



Public Accounts Committee

Records of Meetings

Year: 2018

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Sarah Ferguson'.

Senator Sarah Ferguson

Chairman
Public Accounts Committee

Public Accounts Committee Record of (Electronic) Meeting

Date: 26th June 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Welcome to new Member</p> <p>The Committee welcomed Connétable John Le Bailly who was appointed to the PAC at the States sitting of 26th June 2018. It noted that although the Committee could form a quorum with four States Members, it would require the appointment of up to three non-States members for it to be fully constituted in accordance with Standing Orders. The Committee noted that independent members were currently being sought via social and traditional media.</p>	
<p>2. Declaration of interests</p> <p>The Committee noted the requirements set out in the Code of Practice with regard to declaration of interests.</p> <p>No general conflicts of interest were declared although members agreed to revisit the issue for specific reviews. It was also noted that the members might be conflicted if they were to join policy boards (established for the purpose of influencing policy decisions) while they were privy to scrutinising the implementation of policy in keeping with the PAC's remit. The Officer agreed to seek further clarification.</p>	CT
<p>3. Procedural and administrative matters</p> <p>The Committee, having considered its remit and working practices, agreed the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It would meet every two weeks on Monday afternoons (1pm-4pm) preceding the Tuesday States' sitting. • A Vice-Chairman should be appointed. • It would undertake hearings in public, unless in exceptional circumstances. • The PAC Officer would advise witnesses of the broad subject areas which are likely to be covered in public hearings. • In principle, all written evidence received by the Committee would be published on the States Assembly website. • Submissions would be treated in accordance with data protection legislation. • The following matters would be delegated to the Chairman's discretion: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Engaging in correspondence of a routine nature; (2) Amending the timing of Committee meetings, where necessary; and 	

(3) Authorising the issue of press notices about forthcoming sessions, new inquiries and reports.	
<p>4. Accessing Scrutiny information</p> <p>The Committee noted the arrangements for sharing and storing information via SharePoint and agreed that future meetings should be paperless.</p>	
<p>5. Member training</p> <p>The Committee noted that training would be ongoing, and expressed interest in attending Westminster and a smaller jurisdiction as part of that programme.</p>	
<p>6. Future work programme</p> <p>The Committee, having regard to the previous PAC's legacy report, considered a draft work programme and agreed to give further consideration to future reviews before the next PAC meeting of 9th July 2018. It also agreed to introduce quarterly hearings with the Chief Executive and/or the Treasurer.</p>	CT
<p>7. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG)</p> <p>The Committee received an update on the C&AG audit plan and noted project specifications on the States of Jersey Development Company and a follow-up review of Community and Social Services, with particular emphasis on care for vulnerable adults. The Chairman advised she was a member of Age Concern, however the C&AG assured the Committee that the review was unlikely to report on areas which would cause a conflict of interest.</p>	
<p>8. C&AG Report on Operational Land and Buildings</p> <p>The Committee noted the recent publication of the report by the C&AG, and requested the Chief Executive to provide an Executive Response to the report by 1st August 2018. The Committee expected the Executive Response to include which recommendations were approved, which were rejected (with reasons given) and how and when the accepted recommendations would be implemented.</p>	CT
<p>9. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Risk Management and agreed to give it further consideration at its next meeting, before publishing it on the Scrutiny website.</p> <p>The Committee also noted that the response had been extremely late and an Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Decision Making on the Future Hospital site, had still not been received. It agreed this was unacceptable and the Chairman would write an email to the Chief Executive expressing her concern.</p>	CT
<p>10. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would take place on 9th July 2018 at 1pm in the Blampied room, States Building.</p>	

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 9th July 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the (electronic) meeting of 26th June 2018.</p>	
<p>2. Briefing on Data Security</p> <p>The Committee welcomed Officers from Information Services to discuss aspects of data security. The Officers undertook to send Members detailed project plans and a 'roadmap' on the understanding it would be classified as strictly confidential.</p>	
<p>3. Declaration of interests</p> <p>The Committee noted the requirements set out in the Code of Practice with regard to declaration of interests.</p> <p>No general conflicts of interest were declared although Members agreed to revisit the issue for specific reviews. It was also noted that the Members might be conflicted if they were to join policy development boards (established for the purpose of influencing policy decisions) while they were privy to scrutinising the implementation of policy in keeping with the PAC's remit. The Chairman advised the issue would be raised at the next Chairmen's Committee and requested the Officer to seek the Greffier's views on the status of such Boards and their potential impact on the Scrutiny function.</p>	CT
<p>4. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Audit Plan</p> <p>The Committee received an update on the C&AG audit plan and the C&AG asked the Members to consider topics they would wish to be included on the 2018/2019 plan. The Committee agreed to provide ideas for consideration at the next meeting.</p>	
<p>5. C&AG Report on Operational Land and Buildings</p> <p>The Committee noted it expected the Chief Executive to provide an Executive Response to this report by 1st August 2018. The Committee, having reviewed its draft work programme, agreed it would wish to consider terms of reference and scope of its own review of estate management, at the next meeting.</p>	CT
<p>6. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Decision Making on the Future Hospital site had still not been received. It agreed this was unacceptable and the Chairman would write an email to the Chief Executive</p>	

<p>expressing her concern. It also noted the Executive Response to Police Governance, and agreed to consider at its next meeting.</p>	<p>CT/ Chair</p>
<p>7. Implementation of C&AG recommendations</p> <p>The Committee noted a monthly update from the Health and Social Services Department in respect of its progress on implementing recommendations of the C&AG. It noted that no mention was made of the C&AG's report on decision making in respect of the future hospital siting. The Committee requested the Officer to seek further clarification on the departmental system for prioritising action on the recommendations. It also requested the Officer to ask the Chief Executive what steps were being taken to implement the C&AG's recommendations throughout all the departments.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>8. Briefing on new Finance Law</p> <p>The Committee welcomed members of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel at 3:30pm to receive a joint briefing from Officers of the Treasury and Chief Minister's Departments, on proposals for the new Finance Law.</p>	
<p>9. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would take place on 23rd July 2018 at 1pm in the Blampied room, States Building.</p>	

Public Accounts Committee Record of (electronic) Meeting

Date: 25th July 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 9 July 2018.</p>	
<p>2. Briefing on Data Security</p> <p>The Committee recalled it had met with officers of Information Services to discuss aspects of data security at its last meeting. It asked the PAC Officer to remind them of their agreement to send Members detailed project plans and a 'roadmap' on the understanding both documents would be classified as strictly confidential.</p>	
<p>3. Declaration of Interests and Policy Development Boards</p> <p>The Committee noted that Members might be conflicted if they were to join policy development boards (established for the purpose of influencing policy decisions) while they were privy to scrutinising the implementation of policy in keeping with the PAC's remit. The Committee noted a letter from the Chairmen's Committee to the Chief Minister, seeking clarification on the status of such boards and advising that such conflicts of interest could arise, however the Chairman of PAC had dissented from the letter.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the possibility of more than one PAC member being on the same policy board, thereby potentially rendering the PAC inquorate whilst a topic was being discussed. The Chairman advised that she and Connétable Le Bailly would not sit on policy boards so that scenario was unlikely to arise, however the clarification on the status of policy boards was ongoing.</p> <p>The Chairman advised that PAC members should remain on policy boards, but recuse themselves from PAC meetings when topics of obvious conflict were discussed, until such time as agreement on their status had been reached.</p>	CT
<p>5. C&AG Report on Operational Land and Buildings</p> <p>The Committee noted it expected the Chief Executive to provide an Executive Response to this report by 1 August 2018, and considered draft terms of reference for its own review. It requested the Officer to circulate an amended version for approval.</p>	CT
<p>6. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports</p> <p>The Committee recalled it had asked the Chief Executive what steps were being taken to implement (and monitor said implementation) of the C&AG's recommendations</p>	

<p>throughout all the departments, and to provide evidence of monitoring the process. It considered the Chief Executive's response, dated 19 July 2018, and agreed to ask when the outstanding issues would be addressed. The Committee also agreed to request that the Chief Executive and relevant officers attend a Public Hearing in November 2018, to further explain the changes being made.</p>	<p>CT/ Chair</p>
<p>7. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019</p> <p>The Committee noted the Audit Plan, together with an update on the C&AG's review of health governance. The C&AG advised she would publish this later in the year. The Committee recalled it had been asked to put forward ideas for topics to be included in the 2019 Audit Plan, and accordingly asked the C&AG to consider States insurance as an area to explore.</p>	
<p>7. C&AG Office Budget 2019</p> <p>The Committee noted a Budget paper presented by the C&AG. It noted the costs of the external audit and pressures on that budget. The Committee expressed its support for the C&AG appointing auditors. Having noted that the current C&AG's term of office expires on 31 December 2019, the Committee also agreed it would like to meet the Governance Board members, at its meeting of 8 October 2018, to discuss succession planning for the role.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>9. Executive Response to C&AG's Police Governance Report</p> <p>The Committee noted the Executive Response and agreed to ask the Chief Officer for further information, before presenting it to the Assembly in the Autumn.</p>	<p>CT/ Chair</p>
<p>8. Non-States Independent Members</p> <p>The Chairman updated the Committee on the process undertaken for recruiting independent members, and advised that the shortlisted candidates would be interviewed later in the week. The successful nominees would then be appointed at a States sitting on 11 September 2018.</p>	<p>Chair</p>
<p>9. Vice-Chairman of PAC</p> <p>The Committee agreed that Deputy Alves should be appointed as Vice-Chairman of the PAC.</p>	<p>Chair</p>
<p>10. Westminster Visit</p> <p>The Committee received an update on the arrangements for its visit in February 2019. It asked the Officer to liaise with other Scrutiny Officers to ensure that members who sat on more than one Scrutiny Panel could be accommodated and not duplicate such visits unnecessarily.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>11. Cable Cars</p> <p>The Committee noted an email from a States member seeking clarification on costs of demolishing the cable car site. It agreed that it was not a matter for the PAC but rather a matter for the Member to pursue by way of a question to the relevant Minister, and requested the Officer to advise of same.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>12. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would take place on 10 September 2018 at 1pm in the Blampied room, States Building. It requested the Officer to ensure lunch was provided for lunchtime meetings in future and to research how catering organisations could be added to the 'Supply Jersey' procurement list.</p>	<p>CT</p>

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 10th September 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin (from Item 6) Connétable John Le Bailly
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Nominated Independent Members of PAC</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the three nominated independent members to observe the PAC meeting and noted they would be formally appointed in the States Assembly on 11 September 2018.</p>	
<p>2. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the (electronic) meeting of 25 July 2018.</p>	
<p>3. Data Security</p> <p>The Committee noted the information classification policy and renewed its request for a 'roadmap' as part of the Information Security and Compliance Strategy.</p>	CT
<p>4. Declaration of Interests and Policy Development Boards (PDB)</p> <p>The Committee noted that both the Vice-Chairman and Deputy Huelin were members of a policy development board (established for the purpose of influencing policy decisions) while they were privy to scrutinising the implementation of policy in keeping with the PAC's remit. Deputy Alves apologised for not notifying the PAC Chairman on her appointment to a PDB earlier, however she had been assured by a Board member that there was no conflict of interest in joining the PDB and that its work would not go on beyond October 2018. The Committee noted a further letter dated 31 August 2018, from the Chairmen's Committee to the Chief Minister, reporting issues that had arisen.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the possibility of more than one PAC member being on the same policy board, thereby potentially rendering the PAC inquorate whilst a topic was being discussed. The Chairman advised that the clarification on the status of policy boards was ongoing, although there was a case to be made that due to the special status of PAC, its heavy workload, and its wide overarching remit, it might be advisable to avoid sitting on PDBs in future.</p>	CT
<p>5. C&AG Report on Operational Land and Buildings</p> <p>The Committee noted it had not received the Executive Response to this report and agreed to send another reminder, copied into the Chief Executive.</p>	
<p>6. PAC Review of Estate Management</p>	

<p>The Committee noted its Terms of Reference had been approved by the Chairmen's Committee and agreed to invite the Director of Jersey Property Holdings, together with other relevant senior officers to a public hearing on 22 October 2018, at 2pm. Having noted a set of draft questions for written responses from the department, and noting that it was hampered by the lack of response to the C&AG's review of operational land and buildings, it agreed the questions should more closely reflect this. The Chairman agreed to comprise a list of suitable questions with the officer.</p>	<p>CT/ Chair</p>
<p>7. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports</p> <p>The Committee recalled it had requested the Chief Executive, the Treasurer of the States and relevant officers to attend a Public Hearing on 19 November 2018, at 1:30pm, to advise on financial management changes and their progress on implementing the recommendations made by the C&AG and the PAC. It noted that Ernst Young (EY) had been appointed to partner the States of Jersey in transforming the financial management, and agreed it would also ask questions in respect of that partnership. It agreed that it would request the Chief Executive to attend quarterly hearings in future in order to chart progress of the restructuring programme.</p> <p>The Committee further agreed, in light of the fact that no Executive Responses had been received, that it would also request clarification as to their delay.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>8. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019 and Project Specifications</p> <p>The Committee noted the Audit Plan, and further noted the C&AG's Review of Health and Social Care Governance would be published on 13 September 2018, although the Committee would receive an embargoed copy approximately 48 hours in advance. The C&AG advised she would trial a longer embargo time to allow the recipients to prepare a response in advance of publication.</p> <p>The Committee also received project specifications for C&AG reviews on the States of Jersey Development Company (SoJDC) and Community and Social Services.</p>	
<p>9. C&AG Board of Governance</p> <p>The Committee noted that the Board of Governance members would attend the PAC meeting of 8 October at 3pm.</p>	
<p>10. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would take place on 24 September 2018 at 1pm in the Blampied room, States Building, and that a briefing by the PWC team (auditors of the States' annual accounts) would be incorporated into that meeting.</p>	<p>CT</p>

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 24th September 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Nominated Independent Members of PAC</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the three independent members to their first official PAC meeting.</p>	
<p>2. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 10 September 2018.</p>	
<p>3. Briefing from PWC</p> <p>The Committee noted that Anna Blackman could not attend today's meeting and requested that she be invited to present the briefing at the PAC meeting of 3 December 2018.</p>	CT
<p>3. Declaration of Interests and Policy Development Boards (PDB)</p> <p>The Committee noted that Deputy Huelin intended to join a body similar to that of a policy development board to review States digital policy/strategy. The Chairman requested that terms of reference be sent to both the Officer and the C&AG so that potential conflicts of interest could be advised upon.</p>	CT
<p>4. PAC Review of Estate Management</p> <p>The Committee noted an assurance from the Director General for Growth, Housing and Environment that it would receive an Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Operational Land and Buildings, by the end of this week. The Committee agreed that the Executive Response could inform the questions to be posed to the Director of Property Holdings and the Director General at the public hearing on 22 October 2018, at 2pm. The Committee agreed to revise a set of draft questions for written responses from the department once the Executive Response had been received. It also noted media reports that the Director Of Property Holdings had tendered his resignation, to take effect in November 2018, and requested the Officer to seek formal confirmation of the media report and that the Director was still expected to attend the public hearing.</p>	CT
<p>5. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted that two historical Executive Responses had not been presented to the States and published thereafter because the previous PAC had not been in session when they were received. It agreed it would wish to view them before asking the Chairman to present them to the States.</p>	CT

<p>The Committee also noted that the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Decision Making relating to the hospital site had not been received, despite numerous requests, and agreed to remind the Chief Executive and advise that this issue would be raised at the public hearing with him on 19 November 2018.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>6. Joint briefing with Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP)</p> <p>The Committee noted written responses by the Treasury to CSSP regarding the proposed partnership with Ernst Young, together with a briefing paper from the Council of Ministers of its July meeting. It agreed all members would attend a joint briefing with CSSP, on 16 October at 10:30-11:30am, from senior officers of the Treasury and Exchequer and members of the Ernst Young team, responsible for the Finance Transformation Project.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>7. Roles and Responsibilities of the Office of the Chief Executive and Treasury</p> <p>The Committee, having recalled it had requested clarification on the new structures of the Treasury and the Office of the Chief Executive, noted diagrammatical representations of the new roles and responsibilities of the officers within those departments. The Committee asked the Officer to request diagrams representing links to other departments and corresponding Ministerial responsibilities.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>8. Public Hearing with Chief Executive</p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Chief Executive had previously advised that all recommendations from recent C&AG reports had been incorporated into its workforce modernisation and financial transformation programmes. However the Committee remained concerned that it had not seen an overall strategy, outlining risks and timescales, nor had it received any indications of what recommendations were outwith the scope of the proposed programmes. It requested the Officer to ask the Chief Executive for his management proposals on the implementation of the recommendations, how they would be delivered and by when, together with information he might hold about recommendations not rolled into the proposals. It agreed to then discuss a question plan based on the responses, incorporating key elements of its proposed review of recurring themes.</p> <p>The Committee also noted that the Chief Executive had been invited to attend quarterly public hearings on 25 February, 3 June, 23 September, and 9 December 2019.</p>	
<p>9. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019 and Project Specifications</p> <p>The Committee noted the Audit Plan, and further noted the C&AG had been asked to brief the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel on the findings of her Review of Health and Social Care Governance. The Committee agreed to request an Executive Response to the C&AG's report.</p> <p>The Committee also received project specifications for two C&AG reviews: States Insurance, and Remuneration for States-owned Companies and Arms'-Length Organisations.</p>	
<p>10. C&AG Annual Report</p> <p>The Committee received an updated version of the 2017 Annual Report.</p>	
<p>11. Communications</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Digital Communications Officer from the States Greffe, and agreed a strategy for communicating messages from PAC meetings and hearings. This included setting out points for a press release at the end of meetings, designating</p>	

<p>a spokesperson for particular topics (usually the Chairman) and ensuring that if individual opinions differed from the PAC as a whole, that was made clear. The Digital Communications Officer would work with the PAC's Officer to devise a piece for communicating the function of the PAC for parish magazines.</p>	
<p>12. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would take place on 8 October 2018 at 1pm in the Blampied room, States Building, incorporating a meeting with the members of the C&AG's Governance Board.</p>	<p>CT</p>

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 8th October 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) (Items 1-10) Stephen Warren (Deputy C&AG) (Item 3 onwards) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 24 September 2018.</p>	
<p>2. Declaration of Interests and Policy Development Boards (PDB)</p> <p>The Committee agreed to consider aspects of the Executive Response to the Report on Decision Making of the Future Hospital as the final item on the agenda, so that Deputies Huelin and Alves could withdraw. However, due to a lack of time, the Committee agreed to postpone those aspects of the discussion to the next meeting.</p>	CT
<p>3. C&AG Board of Governance – New C&AG</p> <p>The Committee welcomed Peter Price, Chairman of the Board of Governance, together with Grace Nesbitt OBE, attending as an observer. It received apologies from Russel Griggs OBE. The Committee noted a presentation by the current C&AG, which included succession planning for the next C&AG, with the additional one-off costs this would entail. It agreed that the process for seeking the appointee should be started early next year. The Committee agreed that the Board of Governance should be involved in the appointment process of the new C&AG and gave consideration to requisite skills for the C&AG's successor, including excellent interpersonal skills, understanding of Jersey's unique needs and clear report-writing.</p>	CT
<p>4. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019 and Project Specifications</p> <p>The Committee noted a verbal update from the C&AG on the Audit Plan, including progress on the reviews of States Insurance, and Remuneration for States-owned Companies and Arms'-Length Organisations.</p>	CT
<p>5. Joint (private) briefing with Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP)</p> <p>The Committee recalled that it would attend a joint briefing with CSSP from senior officers of the Treasury and Exchequer and members of the Ernst Young team, responsible for the Finance Transformation Project., on 16th October at 10:30-11:30am. It asked the Officer to request the terms of reference in respect of the appointment of EY, in advance of the joint briefing.</p>	CT

<p>6. Roles and Responsibilities of the Office of the Chief Executive and Treasury</p> <p>The Committee, having recalled it had requested clarification on the new structures of the Treasury and the Office of the Chief Executive, noted diagrammatical representations of the new roles and responsibilities of the officers, links to other departments and corresponding Ministerial responsibilities.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>7. Forthcoming Public Hearing with Chief Executive and future quarterly hearings</p> <p>The Committee agreed that a question plan should be devised by Mr. Rogers (independent member) together with the officer, which would be circulated to other members for comment in advance of the public hearing in November. It also agreed to remind the Chief Executive that he had not responded to the request to attend quarterly public hearings on 25th February, 3rd June, 23rd September, and 9th December 2019.</p> <p>In light of recent Executive Responses received by the PAC, the Committee agreed that it would ask the Chief Executive to clarify the Target Operating Model (TOM) referred to in those responses. It had understood the TOM to be the new structure of the executive office, with appointments made initially in June and with further appointments in August. However recent correspondence contained the phrase, “...after we have redesigned our Target Operating Model...” which suggest further change, and the Committee agreed to ask the Chief Executive for the key performance indicators that he was working to.</p> <p>The Committee agreed that it would be helpful to suggest to the Chief Executive that a spreadsheet or similar be used to catalogue the C&AG recommendations and commitments and provide progress reports. These would be an opportunity for the Chief Executive to demonstrate that his newly structured departments were able to identify and address the barriers to change, as well as the change itself.</p> <p>The Committee further agreed that it would use the quarterly meetings to monitor and measure progress against the common objective of maximising efficient and effective use of public funds.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>8. PAC Review of Estate Management</p> <p>The Committee received a partial Executive Response on the C&AG’s Review on Operational Land and Buildings, noting that the action plans for implementation on most of the recommendations were marked ‘TBA,’ denoting ‘to be announced’. It noted an assurance from the Director General for Growth, Housing and Environment that it would receive a ‘more comprehensive report expanding on the history and milestones which have shaped the management of land and property for the States of Jersey’, prior to the public hearing of 22nd of this month. The Committee agreed to delay the presentation of the Executive Response to the States, but mindful that the department had ample time to respond, agreed that it should insist that the Director-General provide a fulsome response by Thursday 18th October, giving the members time to consider questions for the public hearing. In light of the partial response, it also revised and considered questions for the forthcoming public hearing.</p> <p>Notwithstanding the above, the Committee was concerned to note that recent responses to C&AG recommendations did not contain commitments to implementation with firm dates or deliverables. The Committee agreed to seek S.M.A.R.T. objectives</p>	<p>CT</p>

with much clearer commitment to what would be actioned, by whom, and with clear deadlines. Further the Committee agreed that KPIs should be identified and reported by the department or at corporate level, indicating the benefits or improvements that arose from the progress and completion of the actions. Additionally actions should be prioritised and where those actions fell short of what was originally envisaged, explanation of the factor(s) that hindered progress and steps taken to address the identified failings, should be provided. It agreed, that as there was specific reference to a TOM (Target Operating Model), it would be useful to have a definition of this and some clarity on the ownership, responsibility and delivery, including aims, objectives and goals.

The Committee was further minded to invite attendees to a follow-up PAC Hearing, to report on the delivery of their promises, from 6 months to a year after the initial response. It agreed that a public forum might help sharpen the focus of those preparing to report their progress.

9. Executive Response to C&AG review of Decision-Making: Future Hospital

The Committee noted the late Executive Response to the C&AG's report and agreed that many of the above points they had noted in respect of the Executive Response to her Review on Operational Land and Buildings, applied. Despite being assured that the Executive Responses would be more comprehensive, and given that the relative department and Chief Executive had been given ample time to respond, the Committee was concerned to note that the response did not contain S.M.A.R.T. objectives with a much clearer commitment to what would be actioned, by whom, and with clear deadlines.

For example, the response to a recommendation to "review progress made in implementing recommendations from previous reports in relation to the use of consultants and risk management" was an assurance that:

Best practice principles would be incorporated into the States investment framework and project management in the first half of 2019. The transformation programme will also include measures to prioritise its responses to the C&AG ensuring that actions can be adequately developed and agreed and that all actions are followed up by agreed timescales.

The Committee agreed that this type of response was inadequate, in failing to set out specifics of how the plans were to be achieved. The Committee wanted to see evidence of how the TOM or financial transformation programme would be applied and how the recommendations would be implemented. KPIs should be identified and reported by the department or at corporate level, indicating the benefits or improvements that arose from the progress and completion of the actions. Additionally actions should be prioritised and where those actions fell short of what was originally envisaged, explanation of the factor(s) that hindered progress and steps taken to address the identified failings, should be provided.

Specifically, given the indication that the SRO should have completed a further review of recommendations of the C&AG's review, by September 2018, the Committee agreed it would wish to see a copy of that report.

As per the comments made for the Executive Response to the Review on Operational Land and Buildings, the Committee was further minded to invite attendees to a follow-up PAC Hearing, to report on the delivery of their commitments.

<p>10. C&AG's Review of Governance Arrangements for Health and Social Care</p> <p>The Committee noted the officer had received a letter from the Director General of Health and Community Services, acknowledging the request for an Executive Response to the C&AG's review and explaining he wanted to balance a full response with its timeliness. The Committee noted the formal response was due on 1st November 2018.</p>	
<p>11. HSSD C&AG update report</p> <p>The Committee noted a monthly report from the Health and Social Services Department, based on a RAG system (red, amber, green) to indicate which of the C&AG's recommendations had been actioned within the department. However, it noted that there was not enough information to discern which of the recommendations were outstanding, (i.e. red) so it agreed to request further information and also to suggest to the new Director General, Health and Community Services, and the Chief Executive, that a similar (but more detailed) approach be used to action recommendations. The Committee agreed that during the period of government rationalisation and restructure, the production of a consolidated list of the recommendations, the implementation owners, and a summary of progress against committed delivery dates or KPIs, would be helpful.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>12. Communications and explanatory notes of PAC</p> <p>The Committee noted several points it wished to discuss, including content for the PAC presence on the existing website and how to provide the public with clearer understanding of the work of the PAC. Due to lack of time, it agreed to postpone these agenda items to its next meeting.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p>13. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed that it would hold its next meeting on 22nd October at 1pm, in the Blampied room, States Building, incorporating a public hearing at 2pm with the Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment and the Director of Jersey Property Holdings.</p>	<p>CT</p>

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 22nd October 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 8th October 2018.	
2. Declaration of Interests None declared.	CT
3. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019 and Project Specifications The C&AG updated the Committee on the Audit Plan briefly but advised that she would present a lengthier update at the 5th November PAC meeting.	
4. Joint (private) briefing with Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) The Committee recalled its joint briefing with CSSP from senior officers of the Treasury and Exchequer and members of the Ernst Young team, responsible for the Finance Transformation Project on 16th October. It agreed to discuss further at its meeting of 5th November, in conjunction with question planning for the Chief Executive at the public hearing of 19th November. It also accepted an offer from the C&AG to provide an overarching framework for a potential review and questions for the Chief Executive.	CT
5. Forthcoming Public Hearing and quarterly hearings The Committee noted a letter from the Chief Executive, dated 16 October 2018, where he agreed, amongst other things, to quarterly hearings on 25th February, 23rd September and 9th December, and tentatively to 17th June 2019. He also made comments about Executive Responses and other matters which the Committee agreed to consider in greater depth at its next meeting.	CT
6. Review of Estate Management - Public Hearing The Committee welcomed Mr Ray Foster, Director of Jersey Property Holdings and Mr John Rogers, Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment to the public hearing. It directed a series of questions at the witnesses and explained it would send further queries in written form. It also reminded the witnesses the hearing was being webcast live and any responses would be published.	CT
12. Communications The Committee agreed in the absence of a transcript, it would produce a press statement directing the media and others to the webcast of today's public hearing.	CT

<p>13. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed that the next meeting on 5th November at 1pm will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a work programme update (b) a revised Executive Response template (c) circulating draft correspondence (d) website/communications 	CT
--	----

Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 5th November 2018

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Stephen Warren (DC&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Minutes</p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes, subject to a minor amendment, of the meeting of 22nd October 2018.</p>	
<p>2. Declaration of Interests</p> <p>None declared.</p>	CT
<p>3. C&AG Audit Plan 2018/2019 and Project Specifications</p> <p>The C&AG updated the Committee on the Audit Plan briefly, including the progress of the reports on Visit Jersey and States Employment Board, but advised that she would present a lengthier update at the 3rd December PAC meeting.</p>	
<p>4. Correspondence</p> <p>The Committee agreed it would wish to have time to comment on draft substantive letters prior to sending to the recipient department.</p>	
<p>5. Work programme</p> <p>The Committee agreed to use the updated work programme as a reference document in order to plan out future quarterly hearings and review timetables.</p>	
<p>6. Forthcoming Public Hearing with Chief Executive</p> <p>The Committee noted draft questions for the Chief Executive at the public hearing of 19th November, together with a proposed overarching framework for a series of reviews on recurring themes. The Committee agreed it would tackle the issues of corporate learning and organizational cultures at the next public hearing, and members were allocated narrower themes of questions to cover, namely: resistance to change,</p>	CT

<p>silo mentality, lack of accountability, unclear measurement frameworks and learning from mistakes.</p> <p>The Officer was requested to circulate the amended draft question plan to members in the next few days and members were invited to submit their final questions to the officer by Monday 12th November. It was also agreed if there were questions to be submitted in written form to the Chief Executive, these should be sent in the first instance to the officer. The Chairman would then authorize an appropriate letter to the Chief Executive requesting the necessary information.</p>	
<p>7. Executive Responses</p> <p>The Committee noted a paper describing the options for presenting Executive Responses to the States Assembly and agreed it would present them as and when they were received, with a 'disclaimer' to demonstrate that the PAC was not supporting or rejecting the Response, but would issue an opinion later. It also agreed that in the event the Executive Response were late, inadequate or incomplete, the Chairman would raise the issue in the States Assembly with the relevant Minister or Chief Minister. The Committee agreed the recent Executive Response in relation to the C&AG's Review of Health Governance was of excellent quality and would set the standard for future Executive Responses. The officer would prepare the Response for presentation to the States.</p>	CT
<p>8. Review of Estate Management</p> <p>The Committee noted a draft skeleton Heads of Report. It agreed to review the transcript of the recent public hearing with Mr Ray Foster, Director of Jersey Property Holdings and Mr John Rogers, Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment, to ascertain whether there was further written evidence it would require for its report. It agreed to send comments to the officer by Monday 12th November so that she could send a further letter to the department heads and circulate a draft report for consideration at the PAC meeting of 3rd December.</p>	CT
<p>9. Communications</p> <p>The Committee noted a paper prepared by the Head of Scrutiny on communications and agreed it would want to maintain a media presence in the way described, namely to publicise work it was undertaking and to seek suggestions from the public for questions to be asked at future public hearings.</p>	CT
<p>10. Next Meeting</p> <p>The Committee agreed that the next meeting on 19th November at 12:30 would focus on the imminent public hearing with the Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States.</p>	CT