                    | -11.49%                  |
|                   | St. John     | 2,280         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
|                   | St. Mary     | 1,340         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
|                   | St. Ouen     | 3,200         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
| 6                 | St. Brelade  | 8,590         | 12,600                   | 4         | 2           | 6        | 11                     | 1,145                              | 5                       | 0.47%                    |
|                   | St. Peter    | 4,010         |                          |           |             |          |                        |                                    |                         |                          |
| <b>Totals</b>     |              | <b>77,530</b> | <b>77,530</b>            | <b>26</b> | <b>12</b>   | <b>6</b> | <b>44</b>              | <b>1,140</b>                       |                         |                          |
| <b>Average(s)</b> |              |               | <b>12,922</b>            |           |             |          | <b>11.33</b>           | <b>1,140</b>                       |                         | <b>23.20%</b>            |

APPENDIX 2

BY POPULATION

| District No. | Parish            | Population    | Total pop'n per district | Deputies  | Connétables | Senators | Reps. per resident | Population per rep by district | Difference from average | % deviation from Average |
|--------------|-------------------|---------------|--------------------------|-----------|-------------|----------|--------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1            | St. Helier        | 17,543        | 17,543                   | 5         | 0.5         | 6        | 12                 | 1,462                          | 23                      | 1.63%                    |
| 2            | St. Helier        | 15,942        | 15,942                   | 5         | 0.5         | 6        | 12                 | 1,329                          | -110                    | -7.65%                   |
| 3            | St. Clement       | 9,221         | 17,850                   | 4         | 3           | 6        | 11                 | 1,623                          | 184                     | 12.80%                   |
|              | Grouville         | 4,866         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
|              | St. Martin        | 3,763         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
| 4            | St. Saviour       | 13,580        | 16,736                   | 4         | 2           | 6        | 11                 | 1,521                          | 83                      | 5.76%                    |
|              | Trinity           | 3,156         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
| 5            | St. Lawrence      | 5,418         | 14,178                   | 4         | 4           | 6        | 11                 | 1,289                          | -150                    | -10.40%                  |
|              | St. John          | 2,911         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
|              | St. Mary          | 1,752         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
|              | St. Ouen          | 4,097         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
| 6            | St. Brelade       | 10,568        | 15,571                   | 4         | 2           | 6        | 11                 | 1,416                          | -23                     | -1.60%                   |
|              | St. Peter         | 5,003         |                          |           |             |          |                    |                                |                         |                          |
|              | <b>Totals</b>     | <b>97,820</b> | <b>97,820</b>            | <b>26</b> | <b>12</b>   | <b>6</b> | <b>44</b>          |                                |                         |                          |
|              | <b>Average(s)</b> |               | <b>16,303</b>            |           |             |          | <b>11.33</b>       | <b>1,439</b>                   |                         | <b>23.21%</b>            |