



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday
13th December 2023, at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Sir Timothy John Le Cocq.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Deidre Wendy Mezbourian of St. Lawrence – excused attendance
Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone of St. Martin – ill
Connétable Andrew Nicholas Jehan of St. John – excused attendance
Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.41 a.m.)
Deputy Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf of St. Saviour – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.50 a.m.)
Deputy Beatriz Borges de Sousa Vaz Moreno Porée of St. Helier South – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.54 a.m.)
Deputy Margaret Elaine Millar of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.41 a.m.)

Prayers

Standing Order 55A – remote participation

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023

THE STATES, resuming consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, resumed consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.72/2023 Amd.(33)) and, adopting part 1 of the amendment, agreed that, after paragraph (f), there should be inserted the following new paragraph and the subsequent paragraphs re-designated accordingly –

“(g) to approve a transfer from the Consolidated Fund to the Agricultural Loans Fund in 2024 of up to £10 million, subject to a decision of the Minister for Treasury and Resources based on availability of funds in the Consolidated Fund as at 31st December 2023 in excess of estimates provided in this plan, or from budgeted underspends identified before 31st December 2024;”.

Suspension of Meeting

The Bailiff, during consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, suspended the meeting for a period of 5 minutes, in accordance with Standing Order 46, in order that a problem with the electronic voting system could be rectified.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023

THE STATES, resuming consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, resumed consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.72/2023 Amd.(33)) and, adopting part 2 of the amendment, agreed that, in paragraph (h), after the words “of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the Head of Expenditure for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture should be increased by £2,000,000, with decreases to the following Heads of Expenditure –

(i) Cabinet Office	£1,000,000;
(ii) Customer and Local Services	£22,000;
(iii) Children, Young People, Education and Skills	£286,000;
(iv) Infrastructure	£74,000;
(v) Environment	£18,000;
(vi) Health and Community Services	£415,000;
(vii) Justice and Home Affairs	£60,000;
(viii) States of Jersey Police	£47,000;
(ix) Financial Services	£13,000;
(x) Ministry of External Relations	£5,000; and
(xi) Treasury and Exchequer	£60,000;”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 35

Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy C.F. Labey
 Deputy S.G. Luce
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet
 Deputy K.F. Morel
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat
 Deputy S.M. Ahier
 Deputy I. Gardiner
 Deputy I.J. Gorst
 Deputy L.J. Farnham
 Deputy K.L. Moore
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
 Deputy D.J. Warr
 Deputy H.M. Miles
 Deputy M.R. Scott
 Deputy J. Renouf
 Deputy R.E. Binet
 Deputy H.L. Jeune
 Deputy M.E. Millar
 Deputy A. Howell

CONTRE: 1

Deputy M.B. Andrews

ABSTAIN: 9

Deputy G.P. Southern
 Deputy M. Tadier
 Deputy R.J. Ward
 Deputy C.S. Alves
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec
 Deputy T.A. Coles
 Deputy C.D. Curtis
 Deputy L.V. Feltham
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy T.J.A. Binet
 Deputy M.R. Ferey
 Deputy A.F. Curtis
 Deputy B. Ward
 Deputy K.M. Wilson
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Samuel Yves Mézec of St. Helier South (P.72/2023 Amd.(19)) that –

in paragraph (h), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), in order to ensure the revenue gained from the 3% Stamp Duty uplift on ‘Buy to Let’ investment properties, second homes, and holiday homes may be used to increase the First Step shared equity scheme –

- (i) the Head of Expenditure for the Cabinet Office should be decreased by £2,330,000; and
- (ii) the Reserve Expenditure line should be increased by £2,330,000”; and

in paragraph (l), after the words “Appendix 3 to the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that on page 9 in the section “Improving Access to Housing” after the words “housing market” there should be inserted the words “The revenue gained from the 3% Stamp Duty uplift on ‘Buy to Let’ investment properties, second homes, and holiday homes will be allocated to increase the First Step shared equity scheme.”

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 12

Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy G.P. Southern
 Deputy M. Tadier
 Deputy R.J. Ward
 Deputy C.S. Alves
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec
 Deputy T.A. Coles
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée
 Deputy C.D. Curtis
 Deputy L.V. Feltham
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

CONTRE: 35

Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy C.F. Labey
 Deputy S.G. Luce
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet
 Deputy K.F. Morel
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat
 Deputy S.M. Ahier
 Deputy I. Gardiner
 Deputy I.J. Gorst
 Deputy L.J. Farnham
 Deputy K.L. Moore
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
 Deputy D.J. Warr
 Deputy H.M. Miles
 Deputy M.R. Scott
 Deputy J. Renouf
 Deputy R.E. Binet

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy H.L. Jeune
 Deputy M.E. Millar
 Deputy A. Howell
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet
 Deputy M.R. Ferey
 Deputy A.F. Curtis
 Deputy B. Ward
 Deputy K.M. Wilson
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Vice-Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, agreed that the Assembly would meet until 6.00 p.m. that day and on Thursday 14th December 2023 and that the lunchtime adjournment would be reduced to 1 hour in length on Thursday 14th and Friday 15th December 2023.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Catherine Dolores Curtis of St. Helier Central (P.72/2023 Amd.(20)) that, in paragraph (h), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), in order that additional funds may be allocated to the existing growth bid entitled ‘Investment across CYPES frontline services’ –

- (i) the Head of Expenditure for the Cabinet Office should be decreased by £2,000,000, through a reduction in the allocation to the Modernisation and Digital department; and
- (ii) the Head of Expenditure for Children, Young People, Education and Skills should be increased by £2,000,000”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 13

Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy G.P. Southern
 Deputy M. Tadier
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat
 Deputy R.J. Ward
 Deputy C.S. Alves
 Deputy L.J. Farnham
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec
 Deputy T.A. Coles
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée
 Deputy C.D. Curtis
 Deputy L.V. Feltham
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

CONTRE: 32

Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy C.F. Labey
 Deputy S.G. Luce
 Deputy K.F. Morel
 Deputy S.M. Ahier
 Deputy I. Gardiner
 Deputy I.J. Gorst
 Deputy K.L. Moore
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
 Deputy D.J. Warr

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy H.M. Miles
Deputy M.R. Scott
Deputy J. Renouf
Deputy R.E. Binet
Deputy H.L. Jeune
Deputy M.E. Millar
Deputy A. Howell
Deputy T.J.A. Binet
Deputy M.R. Ferey
Deputy A.F. Curtis
Deputy B. Ward
Deputy K.M. Wilson
Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson
Deputy M.B. Andrews

Changes in Presidency

The Bailiff retired briefly from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Catherine Dolores Curtis of St. Helier Central (P.72/2023 Amd.(20)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mr. William John Charles Millow, Deputy Greffier of the States, until the Bailiff’s return.

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), Deputy Andrea Howell of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity had informed the Greffier of the States that her amendment (P.72/2023 Amd.(31)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023) had been withdrawn.

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the Minister for Social Security had informed the Greffier of the States that the Draft Health Insurance (Amendment of Law – Contracts for Administration of Vaccines) (Jersey) Regulations 202- and the Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law – Payments into Social Security Fund) (Jersey) Regulations 202- had been withdrawn.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, and rejected an amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.72/2023 Amd.(28)) that –

in paragraph (h), after the words “set out in Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the Head of Expenditure for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport & Culture should be reduced by £650,000 and the Central Reserve should be increased by £650,000”; and

in paragraph (l), after the words “as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that the revenue expenditure growth item “I-DFE-GP24-001 Implementation of Digital, Visitor Economy and Elite Sport Strategies”, identified in Appendix 3: Supplementary Financial

Table, should be reduced by £650,000 for each year with these funds being held in the Central Reserve until a business case for this growth is agreed by the States Assembly”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 4

Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy M.R. Scott
 Deputy R.E. Binet

CONTRE: 42

Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Deputy G.P. Southern
 Deputy C.F. Labey
 Deputy M. Tadier
 Deputy S.G. Luce
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet
 Deputy K.F. Morel
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat
 Deputy S.M. Ahier
 Deputy R.J. Ward
 Deputy C.S. Alves
 Deputy I. Gardiner
 Deputy I.J. Gorst
 Deputy L.J. Farnham
 Deputy K.L. Moore
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
 Deputy T.A. Coles
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée
 Deputy D.J. Warr
 Deputy H.M. Miles
 Deputy J. Renouf
 Deputy C.D. Curtis
 Deputy L.V. Feltham
 Deputy H.L. Jeune
 Deputy M.E. Millar
 Deputy A. Howell
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet
 Deputy M.R. Ferey
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs
 Deputy A.F. Curtis
 Deputy B. Ward
 Deputy K.M. Wilson
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

ABSTAIN: 0**Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired briefly from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.72/2023 Amd.(28)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers

entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mrs. Lisa-Marie Hart, Greffier of the States, until the Bailiff’s return.

Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, and rejected an amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.72/2023 Amd.(27)) that –

in paragraph (h), after the words “set out in Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the Head of Expenditure for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport & Culture should be reduced by £150,000 and the Central Reserve should be increased by £150,000”; and

in paragraph (l), after the words “as set out at Appendix 3 to the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that the revenue expenditure growth item “I-DFE-GP24-003 Jersey Business - Core Grant Funding”, identified in Appendix 3: Supplementary Financial Table, should be reduced by £150,000 for each year with these funds being held in the Central Reserve until a business case for this growth is agreed by the States Assembly”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 3

Connétable of St. Brelade
Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy M.R. Scott

CONTRE: 43

Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. Mary
Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy G.P. Southern
Deputy C.F. Labey
Deputy M. Tadier
Deputy S.G. Luce
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet
Deputy K.F. Morel
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat
Deputy S.M. Ahier
Deputy R.J. Ward
Deputy C.S. Alves
Deputy I. Gardiner
Deputy I.J. Gorst
Deputy L.J. Farnham
Deputy K.L. Moore
Deputy S.Y. Mézec
Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
Deputy T.A. Coles
Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée
Deputy D.J. Warr

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy H.M. Miles
Deputy J. Renouf
Deputy C.D. Curtis
Deputy L.V. Feltham
Deputy R.E. Binet
Deputy H.L. Jeune
Deputy M.E. Millar
Deputy A. Howell
Deputy T.J.A. Binet
Deputy M.R. Ferey
Deputy R.S. Kovacs
Deputy A.F. Curtis
Deputy B. Ward
Deputy K.M. Wilson
Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson
Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Samuel Yves Mézec of St. Helier South (P.72/2023 Amd.(7)).

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 14th December 2023 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027' (P.72/2023) and the other outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.58 p.m.

W.J.C. MILLOW

Deputy Greffier of the States