



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday
7th November 2012, at 09.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Sir Michael Birt.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sir Philip Bailhache – absent on States business
Connétable Stephen William Pallett of St. Brelade – ill
Deputy Anne Enid Pryke of Trinity – excused (arrived in the Chamber at 10.03 a.m.)
Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier – ill

Prayers

Dr. Jonathan Renouf – welcome

The Bailiff, on behalf of all Members, welcomed Dr. Jonathan Renouf, a member of the Electoral Commission, who was present in the public gallery.

Documents presented or laid

Old Age Pension: increase for 2012 (P.97/2012) – comments. P.97/2012.
Presented: 7th November 2012. Com.
Minister for Social Security.

Fiscal Policy Panel Annual Report 2012: response of the Minister for Treasury and R.137/2012.
Resources.
Presented: 7th November 2012.
Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Medium Term Financial Plan 2013 – 2015 P.69/2012

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Medium Term Financial Plan 2013 – 2015’ (P.69/2012) and rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 5) that in paragraph (b) after the words “as set out in Summary Table A” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the total amount of States net revenue expenditure shall be increased by £10,700,000 in 2013, £8,700,000 in 2014 and £8,700,000 in 2015 to provide additional funding for public sector pay awards”.

and in paragraph (c)(ii) after the words “as set out in Summary Table C” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the allocation for Contingency (Pay Provision) shall be increased by £10,700,000 in 2013, £8,700,000 in 2014 and £8,700,000 in 2015 to provide additional funding for public sector pay awards”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 5

Connétable of St. John
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

CONTRE: 41

Senator P.F. Routier
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator S.C. Ferguson
Senator A.J.H. Maclean
Senator B.I. Le Marquand
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
Senator I.J. Gorst
Senator L.J. Farnham
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Mary
Connétable of St. Ouen
Connétable of St. Martin
Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy J.P.G. Baker (H)
Deputy J.H. Young (B)
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

ABSTAIN: 2

Senator A. Breckon
Connétable of St. Lawrence

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(c), Senator Alan Breckon, Deputy Robert Charles Duhamel of St. Saviour, Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade and Deputy Roderick Gordon Bryans of St. Helier declared an interest, but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 5).

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (Amendment 9) that in paragraph (c)(i) after the “Summary Table B” there should be inserted the words –

“except that for the financial years 2014 and 2015 the net revenue expenditure of the States funded bodies listed in the table below shall be decreased by the amounts shown.

Ministerial Departments	2014	2015
	£’000	£’000
Chief Minister	1,700	1,670
Economic Development	350	350
Education, Sport and Culture	1,490	2,260
Home Affairs	250	250
Social Security	900	1,200
Transport and Technical Services	1,000	2,000

and that after sub-paragraph (c)(iii) there should be inserted a new sub-paragraph (c)(iv) as follows –

“(iv) the amounts of £5,690,000 and £7,730,000 that, in the budgets for 2014 and 2015 respectively, may be appropriated to growth expenditure.”.

THE STATES, in accordance with Standing Order 80A(2)(b), agreed to debate the Chief Minister’s amendment to the amendment to the amendment which had been lodged less than 7 days before the debate.

THE STATES adopted Part 1 of an amendment of the Chief Minister (Amendment 9)(Amendment) (Amendment) to the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel that in the table in the amendment to the amendment the sum “£2,000,000” in the substituted table in the column headed “2015” in the line “Transport and Technical Services” should be deleted.

THE STATES adopted Part 2 of an amendment of the Chief Minister (Amendment 9)(Amendment) (Amendment) to the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel that in the amendment to the amendment for the amount “£3,460,000” there should be substituted the amount “£1,460,000”.

THE STATES, adopting Part 1 of an amendment of the Chief Minister (Amendment 9)(Amendment) (as amended) to the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, agreed that for the table in the amendment there should be substituted the following table –

Ministerial Departments	2014 £'000	2015 £'000
Chief Minister	410	410
Home Affairs	50	50
Social Security	750	1,000
Transport and Technical Services	1,000	0

THE STATES, adopting Part 2 of an amendment of the Chief Minister (Amendment 9)(Amendment) (as amended) to the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, agreed that in the inserted new sub-paragraph (c)(iv) for the amount “£5,690,000” there should be substituted the amount “£2,210,000” and for the amount “£7,730,000” there should be substituted the amount “£1,460,000”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 33

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy J.P.G. Baker (H)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
 Deputy of St. Peter

CONTRE: 11

Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Connétable of Grouville
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (Amendment 9) (as amended), agreed that in paragraph (c)(i) after the “Summary Table B” there should be inserted the words –

“except that for the financial years 2014 and 2015 the net revenue expenditure of the States funded bodies listed in the table below shall be decreased by the amounts shown.

Ministerial Departments	2014 £'000	2015 £'000
Chief Minister	410	410
Home Affairs	50	50
Social Security	750	1,000
Transport and Technical Services	1,000	0

and that after sub-paragraph (c)(iii) there should be inserted a new sub-paragraph (c)(iv) as follows –

“(iv) the amounts of £2,210,000 and £1,460,000 that, in the budgets for 2014 and 2015 respectively, may be appropriated to growth expenditure.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 37

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

CONTRE: 6

Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy of St. Peter

ABSTAIN:

Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy J.P.G. Baker (H)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)

THE STATES rejected Part 1 of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment) that in paragraph (c)(i) after the words “Summary Table B” there should be inserted the words “except that the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department shall be increased by £350,000 in 2013, £100,000 in 2014 and £100,000 in 2015 to provide funding for the Sustainable Transport Policy and the net revenue expenditure of the Economic Development Department shall be decreased by £350,000 in 2013, £100,000 in 2014 and £100,000 in 2015 by reducing the grant to Jersey Finance Ltd.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 5

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

CONTRE: 37

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
 Deputy of St. Peter

THE STATES rejected Part 2 of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment) that in paragraph (c)(i) after the words “Summary Table B” there should be inserted the words “except that the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department shall be increased by £600,000 in 2013, £600,000 in 2014 and £600,000 in 2015 to provide funding for the town ‘Hoppa’ bus service and the net revenue expenditure of the Economic Development Department shall be decreased by £600,000 in 2013, £600,000 in 2014 and £600,000 in 2015 by reducing the grant to Jersey Finance Ltd.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 7

Senator A. Breckon
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

CONTRE: 35

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy J.H. Young (B)
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
Deputy of St. Peter

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(c), the Connétable of St. Clement declared an interest but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment).

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence (Amendment 8) that in paragraph (c)(iii) the words “, with £8,500,000 of the 2013 allocation, £4,743,000 of the 2014 allocation and £1,757,000 of the 2015 allocation, dependent upon the approval by the States of the redemption of the States’ 9% Preference Shares in the JT Group Ltd. as set out in paragraph (f)” should be deleted and that for paragraph (f) there should be substituted the following paragraph –

“(f) to request the Corporate Services scrutiny panel to undertake a review of the proposal to dispose by way of redemption of the States 9% Preference Shares in the JT Group Ltd. for a redemption value of £20 million.”.

Changes in Presidency

The Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment) to the ‘Medium Term Financial Plan 2013 – 2015’ (P.69/2012) and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States.

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 8th November 2012 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Medium Term Financial Plan 2013 – 2015’ (P.69/2012) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.27 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States