



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
13th December 2022, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Sir Timothy John Le Cocq.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Vice-Admiral Jeremy Paul Kyd, C.B.E. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Marcus O’Donnel Troy of St. Clement – ill  
Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 10.00 a.m.)  
Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 11.25 a.m.)  
Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.53 a.m.)  
Deputy Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf of St. Saviour – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.54 a.m.)  
Deputy Hilary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity – absent on States business

---

Prayers

---

### **Standing Order 55A – remote participation**

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

### **Documents presented**

Draft Food (Jersey) Law 202- (P.105/2022): comments. P.105/2022.  
Presented: 13th December 2022, *Minister for the Environment.* Com.(2).

### **Notification of lodged propositions**

Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 (P.97/2022): eighth amendment (P.97/2022 P.97/2022.  
Amd.(8)) – amendment Amd.(8).  
Stamp Duty on Wills of Immovable Estate Amd.  
Lodged: 13th December 2022, *Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North.*

### **Our Hospital Project: Reporting (P.109/2022)**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter entitled ‘Our Hospital Project: Reporting’ (P.109/2022), as amended, and, rejected the proposition to request the Council of Ministers, in order to achieve the best possible clinical and

financial outcomes from the delivery of a new Hospital, to present a report to the States, no later than 20th March 2023, in which a comparison was made between the multi-site option indicated in the report 'A Review of the Our Hospital Project' (R.154/2022) and the Overdale project, as previously approved with the adoption of the following propositions –

- Our Hospital Site Selection – Overdale (P.123/2020);
- Our Hospital – Acquisition of land for the new hospital at Overdale (P.129/2020);
- Our Hospital – Preferred Access Route (P.167/2020); and
- Our Hospital – Budget, Financing and Land Assembly (P.80/2021);

both with and without the costs involved in the previously agreed remodelling of Westmount Road, St. Aubin's Road, Peirson Road, Victoria Park and the Inn on the Park car park, and the associated land purchases, and the demolition of the Jersey Bowling Club, and its reprovisioning, with the report specifically to include –

- (a) a direct like-for-like financial analysis of the multi-site option and the approved Overdale project to include both capital and running costs;
- (b) a direct like-for-like clinical and medical analysis of the multi-site option and the approved Overdale project; and
- (c) additional options for funding the approved Overdale project;

and that no decision should be sought of the States Assembly that would deviate from the decisions previously taken on the Hospital project until the report has been presented.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 15**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**CONTRE: 32**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106, the Connétable of St. Helier declared an interest in the subject of the proposition of Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter, in that he was the President of the Jersey Bowls Club.

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106, Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter declared an interest in the subject of the proposition of Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter, in that a relevant person to her was a resident of the Overdale area.

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106, Deputy Lyndsay Victoria Feltham of St. Helier Central declared an interest in the subject of the proposition of Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter, in that she was a resident of Westmount Road.

### **Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 (P.97/2022)**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022) and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North (P.97/2022 Amd.), agreed that, in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that the estimate of income in 2023 for Impots Duty on Tobacco shall be amended to £19,483,000, to reflect an increase in tobacco duty on hand rolling tobacco of 16.8%, on cigars of 18.4% and other tobacco products of 15.4%”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(25)), agreed that –

in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 1 –

- i. total States income from Stamp Duty and Land Transfer Tax shall be amended in accordance with the following table, with sum total rows updated accordingly:

	2023 Estimate	2024 Estimate	2025 Estimate	2026 Estimate
Stamp Duty	51,000	51,376	53,442	56,187
Land Transfer Tax	6,887	7,155	7,397	7,718

- ii. the total income arising from Future Tax Measures shall be reduced in each of the years 2024-2026 by £3,063,000, with sum total rows updated accordingly;
- iii. reference to “Land Transfer Tax (LTT)” shall be amended to “Land Transaction Tax (LTT)”; and

in paragraph (i), after the words “as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that –

- (i) after the words “and Enveloped Property Transactions Tax (‘EPTT’).” on page 33, there shall be inserted the words “To support the Island’s housing needs, Ministers are also proposing an exemption to the higher rate for property developers who purchase and develop residential property for resale, in the course of their trade.”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(10)), agreed that –

in paragraph (e), after the words, “for each Head of Expenditure” there should be inserted the words “, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the line for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment should be deleted and replaced with two new lines as follows –

<b>£'000</b>	<b>Income</b>	<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>Head of Expenditure</b>
Infrastructure	22,950	68,201	45,251
Environment	8,227	18,481	10,254

in paragraph (e), after the words, “for each Head of Expenditure” insert the words “, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the line for Department for the Economy should be deleted and replaced with two new lines as follows –

<b>£'000</b>	<b>Income</b>	<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>Head of Expenditure</b>
Economic Development, Tourism, Sport & Culture	-	32,526	32,526
Financial Services	-	7,738	7,738

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(15)) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(15)Amd.), agreed that, after the words “the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services should be increased by”, for the number “£734,000” there should be substituted “£350,000”; and that sub-paragraph (ii) should be deleted.

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Central, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (e) after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that –

in Summary Table 5(i) to allocate funds to enable the extension of the provision of travel for individuals accompanying patients travelling out of the island to receive treatment arranged by the Health and Community Services Department, such funding to be informed by a review of the process by which travel is provided and purchased for travel, in order to ensure the provision is patient centred and the best value for money is being achieved –

- i. the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services should be increased by £350,000”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(17)), agreed

that, in paragraph (e), after the words “Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, with funding to be allocated from the Covid-19 response head of expenditure in Summary Table 5(i), and made available for use by the Minister for Infrastructure, should it be required in excess of existing funding, to extend the Avanchi18 bus scheme to –

- (a) all full-time students who are 19 years and older, to include students in full-time education undertaking Higher Education at Highlands College, Colleges and Universities in the UK or abroad; and
- (b) all trainees and apprentices (who access education through Highlands College and/or who receive funding from the Skills Jersey Trackers Scheme)”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(.)), agreed that, in paragraph (i), after the words “as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report ”, there should be inserted the words –

“except that, on page 46 an additional bullet point shall be added to the list under the heading “Objectives of the Value for Money Programme”, with the following text inserted: “The Council of Ministers will continually seek to identify opportunities for joint working with Guernsey which could generate improved value for money through collaboration, whether through revenue savings or more effective services.”

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(26)) and rejected the first part of an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(26)Amd.) that, in part 3, after the words “future years”, there should be inserted the words –

“; the scheme will be covered by the Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Jersey) Law 2018, which would apply to all rooms included in this scheme - the necessary legislative amendments will be put in place in 2023 to extend the Law to include where one or more individuals rent rooms in the same dwelling in which the owner resides, where the period of residency exceeds 30 days and there is some form of reward. The duties outlined in the Law and subordinate legislation apply to the owner. This includes requirements around electrical safety, gas safety, smoke detection and similar, and ensuring that the property is safe and free of the hazards outlined in the legislation (including damp and mould, excess cold, space, security, trip hazards, falls from height and similar)”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**CONTRE: 29**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

THE STATES rejected part 2 of the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Central that, in part 3 of the amendment of the Council of Ministers, after the words “future years.”, there should be inserted the words –

“An option will be included for participants in the scheme to check whether the prospective tenant or homeowner is subject to the notification requirements of the Sex Offenders (Jersey) Law 2010, which permits a register of offenders to be kept and similarly for the new Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law 2022 when this comes into force.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 13**

Connétable of Trinity  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 29**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Council of Ministers, agreed that –

in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that total States income in 2023 shall be reduced by £330,000 following the introduction of a new “rent-a-room” income tax relief to commence in the year of assessment 2023.”;

in paragraph (e), after the words “of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in summary table 5(ii), the Head of Expenditure for the Community Fund should be reduced by £330,000”; and

in paragraph (i), after the words “as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, underneath Table 10 on page 34, there shall be inserted the heading “Rent-a-room tax relief” below which there shall be inserted the words “Ministers are proposing a rent-a-room income tax relief, under which lodging income of £10,000 a year or less will be exempt from income tax. If lodging income exceeds £10,000 the full amount would be taxable in the normal way but would benefit from the existing concessional treatment. This proposal is intended to encourage better use of existing housing stock and allow Islanders to generate additional income while providing accommodation at a fair rent to ease the housing strain. The required legislative changes will be made by an amendment to the Draft Finance (2023 Budget) (Jersey) Law 202- and would come into force for the year of assessment 2023 and future years”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 32**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf

**CONTRE: 15**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy S. Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106, Deputy Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf of St. Saviour declared an interest in the subject of the amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(26)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, in that lodgers in a property he owned would be affected by the implementation of the amendment, if adopted.

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 80, to suspend Standing Order 32 in order that his amendment P.97/2022 Amd.(8)Amd.) to his own amendment (P.97/2022 Amd.(8) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022) might be listed for consideration at the present meeting; and further agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of the same amendment in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

### **Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 P.97/2022**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022), as amended, and, commencing consideration of an amendment of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North (P.97/2022 Amd.(2)), rejected an amendment of Deputy Raluca Stefana Kovacs of St. Saviour (P.97/2022 Amd.(2)Amd.) that, for the words “4 percentage points” there should be substituted the words “10 percentage points”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 11**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

#### **CONTRE: 34**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**



Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES rejected part 1 of the amendment of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North that, in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law”, there should be inserted the words “, except that the 2023 estimate for Stamp Duty shall be increased by £240,000, and the 2023 estimate for Land Transfer Tax (LTT) shall be increased by £160,000, by increasing Stamp Duty for buy to let investments, second homes and holiday homes at 4 percentage points above the normal rate for residential property”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 29**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected part 2 of the amendment of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North that, in paragraph (c), after the words “Article 9(2)(b) of the Law”, there should be inserted the words “, except that a transfer of £2 million from the Consolidated Fund to the Dwelling Houses Loan Fund should be included for 2023 and subsequent years”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 2**

Connétable of St. Helier  
Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 42**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy G..P. Southern  
Deputy C.F. Labey  
Deputy S.G. Luce  
Deputy K.F. Morel  
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
Deputy S.M. Ahier  
Deputy R.J. Ward  
Deputy C.S. Alves  
Deputy I. Gardiner  
Deputy I.J. Gorst  
Deputy L.J Farnham  
Deputy K.L. Moore  
Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
Deputy T.A. Coles  
Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
Deputy D.J. Warr  
Deputy H.M. Miles  
Deputy M.R. Scott  
Deputy J. Renouf  
Deputy C.D. Curtis  
Deputy L.V. Feltham  
Deputy R.E. Binet  
Deputy M.E. Millar  
Deputy A. Howell  
Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy B. Ward  
Deputy K.M. Wilson  
Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected part 3 of the amendment of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North that, in paragraph (e), after the words “to the Report”, there should be inserted the words “, except that the General Reserve expenditure should be reduced by £1,597,000”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 2**

Connétable of St. Helier  
Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 42**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy G..P. Southern  
Deputy C.F. Labey  
Deputy S.G. Luce  
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
Deputy K.F. Morel  
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
Deputy S.M. Ahier  
Deputy R.J. Ward  
Deputy C.S. Alves  
Deputy I. Gardiner  
Deputy I.J. Gorst  
Deputy L.J Farnham  
Deputy K.L. Moore  
Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
Deputy T.A. Coles  
Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
Deputy D.J. Warr  
Deputy H.M. Miles  
Deputy M.R. Scott  
Deputy J. Renouf  
Deputy C.D. Curtis  
Deputy L.V. Feltham  
Deputy M.E. Millar  
Deputy A. Howell  
Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy B. Ward  
Deputy K.M. Wilson  
Deputy L.K.F Stephenson

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(20).

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 14th December 2022 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026' (P.97/2022), as amended, and the other outstanding propositions listed for the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.29 p.m.

**L.-M. HART**

*Greffier of the States*