



**THE STATES assembled on Monday  
25th November 2019, at 2.30 p.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,  
C.C.M.I. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – absent on States business  
Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – absent on States business  
Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade – excused attendance  
Deputy Mary Rose Le Hegarat of St. Helier – absent on States business

---

Prayers

---

### **Domestic Abuse Awareness Campaign**

The Bailiff informed the Assembly that a domestic abuse awareness campaign had been launched that day by the Jersey Safeguarding Partnership Board and that purple ribbons had been distributed for Members to wear in order to show support for that campaign.

### **Reading out of written questions – ruling by the Bailiff**

The Bailiff advised the Assembly of the following ruling which he had made in respect of the reading out of written questions –

“I have received suggestions that it would be more efficient not to read out the list of written questions when we go through the early part of the Order Paper. At my request, the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee has consulted Members and, of those who responded, 38 were in favour of not reading out the list of written questions. This is not a matter provided for expressly by Standing Orders and accordingly it is a matter within the discretion of the Presiding Officer and so I will not read out the questions on this occasion. Having taken that decision, it is open, of course, to review subsequently should Members urge upon me a different course. But it might be appropriate to see where that takes us at the present time.”

### **Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Employment (Minimum Wage) (Amendment No. 13) (Jersey) Order 2019.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

R&O.127/2019.

**Documents presented**

Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): third amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(3)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(3) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): fourth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(4)) – addendum. Presented: 20th November 2019. <i>Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(4) Add.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): fourth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(4)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(4) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): sixth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(6)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(6) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): seventh amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(7)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(7) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eighth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(8)) – comments. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(8) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)Amd.) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – second amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)Amd.(2)) – comments. Presented: 21st November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.(2) Com.

Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): tenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)) – addendum. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(10) Add.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): tenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(10) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): tenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)) – amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)Amd.) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(10) Amd.Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eleventh amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(11)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(11) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twelfth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(12)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(12) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): thirteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(13)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(13) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): fourteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(14)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(14) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): fifteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(15)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(15) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): sixteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(16)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(16) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): sixteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(16)) – amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(16)Amd.) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(16) Amd.Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): seventeenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(17)) – addendum. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(17) Add.

Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): seventeenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(17)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(17) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eighteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(18)) – comments. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(18) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): nineteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(19)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(19) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twentieth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(20)) – addendum. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(20) Add.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twentieth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(20)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(20) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twenty-first amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(21)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(21) Com.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twenty-third amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(23)) – comments. Presented: 22nd November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(23) Com.
States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – complaint by Ms. A. McGinley against the Minister for the Environment regarding the enforcement of planning conditions by the Planning Department (R.99/2019) – response of the Minister for the Environment. Presented: 18th November 2019. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	R.99/2019. Res.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Minister for Treasury and Resources – revised delegations November 2019. Presented: 18th November 2019. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.142/2019.
Review of access to social housing in Jersey: Ministerial response. Presented: 25th November 2019. <i>Minister for Children and Housing.</i>	R.143/2019.
Population and Migration. Presented: 15th November 2019. <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.14/2019.

**Notification of lodged propositions**

Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): second amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(2)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(2) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): fifth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(5)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(5) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eighth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(8)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(8) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – amendment. Lodged: 15th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – second amendment. Lodged: 15th November 2019. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.(2)
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – second amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)Amd.(2)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.(2) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): ninth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(9)) – third amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(9) Amd.(3)
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): tenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(10) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eleventh amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(11)) – amendment. Lodged: 15th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(11) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eleventh amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(11)) – second amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(11) Amd.(2)
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): sixteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(16)) – amendment. Lodged: 13th November 2019. <i>Senator S.Y. Mézec.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(16) Amd.

Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): eighteenth amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(18)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(18) Amd.
Government Plan 2020–2023 (P.71/2019): twenty-third amendment. Lodged: 13th November 2019. <i>Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour.</i>	P.71/2019. Amd.(23)
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 11) (Jersey) Regulations 201-(P.110/2019): second amendment. Lodged: 18th November 2019. <i>Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier.</i>	P.110/2019. Amd.(2) (re-issue)
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 11) (Jersey) Regulations 201-(P.110/2019): second amendment (P.110/2019 Amd.(2)) – amendment. Lodged: 19th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.110/2019. Amd.(2) Amd.
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 11) (Jersey) Regulations 201-(P.110/2019): second amendment (P.110/2019 Amd.(2)) – second amendment. Lodged: 20th November 2019. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.110/2019. Amd.(2) Amd.(2)
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 11) (Jersey) Regulations 201-(P.110/2019): second amendment (P.110/2019 Amd.(2)) – second amendment (P.110/2019 Amd.(2)Amd.(2)) – amendment. Lodged: 20th November 2019. <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.</i>	P.110/2019. Amd.(2) Amd.(2) Amd.
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 11) (Jersey) Regulations 201-(P.110/2019): third amendment. Lodged: 18th November 2019. <i>Senator S.Y. Mézec.</i>	P.110/2019. Amd.(3)
Jersey Police Complaints Authority: re-appointment of members. Lodged: 12th November 2019. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	P.117/2019.
Diversity Working Group. Lodged: 15th November 2019. <i>Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour.</i>	P.118/2019.
Personal Tax Reforms. Lodged: 22nd November 2019. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	P.119/2019.

**Written Questions***(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- WQ.512/2019** 1. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the protection of cats involved in road traffic accidents.
- WQ.513/2019** 2. The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Lawrence regarding a review of the seven departments comprising the Department of Justice and Home Affairs.
- WQ.514/2019** 3. The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Lawrence regarding the review of Jersey's Prison and Probation Services.
- WQ.517/2019** 4. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat of St. Helier regarding the salary level of the Chief Executive Officer of Andium Homes.
- WQ.518/2019** 5. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the professionals employed in the Child Development Centre.
- WQ.519/2019** 6. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding sites identified for development by Jersey Property Holdings and Andium Homes.
- WQ.520/2019** 7. H.M. Attorney General tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the delays in court proceedings in cases involving children.
- WQ.521/2019** 8. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the appointment of social workers.
- WQ.522/2019** 9. The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the composition of Policy Development Boards.
- WQ.523/2019** 10. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding risk-management training in the public sector.
- WQ.524/2019** 11. H.M. Attorney General tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator S.C. Ferguson regarding the removal of organs from deceased people.
- WQ.525/2019** 12. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding tobacco duty.
- WQ.526/2019** 13. The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the introduction of a Domestic Abuse Law in Jersey.
- WQ.527/2019** 14. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding the location of a branch library at Les Quennevais.
- WQ.528/2019** 15. The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator K.L. Moore regarding the breakdown of centrally-held funding for efficiencies.
- WQ.529/2019** 16. The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator K.L. Moore regarding the generation of savings through the Target Operating Models.
- WQ.530/2019** 17. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding 'lock-up and leave' properties developed by the States of Jersey Development Company.

- WQ.531/2019** 18. The Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the reinstatement of the position of Cultural Development Officer.
- WQ.532/2019** 19. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy S.M. Ahier of St. Helier regarding Impôt receipts.

### **Oral Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- OQ.286/2019** 1. Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture regarding the Jersey Aircraft Registry.
- OQ.292/2019** 2. Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding patients occupying nursing beds in private sector care homes that were funded by the Minister's Department.
- OQ.285/2019** 3. The Connétable of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the decision not to have a Deputy Chief Fire Officer.
- OQ.287/2019** 4. Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the heating bills issued by Andium Homes to its tenants.
- OQ.294/2019** 5. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the development of a model to support access to, and the affordability of, primary care for financially vulnerable individuals.
- OQ.288/2019** 6. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the safety of the Island's bus shelters.
- OQ.289/2019** 7. Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding recently recorded increases in private sector rental prices.
- OQ.295/2019** 8. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding information provided in the 'Government Plan 2020–2023' (P.71/2019) about additional expenditure to improve Islanders' wellbeing and health.
- OQ.290/2019** 9. Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour asked a question of the Assistant Chief Minister regarding immigration policy in relation to the hospitality, agriculture and retail sectors.
- OQ.291/2019** 10. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Education regarding the workload and marking policy agreed for use in the Island's schools.
- OQ.293/2019** 11. Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the structure and effectiveness of taxi and cab services in Jersey.

### **Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Children and Housing answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.



**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Tuesday 26th November 2019 in order to consider the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019) and other items of public business listed for consideration at the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.01 p.m.

**DR. M. EGAN**

*Greffier of the States*