



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday  
2nd December 2020, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – excused attendance (joined at 10.38 a.m.)  
Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré – excused attendance (joined at 9.36 a.m.)  
Connétable Leonard Norman of St. Clement – excused attendance (joined at 9.45 a.m.)  
Deputy Richard John Renouf of St. Ouen – excused attendance (joined at 10.28 a.m.)

---

Prayers

---

**Standing Order 55A – meeting held remotely**

THE STATES assembled remotely, in accordance with Standing Order 55A, as the Bailiff considered that it was not possible to convene or maintain a quorate meeting in view of a substantial risk to the health of both States Members and the public.

**Documents presented**

Scrutiny Review of the Government Plan: 2021-2024 – Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel. S.R.12/2020.  
Presented: 2nd December 2020.  
*Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.*

**Urgent Oral Question**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked the following question of the Chief Minister which the Bailiff had allowed in accordance with Standing Order 15 relating to urgent oral questions –

“What consideration was given to the role played by people aged over 70 in providing childcare when it was decided to move all of those people to the ‘high risk’ category for Covid-19; and what support does the Council of Ministers plan to put in place to assist workers, especially essential workers, who now cannot work because of the loss of childcare provided by over 70s?”

**Composition and Election of the States: Proposed Changes P.139/2020**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee entitled ‘Composition and Election of the States: Proposed Changes’ (P.139/2020) and rejected an amendment of Senator Lyndon John Farnham (P.139/2020 Amd.(5)) that –

paragraph (a) should be deleted and substituted with the following paragraph –

“(a) to agree that it should establish an Assembly of 48 Members comprising 12 Parish Connétables elected from within the current Parish boundaries, 8 Senators elected on an

Island-wide basis and 28 Deputies elected from 6 large districts, and to replace the current Schedule 1 to the States of Jersey law 2005 as follows –

<i>Constituencies</i>	<i>Number of Deputies to be returned</i>
<b>District 1: St. Helier North</b> Vingtaine du Mont Cochon, Vingtaine du Mont à l'Abbé, Vingtaine du Haut du Mont au Prêtre, and Vingtaine du Rouge Bouillon, in the Parish of St. Helier.	6
<b>District 2: St. Helier South</b> Cantons de Bas et de Haut de la Vingtaine de la Ville, and Vingtaine de Bas du Mont au Prêtre, in the Parish of St. Helier.	6
<b>District 3: South-East District</b> Parish of St. Clement, and Parish of Grouville.	4
<b>District 4: East Central District</b> Parish of St. Martin, and Parish of St. Saviour.	4
<b>District 5: North Central District</b> Parish of St. John, Parish of St. Lawrence, Parish of St. Mary, and Parish of Trinity.	4
<b>District 6: West District</b> Parish of St. Brelade, Parish of St. Ouen, and Parish of St. Peter.	4

paragraph (b) should be deleted; and

in paragraph (c) the words “and create an independent Boundaries Commission in time for the 2022 elections” should be deleted.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 3**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
Senator L.J. Farnham  
Connétable of St. Lawrence

**CONTRE: 41**

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
Senator T.A. Vallois  
Senator K.L. Moore  
Senator S.Y. Mézec  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of Trinity

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator S.C. Ferguson

Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee and rejected part 1 of an amendment of Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré (P.139/2020 Amd.(7)) that –

paragraph (a) should be deleted and substituted with the following paragraph –

“(a) to agree that it should establish an Assembly of 53 Members, comprising 8 Senators, 12 Connétables and 33 Deputies, with the existing disposition of Deputies being supplemented as follows:

- (i) 1 additional Deputy in St. Helier District No. 1;
- (ii) 1 additional Deputy in St. Helier Districts Nos. 3 and 4;
- (iii) 1 additional Deputy in St. Clement; and
- (iv) 1 additional Deputy in St. Brelade District No. 2.”;

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence

**CONTRE: 32**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity

Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES rejected parts 2 and 3 of the amendment of Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré that –

paragraph (b) should be deleted and substituted with the following new paragraph –

“(b) that the Privileges and Procedures Committee should institute an independent process for periodic review of the boundaries of districts within parishes so that, as far as possible, the districts within a parish each contain the same numbers of people, with a view to bringing forward amendments to the States of Jersey Law 2005 to change district boundaries in line with the recommendations of this work”.

In paragraph (c) the words “and create an independent Boundaries Commission” should be deleted.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 18**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary

**CONTRE: 30**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy of Grouville	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy of St. Mary	Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)	Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)	Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
Deputy of Trinity	Deputy R. Labey (H)
	Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
	Deputy J.H. Young (B)
	Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
	Deputy of St. Peter
	Deputy of St. John
	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
	Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
	Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
	Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
	Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
	Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
	Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee and, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Martin (P.139/2020 Amd.(3)), agreed that, after paragraph (c), there should be inserted the following paragraph –

- “(d) to request the Privileges and Procedures Committee to bring forward the following plans for implementation in time for the 2022 elections:
- (i) the choice of ‘None of the Above’ to be automatically included as a ballot option in any States Assembly election where the number of candidates in a District or Parish does not exceed the number of seats available, with an appropriate formal consequence being provided should this ballot option achieve a plurality of the votes cast.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 25**

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)

**CONTRE: 23**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy of Trinity

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, as amended, and rejected an amendment of the Connétable of Grouville (P.139/2020 Amd.(4)) that, after paragraph (c), there should be inserted the following new paragraph (d) –

“(d) that the proposition is null and void and of no effect unless the majority of the people voting in a referendum on the question of the proposed changes in the composition and election of the States, held in accordance with the Referendum (Jersey) Law 2017, have voted in favour of the proposed changes”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 15**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity

**CONTRE: 32**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**ABSTAIN:**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, as amended.

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 3rd December 2020 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee entitled ‘Composition and Election of the States: Proposed Changes’ (P.139/2020), as amended, and the other outstanding items of public business listed for the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.28 p.m.

**DR. M. EGAN**

*Greffier of the States*