

STATES OF JERSEY

YOUTH ASSEMBLY

OFFICIAL REPORT

TUESDAY, 19th MARCH 2019

COMMUNICATIONS BY THE PRESIDENT	5
1.1 Welcome to Members of the Youth Assembly	5
QUESTIONS.....	5
2. Oral Questions	5
2.1 Miss S. Rothwell of Jersey College for Girls of the Minister for Education regarding the range of issues covered by the PSHE curriculum:	5
Senator T.A. Vallois (The Minister for Education):	5
2.1.1 Miss S. Rothwell:.....	6
2.1.2 Miss L. Dobber of Jersey College for Girls:.....	6
2.1.3 Mr. F. Mason of Hautlieu:	6
2.1.4 Mr. P. Lalka of Hautlieu:	7
2.2 Mr. J. Dunn of De La Salle of the Minister for External Relations regarding the creation of an independent Channel Island state:	7
Senator I.J. Gorst (The Minister for External Relations):	7
2.2.1 Miss L. Dobber:	7
2.3 Miss L. Dobber of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the rules governing blood donors in Jersey:	8
Deputy R.J. Renouf of St. Ouen (The Minister for Health and Social Services):.....	8
2.3.1 Miss J. Stocks of Jersey College for Girls:	8
2.3.2 Mr. P. Lalka:	9
2.4 Mr. E. Spillane of Hautlieu of the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee regarding the reform of the Island's electoral voting system:.....	9
Deputy R. Labey of St. Helier (Chairman, Privileges and Procedures Committee):	9
2.4.1 Mr. T. Glover of Hautlieu:.....	10
2.4.2 Mr. F Mason:	10
2.4.3 Miss J. Cullen of Hautlieu:	10
2.4.4 Miss S. Rothwell:.....	11
2.4.5 Mr. E. Spillane:	11
2.5 Miss J. Butler of Hautlieu of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding changes to the current tax legislation:	11
Deputy S.J. Pinel of St. Clement (The Minister for Treasury and Resources):	11

2.5.1 Miss J. Butler:	12
2.5.2 Miss E. Pallent of Jersey College for Girls:.....	12
2.5.3 Miss R. Nicholls of Jersey College for Girls:	12
2.5.4 Mr. T. Glover:	13
2.5.5 Miss J. Stocks:	13
2.6 Mr. P. Lalka of the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture regarding the promotion of Jërriais:	14
Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade (Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture - rapporteur):.....	14
2.6.1 Miss L. Dobber:	14
2.6.2 Mr. F. Mason:	15
2.6.3 Mr. E. Spillane:	15
2.7 Miss J. Luiz of Hautlieu of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the diversity of nursing staff:	15
The Deputy of St. Ouen (The Minister for Health and Social Services):	16
2.8 Miss R. Murphy of Beaulieu the Minister for Infrastructure regarding encouraging greater use of public transport:.....	16
Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour (The Minister for Infrastructure):.....	16
2.8.1 Miss R. Murphy:	17
2.8.2 Miss A. Hugh of Beaulieu:	17
2.8.3 Mr. T. Glover:	17
2.8.4 Miss J. Luiz:.....	17
2.8.5 Miss S. Rothwell:.....	18
2.9 Miss A. Hugh of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding introducing a rental cap in Jersey:	18
Senator S.Y. Mézec (The Minister for Children and Housing):	18
2.9.1 Miss A. Hugh:	18
2.10 Mr. R. Laurent of De La Salle College of the Minister for Education regarding the alteration of the timings of the school day across the Island:.....	19
Senator T.A. Vallois (The Minister for Education):	19
2.10.1 Mr. R. Laurent:	19
3. Questions to Ministers without notice - The Chief Minister	19
3.1 Miss J. Stocks:	19
Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré (The Chief Minister):	19
3.2 Mr. E. Campbell of Hautlieu School:	20
3.3 Mr. F. Mason:	20
3.4 Miss J. Cullen:	21
3.5 Miss E. Pallent:	21
3.6 Miss R. Smith of Beaulieu College:	21
3.7 Mr. T. Glover:	22
3.8 Miss J. Luiz:.....	22
3.9 Miss S. Rothwell:.....	23
3.10 Miss S. Greene of Beaulieu:	23
3.11 Miss C. Garrood of Jersey College for Girls:	23
PUBLIC BUSINESS.....	24

4.	Whether Jersey should introduce a new immigration policy based on the Australian points system	24
4.1	Mr. P. Lalka:	24
4.1.1	Miss R. Nicholls:	25
4.1.2	Miss J. Stocks:	25
4.1.3	Miss S. Rothwell:	25
4.1.4	Mr. P. Lalka:	26
5.	Whether changes should be made to the secondary school system in Jersey	27
5.1	Mr. J. Dunn:	27
5.1.1	Mr. R. Laurent:	27
5.1.2	Miss C. Garrood:	28
5.1.3	Miss J. Stocks:	28
5.1.4	Miss J. Cullen:	28
5.1.5	Mr. E. Campbell:	29
5.1.6	Miss E. Pallent:	29
5.1.7	Miss L. Dobber:	30
5.1.8	Mr. E. Spillane:	30
5.1.9	Miss J. Luiz:	30
5.1.10	Mr. P. Lalka:	30
5.1.11	Mr. T. Glover:	31
5.1.12	Mr. J. Burgin of De La Salle:	31
5.1.13	Miss H. Orpin for Jersey College for Girls:	32
5.1.14	Miss R. Murphy:	32
5.1.15	Miss S. Rothwell:	32
5.1.16	Miss R. Nicholls:	32
5.1.17	Miss A. Hugh:	32
5.1.18	Mr. J. Dunn:	32
6.	Introduce Diversity Quotas for the States Assembly	33
6.1	Miss L. Dobber:	33
6.1.1	Miss J. Stocks:	34
6.1.2	Miss R. Murphy:	35
6.1.3	Miss J. Cullen:	36
6.1.4	Mr. S. Hughes:	36
6.1.5	Miss C. Garrood:	36
6.1.6	Mr. E. Campbell:	36
6.1.7	Miss E. Pallent:	37
6.1.8	Mr. J. Burgin:	37
6.1.9	Miss A. Hugh:	37
6.1.10	Mr. T. Glover:	37
6.1.11	Miss S. Rothwell:	38
6.1.12	Mr. P. Lalka:	38
6.1.13	Mr. J. Dunn:	38
6.1.14	Miss L. Dobber:	39
7.	That civil service job applications should be anonymised until candidates are selected for interview	39
7.1	Miss R. Murphy:	40
7.1.1	Mr. P. Lalka:	41
7.1.2	Miss E. Pallent:	41
7.1.3	Miss H. Orpin:	41

7.1.4 Miss J. Cullen: 41

7.1.5 Mr. T. Glover: 42

7.1.6 Miss J. Luiz:..... 42

7.1.7 Miss L. Dobber: 42

7.1.8 Miss R. Nicholls: 42

7.1.9 Miss A. Hugh: 42

7.1.10 Miss C. Lyons of Beaulieu:..... 43

7.1.11 Miss R. Murphy: 43

ADJOURNMENT..... 44

[13:30]

The Roll was called, and Miss R. Nicholls led the Assembly in Prayer.

COMMUNICATIONS BY THE PRESIDENT

The Bailiff:

1.1 Welcome to Members of the Youth Assembly

The first item on the Order Paper is under A, Communications by the President, and I am very pleased indeed to welcome you all as Members of the Youth Assembly today. It is a great pleasure to see you here and I am sure you will have a great afternoon. I am going to chair the first part of the session and then the Deputy of Grouville will take over from me and chair the later part of the session. As communications from the President, perhaps I can add that you are not required to speak in English; French is an official language of the States and you can, if you choose, speak in French and if you really wish to you could speak in Jersey French, because the Assembly agreed that recently and that, I am sure, will be one way of confusing Ministers if you did that. I also thought I would just take a moment to tell you something about the mace. I am sure that all Members of the Youth Assembly will be aware that the mace was given to the Island in 1663 by King Charles II. It is to be carried in front of the Bailiffs of this Island in perpetuity, which is why it was carried in, in front of me, by the Chief Usher today. It was given because of the loyalty shown by the Bailiff in the time of the civil war. King Charles I, who had his head cut off, was supported by the then Bailiff of Jersey and as a result of that support Charles II gave the royal mace to the Island when he was restored to the throne in 1660 and he also rewarded the De Carterets with the grant of extensive lands in America, hence New Jersey. For those who are not sure about it, Guernsey supported Cromwell and the parliamentarians and that is why there is no New Guernsey. But we do not rub their noses in it; they do not have a mace either.

QUESTIONS

2. Oral Questions

The Bailiff:

Right, with those preliminaries out of the way, we come to Question Time and the first question is Storm Rothwell of Jersey College for Girls, who has a question to ask of the Minister for Education.

2.1 Miss S. Rothwell of Jersey College for Girls of the Minister for Education, regarding the range of issues covered by the PSHE curriculum:

Do you consider that the current P.S.H.E. (personal, social, health and economic) curriculum is effective and covers a broad enough range?

Senator T.A. Vallois (The Minister for Education):

Personal, social, health and economic education is an important and necessary part of all people's education. The breadth of the curriculum covers health and well-being, relationships, living in the wider world, and citizenship. There are also additional elements of P.S.H.E. incorporated into the programmes for science, religious education and physical education, which complement a wider picture. Where a whole-school approach is taken towards the P.S.H.E. programme then the curriculum has the potential to develop the qualities and attributes that young people need to thrive as individuals, family members, and members of society. The statements within the curriculum document that students should be taught are deliberately open-ended where possible, for example how to recognise and manage emotions within a range of relationships. The range of relationships is not specified. This allows teachers the flexibility to deliver P.S.H.E. based on the needs of the cohorts of students. In this way, they can equip them with a sound understanding of risk and the skills and knowledge to make safe and informed choices. The content of the P.S.H.E. curriculum

relates only to the basic statutory elements and teachers can expand on this in relation to the vision for the curriculum of the school, or in order to respond to equip pupils with additional skills that they may require. This has to be balanced with all the other elements of the curriculum. All States and non-fee-paying and fee-paying schools now have access to the P.S.H.E. Association. The Association focuses on signposting teachers to high-quality current resources, which they can deploy to maximise the effectiveness of their teaching in this area. In summary, the P.S.H.E. curriculum has the capacity to be effective and meet student needs, especially through a whole-school approach. The breadth of the curriculum is not limited to the statutory requirements and allows schools to widen their learning opportunities, should they choose to do so.

The Bailiff:

Supplementary questions? Yes, Miss Cullen? No. Are there any supplementary questions?

2.1.1 Miss S. Rothwell:

Do you not think that issues like religion, race, gender, ethnicity, living away from home and current affairs, should also be required? How will you ensure these are addressed in the future?

Senator T.A. Vallois:

Yes, absolutely, I believe all of them should be involved in terms of P.S.H.E. and, like I have stated in the answer - the original answer to the questioner with regards to P.S.H.E. - it is within the realms of the school to be able to teach P.S.H.E. within the needs of the cohorts, the students within that school, to ensure that their needs are met, and the requirements are met. I would suggest that an appropriate way to possibly do this would be through school council networks and discussions with the teachers in the way that that curriculum is then put through to the schools.

2.1.2 Miss L. Dobber of Jersey College for Girls:

Would you consider making learning about topics, such as the issues faced by the L.G.B.T.+ (lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender plus) community part of the curriculum, as was done in Scotland last year seeing as people, part of the L.G.B.T.+ community, experience high rates of bullying, mental health issues and suicide rates and increased teaching could improve life by educating peers as well as them? This goes for issues such as racism and Islamophobia as well.

Senator T.A. Vallois:

I completely understand and agree with the questioner with regard to L.G.B.T. It should be part and parcel of the P.S.H.E. curriculum. It is a sad day if I should have to legislate for that requirement and would suggest that it is something that should be taken on board. It is a very real issue in today's society where people do not feel like they understand, or can work, or support each other in a community, which I believe is extremely inclusive and so P.S.H.E. would serve to help to support our younger generations to understand and work better as a community.

The Bailiff:

Any further supplementary questions? Final supplementary, Miss Rothwell? No. We nearly missed your moment, yes, Mr. Mason.

2.1.3 Mr. F. Mason of Hautlieu:

You said there that it should be part of the curriculum. What are you going to do to make it part of the curriculum?

Senator T.A. Vallois:

As I stated in the original answer, the curriculum is specifically put in the way that it is to allow for the teachers to provide the P.S.H.E. that is necessary for the cohorts of students within their schools. I would be happy to have it as a requirement under the curriculum and I would be happy to take it to the Curriculum Council and have that discussion. The Curriculum Council is a requirement under

the Education Law and, therefore, it is a discussion with a range of teachers from right across the schools whereby we make decisions around what the curriculum looks like and how we can provide that. I do go back to the original answer, though, that the curriculum is written specifically to allow for the teachers to have those lessons that are appropriate for the cohorts of students within their schools.

2.1.4 Mr. P. Lalka of Hautlieu:

As human beings, we obviously will have our flaws and positives. However, how are you going to select the specific teachers who will ensure such a range of topics that we need to cover to be, as you said, provided as individuals, family and, most importantly, members of the society?

Senator T.A. Vallois:

With regards to the Curriculum Council, there is an election process through the teachers who decide - who have the time to be able to serve on that Curriculum Council, it is added as an addition to part of their school day and part of their extra work that they need to do - but they add extreme value and they come from all different areas of our schools. So, it will allow us, bearing in mind I also chair that Curriculum Council and I am a States Member, I am a politician, and I do take people's views into account - and you would hope that I would, being a States Member - so I have a say, sitting around that Curriculum Council as well and that is why it is important for us to have that discussion, to be able to identify how it is appropriately taught in schools to ensure that then leads into supporting family members and society.

The Bailiff:

That brings that question to an end and with apologies to Mr. Dunn, whose question I overlooked, because I had an earlier version of the Order Paper, which is a very good lesson to us all, me included. Mr. Dunn has a question to ask of Senator Gorst, Minister for External Relations.

2.2 Mr. J. Dunn of De La Salle of the Minister for External Relations, regarding the creation of an independent Channel Island state:

What consideration has been given to creating an independent Channel Island state?

Senator I.J. Gorst (The Minister for External Relations):

At present no consideration is being given to altering our fundamental constitutional relationship with the United Kingdom, or in creating an independent Channel Island state. Jersey's status as a Crown Dependency gives the Island constitutional rights of self-government and judicial independence. Jersey has a considerable measure of autonomy within its constitutional relationship with the United Kingdom, although it is not independent of the United Kingdom. In practice, responsibility for the Island's international representation rests largely with the United Kingdom Government, however the U.K. (United Kingdom) consults Jersey on its obligations in international law and other international agreements and does not legislate for the Island without our consent. Jersey is also included in many of the important international conventions to which the U.K. is a party, including human rights legislation and international sanctions. So, while not developing a Channel Islands state, work is being undertaken to ensure greater co-operation between the Bailiwicks of Jersey and Guernsey. In June 2018, the Channel Islands Political Oversight Board was established under the joint chairmanship of both Islands' Chief Ministers. The Board is designed to support ongoing co-operation between Jersey and Guernsey's public administrations, to find and support new partnership opportunities to improve our public services and reduce costs to taxpayers.

2.2.1 Miss L. Dobber:

We could not vote on Brexit, so what about - in terms of Brexit - if the U.K. leaves, should we not have a say and perhaps a joint Channel Islands state would become an option if we wished to stay, just as a proposition?

[13:45]

Senator I.J. Gorst:

It would, of course, have been constitutionally inappropriate for us to have a vote in the Brexit referendum: we are not part of the United Kingdom. We are, of course, loyal to the British Crown and have been so for many hundreds of years. We do not have representation in the United Kingdom Parliament. We decide our affairs, rightly in my view, in this place. So, Brexit, of course, is meaning that we have to think about that constitutional relationship, it is meaning that we have to consider the effects of Protocol 3, it is meaning things that we have been allowed great flexibility in - i.e. the choice of which European Directives we wish to implement and how we wish to implement them - are without doubt being challenged. We are prepared for every outcome next week, should it be next week, but of course there are other reasons why thinking about Channel Islands joint working is important; it is around economies of scale, it is around value for money for taxpayers, but it is also about internationally we are seen as the same, we are seen as the Channel Islands, and we do already work incredibly closely and incredibly well in regard to the international engagement that we undertake. So there are other reasons why we should be working towards that, which are not Brexit-related.

The Bailiff:

Any further supplementaries? Very well, then we come to question 3, which Lily Dobber will ask of the Minister for Health and Social Services.

2.3 Miss L. Dobber of the Minister for Health and Social Services, regarding the rules governing blood donors in Jersey:

What plans, if any, do you have to change the rules governing blood donors in Jersey?

Deputy R.J. Renouf of St. Ouen (The Minister for Health and Social Services):

I am grateful to Miss Dobber for her question. Jersey generally follows the U.K. and European Union guidelines on blood donor selection criteria. The primary and overriding objective of our guidelines must always be to ensure that there is a blood supply that is both safe and sufficient for Islanders. The guidelines evolve and change regularly, for example there were 3 minor changes in 2018. Most of the minor changes arise as different infectious diseases become more or less prevalent in different parts of the world and visitors to those areas are excluded from donation accordingly. The U.K. uses P.C.R. (polymerase chain reaction) based technology that is suited to the size of its population to safeguard its blood supply and uses and updates its acceptance and exclusion criteria in keeping with that technology. Jersey uses antigen antibody-based technology in keeping with the size of our population and we use and update our acceptance and exclusion criteria in keeping with that technology. Both systems are equally safe and the estimated residual risk from infection is at least as low with our system and indeed often lower. We are introducing newer antigen antibody-based technology later on this year and we will reassess our acceptance and exclusion criteria in the light of this new technology once it is embedded. This reassessment will include assessment of the safety of reducing the exclusion period for men who have sex with men, which changed in the U.K. in 2017.

2.3.1 Miss J. Stocks of Jersey College for Girls:

The Assembly has made plans for an opt-out organ donor policy in Jersey following a similar scheme in Wales, which I think is great, but how do you plan to raise awareness for this, as that has been a large part of the success in other countries with similar schemes?

The Deputy of St. Ouen:

We are presently planning a campaign, which will go live in the next few months before the anticipated date of 1st July when the new organ donation system will come into place. That is subject to a States decision just agreeing that introduction date. But we are planning a publicity campaign, which we are talking about at the moment, which will involve a postal drop to all households, media and social media presence and making this known, and we just want to get out there and talk about it, encourage people to sign up to the Organ Donation Register, whether they wish to be in a position to donate their organs, or not, because the Register will record a decision, whether it is for organ donation, or against. The important thing in these circumstances is for people to talk with their families, so if that horrible scenario should ever occur and families are being asked: "Would you agree to the donation of the organs of your loved one", they would know what the wishes are. So, it is so important to talk to people about these issues, but also all end-of-life issues.

2.3.2 Mr. P. Lalka:

I was wondering if, for example, I donated my blood here in Jersey, will this blood be kept here until an Islander needs it, or is there a certain scheme, as with the U.K. or France, for example, if someone needed my blood would they be able to gain access to this?

The Deputy of St. Ouen:

My understanding, and I am not familiar with all the detail of how the department works, is that we generally keep the blood here, though there are arrangements with the U.K. and other jurisdictions perhaps in cases of emergency that we could provide them with blood supplies. We certainly have an arrangement with the U.K. that for certain specialist blood groups and other blood products, which we might not have sufficient of here, we will bring them in from the U.K.

The Bailiff:

No other supplementaries? No one going to ask the Minister which parts of the department he is unfamiliar with? [Laughter]

2.4 Mr. E. Spillane of Hautlieu of the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, regarding the reform of the Island's electoral voting system:

Should the electoral voting system in Jersey be reformed?

Deputy R. Labey of St. Helier (Chairman, Privileges and Procedures Committee):

Yes, it should. Urgently. Because, depending on where you live in Jersey, your vote can have more weight or power than that of somebody else living in a different part of the Island. The most extreme example is the Constable of St. Mary, who represents under 2,000 people and the Constable of St. Helier, who represents over 36,000 people. In this Assembly, they both have one vote. That gives the voter in St. Mary vastly increased influence and political power, if you like, than the voter in St. Helier. We are in trouble with the Deputies, too. Take the Parishes of St. Peter, St. Lawrence and Grouville, roughly 5,000 constituents each within a 10 or 15 per cent variance. St. Peter and Grouville return one Deputy each, St. Lawrence returns 2 Deputies. That is giving the people in St. Lawrence twice the political influence and power as those in the other 2 Parishes. At the last general election, some people were entitled to vote for as many as 13 candidates, some people could only vote for 10 candidates. It is a human rights issue. Jersey is signed up to international treaties, from the United Nations to the European Commission, designed to protect the right of every eligible voter to participate fairly and equally in the democratic process. If your vote counts for less than your neighbour's, your human rights are diminished, and Jersey is in breach of its international obligations. We need to redraw constituency boundaries to deliver equal-sized districts in terms of population, with each voter electing the same number of candidates. We need to simplify the system by reducing the number of categories of States Member; at the moment we have 3: Senators, Deputies

and Constables. We need to put an end to people being elected without an election, without a contest, and we need to increase the number of people who turn out to vote.

2.4.1 Mr. T. Glover of Hautlieu:

If the electoral system in Jersey were to be reformed, would it be done under a system of proportional representation, or first past the post as seen in the United Kingdom and, if so, in either case, would this involve the development of parties?

Deputy R. Labey:

It is certainly something that we are considering and certainly it is something that has cropped up and the Assembly has looked at before. At the moment we elect 8 Senators and that is compliant with international standards, because it is the whole constituency, it is the whole Island, so it is the same number of people voting for the same number of candidates. But I think what we would like to look at for the election of Senators, and perhaps Deputies too, is a single transferable vote. At the moment you can just put 8 crosses on the ballot paper for Senator, you do not have to put 8, but you can put up to 8 - if you put 9 you spoil your paper - but I think it would make sense and be more interesting for both the voter and the politician and the candidate if you numbered your choices, one, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, or down to 6 or down to 5, however many you wanted. So, we would be looking at that. As to whether that would inspire the creation of political parties, it is difficult to tell. It is very hard. People have found it hard, in recent history, to form a political party, which is why I commend our only political party, Reform Jersey, because it is a difficult job keeping people in order and keeping people voting the same way, so they deserve commendation for doing that. Of course, the beauty of political parties - the beauty, if I may say so, of Reform Jersey, although I am not a member - is that they have a manifesto across all their candidates, so you are voting more for policy, perhaps; you are voting more for policy than you are for personality. So, that is the advantage of party politics.

2.4.2 Mr. F Mason:

In your original answer to the original question, you talked about the things that we need to do, and it is all very well saying what we need to do, but how do you suggest that we implement these and when will you be making these changes, or proposing them? It is all very well saying what we need to do and that is fine, but we can sit in here all day and talk about what we need to do. When will you do it?

Deputy R. Labey:

I will be bringing a proposition to the Assembly within a month, or 2, with propositions for electoral reform. My propositions, as Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, are prompted by and based on the recommendations of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Electoral Observers Mission, who have observed our elections for the very first time in Jersey's history. This Assembly passed a motion in January 2018 to invite the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Electoral Observers to come and look at our elections, as they do all around the world. They came, they looked at the nominations, there were 10 of them from all around the world, and they looked at our elections. They produced a report, they returned to the Island to check on how we are getting on with implementing 18 recommendations. So, they keep an eye on us. It is a very important step the Island took at that time because that, in black and white now for us to see, is how we are failing as regards meeting international standards. But it is not there just for us to see, it is there for the whole world to see; so I think we are honour-bound to have to work on that. What I have to do is persuade the people, who are normally sitting in these seats every other Tuesday, and that is another question. What you can do, if you like the look of the recommendations, is lobby your Deputy, Constable or Senator, to vote for them and vote with me.

2.4.3 Miss J. Cullen of Hautlieu:

Just going back to the current electoral system, are there any measures in place to increase the number of candidates running for election? Is the system democratic enough if there are Deputies within the States not there on merit, but in fact there because unopposed?

[14:00]

Deputy R. Labey:

Yes, 14 candidates at the last election were returned unopposed without a contest. The Greffe, who you are familiar with, because they organise this Parliament and are in front of me here in the black robes, are very proactive at trying to make it easy and understandable for candidates to stand in elections. But it is a daunting prospect, especially with single-seat constituencies. If we were able to move to multiple-seat constituencies, we would likely attract more candidates, but that is tricky and controversial and it has to gain the approval of the whole Assembly and, as I say, most propositions on electoral reform - in fact probably 95 per cent of all of them in the last 20 years - have failed in this Assembly.

2.4.4 Miss S. Rothwell:

Are there plans to encourage less-represented demographics to stand for the States Assembly, especially considering the increasing demographic of native Polish and Portuguese speakers in the Island and females, which are currently underrepresented in the States?

Deputy R. Labey:

Yes, and work is being done on that. It is very, very important that a Parliament, an Assembly like this, looks like the population it is representing. So, it is great that we now have 14 women Members of this Assembly and, of course, we need to get more. We also have, for the first time, our very first Deputy, who is of Portuguese heritage, and she is also a woman, so she ticks 2 boxes and that is great. Deputy Alves is helping me, because some of you will know she is an ex-maths teacher - I call her the human calculator - she is helping me with my Sub-Committee on electoral reform to try to see if we can get the maths right. It is called outreach and we have to reach out to all sections of our community, we have to reach out to young people, because they have a vote and we need them to use it and we need them to get involved, and it is a constant pressure and it is a constant challenge, but we are aware of it and we need to do more and continue that energy.

2.4.5 Mr. E. Spillane:

What consideration is being given to the 2013 referendum on States reform where 41 per cent chose option B as their first choice, which was to abolish Senators and reduce the States down to 42 Members from 49 Members?

Deputy R. Labey:

Some of the research for that referendum feeds into subsequent research on electoral reform, but effectively that is dead, it is an ex-referendum, it is no more, it is pushing up the daisies, and we have moved on. We have moved on. So, what we must strive never ever to do again is put a question to the public in the form of a referendum that the Assembly is not prepared to carry through and put into law. That was a really bad thing to do, because it massively made people feel disenfranchised, made people feel that it was not worth them going out to vote, so it was a really dumb thing to do by the Assembly of the time to let something go to referendum that they themselves individually were not prepared to vote with, or for, if that is what the public chose. Brexit all over again.

2.5 Miss J. Butler of Hautlieu of the Minister for Treasury and Resources, regarding changes to the current tax legislation:

What consideration has been given to changing the current tax legislation?

Deputy S.J. Pinel of St. Clement (The Minister for Treasury and Resources):

Taxes are the price we pay to live in a civilised society. In Jersey, we believe that they should be set at the lowest amounts that will deliver us a good public service. Taxes should be broadly based, simple to understand and fair. In Jersey, we calculate tax from multiple sources, income taxes from individuals and many companies, G.S.T. (Goods and Services Tax) on the purchase of goods and services, impôts duty on alcohol, cigarettes and fuel, stamp duties and rates. These taxes are amended every year, in my annual Budget and accompanying Finance Law. But, some of Jersey's income tax legislation dates back to 1961 and in other areas it is even older. I am currently carrying out a major review of Jersey's personal, not corporate, income tax regime, which is archaic. It still treats the income of married women as belonging to their husbands. That harks back to the days of Jane Austen and it was not right then, it is not right now. I will be bringing ideas for reform to the States Assembly in a few months' time and we will have new legislation to present by 2020. I have also, very recently, lodged the law that paves the way for an entirely new and modern online filing system for tax returns from 2020, with taxpayers being obliged to keep supporting records. I am also reviewing the powers available to our tax officers to police the tax system. It is important that everyone pays their fair share of taxes and Revenue Jersey must have the right powers to tackle the small minority of people who choose to evade their tax obligations.

2.5.1 Miss J. Butler:

So, if you are aiming to create a fair tax system, why are women taxed on sanitary products, which are deemed as essential items?

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

As I mentioned in my opening remarks, a fair tax system is across the board and, if we would start to tax individual items, as Miss Butler mentioned, then it would be quite difficult, as the argument with G.S.T. was, as to what you take out of G.S.T.; I think the old argument was: "Is a Jaffa Cake a biscuit, or a cake? Is something rabbit food?" Not comparing that to the items you mentioned, but it is very difficult to remove certain items from a tax situation that is supposed to be broad, simple and fair.

2.5.2 Miss E. Pallent of Jersey College for Girls:

You said before that you want to try to keep the taxes low, so that everyone has enough social stability, everything that they need. The thing is that I feel like there are definitely areas where there needs to be improvement. I have a friend where bad things happened: family, sticky divorce, they had no money, they had to get money from the Government to be housed and they had to rely on a system where my friend, who was 16 years old - because she was 16, if she worked on the weekend and earned more than £100 a week, all of the money that was over £100 she would then have to pay for her house - and I do not think that it is right for a girl, who is 16 years old and is still in full-time education to feel like she has to pay for her housing and her accommodation. Surely there needs to be something where taxes need to be increased to stop this from happening.

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

That is a very good point raised and that is why we have the social security system that we do have, which is supposed to be a safety net to carry people who do, through no fault of their own, hit situations, which are very emotionally and physically and, on a lot of occasions, very difficult and that is what the Social Security system does. But, it does treat people as a household, not as individuals, until the young person is 19 years old. So, before that they are treated as a household, so any money earned would be part of that household and therefore part of that tax system, whether that household pays tax, or not.

2.5.3 Miss R. Nicholls of Jersey College for Girls:

I support the changes being made regarding women's income tax. However, this was described in 2012 as archaic and unacceptable, so why has it taken a further 7 years for the law to even start to be amended?

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

Again, may I say, an outstanding question and one that I asked the minute I assumed the role of the Minister for Treasury and Resources? It has taken too long, but what we are doing is changing the tax system. So, the whole computer system, the JD Edwards software system, is being changed and, I think I mentioned in my opening remarks, to allow for online filing; and with a tax system it is so complex that one priority has to succeed another, so to change this archaic system we have to have the online filing system and the Revenue Administration Law in place first in order to allow that to happen, because it is very complex. It will also depend on the results of the consultation, which we are just about to analyse the results of that consultation and I mentioned it in the answer to the question before, as to whether we have a household assessment of tax, be that married or unmarried people, but living as a household, or whether it is independent taxation under which this married women's tax would be allowed to be demolished, be removed from the system. So it will happen either way, but it is a very complicated law and has to come into place with the rest of the Administration Law that goes behind it.

2.5.4 Mr. T. Glover:

In your original answer to the original question, you mention corporation tax. Now, the recent issue of there being no money, as mentioned in popular media, could corporation tax not be tweaked to meet this supposed deficit?

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

The short answer to that is no. It took quite a long time to bring corporation tax into the process and it is a very competitive situation that we are in. As far as an Island dealing with other jurisdictions and from the consultative period that we are undergoing at the moment it is a personal tax review, it does not incorporate corporation tax, but no doubt that will come again. I think the questioner is talking about the Fiscal Policy Panel review that was announced yesterday in their report, which says that we must increase our reserves and look to increase our revenue, so obviously we take on board what the F.P.P. (Fiscal Policy Panel) says to us and we will be looking to do that, but not as part of this personal tax review.

2.5.5 Miss J. Stocks:

Considering the law in where husbands own their wives' income and same-sex couples must assign a husband has taken 7 years to even be amended, it feels as if the States values financial expediency over the rights of women and the L.G.B.T. community. Do you agree with this?

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

I thank the questioner. I, of course, agree, otherwise I would not be bringing this forward in as fast a pace as I can possibly do it in answer to a previous questioner. When a change in tax law is required, it does take time, it cannot be done overnight, and as you will all have appreciated from the media coverage of this, Deputy Doublet and Deputy Perchard have both been very behind the change in this law and between us we are pushing it forward. But when it is a change in law just to go through Privy Council takes somewhere between 4 and 6 months and we have to write that law in advance of that, which of course involves the law draftsman plus the Taxes Office putting forward the recommendations in the first place, so that in reverse order, and it just cannot be done overnight.

The Bailiff:

So, until this happens, my wife keeps her income and I have to pay tax on it. [Laughter]

Deputy S.J. Pinel:

Wonderful, Sir.

The Bailiff:

Very good, we come to the next question, which normally would have been asked by Philip Romeril of Victoria College but, as you will be aware, the college students are not here this afternoon. Does anyone wish to ask that question of Deputy Tadier, then we can have his answer in case there are supplementary questions? Do we have a volunteer? Yes, okay, Mr. Lalka.

2.6 Mr. P. Lalka of the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture, regarding the promotion of Jèrriais:

What proposals, if any, do you have to promote the use of Jèrriais throughout the Island?

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade (Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture - rapporteur):

If I can start off by saying by saying *mèrcie bein des fais* to yourself for allowing this to be asked and answered. The States Assembly has recently agreed, by an overwhelming majority, to accept a proposition to produce all official public sector signage and letterheads both in English and Jèrriais, when they need to be replaced. An amendment was also passed to adopt Jèrriais as an official language of this Assembly. This sends a strong message to Islanders that Jersey politicians value our native language and that we are also serious about supporting steps to promote and increase the profile of Jèrriais throughout the Island. In the last 3 years, the Government has appointed 4 experienced teachers to learn and teach Jèrriais. These teachers are currently delivering lessons in 13 primary schools and 6 secondary schools and also teach a number of adult classes. We hope to expand the teaching service by recruiting more teachers as part of the next Government Plan over the next 4 years. Ideally, Jèrriais will be in the long-term curriculum and this has happened in other places where minority languages also exist and are used and promoted.

[14:15]

As a result of these measures, it is hoped that new generations of native Jèrriais speakers will emerge. The Jèrriais teaching service has also produced a Jèrriais language plan, which outlines aims and objectives to protect and promote Jèrriais centred around 5 strategic themes. These themes build on the objectives to protect and promote Jèrriais. The aims of the States Jèrriais plan will also seek to increase the acquisition, the use, the status of Jèrriais and in addition to this we are also working with L'Office du Jèrriais with a view to securing ratification of Jèrriais under the terms of the European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages. Lastly, the Government of Jersey will also continue to support the work of L'Office du Jèrriais and the Jèrriais teaching service in protecting and promoting our native language, so this unique aspect of our culture will continue to survive and thrive for many generations to come.

2.6.1 Miss L. Dobber:

Because you have said you would like to get it into the curriculum long term, would you consider teaching it from reception in a way similar to how some schools, for instance, in Basque country in Spain, they have different systems, but there are schools where 50 per cent of the subjects are taught in Jèrriais, 50 per cent in English, or Spanish there. But would you consider sharing out what is taught, just to be able to fully promote the language?

Deputy M. Tadier:

I think that is a very good point. Last weekend and Thursday, I was visiting some schools in the Isle of Man and they had a very good example of a fully-immersive language school there, so the whole curriculum is taught from a very young age. There is basically a reception class, which goes up through to year 6. They teach all of their subjects in Manx, but they also have a period of time where they all speak and teach English alongside it and the 2 key things from that school is you teach it at a very young age. When pupils are young people and they are a very young age, they are receptive to the new sounds, which become increasingly difficult as you get older. Also, it is teaching you

other things, so whether it is maths, or the science group, you are learning that, in that case it is the Manx language, and there is no reason that could not be applied to Jèrriais, or to French, or to any other language.

2.6.2 Mr. F. Mason:

I think it is very important that you promote the use of Jèrriais, not only for younger children, teaching them, but for people of my age group. So I am 17 currently and I cannot think of many people of my age group who would see any use in Jèrriais and see the point of it. How do you plan to promote it and make it interesting for people of my age group?

Deputy M. Tadier:

One of the things we need to recognise is that there was a generational phase that took place perhaps 40 or 50 years ago where Jèrriais was discouraged and it became very uncool to speak Jèrriais where it was beaten out of you at school, sometimes literally, unfortunately. We are at a point now where Jèrriais could be seen to be the new 'in' thing. So, it is an identity marker and you see it in places like Wales, the Isle of Man, where it is used to distinguish yourselves from perhaps the previous generation. So, the past generation are by and large non-Jèrriais speakers, they might have some legacy of the language, but it is really the generation before that. Some of the steps we have seen with the music that is being produced in Jèrriais, but also the new younger teachers, who are going out there teaching it from a young age, we need to make it more trendy, and that is one of the areas that has been employed in the Isle of Man.

2.6.3 Mr. E. Spillane:

Would any consideration be given to adopting a system like Ireland, where Irish was almost phased out in the last century and now it is compulsory to take it to the equivalent of A-level? I am not suggesting that it do be made compulsory until then, but would any consideration be made to make it compulsory to a certain age? The Irish system also features 2-week periods of complete immersion in the Irish language. Obviously, that is harder to implement in Jersey, because we do not have regions where there is just Jèrriais spoken, but would any consideration be given to promote this kind of activity?

Deputy M. Tadier:

That is an interesting question and it is one that applies more generally to languages, so if I can very briefly apply that idea, is that if we want to get to a point where we value languages, generally and second and third languages, we need to make people want to acquire those languages and do it from a younger age, if possible. So, there are 2 schools of thought on compulsion. So, the idea of making things obligatory, one is that you do not want students being forced to take a subject, or certainly an exam, which they are not interested in. But the other point is that, if you do not make it compulsory, then it drops off from the curriculum and that you do not necessarily get the early investment you would do, because it is not considered a valued subject, which you can then use to score in your league tables, *et cetera*. The key thing is to promote it from an early age, to get more people interested in Jèrriais, or in other languages, so that they continue to do it. I think there is a question about which languages we make compulsory through to G.C.S.E. (General Certificate of Secondary Education) and A-level.

The Bailiff:

That deals with that question. We now come to the question, which Lysander Mawby was going to ask of the Minister for Health and Social Services. Would anyone like to read that question? Yes, Miss Luiz.

2.7 Miss J. Luiz of Hautlieu of the Minister for Health and Social Services, regarding the diversity of nursing staff:

What action, if any, is the Minister taking to encourage a diverse range of people to train as nurses?

The Deputy of St. Ouen (The Minister for Health and Social Services):

The Education Department and my department, Health and Community Services, is keen to recruit a diverse range of people to train as nurses and to this end the pre-registration nursing team undertakes a variety of activities, which are listed. First of all they attend careers events organised by Skills Jersey; they attend individual schools when they are invited to do so; they visit nursery schools to speak to staff there who may be wishing to move into nursing. They offer vocational qualifications, so that potential students can access awards that lead to a future career as a registered nurse. In practice that really means that the healthcare assistants we employ are offered vocational qualifications, which would lead them on to the degree programme for nursing. The team also guides students to Highlands College, where, again, the access course can be carried out and that is an entry criteria to the nursing degree. It also offers guidance to potential students who are not from the Island, or the U.K., but who might have nursing qualifications, which need to be validated in Jersey. It also holds monthly open events for Islanders to come and meet staff to discuss nursing and midwifery as a career. It offers all potential students personal advice and guidance, whenever they wish, at one-to-one meetings and it works with students accessing the B.T.E.C. (Business and Technology Education Council) in Health and Social Care ward placements. It guides students to Skills Jersey and student support for all additional information and information on up-skilling for interviews and also gives financial information.

The Bailiff:

Any supplementary questions? No.

2.8 Miss R. Murphy of Beaulieu the Minister for Infrastructure, regarding encouraging greater use of public transport:

What efforts are being made to encourage people to use public transport?

Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour (The Minister for Infrastructure):

We have been working with LibertyBus since January 2013 and we have been encouraging people to use the bus more by improving school bus travel. Bus lay-bys have been improved in recent years on Wellington Road, outside Beaulieu, helping to reduce congestion, increasing the bus service capacity, both by increasing the frequency of buses and the coverage of the network, as well as by increasing the passenger capacity of the buses, e.g. using double-deckers. Improving the winter bus service, the level of service in winter is now very nearly the same as that of providing the peak summer season. Making it easier to pay with the introduction of AvanchiCard and contactless payment, less than 40 per cent of bus journeys are now paid in cash, speeding up boarding and journey times. Better management of the fare structure, for example an adult single journey still costs just £1.60 with an AvanchiCard, the same as the most expensive single fare was in 2010. Making buses more accessible, AvanchiPass pilot scheme was introduced in March 2017 providing free bus travel to those whose disabilities prevent them from driving. Also, buses have facilities for those with disabilities, e.g. wheelchair ramps. Enabling bikes on buses, the Liberty Bike initiative allows people to hire a Brompton folding cycle from Liberation Station and take it on the bus, or customers can bring their own folding bike, if it is checked for size first. Making it easier to get bus information, both at the bus station and electronically via TrackMyBus app. Making buses more comfortable, extra leg room, more comfortable seats, modern interior environment and low engine emissions. Improving bus stops, more timetables provided at bus stops and over 90 waiting shelters with approximately 50 of those installed since 2013. These improvements have been recognised nationally and LibertyBus has won numerous awards for transport best practice, including the National Transport Award for the most improved bus service in October 2016 and the Chartered Institute of Transport and Logistics award for excellence in 2018.

2.8.1 Miss R. Murphy:

I notice that you failed to sufficiently mention any efforts taken to improve the bus service timetable, some of which routes including outbound to Gorey finishes as early as 7.30 p.m., and therefore what do you suggest could be done to improve the availability of such bus routes in the future?

Deputy K.C. Lewis:

I mentioned that the winter service is now more or less the same as the summer service, which is a great improvement. We do try working with LibertyBus on an experimental basis to reach outlying areas of the Island but, again, this is based on supply and demand. We have tried several services on the northern routes and on the eastern routes, but that is something I will take up with LibertyBus for people who wish to have an evening in town and return later. But, as I say, they are returning to the principal points as in Gorey, but maybe not further afield.

2.8.2 Miss A. Hugh of Beaulieu:

What are your thoughts on school buses being made free, as many students are being forced to take them to and from school every day? **[Approbation]**

Deputy K.C. Lewis:

This is something that has been discussed at length with LibertyBus and basically, at the moment, the school bus fares are heavily subsidised, I believe it is about 80 to 85p, but it would not improve the situation. This has been discussed at length with LibertyBus, but we are trying to keep it as low as possible and put on extra services when available.

2.8.3 Mr. T. Glover:

In concern for transportation and therefore of traffic congestion, would you ever consider putting a cap on the number of owned vehicles and, if not, why?

Deputy K.C. Lewis:

Sorry, I am not sure I heard correctly, on private individual vehicles? Right. That is slightly outside of my remit. Basically, it is a human right to own a vehicle if someone chooses to do so. We are encouraging more and more people to use the public bus service, walking; we have just completed 2 final links of cycle track down at French Harbour and English Harbour. It is now possible to cycle from Corbière all the way to Havre des Pas without encountering any large vehicles on the track there. As the Deputy of Grouville is well aware, we are trying to extend the eastern cycle track, but it is problematic, because getting land ownership rights and passage through is difficult, but it is something we are definitely working on. We had the advantage, in the old days, that the western railway track was more, or less, intact, apart from the tracks taken up, but the eastern railway was in fact sold off for housing, so we have to make new inroads there. But it is something we are well aware of and working on.

2.8.4 Miss J. Luiz:

Would you consider making sure that the bus routes go until 3.00 a.m. on weekends, because a lot of people struggle to get back home, and they also find themselves in difficult situations and having to get lifts and I think it is also quite dangerous?

Deputy K.C. Lewis:

3.00 a.m.; I think there would be a capacity problem that there would not be the demand there for buses at 3.00 a.m., but I would also agree with the questioner that there are Jersey Lifts, which I would say are extremely dangerous and would advise people: definitely do not use them, because they are uninsured, the drivers are not screened, and heaven forbid, should there be a tragic accident, insurance would not be covered.

[14:30]

2.8.5 Miss S. Rothwell:

Given low-income families are more likely to have to take the bus, considering the high cost of petrol and cars, would you consider further subsidising bus fares for low-income families?

Deputy K.C. Lewis:

Subsidies, that would be something for our colleagues in Social Security to assist with, but for £1.60 we are keeping the fares as low as possible with the AvanchiCard, which speeds up admission to the bus and processing passengers very quickly. We are very keen to keep the fares as low as possible, but obviously we cannot run the bus service at a loss.

2.9 Miss A. Hugh of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding introducing a rental cap in Jersey:

What are your thoughts on there being a rental cap in Jersey?

Senator S.Y. Mézec (The Minister for Children and Housing):

The last Income Distribution Survey showed that it is the cost of housing that is the single biggest contributory factor for causing relative poverty in Jersey. This is a market which is broken and is not working in the best interests of ordinary Islanders. We know, for example, that private rented sector rents were 9 per cent higher in 2018 than they were in 2017 and 56 per cent of people who rent privately pay more than 30 per cent of their income on rents. This clearly has a significant impact on the quality of life enjoyed by Islanders, so I am taking action to improve the affordability of housing in Jersey. Introducing a cap on rents is one option, but it has shown limited success when used in isolation in other jurisdictions. There are many other options to improve the affordability and indeed the quality of housing that have to be considered too. They include improving the supply of housing, with more than 1,000 affordable homes being built between now and 2020, which will reduce the upward pressure on rents; considering rent stabilisation measures that require landlords to provide longer leases with no above inflation rent increases permitted; improving the transparency of the fees and charges tenants are required to pay when letting a property; preventing landlords from discriminating against tenants with children; introducing legal minimum standards for rented properties, so that no tenant is having to pay rent to live in a substandard property; bringing long-term vacant properties back into use; assisting people to buy their own home; and looking at ways of restricting foreign ownership of buy-to-let properties, as these increase demand for a restricted supply of homes. These are just some of the measures that need to be considered by the new Housing Policy Development Board that I will lead during this term of Government, to help secure good quality and stable homes that are affordable for people in Jersey.

2.9.1 Miss A. Hugh:

It is my understanding that currently first-time buyers are able to make major home improvements to their properties after buying them and selling them for higher prices, leading to a lack of affordable housing for new first-time buyers. What is being done, therefore, to prevent this?

Senator S.Y. Mézec:

It is a good point and there has, in the past, been investment in supporting first-time buyers, particularly younger people, to buy properties. Many of those options are no longer available, so I would like the Housing Policy Development Board, which I chair, to look at this issue to see what we can do to support properties remaining as first-time buyer properties for the future and looking at what we can do to increase support for those people who want to buy their properties.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

No more questions to the Minister?

2.10 Mr. R. Laurent of De La Salle College of the Minister for Education, regarding the alteration of the timings of the school day across the Island:

Has any consideration been given to altering the timings of the school day across the Island?

Senator T.A. Vallois (The Minister for Education):

Schools have considered this individually and over the last few years. Indeed, some schools have altered the school day in recent years and changed their internal arrangements. The hours of the school day are decided by the individual schools, taking into account the needs of the curriculum, the historical precedents established in a school, parental preferences and needs, the requirements of the Government for sufficient education time - but no demands for specific hours, start, finish times - the exam programmes, which require certain minimum hours to complete courses, and even the scheduling of buses. I am aware of research on the teenage brain that suggests a later start in the day for all the students. I understand that this is to be trialled in a few schools in the U.K. To change the times at the end and start of the day, there needs to be consultation with different stakeholders and notice given to parents. Any changes would commence at the start of an academic year, i.e. September.

2.10.1 Mr. R. Laurent:

You say schools have considered this individually, highlighting that it is being left to them. Has this topic been seriously thought about, or will it just be left unheard of?

Senator T.A. Vallois:

I have been the Minister for Education for 9 months and in this term I plan to look at a whole raft of issues with regards to education, one in particular being the Education Law, the curriculum, the actual funding of our schools. They are huge pieces of work that need to be carried out, but I am hoping to create a foundation in education that lasts for the next 20 years. All views and all concerns will be taken into account. Of course, the Education Law I am hoping to bring in 2021, but the work surrounding and behind that will feed into the Education Law and, of course, understanding there is research, there are science studies, all those types of things with regards to how the day of a student at school may be affected, depending on the times. It is a consideration that needs to be taken into account. At the moment, of course I want to focus on trying to get the Education Law sorted out, the curriculum in place properly and school funding, so that we can support all our younger generations going forward.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Any more supplementaries? Very well, we will move on to questions without notice - and this will be about 15 minutes - to the Chief Minister, so I hope you have all got your questions ready and fingers on the button, ready for the off. Who would like to ask the first question?

3. Questions to Ministers without notice - The Chief Minister

3.1 Miss J. Stocks:

In the U.K., a woman does not need parental consent to have an abortion if she is under the age of 16. However, in Jersey there is nothing written in the law about this and so doctors can ask for parental consent. Would you consider an amendment to this law, so that it is the same as the U.K. in the interests of patient confidentiality?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré (The Chief Minister):

So much for a nice easy ride into the questions. It is a very serious subject. I am not going to give you a direct answer straight away because, bluntly, it would be on the advice of the Minister for Health and Social Services to my left, and in terms of what are the ethical views within the Island. That would require consultation, I am pretty clear. I do understand the point you are making, but I

think it would be through the Minister for Health and Social Services and through a very careful period of making those changes, but I would be very happy to direct the Minister for Health and Social Services to look into it.

3.2 Mr. E. Campbell of Hautlieu School:

I cannot help but think that a lot of the issues that have been discussed today are really quite small in comparison to the environmental crisis that we are currently facing as a planet. Animal agriculture, a lot of research has suggested that it is the world's leading cause of habitat degradation, water scarcity and greenhouse gas emission. Is this something that would be viable to challenge on the Island in terms of the cow industry? If not, why? What else is being planned to be done, or being done, to challenge the environmental crisis?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

Sorry, can I just clarify, that was cow industry, not the car industry? I am not going to get into too much about the merits of the Jersey cow over other cows on the planet, although I have always been given to understand that, oddly enough, as a smaller cow, it produces less methane and, therefore, in terms of cows, it is more environmentally friendly than others. But in terms of environmental challenges, we know that, as a small Island, the impact on the global scenario is obviously going to be small, but that does not mean we should not be doing things. That is why - and although we talk about process as politicians a lot - we were required to produce a plan as a Government, legally required, it had to be put in by a certain date, and one of our top 5 priorities is environment. That, I believe, is the first time there has been a top priority from any plan from any previous Council of Ministers. Hopefully that shows we are committed to doing that sort of thing and therefore looking at ... and when you say "emissions", I am more looking at the vehicle side and reducing those sorts of things. I think that is something that we will be looking at as a Government going forward.

3.3 Mr. F. Mason:

Do you think it is okay to be rebranding the Government and spending millions of pounds with U.K. consultancies, excluding local firms from the Charlie Parker project, while cutting funding to public organisations such as the Jersey Arts Centre, as well as pay awards to front line services?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

To answer that in 30 to 90 seconds is going to be interesting. Let us start at the beginning. In terms of the rebranding, the rebranding is, as we have tried to explain, technically the issue or the divide between the Government of Jersey and the States of Jersey started in 2005, when ministerial government came in. Previously, we had a committee system. That meant the Government was part of this Assembly. That split in 2005 to ministerial government meant that there was a division and therefore the Government of Jersey was separate to the States. The States is the Parliament now. What we have done is essentially the actual branding started in 2014 being used off-Island, because it gave clarity when you are dealing with other Governments. All we have done is said: "Look, the confusion [and there was a confusion around] we have bitten the bullet and adopted it wholesale." We have obviously ensured that there is d'Jèrri branding according to that. It did not cost millions of pounds in that instance, because basically it was all done internally. I cannot remember the exact figures, but it was several thousand. In terms of the wider transformation project, which is crucial, one of the things certainly I stood on, and many of us have encountered over a long period of time, is that the systems we had in place have not been working well. We can turn around and we can look at mental health services and say they are, bluntly, poor. Therefore, that means that what we were doing previously has not been good enough, for all sorts of reasons. As a technical argument - it may or may not appeal to people - there is a thing called G.D.P.R. (General Data Protection Regulation), which is about the new legislation under data protection. In most companies, on-Island and nationally and internationally, they have been preparing for it for 2 years. If you get it wrong and you are not ready for it, you get fined by up to 10 per cent of turnover. The States of Jersey turnover is between £750 million and £800 million, therefore a fine would be in the order of £75 million to £80 million.

Six months before G.D.P.R. had to be implemented by Jersey law, we were not even remotely ready for it. Exactly. I can see from the expression on the questioner's face that was not acceptable. Therefore, we had to bring in experts very rapidly to get it in place. You do not get experts on that at the drop of a hat. If they are going to come in at short notice, they are going to be expensive. Those are the type of the things that we have been dealing with and those are the type of things, that is why we are going through a transformation process at the moment. It has been long-needed. It is not just the previous Council of Ministers, but the one before. This has been sitting there for decades in certain times, so what we are dealing with at this whole time is anything from pay and conditions, some of which are archaic, some of which are discriminatory, to dealing with processes which have not been acceptable, to then sorting out ... and this is where some of the priorities are coming forward, with things like mental health coming forward. The transformation programme, the old adage is if you keep doing things the same way, you will end up with the same result. That is why you need different people at the top to bring in their external expertise to get things done.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Chief Minister, before we move on to the next question, could I ask your answers be more concise, please, because we will only get around to about 4 questions?

3.4 Miss J. Cullen:

For the States to reduce damage to the environment through cars and motor vehicles, as you previously stated, are the new 20 miles-per-hour speed limits through the ring roads in town necessary? Did you consider the additional traffic jams and congestion that this would have and then the contribution to climate change and the environment?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

At a level of detail, I have to say I am not too sure at the results in terms of the emissions. I have always understood 2 things. One is that if the car was going slower, I think it does depend: does it produce less emissions, or not? I will just say, in reality, in town how easy was it to do more than 20 miles an hour, at any given time, but the other point is it is about safety of pedestrians. That is the overriding priority in that instance. In terms of going forward, I think as a generation you will see probably more than me - hopefully we will all see in the next 10 years - things like more electric cars coming through, obviously driverless, potentially, and hopefully at some point even wider, perhaps electric buses and stuff like that. That could do a lot of things for emissions.

[14:45]

3.5 Miss E. Pallent:

In an age where we are threatened by climate change, why has an effective recycling collection system not been established for schools and offices? For example, at my school, we have green recycling bins that just get put with all the other rubbish and it seems like they are just there for show, because there is not a recycling collection system, which a lot of schools in the U.K. have.

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

I am surprised, and I would certainly be happy to ask the Minister for Infrastructure and the Minister for Education just to liaise. I am surprised that the schools would be going through a collection process just for it to be disposed and burnt, so I would hope that would be happening. Obviously, one of the things that we do have at the moment is kerbside recycling from a number of the Parishes. I know it is the ambition to try to get it out to all the parishes. The point is if recycling is easy, more people buy into it, and that is important.

3.6 Miss R. Smith of Beaulieu College:

What efforts are being made to support those students, whose first language is not English, in our schools? Would you ever consider a school that caters for multinational students?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

Again, as a detailed point, I think this is very much one for the Minister for Education. My understanding is that where you do have pupils, whose first language is not English, that there are specific provision in certain schools for them. Can that be better? I think you are probably in a better position than me to judge, and again, I will have a discussion with the Minister for Education.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

I have seen Fynn Mason, but you have already asked a question, so I will move to Thomas Glover and we may come back to you after.

3.7 Mr. T. Glover:

Chief Minister, how can Charlie Parker's contract, which grants important powers to an unelected person, be justified in a supposedly democratic state?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

Just to clarify, the Chief Executive's contract does not grant him powers. That would be his contract of employment. What the Member may be referring to are changes that were approved by the previous Assembly and others that may be coming to this Assembly, which are changes to the law. There has always been a recommendation that there was ... in the past, Ministers did not work together properly and equally, the departments did not work together properly. I think they called them dual fracture lines. One of the recommendations that came through, which was what was approved by the previous Assembly, was to sort that out, so that effectively you did have a Chief Executive, who could tell civil servants what to do, which bearing in mind the other problems that are coming through is probably the right move. What is important is that we do have the right checks and balances in place and there are some discussions around the improvements in structures that do need to happen.

3.8 Miss J. Luiz:

Referring to my colleague, Mr. Campbell's point, which I think was not answered properly, as a financially privileged community, I think we have an obligation to make environmental changes and set an example for other communities. You have said that the environment is now a top priority, but what specifically is going to be done? It should be our number one priority.

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

In terms of what is happening, I would like to refer the Member to, for example, the headlines in the press - I cannot remember if it was today, or yesterday - which was around water pollution. There is a very concerted effort being done now to start addressing it, which has not really been tackled in the past. I know, having particularly been involved in things like the PFOS (perfluorooctane sulphonate) pollution that affected residents in St. Peter and St. Brelade from the airport, there are actions being taken to try to address that, which has been a longstanding issue that has not been addressed. As I made reference previously, I think we will start seeing measures in place to reduce emissions and to try and encourage electric vehicles. Obviously, there is the wider theme, trying to encourage people to cycle, walk and not use vehicles, or not use private vehicles, and we will see more of that coming through.

Deputy R. Labey:

While the Chief Minister is receiving his grilling, I wonder if I could ask for a suspension of the normal Standing Orders preventing us from taking photographs, so that I can tweet an Instagram shot of the Youth Parliament from this angle?

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Okay, I was just checking, because I thought it was up to the Bailiff to give permission, but apparently it is up to me, so fire away.

Deputy R. Labey:

Thank you.

3.9 Miss S. Rothwell:

Given Mr. Parker's recent assertion that there is a funding shortfall of £14.9 million and therefore no more money for pay offers, do you think it is reasonable to suggest a £3 million project around Liberation Square and the Weighbridge?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

I am not too sure about the £14.9 million. At the moment, we are facing a deficit in 2020 of £30 million and that will increase up to £40 million over the next 4 years. That is why the transformation programme that we are talking about is so critical and that is also why, as I said, we are having the various discussions around the pay dispute that has been also referred to. In terms of the Liberation Square project, again that was a decision made by the previous Council of Ministers at the time and I do emphasise the difference between one-off capital spending and incurring a revenue expenditure. A revenue expenditure keeps repeating itself. So, it comes down to ... and there will be a decision, this has gone out to public consultation, essentially, and we will see what the feedback is like. Next year is the 75th anniversary of the Liberation. That should be something that is special for this Island, so as a concept, I do not have a problem with, or I am supportive of the Liberation Square project. When I say "as a concept", we need to understand the traffic implications. As a concept, that could produce quite a large useable public space. That means it is investing into St. Helier. It would be the first physical tangible dividend out of S.o.J.D.C. (States of Jersey Development Company) that is the Finance Centre i.e. that would be the source of the funding. If you think of things like the marathon, or think about the food fairs, or Liberation Square itself, it gives you a much better permanent space that we could use. It is the equivalent for town of us buying Plémont a few years ago, which I was supportive of. Now, we do have to understand the traffic implications - and I have to keep this a concise answer - and I hope that gives you the context we are operating in. But the deficit we have, which is an ongoing revenue expenditure issue, will not be affected by a one-off capital spend.

3.10 Miss S. Greene of Beaulieu:

Why is it that health visits stop at the end of primary school and do not extend to the age of 18?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

I was not aware, because I thought they ... certainly it is a long time ago: in my day, I think the health visits did continue into secondary. I genuinely do not know. I can find out from the Minister for Health and Social Services right next to me and we will relay that question back to you.

3.11 Miss C. Garrood of Jersey College for Girls:

Would you consider introducing frequent visits to care homes in the primary school curriculum, considering the prevalence of a generational gap in Jersey and the major benefits for both the elderly people and the primary school children?

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

That is a very interesting question, a good one to end on. Yes, because I know I have seen certain projects I think in the U.S. (United States) and in the U.K. where there have been benefits for both sides. As you say, the older people really enjoy having the younger company and it bridges that generational gap. Yes, that would be something we should be supporting.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you, Chief Minister. On behalf of the Youth Assembly, I would like to thank the Chief Minister and the Ministers, who joined us this afternoon and the Chair of P.P.C. (Privileges and Procedures Committee). They all have busy diaries and I am sure we would all appreciate showing

our appreciation in the usual way to them. **[Approbation]** They are very welcome to stay, and I am sure they will learn a lot from the public business that we are about to start now.

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré:

Might I say on behalf of the Ministers: thank you to all the attendees of the Youth Assembly. I have to say, on my first time, particularly as there was an element of glee as to how the Chief Minister was going to be grilled, I have enjoyed the process and there have been some very good questions, particularly ranking with the ones that will get thrown at me next week, I suspect, as well. Thank you all very much and well done, enjoy the rest of your day. I do have to go in about 10 minutes, but I will stay until then.

PUBLIC BUSINESS

4. Whether Jersey should introduce a new immigration policy based on the Australian points system

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you. We now move on to Public Business and the first item is a proposition from Patryk Lalka of Hautlieu School and I ask the Greffier to read the proposition.

The Greffier of the States:

The Assembly is asked whether it is of the opinion that Jersey should introduce a new immigration policy based on the Australian points system.

4.1 Mr. P. Lalka:

My team and I hopefully are here today to discuss the current issue of over-population here in Jersey. This issue is usually disregarded and is an example of a: 'We will cross that bridge when we get there' initiative. However, this is an ongoing and long-term issue and when we get there it will certainly be too late. Nevertheless, we are not suggesting stopping everyone from coming to the Island. Certainly myself, as an immigrant, I cannot be more thankful for the opportunity to come here and to basically start a new life. What we are saying is to be more selective of who we allow into our Island. This is where we look towards Australia as an example of how our system could be changed. Their system, in summary, is based around a points system and that people gain points according to their occupation. There is also adjustment to the country's requirements. Here, simple economic laws of if there is a demand for a job in Australia, the supply will be adjusted to meet that need. Therefore, Australia is very adjustable in their immigration system. This could be easily implemented into Jersey with Jersey's small size and there is no reason why it could not work. The only way to enter Jersey is through airport, or boat, and it allows for easy monitoring of the Island and it will allow people to come in, who we require, according to the system. The Australian system for immigration is closely monitored yearly. The Government has an annual immigration intake as part of the budget. Since 1998, the annual migration has been mostly skilled workers rather than families coming into the country. Australia have a population of 24.6 million as of 2017. They saw a net migration of plus 245,000 people, which is just 1 per cent of their population. To reiterate the importance of immigrants, Australia filed a report in 2018 looking at immigration and the positive impacts it brings. It is common knowledge that migration brings positive economic, social and cultural impact on Australia. Generally speaking, migrants and refugees show strong resilience and adaptability to new challenges and surroundings. They are willing to take menial jobs when first settling in. Also, many migrants and refugees show a disposition for hard work and are willing to take sacrifices in order to establish themselves in a new society. This could not be more true for Jersey, with the large population of Polish, Portuguese and other immigrants and refugees that have established themselves in Jersey society. As a result, these people take low-income jobs to settle into the Island, which fills the demand for these kinds of jobs. However, the Jersey system of managing

immigration, the system is nowhere effective or sustainable for the population. The current system requires migrants to stay on the Island for over 10 years before they can buy their own home and establish themselves as proper Jersey citizens with their own piece of land on the Island. Although this does decrease the incentive for people to come here, they are still seeking a new life, and if they left their home country, which they are struggling in, they will still stay here and try and make use of what they have. As a result, the housing crisis, combined with the high income tax which individuals have to pay, has a negative impact on their standards of living. This is due to the low quantity of disposable income available to people in everyday life. Increasing the supply of houses can be a part of the solution. However, much of Jersey's private sector is unregulated, with no safeguards in place on whether those properties are suitable, or being rented for a reasonable amount. This means immigrants are mistreated by landlords on the Island just because they were not born here. This should be resolved in the Island implementing the idea only to allow people who are selectively chosen through the system. Overall, we know humans are regarded as working machines, those who are useful and not useful. However, there comes a time which requires consideration. In view of the size of the Island, it should be seen as a limiting factor. The population grew in Jersey to provide the basis of a strong economy. However, now, to allow our Island to evolve, we need to acquire quality over quantity.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Is the proposition seconded? **[Seconded]** Thank you. Does any Member wish to speak on the proposition? Do not be shy.

4.1.1 Miss R. Nicholls:

Would you say that a points-based system is ethical? Because it may not be the fault of an individual if they have low-value skills, due to the place they have grown up.

[15:00]

They may have had a lack of education to build up on those skills and therefore do you think it is fair to penalise them for not having access to the same skills as someone living in a more developed country might have and would this apply to refugees as well?

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Does any other Member wish to speak? It is a very good debate and I am sure you have all got an opinion on it.

4.1.2 Miss J. Stocks:

This is a different point to my colleague, but currently in Jersey the dependency ratio - so the ratio of people working and paying into the system against those not working and thus not paying into the system - is 50:50. For every one person that works, there is one person that does not. However, statistics from Jersey predict that as immigration decreases, the dependency ratio increases, meaning there are more people not working to every person working, which could result in not enough money coming into the system to support the population. What action do you propose to prevent this from happening, as you aim to decrease immigration?

4.1.3 Miss S. Rothwell:

Yes. Again, I have got a different point. The points system would not be as effective in Jersey, because a lot of the immigrants we take in are for agricultural work, which we ourselves would not be willing to do. The immigrants that we take in for this do not require minimum English language speaking skills, or qualifications, or work experience, which the Australia points system requires.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Does any other Member wish to speak?

4.1.4 Mr. J. Dunn:

Maybe I am misconceiving what has been said, but is it not based on the supply and demand system? If there is demand for these farm-based, agricultural workers, then surely the system will be adjusted for the supply to be available for them.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Does anyone else wish to speak? Very well, I will call upon Mr. Patryk Lalka to reply.

4.1.4 Mr. P. Lalka:

As I said before, I think the rental cap that was talked about will definitely be helped through this immigration system, as there will be basically less demand for the houses, which will mean the supply would be able to finally keep up. We obviously want to be different from Brexit and make this happen. I think the system would also help the idea of the unequal Assembly, as taking more experienced people - you could say more quality - it will bring much better views into the society, as just because someone is Polish, or Portuguese, or a woman, they should not be automatically elected into the Assembly, just because they have that origin. They need to be experienced and have the ability to show people's views across. I think the proposed system would decrease the immigration, as well as decrease the pressure on the public transport that has been talked about before. LibertyBus, basically being a monopoly here in Jersey, is forced to supply people with the service that they need to get to work and home every day. As mentioned, Jersey Lifts can be a very dangerous service, so therefore relying on public services will allow people to feel safer, hopefully, in their lives. Also mentioned by my colleague, Evan, the climate emissions. As we bring less people into the Island, there will be less demand for food and, for example, Jersey milk, and it will allow for these emissions to slowly decrease. When we establish this, we could then focus on being a sustainable Island. For example, we have one of the best tides in Jersey, which will allow for things such as wave power to be finally implemented into this Island, which would help the environment. When we set this balance of basically not allowing more people into the Island, it will even force people from Jersey to seek these low-income jobs, as they will need to see it as something that will help the economy and hopefully develop as people and not see immigrants as only someone to fill those low-income jobs. Your ethical points I think are valid. However, there has to be a point where we look some further, as there is no planet B, so if we keep growing and not do anything about it to be more sustainable, it would just be an ongoing problem that is usually avoided. People come here, their main reason is income, as it pays more than their home country, so I think there needs to be an issue of countries, for example, as Poland or Portugal, where people basically need to earn more. It is something that I think, as the whole world, we need to help to make people feel comfortable in their own society.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Is the *appel* called for?

Mr. P. Lalka:

I call for the *appel*.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you. Very well, the *appel* has been called for. I ask the Greffier to open the voting.

POUR: 15	CONTRE: 9	ABSTAIN: 4
James Dunn	Lily Dobber	Jennifer Cullen
Ross Laurent	Jenna Stocks	Sam Gibbins
Patryk Lalka	Storm Rothwell	Stella Greene
Jemima Butler	Fynn Mason	Romy Smith
Rhian Murphy	Heather Orpin	
Aimee Hugh	Rosie Nicholls	
Emma Pallent	Clara Garrood	
Sam Wright	Thomas Glover	
Jacob Burgin	Evan Campbell	

Morgan Brady				
Eoghan Spillane				
Christie Lyons				
Sean Hughes				
Max Johnson				
Jennifer Luiz				

5. Whether changes should be made to the secondary school system in Jersey

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

We move on to the next item on the agenda, and that is a proposition from Mr. James Dunn of De La Salle and I ask the Greffier to read the proposition.

The Greffier of the States:

The Assembly is asked whether it is of the opinion that changes should be made to the secondary school system in Jersey.

5.1 Mr. J. Dunn:

Our school system is failing. Teachers are striking, students are at breaking point and the people want change. Not enough legislation has been passed, not enough action has been taken and it is up to the States to fix this issue and bring real change to Jersey. There are a few key areas of reform to fix the large-scale dissatisfaction. Firstly, what is being taught in schools is simply not applicable for everyday life post-school. Topics like the structure of a cell, distillation of crude oils and electromagnetism are things that we are learnt about throughout our G.C.S.E.s (General Certificate of Secondary Education) that will have no bearings or implications within our lives. You probably have not even thought about these topics since your exams. Instead, what should be taught are useful skills that will be utilised pretty much every single day: managing finances and dealing with stress in the workplace. Secondly, the role that teachers play in education is vital and undervalued. This is clearly evidenced by the strikes that are taking place as we speak. Our teachers need more funding and support to help raise the generations that will carry Jersey into the future. Thirdly, the school day itself is in question. It simply starts too early. Throughout the U.K., schools have recently been given the ability to set their own school timings and there is no reason that Jersey could not follow suit. Finally, our school system is too open to the dangers of e-safety, and more specifically, issues like Islamic radicalisation and other such issues. In conclusion, more needs to be done in the States to fix the issues that are affecting our youth, so that future generations can take Jersey into the future.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you. Is the proposition seconded? **[Seconded]**

5.1.1 Mr. R. Laurent:

I would like to second, but you need to start by asking the right questions. What are the objectives of school? How do we best deliver these objectives? How do we measure success and failure? Where do we look for guidance and how much are we prepared to pay? These are the key questions for us in Jersey. I think schools should aim to deliver a broad and solid education that prepares us for adult life, higher education, training and work, but at the same time, schools should do no harm. Students today are under more pressure than ever before. Stress levels are high, and depression and anxiety level diagnoses are rising. Admittedly, some stress is good for us and it definitely helps us in motivating, but today's levels are counterproductive, so what might help? Sleep. It is as important as diet and exercise, and according to the National Sleep Foundation ...

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Mr. Dunn, I hesitate to interrupt you, but your fan noise is being picked up by the microphone.

Mr. R. Laurent:

Sleep: it is as important as diet and exercise and according to the National Sleep Foundation, the sleep requirement for teenagers is between 8 to 10 hours per night, which indicates that the earliest healthy wake-up time for teens should be not before 7.00 a.m., so what about a small shift in school hours to reflect this? Minnesota, U.S.A. (United States of America) was one of the first places to trial this in 1996 and instantly car crash rates declined in this area by 70 per cent. These were student car crash rates. Major national health organisations put statements forward supporting later starts for high schools and this can be easily trialled in Jersey, using a small pilot scheme initially. The quality of teachers: from as far back as the Coleman Report, more than 50 years ago, to today's research, teacher quality is one of the few school characteristics that significantly affects student performance. Interestingly, one of the specifics that makes a good teacher is their scores on the verbal skills test. The teachers' verbal skills test result appears to be predictive of student achievement and modern data can even see the impact of individual teachers over time and measure their success compared with average. Teachers, who are successful with students in one year, tend to go on to be successful in future years. There is a huge difference between an effective teacher and an average teacher in exam success and data shows that teachers appear only to improve in quality up to 5 years of teaching no matter what is spent on personal development. So, to get the best teachers delivering the best outcomes for students, you have to pay more. Teachers in educationally successful Canada and Finland are significantly better paid, they are treated better, work fewer hours and they are highly regarded. Entry into the teaching profession is extremely selective. Measuring success and failure, finding out what works well needs more collaboration between politicians and teachers. It should be easy in Jersey to arrange meetings with representative teachers from each school and/or a student rep, who can collate information from many other students and quality data can be both analysed by both educators and by policymakers with student presence to ensure that common sense prevails and that changes are at least evidence-based.

5.1.2 Miss C. Garrood:

I do agree that, in this day and age, students suffer from a huge increase in mental health problems; anxiety and depression rates are significantly higher than they have ever been before among younger people, but I disagree with Mr. Dunn's proposition in his speech, saying that why do we learn about ... I cannot remember what your specific examples were, the organelles within the cell, I think you mentioned. It is not about exactly what you learn, it is about the environment that you learn in and it is about encouraging this passion for education and understanding the importance of education and learning and increasing educational attainment, which can last a lifetime, if done well in education from the beginning. I also would like to point out that the studies you mentioned in the U.S.A., school start times there start as early as 7.00 a.m. on average, so here when we start around 8.30 a.m., there is a big difference there and so that is perhaps one of the reasons why we see these results in the U.S. I do agree with increasing teacher salaries. Teachers obviously make education. The O.E.C.D. (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) does an annual Education at a Glance report for each country and I have looked at this, and the O.E.C.D. average for salaries is ... I cannot remember the exact figure, but in the U.K. it is significantly lower, which is a really large problem we have, which does not encourage enough teachers to enter the profession. We also have a really young Education Department. Teachers on average are 5 years younger than the rest of the O.E.C.D. countries studied, so that is a point to raise.

5.1.3 Miss J. Stocks:

In addition to my colleague's point earlier made, understanding things like hydrocarbons, or crude oil, are essential in understanding how to make these means of energy production more eco-friendly, to save our environment, which we have already mentioned is failing. Your statement that these things we are learning at school are useless is incorrect.

5.1.4 Miss J. Cullen:

Just addressing your issue of sleep, or lack thereof, surely going to sleep earlier would solve the issue of not getting enough sleep. I was just thinking, starting the day later, would that not demotivate students? I may be in the minority, but when I wake up earlier, I feel as though I have the day to be productive and I feel as though I can utilise the day more. I know, for me, an earlier start means that I can get more out of the day, rather than me perhaps starting at 10.00 a.m.

[15:15]

Also, the time before that, so students, if they are getting up earlier and then going to do something perhaps before school, would that not encourage people to maybe not turn up for their first lesson, or be late to school, because there is no real structure in having an earlier start time?

5.1.5 Mr. E. Campbell:

I would like to back up De La Salle's point. I think that I agree that the things we learn in school are not very useful. Like you said, while the skills we learn and the first presentation is important, that can be there while still learning more important things. You mentioned hydrocarbon and more environmental stuff, and yes, we should be learning about that. But I have not really come into real contact with those issues until year 12 and 13 when I started studying environmental systems and societies and that subject is only offered on I.B. (International Baccalaureate) and I think that should be a more widely integrated subject. Also, one of the only other subjects I find important is philosophy. To me, it helps me in my approach to learning and more analytical and understanding skills. I think this should be something which is employed earlier on in the school system. Where was I going with that? So, yes, things like English literature and things like that, although it is a useful skill, it builds you as a learner, when am I ever going to sit down and deconstruct a book I am reading? I just want to enjoy it, to be honest. Following on from that, in terms of teachers, I think a big way to challenge student stress would be more extra-curricular activity, not necessarily just sport because that is going to be more stressful to some people than others, but I think we need more teaching staff to make this available. My mum is a teacher and she works really, really long hours, she is always very stressed, and she is always trying to go above and beyond for her students; more extra-curricular stuff. She has always got time to help students de-stress and I think the time that takes needs to be almost written into the school day for teachers, and there are not enough teachers in the system to account for that. That is my point.

5.1.6 Miss E. Pallent:

Firstly, with times and stuff just a general question. What time were you planning on introducing the school day to start, because recent studies have been suggesting that it should be at 10.00 a.m. If this gets put into place then people will not finish school until 5.00 p.m. I live in St. Ouen, I will not get home until 6.00 p.m. By that point I will not have much time to do anything with the rest of my day and my whole life will be just going to school. Waking up and then coming home when it is dark and miserable. Your comment about sleep and stress; when you go to work, you have to wake up at that time to then go to your workplace and stress is common in the work environment. Obviously, there is too much stress put on students nowadays and I completely agree with that, with exams and all of this, but I feel like you cannot get rid of all of the stress, because it can be used as a positive factor, which is a useful skill to learn when you are in education, so that when you go into work, especially if you are going to be in a place like this, stress is very common. To do with the thing you said about a lot of stuff you learn in school being irrelevant. Yes, there is a lot of stuff for each individual person that they learn in school that they will never use again. All of the equations I learnt in maths I am never going to use again, but I think that there is a lot within life that you do not want to be turned into a machine throughout your whole time at school being driven straight towards one career. You need to be enriched by education, otherwise we are all going to be so bland, we are going to be so boring and there are a lot of things where you have to learn a bunch of subjects at the beginning, because otherwise you would be told from the age of, what, 12, you would have to decide what career path you wanted to go down. You would have to decide all of these things and there are a lot of things that I have personally picked up from subjects that I would not have chosen to do, but

that were made compulsory for me, for example, within R.S. (Religious Studies) I have learned loads of things to do with Islam and now I have been able to understand a lot of the things to do with our culture and Islamophobia today, and that has really helped me. Within history you can see the repeating cycles of where our society is going today and how that has happened in the past and ways to avoid such issues. A final thing; you mentioned something to do with Islamic radicalisation and schools encouraging it. I do not really know what your point was there about how we encourage Islamic radicalisation.

5.1.7 Miss L. Dobber:

I have a few points that I would like to make in response to someone's point over there about starting school later. In one study it improved enrolment and attendance and made students more likely to be on time when school started as well as improving moods and reducing visits to the nurse or school counsellor; that was from one study. Furthermore, you said that you did not learn about eco-type things until doing it at the I.B., which, I would like to point out, is a very broad thing in the first place. So, you are saying about not wanting to be learning all these things that you find irrelevant, but you are only going to ... I feel like it is very important to have a broad education, as Emma said, and I think that is important. But we learnt, certainly in chemistry and biology at G.C.S.E. a lot about ecosystems and things like that, so that gave us a good start there. So, I disagree with the fact that it only starts at I.B. or A-level. Furthermore, to second Emma's point, knowing some subjects are never going to be valuable to everyone, but you cannot decide people should stop learning about analysing literature just because you do not like it. I just think that is quite a narrow-minded perception to take. Furthermore, it is all very good knowing about taxes, like you said, I think that is really important and I think we need more life skills and things like that, maybe more into things like the P.S.H.E. curriculum. But, if you do not learn about the organelles and chromosomes in science, then you are not going to be able to get a job in science if that is your goal. So you are not going to have a job, so there is no need to learn how to do taxes. It all feeds into each other; that is what education is for.

5.1.8 Mr. E. Spillane:

With the issue of sleep, I feel most of it is up to the individual. I get to school at 7.00 a.m. every single morning and still manage to have a 9-hour sleep. I feel it is up to the individual student, as opposed to the school, to have that passion and to have that responsibility to get what they need. With regards to starting the school day later, it could present a lot of issues for parents, especially with maybe some of the younger years in secondary school where working parents would not be able to get their children to school for 10.00 a.m. You know, working parents are in the office from 9.00 a.m. to 5.00 p.m., or whatever job they do, and that is a major issue. With regard to how you deem some things irrelevant, everything is important to someone. Even if you do not find something important in the class, there are 20 people in that room and the balance of probability is that at least one of them does. The education system is designed to be as broad as possible and to appeal to as many people, so by narrowing this we would be restricting the information and potentially a passion that people did not realise they had for something if they do not end up learning about it in class. Those are my points.

5.1.9 Miss J. Luiz:

You mentioned trying to change the 8.30 a.m. starting time to say, for example, 10.00 a.m. But how can you be so sure that the 10.00 a.m. will not then become the 8.30 a.m., and they are just going to keep going and it is just going to completely change people's sleeping pattern?

5.1.10 Mr. P. Lalka:

Firstly, I just want to disagree with my colleague behind me. I think it definitely should not be left to each individual, because if the school just decided: "Oh, you can come in at whatever time you want" it would just be too specific, and it would never reach a point where everybody will get lessons when they want to and be specific to each individual. So I think we need to go on the basis of studies

that have been done where working earlier does improve the ability to learn. Also, supporting the point from De La Salle to reform the school system, I think, talking about learning a broad range of subjects. When some of J.C.G. (Jersey College for Girls) where you learn 3 A levels compared to something like the I.B. that we do at Hautlieu where we do 6 subjects, which range from social studies, language, English literature and maths, science or something arts-based, which you have to take. This just prepares you so much more for life, being so much more open-minded in that you do not have to specify yourself to a certain career, which, as you said, you cannot decide what you want to be at 12 so how can you be sure you know what you want to do when you are 16, for example. Even if you are, for example I knew I wanted to do medicine, but I still decided to take the I.B. and take that broad range of subjects knowing it would be harder, knowing it would take more work and time. However, I think the long-term investment for this is that you will become such better citizens through things that we do. The thing called C.A.S. (Creativity, Action, Service) where we take 3 hours per week helping in our community, doing projects to help the environment, about things for just well-being we do at Hautlieu to promote things on the Island for our students to improve mental wellbeing. It is just such a way that it allows you to then go into the wider world and start these projects for people in your own little community. I.B. being something that people do all across the world, such as we went over to Costa Rica, who take the same curriculum. So, then taking C.A.S. and doing something small there and us doing something small here, it all adds up in the long term and it just benefits the whole world in a sense, in the long term. I just feel that reforming the system in Jersey, to make people do the I.B., especially something in the middle years' programme and primary, which is not addressed at the moment in Jersey; is not available, should be reinforced.

5.1.11 Mr. T. Glover:

In defence of the proposition, I would agree in one aspect of its overhauling of the testing system, which I think has a bias to a quantitative measure of someone's skill in any subject, which is not always applicable, such as in say, philosophy and arts. Also, the lack of sleep, which has been mentioned, of course, does have defence in biology, as the sleeping patterns of students do not match up with their circadian rhythms, which are the natural order to which we organise our day-to-night cycle. However, I feel the proposition exaggerated the lack of sleep being a cause of stress, since there has been such a dramatic increase within the last generation, which I do not think can be entirely attributed to stress itself. Also, the study cited the reduction of car crashes may only be a correlative effect. Also, the advocacy for only practical knowledge, I think, disregards the use of having a general knowledge, since it implies that knowledge is only useful insofar as it is practical, whereas knowledge for knowledge's sake I think is the essence of the education system. Also, I would wish you to specify the actual changes you would wish to make, since you proposed making changes, but have not articulated what those changes would be.

5.1.12 Mr. J. Burgin of De La Salle:

I will finally respond to a few things now, I suppose. For me, personally, everyone is different, with different amounts of sleep they need. I feel insanely tired basically every day of the school week. I occasionally rest when I get home immediately because I am just tired. But there are so many distractions. I think, for the vast majority of people in education - maybe university is different, areas are slightly different - but certainly for a G.C.S.E. in mandatory education, you cannot leave kids to control when they go to sleep. You could say you would leave it up to the parents, but I mean there is so much technology nowadays and it is so easy to get distracted. Midnight, or 1.00 in the morning feels a lot later, a lot like: "Ah, I should get to sleep at this time, maybe" than say at 10.00 p.m., which is when you would be required to go to sleep if you have to get to school and to get a good proper night's sleep that is healthy.

[15:30]

In regard to knowledge not being ... you should learn a wide variety. Specialists are required in our society. Everywhere needs to specialise and people do need to know what they enjoy. But our point is more that necessary knowledge is not taught necessarily. I mean, I have no idea about taxes.

Maybe this is more of a personal thing, but I have not cooked anything ever; I cannot cook in the slightest. It would be useful to learn that in school and of course parents should teach you that. My dad has said for a while now he will at some point. **[Laughter]** Yes. There was some other point as well, but a lot has been said and I cannot fully remember it.

The Deputy of Grouville:

Well, thank you. You are not meant to repeat what other people have said, it is only if you want to make a new point. But that is fine, we want to encourage you anyway.

5.1.13 Miss H. Orpin for Jersey College for Girls:

Similar to a point someone earlier made, how do you propose about orchestrating the bus times? Is this system going to be implemented in all schools, so that all schools finish at the same time? Because, are there enough buses to go round all the schools picking up everyone at the same time? I think the system at the moment is that certain schools finish earlier, and the buses go to them first before the other schools. What do you propose to do about that?

5.1.14 Miss R. Murphy:

I would just like to refer back to one of your original points. You suggested that many topics in the science area are labelled as non-applicable, however they can be very applicable to many people across the Island who plan on going into such S.T.E.M. (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math) careers, which is critically lacking in diversity. For example, there are not enough women in S.T.E.M. careers, there are not enough people of ethnic minorities in S.T.E.M. careers at the moment. So, do you think this should become optional, or should it be completely abolished, these science topics which would hinder individuals from being able to reach the next stage of their further education?

5.1.15 Miss S. Rothwell:

You mentioned in your report and definitely in your speech not having enough relevance to the workplace. But, for a lot of students studying A level, and I.B. they would then go on to university anyway, because they would need further qualifications to go into their career. For the courses which one would go straight into the workplace, which are mainly offered at Highlands, that is a heavy weighting on work experience within that course. So, I mean, for A level and I.B. courses your studies would suffer with more work experience for very little pay-out because, for example, for a career like medicine you cannot have the level of work experience that you would need without the level of education which you would get from A levels and I.B.

5.1.16 Miss R. Nicholls:

I was going to draw on earlier points by saying I think we are all perfectly capable, even as, you know, doing G.C.S.E.s as a 15 year-old, of choosing when we go to bed. I think part of starting school at a specific time is that we have the independence to get ourselves to school and therefore I think by starting your school day later people could be encouraged - I know I probably would be - to go to bed later. So, I think that defeats the whole point of starting the day earlier. I think we are all young adults, we should be able to make the responsible decision to go to bed a bit earlier if we know that we might be tired the next day.

5.1.17 Miss A. Hugh:

Relating back to the point you made earlier about the high level of mental health issues within schools being linked to exams. How else would you propose to examine students, while reducing the stress levels at the same time?

The Deputy of Grouville:

Would anyone else like to speak? OK, I would like to call on Mr. James Dunn to respond.

5.1.18 Mr. J. Dunn:

In essence our proposal is for general and large-scale reforms, rather than specific issues like bus timings, which we feel do not really have many implications on the school day itself, although we do understand the importance of getting to school in the first place.

The Deputy of Grouville:

OK. Do you call for the *appel*, Mr. Dunn?

Mr. J. Dunn:

Yes. [Laughter]

The Deputy of Grouville:

OK. The *appel* has been called for. I ask the Greffier to open the voting.

POUR: 10	CONTRE: 13	ABSTAIN: 4
James Dunn	Jemima Butler	Sean Hughes
Ross Laurent	Rhian Murphy	Aimee Hugh
Patryk Lalka	Storm Rothwell	Jenna Stocks
Jacob Burgin	Emma Pallent	Lily Dobber
Morgan Brady	Sam Wright	
Christie Lyons	Eoghan Spillane	
Max Johnson	Fynn Mason	
Sam Gibbins	Heather Orpin	
Evan Campbell	Rosie Nicholls	
Stella Greene	Clara Garrood	
	Thomas Glover	
	Jennifer Luiz	
	Romy Smith	

6. Introduce Diversity Quotas for the States Assembly

The Deputy of Grouville:

That moves us on to the next proposition, which has been brought by Lily Dobber of Jersey College for Girls and I ask the Greffier to read the proposition.

The Greffier of the States:

The Assembly is asked whether it is of the opinion that diversity quotas should be introduced to ensure that the States Assembly fairly represents the population of Jersey.

6.1 Miss L. Dobber:

We believe that diversity quotas should be introduced to ensure the States Assembly fairly represents the population of Jersey. To take the definition of diversity quotas from the C.I.P.D. (Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development): “They are a type of affirmative action policy that aim to improve equality of opportunity and increase diversity by addressing the under-representation of minority groups in a range of different domains including politics.” Before we explain the benefits of quotas themselves, it is necessary to appreciate the reason that diversity, equal opportunities and representation are important in the first place. There are obvious positives, such as having a larger range of life experiences and backgrounds to draw on, which can lead to access to a whole new range of people who may have felt alienated by a previously homogenous group of leaders, but who now feel seen and represented and thus are more willing to discuss problems and change. For instance, research shows that when at least one team member shares a client’s ethnicity, that team is 152 per cent more likely to understand that client than another team and in this case a client could be an issue, or a proposal, that would impact a certain group. If you are still not convinced, then according to the United Nations, a minimum of at least 30 per cent female legislators are required to ensure that public policy reflects the needs of women. However, an interesting and less discussed benefit of diversity

is that being surrounded by people, who are different than us, challenges us to consider our words and decisions far more than being around people who are exactly like us. This forced awkwardness, researchers say, can lead to improved problem solving, as disagreements encourage creativity that inspire more people to come up with solutions that work for everybody, as they have never been part of the ... as well as forcing people to have discussions about problems they have never realised existed, because they have never been part of the community that faces them daily. This is crucial in government, as we, at least, believe that one of its core aims should be to improve life for all the citizens they govern. A Harvard Business Review study also showed that without diverse leadership, perhaps without a diverse group of Ministers, in terms of Jersey's Government, women are 20 per cent less likely than white men to win endorsement for their ideas and people of colour are 24 per cent less likely. So, having outlined the many benefits of a diverse and representative team in government, why then is the States Assembly not already making a strong push to be more inclusive in its composition and why do quotas not already exist. The answer is, of course, complex, but also betrays some uncomfortable truths that we rarely like to bring to the forefront. For instance, studies have shown that people are more concerned with the impact of a quota on members of their own group, that being for instance male or white, than they are by the improvement of circumstances in a target group. What is interesting is that to me it is clear that in terms of diversity in government this apprehension towards changing the *status quo* really stems from the inherent biases and assumptions that people have about young people, women, people with disabilities, people of colour and their abilities to succeed at politics, which is inherently linked to the age-old concern that these jobs will not go to the best candidate. How people come to the conclusion that they are employing the best candidates already from a tiny pool of less than half the population, if we consider it to be older white males, which is the majority of the States Assembly, is absurd to me as it is laughable to suggest that we live in a society that is anything approaching a true meritocracy, because the *status quo* means that in the most recent election we had 7 Members re-elected unopposed and 7 Members elected unopposed. To truly have a competent and representative Government, we, voters and Government Members must work hard to tackle internalised biases and, we believe, introduce diversity quotas to encourage the broadening of our horizon, so the same few candidates do not get through every time. Of course, I am sure you are all excited to point out the fact that not enough of these various demographics of people even run for Government in the first place, so how on earth can we propose quotas for candidates who do not exist. This is a valid question with a clear answer. It is not merely enough to impose quotas and to expect people to step up to the plate, we must encourage people to see politics as a viable career path for them from the start. As well as rooting out undeniable barriers that stop many people who would make fantastic politicians from taking that step. For instance, women are raised to be less competitive, less confident and more risk averse than men. These frustrating stereotypes can be challenged from within homes and schools. Another example is that if a woman is married to a man and she feels she has a higher status position compared to her husband's, she is more likely to feel resentful, or embarrassed. However, this sentiment is reduced, in the study that this was done, when the husbands provided physical support to their wives in terms of helping with care, or doing household chores. Our point being that there are very real changes that can be made that will have a large impact. The main goal of raising this issue and of implementing diversity quotas would not be simply to get a predefined number of various demographics into the States and leave it at that, but to really tackle the problems that have led to this appallingly homogenous state of affairs in the first place. Overall, by introducing diversity quotas the Government and the people will benefit enormously from new more innovative ideas, people who understand each other and their issues better and a more successful Government.

The Deputy of Grouville:

Is the proposition seconded? [**Seconded**]

6.1.1 Miss J. Stocks:

Yes, the proposition is seconded. Not only do diversity quotas provide emotional benefits, they also present practical benefits in business and government. Gender quotas in business result in more gender diversity within companies, which leads to enhanced firm innovation, in turn leading to increased accountancy-based performance. In addition, a McKinsey & Company study found that an increase in women's overall share of labour in the United States, increasing from 37 to 47 per cent over the past 40 years, was responsible for a quarter of the country's current G.D.P. (Gross Domestic Product). Other forms of diversity, such as ethnic diversity, are equally as important and beneficial. An economic value of cultural diversity study concluded that their findings were consistent with a dominant positive effect of diversity on productivity. A more multicultural urban environment makes U.S.-born citizens more productive and the Centre for Talent Innovation found that 48 per cent of companies in the U.S., with more diversity at senior management, improved their market share the previous year, while only 33 per cent of companies with less diverse management reported similar growth. Diversity quotas are not only employed in business around the world, but also in government. For example, in Singapore, racial quotas have been introduced in public housing as an attempt to fairly allocate opportunities between its majority Chinese population and minority Malay, Muslim and Indian ethnic groups. Furthermore, these quotas in government also see benefits. A Journal of Politics study found that in countries where gender quotas were introduced, the female representation doubled and as a result these governments tended to shift their priorities, for example, away from military spending and towards public health. However, for diversity quotas to be effective, they have to be more than a mere token; they must be mandatory and sufficient enough that they mirror the population if diversity is to truly be introduced and significant benefits are to be gained. This means they cannot simply be a guideline and that repercussions must result if they are not reached, such as in Norway where companies face dissolution if they fall short of their gender quotas. To introduce diversity quotas in Jersey we will need to consider the population and the sizes of the different diversity groups within it. If we take gender diversity as an example, in Jersey the States Assembly should contain 27 women to accurately represent the population, of which women make up 51 per cent. Currently there are only 14 elected female Members in the States Assembly, meaning women make up only 29 per cent of elected Members. This shameful figure highlights the reason why diversity quotas need to be introduced if diversity and proper representation of the population is to be achieved. However, as the number is currently so low, these quotas would have to be introduced gradually, rather than instantly. For example, in the next election, a quota could be set at 40 per cent of women, as is popular with many businesses that introduce gender diversity quotas and then increase over time to accurately represent the population. As the population and the groups within it are constantly changing, quotas must be adjusted with each election, to ensure they represent this and warnings must be given on the latest quotas to voters and candidates as the elections approach. By introducing diversity quotas into the States, the Government would be able to lead by example and encourage other sectors to follow suit creating a more diverse government and workforce so that Jersey can reap the benefits. For example, last week the *J.E.P.* (*Jersey Evening Post*) published an article reporting on how Jersey's economy could be boosted by £239 million if more women were encouraged to work.

[15:45]

This could directly result from diversity quotas in business encouraged by diversity quotas in government. In conclusion, we propose that diversity quotas should be introduced into the States Assembly, to ensure that it fairly represents the population of Jersey. We propose this as we believe it will enable minority groups' voices to be heard and for them to be better represented so that, in future, quotas can be removed, as minority groups will not feel held back by prejudices and thus will be more likely to put themselves forward for elections and jobs. This will mean voters and employers really will be able to find the best people for the job and will be able to benefit from all the positive effects of diversity.

6.1.2 Miss R. Murphy:

Just going back to your original proposition, would you not consider that it is more important to contain the States Assembly with individuals who are best qualified to do so? Instead of putting people of diversity in simply because they are of a different race, or a different gender, is not necessarily the best thing to do; surely we should be encouraging the education of ethnic minorities that are willing to have the skills that are required to gain these positions, rather than just including underqualified individuals with large diversity simply because of the pressure to have a diverse Assembly?

6.1.3 Miss J. Cullen:

You mentioned how clients, I think it was about 130 per cent, are more comfortable with talking to someone who are of the same ethnic group as them. Is that not counterintuitive? Does that not encourage that ethnic group to discriminate against people that are not of the same group as them? In general, I do agree with your proposition, but I would say rather than quotas, does it not need to have happened before. The women and the people in ethnic minorities, do they not need to be provided with the opportunities and examples for them to build their C.V. (*curriculum vitae*) and get involved in building up the confidence and the skillset to then go for higher jobs or go for different jobs within the economy or the market? Is it better to equip people for these opportunities, rather than forcing diversity quotas where they may be ill-fitting?

6.1.4 Mr. S. Hughes:

I remember you bringing up the point about women being less competitive. What do you plan to do to fix this, or change this, sorry?

6.1.5 Miss C. Garrood:

We knew this argument was going to come up that we would not get the best people for the job and that we need to ... if we were to introduce this policy, it would need to come hand in hand with other policies. This could not be standalone. We fully understand that. We need to educate people on how to be more confident. Introducing the idea, perhaps in the P.S.H.E. curriculum, of politics as a career for women and that education does not just mean in the classroom, sitting down and learning about things, it means being taught things every day, that educational attainment and further education that comes from that, people will experience that later in their lives. There are groups in Jersey aiming to do this. Lean In: Women, for example, is one where women in senior positions help other women get into senior positions by teaching them how to be more confident and how to speak properly. For example, at the J.C.G. (Jersey College for Girls) we have lots of initiatives to combat this. We have something called the 'Speak Out' competition where we have to stand up and talk about something that is meaningful to us, in front of an Assembly, or the year. We just hope that quotas would encourage people to come forward. One of our teachers, Deputy Perchard, she used to teach us English, and she thought: "Actually, maybe this is something I can do" and we hope that quotas would encourage more people to think that it is a career that they could possibly partake in.

6.1.6 Mr. E. Campbell:

I would like to agree with the proposition. I think that diversity is very important. I think it was a well-argued point. I think quotas is the issue here and I think that is something that should be employed quite quickly. Talking about needing to establish education for these other groups and stuff, especially females, I think that is already there, to be honest. The boys have been smacked around a bit in this debate, so far, by women. If we were to establish a quota sooner, rather than later, to get more women into Parliament, or whatever you want to call it, that would be important, but going forward a quota might not be the best way to do it, because once you have already established more diverse people in Government and the mindset starts to change that is the important thing. The mindset, rather than the technicalities of it and ensuring that you have to have this many people. I think there would need to be more flexibility in that quota than say a 50:50 split, or whatever the minorities we are talking about, to allow flexibility to people having a broader range of skills, independent of their ethnic group, or whatever. In my view, almost against this diversity idea to say:

“Right, this minority group has to fill up this percentage.” It is more about being open-minded and once that mindset has changed then I do not think the quotas are necessarily, but I think until then it is a good idea.

6.1.7 Miss E. Pallent:

To your thing about you need to not have a specific amount of numbers and everything in this example, in the States Chamber, the whole idea of the quotas is that when they are first introduced they are made mandatory, so that people, who are from those ethnic minorities, or women, feel like they do have a place in a job like this and that then they are encouraged to pursue this as a career path and eventually these quotas will not be needed, because people will step up. You can already see that with the argument where women, or people from ethnic minorities ... by introducing these quotas you might get people, who are under-experienced and they are not the best candidate. Patryk, I think you mentioned this earlier on in your ... you had a very valid argument with your Australian point system about how you cannot just ... you need people to come in who are skilled, you could not get someone in who was not skilled. The argument back is that there are people from ethnic minorities who are skilled and there are people who can represent the views of their minority that we do not understand, because we are not part of that minority. With the thing about males and females, if you look at the amount of people who are here right now, there are more women in here than men, which shows that there is a vast group of females who do want to pursue this career, who do want to get into politics and who are perfectly able to do it. If you want the exact percentage, it is 53.6 per cent of the people here are girls to the nearest decimal place. Basically the whole thing that you asked about, how you are going to stop women from feeling like they cannot be competitive, that is a social construct where women are criticised for being outgoing and all of this stuff. You hear it every day: “Oh, women are dish washers”, “woman, go make me a sandwich”, it is these small things which do get into girls’ heads and people are then internalising the fact that they need to stay quiet and it is something that is wrong in society and something that needs to change. Through introducing diversity quotas into the States and showing young girls that there are influential people and maybe that we will not only have the second female Prime Minister right now, like in the U.K. Once changes like this start to happen then women will grow in confidence and they will realise that society accepts them and their abilities, just as much as men.

6.1.8 Mr. J. Burgin:

Do you not think, perhaps, quotas could potentially have the opposite effect of they are only there because they have to be there, they are not deserving of their place? We only have 27 women in our States, because they have to be there. You can obviously cannot say it openly politically, or whatever, but I do not know rumours can do a lot of the demeaning stuff but, yes: “They got in easy, they were token, they do not deserve to be here, really, but they are because we have to them and it is not on their capabilities.” We can all think of capable people losing out for this.

6.1.9 Miss A. Hugh:

How can you realistically say that you are creating equal opportunities for everyone, as you said in your opening statement, when you are essentially moving the discrimination to another group of people, who have not been born with the characteristics you are now favouring? I would say that a selection process, based on meritocracy, is the process that would create a fair society, rather than valuing inherent characteristics that people do not have control over.

6.1.10 Mr. T. Glover:

I disagree with the proposition, firstly for the fact that it seems to create a superficial sense of change in the States in that the culture has not changed in order to have an equal representation, as in what people have voted for, it has been implemented there. It was said a bottom-up approach to creating equalities. Also, with this being applied to the States, I think this would undermine democracy, since you would have to have a certain amount of either female, or male, despite other more favourable candidates. Therefore, again, it not just undermines democracy but additionally meritocracy. So, the

way in which I propose to change the laws, since I agree with the intent of it, would be one in which ... is for other avenues that we can change the culture at large and thereby bring about that change democratically, with having an equal distribution of male to female members. You could do that through, say, education. Of course, this would have to be done through the access of direct democracy, as we have seen demonstrated today. Also, concerning minorities, you propose that the main reason which candidates of those minorities do not run was due to an apathy, which I would agree with, although you did not seem to justify how you would reduce that apathy. Also, of course, this is not just applicable ... these diversity quotas are not just applicable to the States, but also to business and yet again I would think that if there is undeniably a bias in business towards one sex over the other, quotas would perhaps backfire by having that change imposed, instead of being brought about through the culture itself.

6.1.11 Miss S. Rothwell:

You argued that it was - or someone argued - undemocratic, but, in fact, having politicians elected unopposed is far more democratic, especially when they are mainly middle-aged white men, who are not representative of the population anyway and, in fact, even if someone is, for example, less qualified, having less work experience in the field of politics, that does not allow for context specific information. For example, while someone may have more experience being a politician, that can be because in the past biases towards them have let them be elected in and the best candidate is, in fact, someone who is representative of the minorities, who already are represented in Government. We simply cannot understand the issue faced by minorities, which we are not. By introducing quotas, the change in attitudes will increase democracy, because more people are going to be standing, so there will be more choice for the voters.

6.1.12 Mr. P. Lalka:

So, firstly, I would like to - because you heavily mention on woman, in your survey the majority of the women that are in Parliament seats are seen as economically lesser developed countries. Costa Rica for example and Rwanda. I was just wondering if you could tell me what are they doing ... sorry, Jersey can be said is a more economically developed country.

[16:00]

We are doing well, we are a very wealthy Island. We are doing well, but there are more men in the Parliament than there are in Rwanda. However, Rwanda and, say, Costa Rica is not seen to be doing as well. It kind of shows the opposite effect to what you were suggesting. Also, in your surveys it says, under Mexico, it is only an estimate so it kind of shows the unreliable nature of the data and how Mexico's system seems to be so unreliable that they can only give an estimate of how many women are there. I would also like to mention that as Jersey is normally seen as a very wealthy Island, there is a very wrong misconception that we have a dual economy where there is a very high percentage of people who are very poor and a percentage who are very wealthy. With your heavy focus on women, I was wondering: how would you encourage people, who are smart, coming from Poland or Portugal, who maybe do not speak the language and do not have the economic advantages of people living here to run for elections and have their voice heard when they are only starting to settle in.

6.1.13 Mr. J. Dunn:

At the core of issues to do with equality and equality ethics is the idea that there should be equal treatment for equals and unequal treatment for unequals. For example, people who are equals should be treated equally. In the example of quotas, people who are equal, you are deeming to be equal - so women and minorities which are equal as the same middle-aged white men which take the seats - they are being treated unequally compared to the equals.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Does any other Member wish to speak? I will call on Miss Lily Dobber to reply.

6.1.14 Miss L. Dobber:

OK, so something that I would really like to emphasise is that we want to use these quotas to inspire a change, because as many of you said, a really valuable and valid point, that people need to be encouraged from education, from lower levels of education, from primary school to secondary school, that they feel that they have the skills and the competences to be able to go into politics and we feel that having diversity quotas would raise the profile of this issue - the issue being not enough minorities in Parliament - and therefore get people thinking about it and also hopefully inspired to become States Members. Obviously, this cannot be done without a culture change; however, you did mention a culture change and society has had a long time to change culture. Culture and the culture of stereotypes and sexism and racism and things, and things are changing, things are always changing but sometimes I think that we need this affirmative action to really push us into the next stage of development and quotas can combat the internal biases that people have. You said that equals should be treated as equals; yes, of course, but internal biases that people have because of these years of built up stereotypes and things like that in society, that people are just brought up and they cannot necessarily change. That causes the internal biases which then, I will argue, causes people to be treated unequally. Quotas can be one method of combating these internalised biases until, as we mentioned, we will try and remove the quotas when that mindset seems to be thoroughly established and changed within the States. Furthermore, someone spoke about how to ensure that the diversity would really happen, because, otherwise, what if you do not have enough candidates, what if it ends up having to be more men. In that case we would suggest that quotas are only effective according to studies when they have been ... when there are sanctions against them not occurring. So, we would suggest a sanction, such as reducing States Members' salaries, or something like that, but obviously that would have to be brought up for discussion because that would, we think, make quotas more effective. I think that is pretty much it.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you. Is the *appel* called for?

Miss L. Dobber:

Yes, I call for the *appel*.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you. The *appel* has been called for. I ask the Greffier to open the voting.

POUR: 15		CONTRE: 9		ABSTAIN: 4
Lily Dobber		James Dunn		Sam Wright
Jenna Stocks		Ross Laurent		Fynn Mason
Patryk Lalka		Rhian Murphy		Sean Hughes
Jemima Butler		Aimee Hugh		Sam Gibbins
Storm Rothwell		Jacob Burgin		
Emma Pallent		Morgan Brady		
Jennifer Cullen		Eoghan Spillane		
Christie Lyons		Max Johnson		
Heather Orpin		Thomas Glover		
Rosie Nicholls				
Clara Garrood				
Jennifer Luiz				
Evan Campbell				
Romy Smith				
Stella Greene				

7. That civil service job applications should be anonymised until candidates are selected for interview

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

The next item on the agenda was going to be proposition brought forward from a Victoria College student. So, unfortunately they are not here this afternoon, so we will move on to the next item, which is a proposition being brought by Rhian Murphy of Beaulieu and I ask the Greffier to read the proposition.

The Greffier of the States:

The Assembly is asked whether it is of the opinion that civil service job applications should be anonymised until candidates are selected for interview.

7.1 Miss R. Murphy:

Our proposal is that any job application for a position in the civil service should be completely anonymised until candidates are selected for interview. We think that in a world where equality is becoming increasingly significant, these crucial positions in society should be free from prejudice. We suggest that applications should not require applicants to provide any information regarding race, age, gender and name. Hopefully, this will remove preconceived ideas based on those uncontrollable and unchangeable factors. This proposal is about equality and giving equal opportunities to individuals of any age, gender and ethnicity. It is with the intention that this would increase meritocracy in the job application process. Anonymising applications would allow people to be selected for the next stage of application, based on the skills that they would have to benefit a company employing them, as opposed to being selected simply because they have connections within the industry, or may appear to have features which the employer may like. We have found that during the first online application process for the States of Jersey, it almost immediately asked for the applicant's cultural and ethnic origin, long-term mental or physical disability and age. This indicates that the information will play a role in the candidate being selected for the next stage of their application, something which could decrease diversity and increase discrimination in the workplace. We appreciate that the mental state of the applicant would be important should they be offered the position, however we feel that it would be inappropriate to make the decision regarding this, if this was an issue, or not, at the very first stage of application. In our opinion, this decision should be made later on in the interview process where the individual's mental state could be discussed at length with the employer, who can then decide if it will affect the applicant's ability to fulfil the role. Anonymising applications for positions in the civil service would overall increase the competency of the workforce, as applicants would be selected based on skills they possess, without discrimination against innate characteristics. This would lead to individuals, with much more valuable and applicable skills and qualities to be employed by companies as opposed to simply being employed due to them being a certain age, or race, by an employer who may want their company to seem particular diverse. This point could lead to arguments that it would be tougher to create a genuinely diverse workplace; however we believe the focus should then be on educating minorities and giving them further desirable skills that will make them more employable. A study conducted by the National Bureau of Economic Research measures discrimination in a novel way. In response to job advertisements in Chicago and Boston, newspapers they sent mock résumés with either typical African American, or Caucasian names, and measured the number of call-backs each résumé received for interviews. In total, they applied for 1,300 employment advertisements in sales, administrative and customer service job categories. The results indicated large racial differences in call-back rates, as job applications with typical Caucasian names needed to send about 10 résumés out to receive a call-back, whereas an application with a typical African American name needed to send approximately 15 résumés. This would suggest either employer prejudice, or employer perceptions that race signals lower productivity. This study is clear evidence of the issues that face individuals of different ethnicities in regard to job applications and displays why changes desperately need to be made to this current application process, as it leaves significant room for prejudice and discrimination against our workforce.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Thank you, Miss Murphy. Is the proposition seconded? **[Seconded]** Does any Member wish to speak on the proposition?

7.1.1 Mr. P. Lalka:

So, you said that all the nationality, age and the name should be anonymised. But I believe certain jobs, such as definitely language teachers, if you know that someone is from, for example, Spain and they are applying for a job as a Spanish teacher I think it is not racist to say that if someone from England, who knows how to speak Spanish, a native Spanish speaker who can speak English should be chosen over the person born in England, as it would allow for a better experience for the students, definitely in things like sayings, or traditions, could be influenced into the students. I think it should be definitely said that being able to communicate these skills to the students and influence their culture on to them is definitely a skill and something that people should be proud of and should not be anonymised. This really shows the misallocation of resources of human capital, where people who are migrants are as valuable, as was said here before, of bringing economic cultural benefits into the Island, for example. Anonymising these would only put people in a random order and if the Spanish native speaker is put last on the list then, tough luck, you have to try in another school, for example, and it would not benefit the society.

7.1.2 Miss E. Pallent:

So, the idea of anonymous civil service applications; I think to an extent that is a good idea and it a way to battle discrimination, but how would you prevent the discrimination from just being postponed to a later stage, when you get to interviews and then, obviously, affinity bias? Obviously, the person cannot stay anonymous for ever through the whole application progress. Also there was one thing that they found in France when they tried using the anonymous applications, is that places that tried to increase diversity by trying to recruit people who were of different ethnic backgrounds and more women, call-back rates went down, because they had been trying hard to increase the diversity because of context specific information. If you are a white and middle-class person you will receive a better education from where you come from. For example, all of us here will receive a better education than someone who may be like ... I have a friend whose mum lived in Madeira and she stopped going to school at the end of the primary school and joined a farm. There is context specific information - obviously maybe not in that specific case, because that person would not really be applying for the civil service - like where you need to ... like low income backgrounds, do you have worse opportunities sometimes, but they could be just as capable to do the job than other people. For example, with age, surely you would have less work experience if you did not ... if the employers did not know that you were young and that you were just out of university then would they just see having no work experience as a bad thing? How would you battle these things?

7.1.3 Miss H. Orpin:

I would like to agree with the proposition as there are ways, such as when you apply for certain university courses with things like the M.L.A.T (Modern Language Aptitude Test) and the B.M.A.T. (BioMedical Admissions Test) which are aptitude tests for certain subjects that you can assess someone's aptitude for that subject, in this case for a job, which relates to that subject and is another way to test how they would fit the job instead of just an interview.

7.1.4 Miss J. Cullen:

I, again, do agree with the proposition. I just do think that there would be some issues going about it. For example, companies, or businesses, do need to do background checks, or police checks, to ensure that their candidate that they are going to invite to interview does not have a criminal record, or has not been in trouble with the law. Similarly, very common nowadays they like to do social media checks before inviting candidates to interview, to ensure that they are not publicly discriminatory, or radically racist or, I do not know. How are you going to prevent ensuring that you are not inviting people to interview without doing prior checks to ensure that they are right for the role?

[16:15]

7.1.5 Mr. T. Glover:

The previous speaker mentioned something called an affinity bias, which I presume is based on say an interview with the applicant. I think what underpins the sentiment of this proposition is partly a presumption that all bias is bad bias, whereas an affinity bias, whereby someone makes a good impression, or a bad one, is in some way uninformative to the process of the application, which I cannot see is agreeable. It is only the biases which inform prejudice that would be a bad bias, such as in the cases in which the offer of opportunities may be limited due to the anonymity of the applicants such as, say, when an offer may be given to someone of lesser experience, either due to their age, or their economic background and also in cases in which experience cannot be officially recognised. What I think ought to be the resolution to this issue of bias in job applications is rather an oversight of the process of those offering the application.

7.1.6 Miss J. Luiz:

I would like to raise a point that Patryk made about Spanish teachers. If they studied Spanish to a point of being able to teach it then, surely, they are capable and competent. That would also introduce discrimination and place a person born in England at a disadvantage and possibly loss of employment simply because they are not of Spanish nationality. This would also decrease the amount of people able to apply to a second language job. For example, I was born in Jersey, but I speak Portuguese so why should I not be able to apply for a Portuguese-speaking job?

7.1.7 Miss L. Dobber:

I would just like to clarify that the term ‘affinity bias’, used by Emma, refers to a bias whereby you are more likely to, for instance if you are an employer, pick a candidate who has traits similar to you; maybe the same ethnicity, the same background, or the same gender. In that case it is still a bias and can still be a negative thing because the whole point of anonymising is to reduce biases entirely and I do not think it is necessarily a good idea to go about trying to define what is a good bias and what is a bad bias, because if we remove all the biases then you will try to see who is the best candidate for the job. Also, an interesting point is the job listings themselves, the type of people they attract can depend on the wording. For instance, there was a study done that showed that if certain words, or terms, were used like ‘rock star’, that is going to attract more male candidates than female candidates, or saying something like ‘a passion for learning’ is going to attract more female candidates than male candidates. Something to be aware of is that this needs to be broader than just anonymising applications, but probably, as well, thinking about the wording on job listings in the first place.

7.1.8 Miss R. Nicholls:

I agree with the intent of the proposition. I think it is really important that we try to give everyone equal opportunities in the workplace. However, I do not think anonymising applications is the best way to go. I do not think people should have to be ashamed of their nationality, or where they come from, or their age. I think it is something that should be celebrated. I know there is deep-rooted bias within society towards different nationalities and I think possibly that is what the proposition is trying to address, but I think that could be better tackled through education of employers and just of society in general that we should be celebrating people wherever they come from. Everyone has different skills to bring and I think that is not something that should be anonymised. I think we need to place a greater importance on looking for candidates who are more diverse.

7.1.9 Miss A. Hugh:

Just to respond to a few points made, someone said that prejudice could be postponed to the interview process where we agree it could be, but hopefully it would decrease it in some way with an employer not just looking straight at an application and saying: “I know this person, because I know their last name and I am going to put them straight through to the interview process.” Someone mentioned

social media and employers liking to do checks on people. We said this was not really relevant and checks on people can discriminate against people, as we all have had social media since we were quite young now and if you made a mistake on there when you were, say, 12 years old and an employer looks back on that I do not think that should affect your job offer now for someone who is 17. Someone brought up that it could decrease diversity within the workplace, but I think that comes down to educating minorities and giving them skills, or making them more employable, rather than just employing them because they are a minority. This will increase meritocracy within the workplace hopefully because candidates will be chosen based on their skills and their application.

7.1.10 Miss C. Lyons of Beaulieu:

Just referring to what Aimee said, I would just like to clarify that we consider the applications being postponed and being abused by the interview process. However, the practicality of somebody going through 100 interviews would cost a massive amount of money and I do not think that we are wasting our time and money doing that.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Does any other Member wish to speak? Very well, I shall call on Miss Murphy to reply.

7.1.11 Miss R. Murphy:

I would like to begin by addressing some of the points that were made by some other people. The first point I would like to address was made over here about someone who speaks their native language being employed over someone who has learnt the language and may have been born in a different area. I think this is an unnecessary perspective, as someone born in England, with a firm grasp of, I think the example was Spanish, could have a firmer grasp of the language than someone that was born in Spain and they have spoken that language growing up, but does not speak it as much anymore. They may have less of a grasp of the language than the person who has learnt it later on in life, maybe at G.C.S.E. and A levels, so I think they would be more applicable to be put into a teaching job of the language. The next one I would like to address is the affinity bias where you said employers might hire someone just because they feel they are similar to them. But this method would decrease the positive discrimination which is rather than discounting any minority candidate you could hire managers who discriminate positively and would prioritise these minority candidates, giving them more of a view and a second look than possibly someone with an affinity bias might not have done. In summary, equality is our major concern in regard to this matter. We want to be able to move forward and establish a workforce free of discrimination completely and prejudice and a world that is aiming to do just that and anonymising civil service applications is just the first step of many towards a fairer society and future for us all.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

Is the *appel* called for?

Miss R. Murphy:

Yes.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

The *appel* has been called for. I will ask the Greffier to open the voting.

POUR: 13		CONTRE: 13		ABSTAIN: 2
Lily Dobber		James Dunn		Jacob Burgin
Jenna Stocks		Ross Laurent		Sam Gibbins
Rhian Murphy		Patryk Lalka		
Aimee Hugh		Jemima Butler		
Storm Rothwell		Sam Wright		
Emma Pallent		Morgan Brady		
Christie Lyons		Eoghan Spillane		

Clara Garrood		Fynn Mason		
Max Johnson		Jennifer Cullen		
Jennifer Luiz		Heather Orpin		
Evan Campbell		Rosie Nicholls		
Romy Smith		Sean Hughes		
Stella Greene		Thomas Glover		

I think we have had a varied result throughout the afternoon, so well done. This brings us to the end of public business, but before we leave I thought I would just give you a little short *résumé* of how today has gone. We have had 46 questions and supplementary questions asked, 10 questions to the Chief Minister and answered in 15 minutes, so I think he took heed of his telling off to keep his answers concise, so well done. We have had a total of 45 speakers over 4 debates. I think we all ought to congratulate you. Very well done for the many contributions you have made. I would also like to say thank you to the Greffe, especially the Deputy Greffier, who has been liaising with your schools and schoolteachers and set up the Assembly for today. That is an awful lot of work that goes on behind the scenes with changing everyone's names from the States Members to your own, so I could eventually work out what I am doing up here with these little gadgets. I would like to thank Lisa and the Greffier and all the Greffier's staff for helping to put this together. **[Approbation]** All the papers you have on your desks are for you to keep and I think there will be a folder made up for you as a memento of your experience here. It has been an interesting Youth Assembly this year. It has been going for 22 years now and 2 of the current Members of the States were Youth Assembly participants some years ago. One of them, Senator Sam Mézec, was in the Assembly today answering questions as a Minister, so perhaps, in due course, all of you could return in one capacity, or another. Certainly, by the standard of debate and the questions asked, I think you have a very high standard, so the second vote of thanks should go to you, because there was obviously a lot of preparation that went on and your contributions were elegant, incisive and very thoughtful. I think it is really good that all of you here are interested in politics and debating. I was the politician who passed our law, the first in Great Britain, to give 16 and 17 year-olds the vote **[Approbation]** so Jersey was the first, for once. It is really good that you are interested and can play a part in our society, if not as a voter, maybe one day as a States Member as well and that would be really good. We have some soft drinks downstairs and I invite you to come down with your friends and any people you have in the public gallery who wish to join you. Thank you very much and well done.

Miss L. Dobber:

We would just like to thank the Chair, Deputy Labey, for doing a fantastic job running the event, especially as it was her first time since becoming the C.P.A. (Commonwealth Parliamentary Association) Chair. Thank you so much.

The Deputy of Grouville (in the Chair):

I do not know who was more nervous, you or me. Anyway, it is learning curve for us all today. Thank you very much. The States stands adjourned.

ADJOURNMENT

[16:30]