



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
21st June 2011, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Lieutenant-General Sir Andrew Ridgway, K.B.E., C.B.  
was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur – absent on States business (arrived in the Chamber at 2.15 p.m.)  
Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.)  
Connétable Kenneth Priaulx Vibert of St. Ouen – excused attendance  
Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.)  
Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 11.50 a.m.)  
Deputy Anne Enid Pryke of Trinity – excused attendance  
Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade – excused attendance  
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.20 a.m.)  
Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.20 a.m.)

---

Prayers read by the Greffier of the States

---

### **H.M. The Queen's Birthday Honours List – congratulations**

The Bailiff, on behalf of all Members, congratulated His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor, Lieutenant-General Sir Andrew Ridgway, K.B.E., C.B., on the knighthood recently conferred upon him in H.M. The Queen's Birthday Honours List.

### **Documents presented or laid**

Valerie Band House: therapeutic workshop (P.80/2011) – comments. P.80/2011.  
Presented: 21st June 2011. Com.(2)  
*Council of Ministers.*

Jersey Appointments Commission: Annual Report for 2010. R.75/2011.  
Presented: 21st June 2011.  
*Chief Minister.*

### **Notification of lodged propositions**

Draft Control of Housing and Work (Jersey) Law 201- (P.37/2011): second amendment. P.37/2011.  
Lodged: 21st June 2011. Amd.(2)  
*Chief Minister.*

Draft Register of Names and Addresses (Jersey) Law 201- (P.38/2011): second amendment. P.38/2011.  
Amd.(2)  
Lodged: 21st June 2011.  
*Chief Minister.*

Discrimination Law and delay on pension reform. P.118/2011.  
Lodged: 21st June 2011.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

### **Withdrawal of lodged propositions**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011): thirtieth amendment. P.48/2011.  
Lodged: 26th April 2011. Amd.(30)  
*Senator T.J. Le Main.*

Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011): thirty-eighth amendment. P.48/2011.  
(paragraphs (1), (4) and (6)) Amd.(38)  
Lodged: 26th April 2011.  
*Connétable of St. Helier.*

### **Island Plan 2011: approval P.48/2011**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment concerning the approval of the Island Plan 2011 (P.48/2011).

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Mary (Amendment (34)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in the Introduction, on page xvii, after the words “For the avoidance of doubt, the following development plans and frameworks are superseded by the new Island Plan:” there should be deleted the words “1. St. Mary’s Village Development Plan (1994)” and the list renumbered accordingly.”.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (39)), agreed that, after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that after the heading “Relationship with other plans and documents” (page 24) there should be inserted the following paragraph:

#### **‘Law**

1.3 The Island Plan is prepared under the auspices of the Planning and Building (Jersey) Law. It is the intention of this law to ensure that ‘when land is developed, the development is in accordance with a development plan that provides for the orderly, comprehensive and sustainable development of land in a manner that best serves the interests of the community’. In developing the Island Plan, specific regard has been made to all of the relevant purposes of the law<sup>(1)</sup>.

(1) **Purposes of Law**

- (1) The purpose of this Law is to conserve, protect and improve Jersey's natural beauty, natural resources and general amenities, its character, and its physical and natural environments.
- (2) Accordingly it is the intention of this Law –
- (a) to ensure that when land is developed the development is in accordance with a development plan that provides for the orderly, comprehensive and sustainable development of land in a manner that best serves the interests of the community;
  - (b) to protect sites, buildings, structures, trees and places that have a special importance or value to Jersey;
  - (c) to provide for the orderly management of transport and travel, both on, and from and to Jersey;
  - (d) to ensure that the coast of Jersey is kept in its natural state;
  - (e) to control advertisements in Jersey; and
  - (f) to impose other necessary controls on the development and use of land in Jersey.
- (3) In paragraph (1) the reference to –
- (a) the natural resources of Jersey includes its biodiversity; and
  - (b) the natural environment of Jersey includes the natural environment around Jersey.
- (4) It is also the purpose of this Law to secure the health, safety and welfare of people in or about buildings by establishing functional requirements in respect of buildings and ensuring that buildings comply with those requirements.';

and all subsequent paragraphs and footnotes re-numbered accordingly.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier (Amendment (32)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in the Island Plan Strategic Policy Framework (page 33) relating to the Town of St. Helier, at the end of paragraph 2.22, after the words ‘its public realm and infrastructure.’ there should be inserted the words ‘In particular, it is imperative that to create an acceptable urban living environment in the Town, adequate provision of good quality and accessible public open space must be planned for and made.’ ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 42**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton

Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of Deputy John Benjamin Fox of St. Helier (Amendment (3)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy GD 1, General development considerations (on pages 54–55), paragraph 3.d, after the words ‘in accordance with the principles of safety by design,’ there should be inserted the words ‘by way of a crime impact statement if required,’; and in Policy GD 7, Design quality (on pages 66–67), paragraph 7, after the words ‘in accord with the principles of safety by design,’ there should be inserted the words ‘by way of a crime impact statement if required,’.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 42**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 2**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard

**ABSTAIN:**

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (44)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy GD1 – General development considerations (page 54) after the words ‘and other service infrastructure.’ at para. 1. d.’ there should be inserted a new paragraph as follows –

‘e. it improves facilities for the storage and collection of refuse, including recyclables (in accord with WM5)’ ”.

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38)) and, adopting an amendment to that amendment by the Deputy of St. Mary (Amd.(38) Paragraph 1), agreed that after the word “parking” there should be inserted the words –

“(bearing in mind the potential for reducing the need for car ownership by the creation of car pooling schemes and other methods)”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 39**

**CONTRE: 3**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38)), as amended, agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy GD3 – Density of Development (page 59), after the words ‘commensurate with good design’ there should be inserted the words ‘, adequate amenity space and parking (bearing in mind the potential for reducing the need for car ownership by the creation of car pooling schemes and other methods)’ ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 41****CONTRE: 2****ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)

Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Peter

Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence (Amendment (37) Paragraph 1), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that –

- (a) in paragraph 1.22 (page 60) for the words ‘Supplementary planning guidance will be used to provide further information about the use and arrangements for planning obligation agreements’ there be substituted the words ‘Supplementary planning guidance will be updated and used to provide further information about the use and arrangements for planning obligation agreements, and shall, in particular, indicate by what point in the life of a development (in the normal course of events) planning gain should be provided, depending upon the nature of such gain. Once the supplementary guidance has been updated, the Minister will inform the States Assembly of any new proposals by way of a report.’;
- (b) in Policy GD4 – Planning Obligations (page 61) after the last paragraph there should be inserted a new paragraph as follows –

‘The Minister will update and publish guidance in relation to planning gain and planning obligation agreements, and such guidance shall, in particular, indicate by what point in the life of a development (in the normal course of events) planning gain should be provided, depending upon the nature of such gain.’ ”.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38), Paragraph 3), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy GD4 – Planning obligations (page 61), in the second paragraph, after the word, ‘including’ there should be inserted the words ‘the provision of amenity space, public parking,’ ”.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (46)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy GD9 – Signs and advertisements (page 69) in paragraph 1.52, after the words ‘road traffic sign or navigational equipment’ there should be inserted a new paragraph, as follows –



‘Official signage displayed in relation to transport infrastructure, including pedestrian and cycle routes and facilities, is generally classed as a form of approved advertisement which does not require permission. Where new pedestrian and cycle transport infrastructure is provided, whether it is on-road; off-road; urban; or rural, the Minister for Planning and Environment would expect to work closely with the highway authorities to ensure that the need for the public awareness and promotion of new facilities; the safety of all road users; and the quality and impact of signage on the character of the area, were taken into account, in accord with the spirit of this policy.’ ”;

and the subsequent paragraphs renumbered, as necessary.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 36**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (a) of an amendment of Senator Francis Du Heaume Le Gresley (Amendment (9)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Plan be amended to include the following areas as part of the Coastal National Park –

- (a) Mourier Valley, and after the words ‘D4: North Coast Valleys’ on page 92 there should be inserted ‘[including Mourier Valley]’ as shown on the attached plan (Appendix 1);”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 41**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 9**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. John

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (b) of an amendment of Senator Francis Du Heaume Le Gresley (Amendment (9)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Plan be amended to include the following areas as part of the Coastal National Park –

- (b) La Commune de Gouray, and after the words ‘B5: St. Ouen’s Bay Coastal Plain’ on page 91 there should be added, as a separate bullet point, as shown on the attached plan (Appendix 2):

‘La Commune de Gouray: The dunes at La Commune de Gouray, which form part of the Grouville Coastal Plain character area (B1), are a remnant of the historic landscape of this area and provide an important open break in the coastline. They are also valuable in terms of biodiversity, particularly for birds.

- La Commune de Gouray (part of B1: Grouville Coastal Plain)’ ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 26**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**CONTRE: 23**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator F.E. Cohen

THE STATES rejected paragraph (c) of an amendment of Senator Francis Du Heaume Le Gresley (Amendment (9)), that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Plan be amended to include the following areas as part of the Coastal National Park –

- (c) Site of former Plémont Holiday Village, and after the words ‘D5: St. Martin’s Valleys’ on page 92 add, as a separate bullet point:

‘Site of former Plémont Holiday Village

- Site of former Plémont Holiday Village (part of E1: north west headland’ as shown on attached plan (Appendix 3);’ ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 23**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**CONTRE: 25**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 2**

Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Connétable of Trinity

THE STATES rejected paragraph (d) of an amendment of Senator Francis Du Heaume Le Gresley (Amendment (9)), that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Plan be amended to include the following areas as part of the Coastal National Park –

- (d) North Coast interior agricultural land, and after the words ‘D5: St. Martin’s Valleys’ on page 92 there should be added, as a separate bullet point, as shown on the attached plan (Appendix 4):

‘North Coast interior agricultural land: The essential character of this area is created by the contrast between the intricate patchwork of small fields, with the wilderness of the rugged north coast cliffs, heathland and sea. The views of sky and sea and enhanced ‘light’, the treeless windswept landscape and the distinctive boundary features plus a sense of remoteness all contribute to its special identity.

- E4: North Coast interior agricultural land’ ”;

and to consequentially amend Map 2.4: Coastal National Park on page 93, accordingly.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 6**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 43**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator F.E. Cohen

Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen, Deputy Roy George Le Hérissier of St. Saviour and the Deputy of St. Mary, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(b), declared an interest not being of a direct financial nature, and remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

### Changes in Presidency

The Bailiff briefly retired from the Chair during consideration of the amendment of Senator Francis Du Heaume Le Gresley (Amendment (9)) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States until his return.

### Island Plan 2011: approval P.48/2011

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment (23)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Plan be amended to include the following area as part of the Coastal National Park –

‘Wolf’s Caves car park and former cafe/bar, and after the words ‘D5: St. Martin’s Valleys’ on page 92 add, as a separate bullet point ‘Wolf’s Caves car park and former cafe/bar’ as shown on the plan at the Appendix’ ”;

and to consequentially amend Map 2.4: Coastal National Park on page 93, accordingly.

Members present voted as follows –

#### POUR: 22

Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)

#### CONTRE: 16

Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

#### ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Following the withdrawal of the amendment of Senator Terence John Le Main (Amendment (30)) the Bailiff informed the Assembly that an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment (30)) was deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38) Paragraph 5), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy NE8 – Access and awareness (page 105) after the words, ‘coast and countryside’ there should be inserted the words ‘, and which assist in the provision of the Island’s provision of off-road walking and cycling routes,’ ”.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (49)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

- (a) “except that in the section relating to Listed buildings and places, paragraph 3.18 (page 112), after the words ‘front elevation of the main building’ there should be inserted the following words –

“Listed buildings and places do not enjoy the same permitted development rights of other properties, as a consequence of the need for the greater regulation of change to historic fabric. To ensure that the owners of these properties are not treated unfairly and required to pay fees for works which would otherwise be deemed to exempt from planning control, the Minister for Planning and Environment will amend the planning fee schedule, which is regulated by Order.”; and

- (b) except that after paragraph 3.18 (page 112) there should be inserted the following proposal –

**‘Proposal 7: Listed buildings and permitted development**

The Minister for Planning and Environment will amend the Planning and Building (Fees) (Jersey) Order to ensure that planning applications in respect of listed buildings or places will be exempt from planning fees to the extent that such fees would not have been payable were the building or place not listed.’ ”;

and the subsequent proposals renumbered as necessary.”

Deputy Jacqueline Ann Hilton of St. Helier, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(b), declared an interest not being of a direct financial nature, but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

Following the withdrawal of paragraph 6 of the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38), Paragraph 6), the Bailiff informed the Assembly that an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment (38), Paragraph 6 Amendment) was deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (Amendment (38), Paragraphs 7 to 9), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that –

- (a) “in Objective BE2 – Regeneration of St. Helier objectives (pages 128–129), after paragraph 5 there should be inserted a new paragraph as follows –

‘Promote and enable access to the countryside for the residents of St. Helier through the creation of a St. Helier Country Park’;

- (b) in Proposal 9: Public Realm Strategy (page 135) after the words ‘of St. Helier’s public realm.’ there should be inserted a fifth bullet point as follows –

‘Consult upon and develop the proposal to designate a St. Helier Country Park in the countryside immediately to the north of the Town as shown on the Map attached at Appendix 1’ ”.

After the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Objective BE2 – Regeneration of St. Helier objectives (pages 128–129) for paragraph 8 substitute the following paragraph –

- ‘8. Create a ‘walkable’ and ‘cyclable’ town – with a permanent and continuous network of safe and continuous routes for pedestrians and cyclists to help promote modal change in transport choices;’ ”.

After the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that in Policy BE1 – Town centre vitality (pages 136–137) –

- (a) after paragraph 6 there should be inserted new paragraphs as follows –

‘7. support the provision of improved cycling and public transport links serving the Core Retail Area;

8. support the provision of adequate off-street parking for shoppers and visitors to the Core Retail Area;’ ”.

and the following paragraphs renumbered accordingly;

- (b) in paragraph 7(d) (as originally numbered) after the word ‘pedestrians’ there should be inserted the words ‘and cyclists;’ ”.



**POUR: 44**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 3**

Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 22nd June 2011 to continue consideration of the Island Plan 2011 – approval (P.48/2011) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.37 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*