



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
8th September 2009, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Lieutenant-General Andrew Peter Ridgway, C.B., C.B.E.,  
was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut  
Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.41 a.m.)

---

Prayers read by the Greffier of the States

---

#### **Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Financial Services (Financial Service Business) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	R&O.74/2009.
Non-Profit Organizations (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	R&O.75/2009.
Financial Services (Trust Company Business (Exemptions Amendment)) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	R&O.76/2009.
Road Racing (Festival of Speed) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.77/2009.
Court of Appeal (Criminal Reference of Points of Law) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal.</i>	R&O.78/2009.
Court of Appeal (Criminal) (Reference for Review of Sentence) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal.</i>	R&O.79/2009.
Court of Appeal (Criminal) (Confiscation Order Appeals) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal.</i>	R&O.80/2009.
Court of Appeal (Civil) (Amendment No. 3) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal.</i>	R&O.81/2009.

Court of Appeal (Civil) (Judicial Review) (Amendment) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal.</i>	R&O.82/2009.
Court of Appeal (Criminal) (Amendment) Rules 2009. <i>Court of Appeal and the Superior Number of the Royal Court (sitting together).</i>	R&O.83/2009.
Diseases of Animals (Avian Influenza) (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Planning and Environment.</i>	R&O.84/2009.
Social Security (Mariners) (Amendment No. 3) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	R&O.85/2009.
Road Racing (Motor Vehicle Rally) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.86/2009.
Education (Discretionary Grants – Amounts) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Education, Sport and Culture.</i>	R&O.87/2009.
Jersey International Air Display (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.88/2009.
Income Support (General Provisions) (Amendment No. 3) (Jersey) Order 2009. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	R&O.89/2009.

### Documents presented or laid

Electricity Tariffs: Regulations under Article 22 of the Electricity (Jersey) Law 1937 (P.41/2009) – comments. Presented: 4th September 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	P.41/2009. Com.(2)
Electricity Tariffs: Regulations under Article 22 of the Electricity (Jersey) Law 1937 (P.41/2009) – report of the Minister for Economic Development. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	P.41/2009. Rpt.
Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – first, second and third amendments (P.72/2009 Amd., Amd.(2) and Amd.(3)) – comments. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	P.72/2009. Amd.Com.
Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – fourth amendment (P.72/2009 Amd.(4)) – addendum. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Mary.</i>	P.72/2009. Amd.(4) Add.
Rôle of the unelected members of the States: review – appointment of chairman and members (P.118/2009) – comments. Presented: 4th September 2009. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.118/2009. Com.

Verita Investigation: extension to cover exclusion of Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist (P.131/2009) – comments. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.131/2009. Com.
Verita Investigation: extension to cover exclusion of Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist (P.131/2009) – comments. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	P.131/2009. Com.(2)
States Investment Strategies. Presented: 17th July 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.76/2009.
Jersey Overseas Aid Commission: annual report for 2008. Presented: 17th July 2009. <i>Jersey Overseas Aid Commission.</i>	R.77/2009.
States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – Complaint against a decision of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding No. 3 Teighmore Park, Grouville. Presented: 20th July 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.78/2009.
Parliamentary Privilege in Jersey. Presented: 21st July 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.79/2009.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Old Blacksmith’s Shop, Corbière, St. Brelade – lease. Presented: 22nd July 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.80/2009.
Jersey Safety Council: Report and Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2008. Presented: 24th July 2009. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	R.81/2009.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Planning and Environment – July 2009 revised delegations. Presented: 24th July 2009. <i>Minister for Planning and Environment.</i>	R.82/2009.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Housing – July 2009 revised delegations. Presented: 28th July 2009. <i>Minister for Housing.</i>	R.83/2009.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – (a) N19, N19A, LC11, E52 and A57, St. Helier – leases; (b) No. 2, Howard Davis Farm, La Route de la Trinité, Trinity – lease. Presented: 28th July 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.84/2009.

- Criminal Injuries Compensation Board: Report and Accounts for 2008. R.85/2009.  
Presented: 29th July 2009.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.*
- States of Jersey Utility Companies: Financial Reports and Accounts – 2008. R.86/2009.  
Presented: 3rd August 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*
- Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Sea Wall, Pontac to La Rocque, St. Clement – proposed transfer of land. R.87/2009.  
Presented: 7th August 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*
- Public Employees Contributory Retirement Scheme: Actuarial Valuation at 31st December 2007. R.88/2009.  
Presented: 11th August 2009.  
*Chief Minister.*
- Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – R.89/2009.  
(a) V06 Victoria Pier, St. Helier – lease;  
(b) La Rue de la Poterie, Grouville – exchange and counter-exchange of land with Jersey Pottery Limited.  
Presented: 11th August 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*
- States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Education, Sport and Culture. R.90/2009.  
Presented: 13th August 2009.  
*Minister for Education, Sport and Culture.*
- Land Transactions under Standing Order 168 – The Fire House, Western Fire Station, La Route des Quennevais, St. Brelade – Lease. R.91/2009.  
Presented: 14th August 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*
- Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – R.92/2009.  
(a) A29 Albert Pier, E43 Elizabeth Terminal, N20 New North Quay and S08 South Pier, St. Helier – leases;  
(b) The Supplement Store, Fort Regent – lease;  
(c) Le Belon, 2 Le Clos Vallois, Le Passage, St. Lawrence – Assisted House Purchase property;  
(d) The Fire House, Western Fire Station, La Route des Quennevais, St. Brelade – lease.  
Presented: 25th August 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*
- States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – Complaint against a decision of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding the development of Field 268, Les Croix, La Rue du Tas de Geon, Trinity. R.93/2009.  
Presented: 28th August 2009.  
*Privileges and Procedures Committee.*

Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Springfield Sports Stadium Café premises – lease. Presented: 28th August 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.94/2009.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services. Presented: 2nd September 2009. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R.95/2009.
States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – Complaint against a decision of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding the refusal for permission to change a dormer window into a bi-folding door and balcony. Presented: 3rd September 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.96/2009.
Privileges and Procedures Committee: report concerning the Royal Court cases against Deputy G.P. Southern and Deputy S. Pitman. Presented: 3rd September 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.97/2009.
Land Transaction – Grève de Lecq Rockface and Headland on North-West Coast, St. Ouen – cession to the Public. Presented 3rd September 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.98/2009.
States of Jersey: Pay Benchmarking. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	R.99/2009.
States of Jersey: Pay Benchmarking (R.99/2009) – addendum. Presented: 8th September 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	R.99/2009. Add.
Population Policy (S.R.3/2009): response of the Chief Minister. Presented: 27th July 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	S.R.3/2009. Res.
Economic Stimulus Plan (P.55/2009) (S.R.4/2009): response of the Minister for Treasury and Resources. Presented: 29th July 2009. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	S.R.4/2009. Res.
Co-ordination of Services for Vulnerable Children: Sub-Panel Review. Presented: 27th July 2009. <i>Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.6/2009.
Prison Board of Visitors. Presented: 18th August 2009. <i>Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.7/2009.

Air Quality Review: report of the Environment Scrutiny Panel (S.R.8/2008) – response of the Minister for Planning and Environment. S.R.8/2008.  
Presented: 28th July 2009. Res.  
*Minister for Planning and Environment.*

Air Quality Review: report of the Environment Scrutiny Panel (S.R.8/2008) – response of the Minister for Health and Social Services. S.R.8/2008.  
Presented: 20th August 2009. Res.(2)  
*Minister for Health and Social Services.*

Long-term care of the elderly (S.R.12/2008): response of the Minister for Social Security. S.R.12/2008.  
Presented: 21st July 2009. Res.(3)  
*Minister for Social Security.*

Urban Regeneration Review (S.R.15/2008): response of the Minister for Planning and Environment. S.R.15/2008.  
Presented: 28th July 2009. Res.  
*Minister for Planning and Environment.*

Public Accounts Committee: Review of the report of the Comptroller and Auditor General entitled: “Energy from waste plant: management of foreign currency exchange risks”. P.A.C.1/2009.  
Presented: 10th August 2009.  
*Public Accounts Committee.*

### Notification of lodged propositions

Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – second amendment. P.72/2009.  
Lodged: 28th July 2009. Amd.(2)  
*Connétable of St. Clement.* (re-issue)

Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – second amendment (P.72/2009 Amd.(2)) – amendment. P.72/2009.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009. Amd.(2)  
*Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier.* Amd.

Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – third amendment. P.72/2009.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009. Amd.(3)  
*Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier.*

Composition and election of the States: revised structure (P.72/2009) – fourth amendment. P.72/2009.  
Lodged: 4th September 2009. Amd.(4)  
*Deputy of St. Mary.*

States of Jersey Complaints Panel: appointment of members. P.116/2009.  
Lodged: 21st July 2009.  
*Privileges and Procedures Committee.*

Draft Annual Business Plan 2010. Lodged: 21st July 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.117/2009.
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): amendment. Lodged: 24th August 2009. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): amendment (P.117/2009 Amd.) – amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy S. Pitman of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.Amd.
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): second amendment. Lodged: 7th September 2009. <i>Senator A. Breckon.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(2)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): third amendment. Lodged: 7th September 2009. <i>Senator B.E. Shenton.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(3)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): fourth amendment. Lodged: 7th September 2009. <i>Senator S.C. Ferguson.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(4)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): fifth amendment. Lodged: 7th September 2009. <i>Deputy of Grouville.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(5)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): sixth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Senator A. Breckon.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(6)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): seventh amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Connétable of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(7)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): ninth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy J.B. Fox of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(9)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): tenth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy S. Pitman of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(10)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): eleventh amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(11)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): twelfth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Minister for Education, Sport and Culture.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(12)

Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): thirteenth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(13)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): sixteenth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(16)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): seventeenth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Mary.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(17)
Draft Annual Business Plan 2010 (P.117/2009): eighteenth amendment. Lodged: 8th September 2009. <i>Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade.</i>	P.117/2009. Amd.(18)
Rôle of the unelected members of the States: review – appointment of chairman and members. Lodged: 23rd July 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Martin.</i>	P.118/2009.
Wheel clamping: introduction of legislation. Lodged: 28th July 2009. <i>Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.</i>	P.119/2009.
Draft Gambling (2010 Fees) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. Lodged: 28th July 2009. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	P.120/2009.
Police Act 1997: extension of Part V to Jersey by Order in Council. Lodged: 29th July 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.121/2009.
Custody Visitor Scheme. Lodged: 3rd August 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Martin.</i>	P.122/2009.
Custody Visitor Scheme (P.122/2009): amendment. Lodged: 25th August 2009. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	P.122/2009. Amd.
Draft Marriage and Civil Status (Amendment No. 3) (Jersey) Law 200-. Lodged: 5th August 2009. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	P.123/2009.
Law Society Disciplinary Panel: appointment of lay member. Lodged: 7th August 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.124/2009.
Public Employees Contributory Retirement Scheme Committee of Management: membership. Lodged: 11th August 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.125/2009.



- Draft Public Employees (Contributory Retirement Scheme) (General) (Amendment No. 10) (Jersey) Regulations 200-.  
Lodged: 11th August 2009.  
*Chief Minister.* P.126/2009.
- Jersey Law Commission: re-appointment of Chairman and Commissioner.  
Lodged: 13th August 2009.  
*Chief Minister.* P.127/2009.
- Draft Road Traffic (No. 59) (Jersey) Regulations 200-.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.* P.128/2009.
- Jersey Police Complaints Authority: appointment of Chairman and members.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.* P.129/2009.
- Rental Deposit Scheme to protect tenants' deposits.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.* P.130/2009.
- Verita Investigation: extension to cover exclusion of Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist.  
Lodged: 18th August 2009.  
*Deputy of St. Martin.* P.131/2009.
- Draft Sex Offenders (Jersey) Law 200-.  
Lodged: 19th August 2009.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.* P.132/2009.
- Draft Amendment (No. 12) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey.  
Lodged: 19th August 2009.  
*Privileges and Procedures Committee.* P.133/2009.
- Draft Protection of Children (Cigarette Lighter Refill) (Jersey) Regulations 200-.  
Lodged: 24th August 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.* P.134/2009.
- Millennium Town Park: funding from the Stabilisation Fund.  
Lodged: 24th August 2009.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.* P.135/2009.
- Civil Partnerships.  
Lodged: 4th September 2009.  
*Chief Minister.* P.136/2009.
- Draft Companies (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Regulations 200-.  
Lodged: 4th September 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.* P.137/2009.
- Composition and election of the States: abolition of 6 Senatorial positions in 2011.  
Lodged: 7th September 2009.  
*Deputy A.E. Jeune of St. Brelade.* P.138/2009.

- Draft Gambling Commission (Jersey) Law 200-. P.139/2009.  
Lodged: 8th September 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.*
- Draft Gambling (Gaming and Lotteries) (Amendment No. 15) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.140/2009.  
Lodged: 8th September 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.*
- Draft Gambling (2010 Fees) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.141/2009.  
Lodged: 8th September 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.*
- Vote of No Confidence: States Employment Board. P.142/2009.  
Lodged: 8th September 2009.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

### **Withdrawal of lodged propositions**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

- Ann Court Site, St. Helier: use for sheltered social housing for the over-55s. P.43/2009.  
Lodged: 27th March 2009.  
*Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier.*
- Draft Gambling (2010 Fees) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.120/2009.  
Lodged: 28th July 2009.  
*Minister for Economic Development.*

### **Written Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the re-fit of the fisheries vessel the Norman Le Brocq.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the completion dates of works undertaken at Les Charrières de Bonne Nuit.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the funding of the Energy from Waste Plant and the pre-purchase of Euros.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the settlement of accounts by Harcourt.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the compensation payments to Alternate Insurance Services Limited investors.

The Chairman of the Comité des Connétables tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the rôle of parish assemblies in the democratic life of the Island.

The Minister for Planning and Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding conditions imposed on developers and contractors when granting planning permission for the Castle Quays development.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy A.E. Jeune of St. Brelade regarding nurses and midwives employed by Health and Social Services.

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator B.E. Shenton regarding the detailed breakdown of grades at 'A' level by Hautlieu students.

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator B.E. Shenton regarding the detailed breakdown of G.C.S.E grades by students in the non fee paying sector.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the tipping of inert waste at La Collette.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the overspend on the incinerator to date.

The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour regarding the annual cost of imprisoning an inmate at H.M.P. La Moye and the cost of security for an overnight hospital stay for an inmate.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour regarding the savings measures proposed before the summer recess.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Martin regarding the Verita investigation and issues relating to the Locum Consultant Gynaecologist.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Martin regarding the Verita investigation and issues relating to a Senior Consultant Gynaecologist.

### **Oral Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

Deputy J.A. Hilton of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the criteria for a Secure Accommodation Order for young people in the care of the Children's Service.

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the administration of Woolworths Jersey.

Deputy T.A. Vallois of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Housing regarding the rise of housing rentals by 2.5% as of October 2009.

Deputy A.K.F. Green of St. Helier asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the Customer Services Department.

Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the introduction of a zero tolerance approach to drink driving.

The Deputy of St. John asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the Computer Services Department's ability to provide 24 hour technological support in the event of a system breakdown.

Deputy A.E. Jeune of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture regarding the number of Jersey students pursuing a nursing diploma or degree.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the compatibility of the new Jersey Post scheme (Ship2Me) with the 'Think Twice Buy Local' policy.

The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the impartiality of the Verita enquiry.

Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture regarding the adequacy of the pool facilities in Jersey for the 2015 Island Games.

The Deputy of Grouville asked a question of the Minister for Transport and Technical Services regarding the involvement of Connex in unscheduled services that would otherwise be undertaken by private coach companies.

Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier asked a question of the Chairman of the Comité des Connétables regarding the use of Honorary Police to support the States of Jersey Police.

The Deputy of Grouville asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding proposals to introduce the U.K. National Lottery to Jersey.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the role of back-benchers in formulating policy with respect to external affairs.

The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the review of suspensions in line with P.98/2009 approved by the States on 1st July 2009.

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the President of the Chairmen's Committee regarding the notice requirement for 'unaccredited media' to film a Scrutiny hearing.

Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the introduction of a low cost formal identity card for young people to carry when entering licenced premises.

### **Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for Health and Social Services answered questions without notice from members.

### **Arrangement of Public Business for the present meeting**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Deputy of St. Mary that consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee entitled 'Composition and election of the States: revised structure' (P.72/2009) be deferred from the present meeting until 6th October 2009.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D. De Sousa (H)

**CONTRE: 35**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.D. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Deputy of St. Mary, in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of his amendment to P.72/2009 ('Composition and election of the States: revised structure – fourth amendment' lodged 'au Greffe' on 4th September 2009).

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Helier

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy of St. Martin	Senator F.E. Cohen
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	Senator J.L. Perchard
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)	Senator S.C. Ferguson
Deputy S. Pitman (H)	Senator A.J.D. Maclean
Deputy M. Tadier (B)	Senator B.I. Le Marquand
Deputy of St. Mary	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)	Connétable of Trinity
Deputy D. De Sousa (H)	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Connétable of St. Brelade
	Connétable of St. Martin
	Connétable of St. John
	Connétable of St. Saviour
	Connétable of St. Clement
	Connétable of St. Peter
	Connétable of St. Lawrence
	Connétable of St. Mary
	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
	Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
	Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
	Deputy of St. Ouen
	Deputy of St. Peter
	Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
	Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

THE STATES, in accordance with Standing Order 32, agreed that the following propositions would be considered by the States at the present meeting –

States of Jersey Complaints Panel: appointment of members. Lodged: 21st July 2009. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	P.116/2009.
Rôle of the unelected members of the States: review – appointment of chairman and members. Lodged: 23rd July 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Martin.</i>	P.118/2009.
Rôle of the unelected members of the States: review – appointment of chairman and members (P.118/2009) – comments. Presented: 4th September 2009. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.118/2009. Com.
Police Act 1997: extension of Part V to Jersey by Order in Council. Lodged: 29th July 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i> (Cannot be debated until 9th September 2009)	P.121/2009.

Custody Visitor Scheme. Lodged: 3rd August 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Martin.</i>	P.122/2009.
Custody Visitor Scheme (P.122/2009): amendment. Lodged: 25th August 2009. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	P.122/2009. Amd.
Law Society Disciplinary Panel: appointment of lay member. Lodged: 7th August 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.124/2009.
Public Employees Contributory Retirement Scheme Committee of Management: membership. Lodged: 11th August 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.125/2009.
Jersey Law Commission: re-appointment of Chairman and Commissioner. Lodged: 13th August 2009. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.127/2009.
Verita Investigation: extension to cover exclusion of Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist. Lodged: 18th August 2009. <i>Deputy of St. Martin.</i>	P.131/2009.

#### **Electricity tariffs: Regulations under Article 22 of the Electricity (Jersey) Law 1937 P.41/2009**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Senator Alan Breckon to request the Minister for Economic Development to exercise his powers under Article 35 of the Electricity (Jersey) Law 1937 to safeguard the public interest by bringing forward for approval without delay Regulations under Article 22 of the Law to determine the tariffs to be made by the Jersey Electricity Company in respect of electricity which it supplied at rates which were at a reduction of 20% reduction from the present tariffs, with the reduction to take effect no later than 1st October 2009 and with no further increase in tariffs during 2010.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 8**

Senator S. Syvret  
Senator A. Breckon  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy D. De Sousa (H)

#### **CONTRE: 38**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.D. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Connétable of St. Ouen

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(a), Deputy Anne Teresa Dupré of St. Clement declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

#### **Composition and election of the States: revised structure P.72/2009**

THE STATES, having commenced consideration of a proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee concerning revisions to the composition and election of the States, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Clement and rejected an amendment to that by Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier that in amendment 1 for the words “49 members” there should be substituted the words “47 members” and in amendment 2 after the words “fewer than two Deputies” there should be inserted the words “with the 47 Deputies being allocated across the Parishes according to a system of representative to population ratio as set out in Table A on page 6 of the Report of Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier dated 18th August 2009”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 15**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator A. Breckon

#### **CONTRE: 30**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**



Connétable of St. Helier	Senator S.C. Ferguson
Connétable of St. Brelade	Senator B.I. Le Marquand
Connétable of St. Clement	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy of St. Martin	Connétable of Trinity
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)	Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy M. Tadier (B)	Connétable of St. John
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)	Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)	Connétable of St. Peter
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)	Connétable of St. Lawrence
Deputy D. De Sousa (H)	Connétable of St. Mary
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
	Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
	Deputy of St. Ouen
	Deputy of Grouville
	Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
	Deputy S. Pitman (H)
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
	Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
	Deputy of St. Mary
	Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

Following the rejection of the amendment proposed by Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier to the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, the Bailiff informed the Assembly that the third amendment of Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier that in paragraph (b) for the words “49 members” there should be substituted the words “47 members”, was deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the amendment of the Connétable of St. Clement that in paragraph (a), for sub-paragraphs (i) and (ii), there should be substituted the words “49 Members to be known as Deputies, elected by reference to the Parishes, some of which will be divided into districts” and a consequential amendment made in paragraph (d)(i) of the proposition by the deletion of the words “6 large”.

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 9th September 2009 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee entitled ‘Composition and election of the States: revised structure’ (P.72/2009) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.30 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*