

STATES OF JERSEY



CARBON NEUTRAL ROADMAP (P.74/2022): AMENDMENT (P.74/2022 AMD.) – AMENDMENT

**Lodged au Greffe on 19th April 2022
by the Minister for the Environment**

STATES GREFFE

CARBON NEUTRAL ROADMAP (P.74/2022): AMENDMENT
(P.74/2022 AMD.) – AMENDMENT

1 PAGE 2 –

In section (iii) of the proposed paragraph (c), for the words “an annual report” substitute the words “a report at the end of every four-year delivery phase for the term of the Roadmap”.

2 PAGE 2 –

In paragraph 3 of section (v) of the proposed paragraph (c), after the word “policy” insert the words “where such information cannot be transposed from other peer reviewed scientific research or analysis”.

MINISTER FOR THE ENVIRONMENT

Note: After this amendment, the first part of the amendment would read as follows –

Insert a new paragraph (c) as follows;

- (c) to request the Minister for the Environment (or if created following the successful adoption of paragraph (b), the new Minister for Energy and Climate Change) to –
- i. establish an independent, scientific Climate Council for Jersey with a composition, scope and focus that is proportionate to Jersey’s size, the full terms of reference and membership of which should be agreed by the States following a detailed proposal brought forward by the Minister before the end of 2022;
 - ii. bring forward a budget proposal for the Climate Council, to be agreed by the States before the end of 2022, and reviewed every 4 years to ensure that the Council is provided with appropriate funding;
 - iii. present to the States, on behalf of the Climate Council, a report at the end of every four-year delivery phase for the term of the Roadmap prepared autonomously by the council which reports on and evaluates the Government of Jersey’s progress on reducing carbon emissions and the climate change policy initiatives being delivered by the Carbon Neutral Roadmap;
 - iv. ensure that the membership of the Climate Council shall not include members of the States and must include:
 - (a) an odd number of members.
 - (b) a Chair chosen by the membership.

- (c) one member with expertise in the field of Energy.
 - (d) one member with expertise in the field of Economics.
 - (e) one member with expertise in the field of Climate Technology;
and
- v. ensure that the focus of the Climate Council includes (but is not necessarily limited to):
1. providing independent science-based advice on setting and meeting carbon budgets and preparing for climate change.
 2. monitoring progress in reducing emissions and achieving carbon budgets and targets and recommending actions to keep Jersey on track.
 3. conducting independent analysis into climate change science, economics and policy where such information cannot be transposed from other peer reviewed scientific research or analysis.
 4. engaging with a wide range of organisations and individuals to share evidence and analysis.

Note: After the amendment, as amended by this amendment, the proposition would read as follows –

THE STATES are asked to decide whether they are of opinion –

- (a) to refer to their Act dated 2nd May 2019, in which they agreed that there existed a climate emergency likely to have profound effects in Jersey and, in order to respond to the climate emergency, to approve the Carbon Neutral Roadmap for Jersey as set out in the Appendix to the report accompanying the proposition; and
- (b) to recommend that, at the start of the next Assembly, the Chief Minister considers creating a new ministerial portfolio for Energy and Climate Change.
- (c) to request the Minister for the Environment (or if created following the successful adoption of paragraph (b), the new Minister for Energy and Climate Change) to –
 - i. establish an independent, scientific Climate Council for Jersey with a composition, scope and focus that is proportionate to Jersey’s size, the full terms of reference and membership of which should be agreed by the States following a detailed proposal brought forward by the Minister before the end of 2022;
 - ii. bring forward a budget proposal for the Climate Council, to be agreed by the States before the end of 2022, and reviewed every 4 years to ensure that the Council is provided with appropriate funding;

- iii. present to the States, on behalf of the Climate Council, a report at the end of every four-year delivery phase for the term of the Roadmap prepared autonomously by the council which reports on and evaluates the Government of Jersey's progress on reducing carbon emissions and the climate change policy initiatives being delivered by the Carbon Neutral Roadmap;
 - iv. ensure that the membership of the Climate Council shall not include members of the States and must include:
 - (a) an odd number of members.
 - (b) a Chair chosen by the membership.
 - (c) one member with expertise in the field of Energy.
 - (d) one member with expertise in the field of Economics.
 - (e) one member with expertise in the field of Climate Technology; and
 - v. ensure that the focus of the Climate Council includes (but is not necessarily limited to):
 - 1. providing independent science-based advice on setting and meeting carbon budgets and preparing for climate change.
 - 2. monitoring progress in reducing emissions and achieving carbon budgets and targets and recommending actions to keep Jersey on track.
 - 3. conducting independent analysis into climate change science, economics and policy where such information cannot be transposed from other peer reviewed scientific research or analysis.
 - 4. engaging with a wide range of organisations and individuals to share evidence and analysis.
- (d) the Carbon Neutral Roadmap should be further amended in such respects as may be necessary consequent upon the adoption of paragraph (c).

REPORT

Summary

The amendment is based on the observation as follows:

“The [EHI Scrutiny] Panel has observed that the governance framework for the long-term development and delivery of the Roadmap’s climate policies does not propose any form of continued independent, scientific oversight or involvement”

The Panel notes:

“On reviewing the proposals for governance in the Roadmap, the Panel raises concern that no formal framework for independent, scientific oversight is being proposed for the complete term of the Roadmap, therefore it appears that the GoJ will be ‘marking its own homework’ in respect of this aspect of the delivery of the Roadmap’s objectives between 2022 –2050.”

The amendment to the amendment asks the assembly to agree that the Climate Council, as proposed by the Panel, will:

Part (c) (iii) Deliver a report in every four-year cycle, rather than annually, during the term of the Roadmap.

Part (c) (v) (3) Only conduct independent analysis, as proposed by the panel, where such information cannot be transposed from other peer-reviewed scientific research or analysis.

Part (c)(iii): four-year reporting cycle

The Minister proposes to amend the amendment to align the independent audit and review work of the Council with the other reporting requirements of the CNR as set out below to avoid duplication of effort and cost.

The reporting requirements of the CNR comprise:-

1. Annual greenhouse gas reporting in line with Paris Agreement requirements via the UK to the IPCC. This reporting provides detailed information on individual greenhouse gas volumes by economic activity sector. Jersey is part of UK inventory and the data is prepared to international standards and independently audited.
2. The CNR proposes a 4 year reporting cycle in line with government cycles to set out the delivery plan for each period of government and to provide a mechanism to review social, economic and environmental impact of policies through an updated distributional impact assessment. More frequent review and reporting would not recognise the time lag inherent in the policy cycle through to implementation and impact and so would not be representative of the impact of the policies.
3. As a signatory to the Paris Agreement, Jersey will need to comply with additional ongoing reporting requirements as specified at an International level. These reporting requirements will be integrated into the CNR reporting cycles to ensure efficiency and prevent duplication of effort. The Paris Agreement

provides an ongoing, structured, internationally specified reporting standard to which we will adhere to demonstrate compliance with the articles of the Agreement. For Annex I Parties to meet their commitments for reporting under the Convention, they are required to prepare national communications every four years, and biennial reports every two years. Jersey will be required to contribute to the UK national reporting on this basis.

4. Corporate programme management office reporting requirements. CNR is a major programme and will be subject to the corporate reporting requirements which include quarterly progress reporting against milestones and targets through PERFORM.
5. The programme office will be established to provide day to day management and reporting on the policy delivery plan. The office will report to a programme board of senior reporting officers, The Programme Board is overseen by the sponsoring body which comprises the Accountable Officers and reports to ELT and CoM via the Chief Accountable Officer.
6. The establishment of a standing scrutiny panel on energy and climate change will provide access to their own independent advisors regarding elements of the performance of the CNR programme.

We agree that it is important that we are monitored against our full emissions reduction pathway to 2050 and for there to be external challenge if Jersey should fall short on delivery.

Good governance and scientific evidence are vital to ensure the CNR delivers the policy objectives and emissions reductions in line with the Paris trajectory. This has been brought even more clearly into focus with the publication of the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) report in early April¹.

The Minister recognises the value and importance of robust governance and the need for independent oversight of progress on our emissions reduction trajectory for the term of the Roadmap.

Whilst welcoming this independent oversight and recognising the importance and value of the transparency that this reporting would bring, the Minister and Assistant Minister feel that the annual reporting as proposed in the amendment is not optimal. This is because annual reporting could be overly burdensome given the scope of the work of the Council and does not account for the fact that the impact of policies in reducing greenhouse gases are unlikely to be measurable annually. It would also be very costly for the Council to carry out its work as described. Whilst we accept that a full costing would come forward in accordance with part (c) (i) of the proposition, we estimate that a Climate Council of the scope described will be significantly more than the Fiscal Policy Panel whose annual costs are in the order of ~£150k pa but whose scope is less than that described for the climate council.

Thus, the Minister proposes the amendment to the amendment of part (c) (iii) to recognise the value of the independent review but report at the most optimum time period. This will align the work of the Council with government cycles and international reporting requirements and provide best value for money.

Therefore, Minister proposes an amendment to the amendment at part (c) (iii) as follows:-

¹ [IPCC_AR6_WGIII_SummaryForPolicymakers.pdf](#)

- iii. present to the States, on behalf of the Climate Council, an annual report at the end of every four yearly delivery phase for the term of the Roadmap prepared autonomously by the council which reports on and evaluates the Government of Jersey's progress on reducing carbon emissions and the climate change policy initiatives being delivered by the Carbon Neutral Roadmap;

Part (c)(v)(iii)

The Minister and Assistant Minister agree that access to independent expert peer-reviewed scientific evidence and technical advice is fundamental to the development of good policy especially in such a significant area as climate change.

We need to be able to assess the scientific context of our local decisions against which we can measure performance. However, it is important to recognise that commissioning original independent research for Jersey's specific situation must be proportionate as there is significant cost and resource implications to this part of the remit of the Council. We have access to a significant amount of expertise and scientific analysis as listed below. For this reason, the Minister proposes that part (c) (v) (iii) of the amendment is amended to ensure the Council is not burdened with excessive cost or expectations of commissioning original research where it is already readily available. This will avoid duplication of effort and ensure efficient use of resources.

The use of independent external scientific and technical advice is clear from the extensive evidence base that has been compiled in order to help inform and develop the CNR and is published here Evidence for the Carbon Neutral Roadmap (gov.je). The Minister welcomes the panels recognition of this practice in their report.

Some examples of how these functions are currently provided is set out below:-

- a. We already employ a team of professional well qualified and experienced civil servants who lead and coordinate the work on energy and climate change. The team draws on international research and expertise, in line with good practise, using internationally developed and peer reviewed scientific research and modelling from the IPCC.
- b. Jersey is included in the UK IPCC greenhouse gas reporting inventory and as such has access to internationally accredited and verified greenhouse gas data. This is made available as open data on gov.je and is summarised in the greenhouse gas statistics Greenhouse gas emissions (gov.je).
- c. The government has established a standing framework with the UK greenhouse gas inventory experts to provide Jersey specific advice and support on technical matters in relation to the CNR and climate change data.
- d. Across government, there are scientific and technical subject matter experts that provide expert input on relevant issues e.g. the work on blue carbon being coordinated through the natural environment team has been peer reviewed and is subject to a PhD thesis. Scientific analysis and technical climate data are provided by our own professional Meteorological office who work to international reporting standards and requirements.
- e. Economic advice is provided by the Economic Advisor and commissioned via independent expert economic consultants.
- f. Statistics Jersey are supporting the development of a data strategy for monitoring and reporting on the CNR policy impacts.

- g. Working in collaboration with the Future Economy Programme, we have been able to access innovative and cutting-edge analysis on distributional impact assessments via independent expert advisors.
- h. The work on participatory democracy with the Climate Assembly has been internationally recognised as good practise.

Accessing the range, quality and calibre of scientific and technical advice and analysis will ensure the Council can provide effective and appropriate advice and review of the presented CNR and policy delivery plan.

In summary, we believe that the Council should access peer-reviewed scientific analysis for the purposes as outlined in the amendment but only commission additional research where such information cannot be transposed or applied from other credible sources.

The assembly can be assured that all of the policy work that has taken place over the past three years on the CNR has been underpinned by peer-reviewed scientific evidence and, therefore, the process of its development has adhered to usual standards of best practice.

Existing mechanisms for the independent analysis of Jersey's progress are already in place through our annual reporting of greenhouse gas emissions to the UK. This is part of our international obligations under the Kyoto Protocol and will be extended when Jersey becomes a signatory to the Paris Agreement.

The Minister and Assistant Minister propose an amendment to the amendment to ensure efficiency and cost effectiveness as well as alignment with international reporting requirements and the delivery phases of the Carbon Neutral Roadmap.

Amend the amendment as follows:-

- 3. conducting independent analysis into climate change science, economics and policy where such information cannot be transposed from other peer reviewed science/analysis.

Conclusion

The Minister and Assistant Ministers emphasise their support for the establishment of an independent scientific council to provide independent oversight of the CNR.

The amendment to the amendment ensures alignment of the review work of the Council, which is welcomed, on a four yearly delivery phase basis. The amendment to the amendment ensures efficient and appropriate use of the proposed Climate Council resources to utilise and access scientific peer-reviewed analysis.

Financial and manpower considerations

The estimates included in the amendment report for financial and manpower implications will be updated and brought forward in line with the timeline as proposed in the original amendment to recognise the full cost implications of the set up and running costs of the Council as outlined in the amendment to the amendment.