

**WRITTEN QUESTION TO THE MINISTER FOR THE ENVIRONMENT
BY DEPUTY M.R. SCOTT OF ST. BRELADE
QUESTION SUBMITTED ON MONDAY 26th JUNE 2023
ANSWER TO BE TABLED ON MONDAY 3rd JULY 2023**

Question

“Will the Minister state –

- (a) the number of hours during the last 12 months that the Planning Committee was in session for –
 - (i) meetings not held in public; and
 - (ii) hearings of planning applications;
- (b) the number and cost of appeals from Planning Committee decisions during the last 12 months;
- (c) the amount and cost of Independent Planning Inspectors’ time to consider and hear appeals against Planning Committee decisions for each 12-month period from 30th June 2020 to date;
- (d) the average cost, per hour, of Independent Planning Inspectors’ time to consider and hear appeals against Planning Committee decisions over the last 12 months;
- (e) the number of Members of the Planning Committee who attended each individual hearing for planning applications over the last 3 years; and
- (f) the number of occasions over the last 12 months that each Planning Committee member has recused themselves from hearing a planning application owing to a conflict of interest, if any, together with the nature of the interests declared?”

Answer

- (a) (i) During the past 12 months, meetings not held in public were i) site visits, whereby the Planning Committee visits all sites subject to applications being heard in public and the total time was approximately 104 hours and ii) training courses prior to their formation and first meeting which was approximately 16 hours; and
 - (ii) During the past 12 months, there have been 13 meetings of the Planning Committee held in public and this equated to approximately 104 hours.
- (b) During the past 12 months, there were 11 appeals against decisions made by the Planning Committee. The Judicial Greffe administers planning appeals. Not all costs are assigned directly to each appeal; for instance, the Tribunal staff and offices are shared by all tribunals run by the service. Therefore, calculating the average spend for appeal requires assumptions to be made about the allocation of shared costs.
- (c) During the past 12 months, there have been 11 appeals against decisions made by the Planning Committee. Data is not held on the cost associated with each appeal, because an inspector will handle multiple appeals in a single engagement and the fee is based on time logged for all appeals considered. This is usually by a day rate rather than hourly rate.
- (d) The day rate for an Independent Planning Inspector is £350, which would equate to an hourly rate of £47.50. This is no different if the Inspector is considering an appeal of a delegated decision or Planning Committee decision.

(e) The number of Members of the Planning Committee who attended each individual hearing for planning applications over the last 3 years.

2020									
	Deputy R. Labey of St. Helier - Chair	Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade – Vice Chair	Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity	Deputy S.M. Wickenden of St. Helier	Deputy R.E. Huelin of St. Peter	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of St. Clement	Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence
19 Feb 2020	X	X	X	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
20 Feb 2020	X	X	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
17 Mar 2020	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓	X
19 Mar 2020	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓	X
7 May 2020	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
11 Jun 2020	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓	✓
19 Jun 2020	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	X	✓
8 Jul 2020	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓	✓	X	X
16 Sept 2020	X	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	X	✓
17 Sept 2020	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
15 Oct 2020	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X
27 Oct 2020	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	✓	✓	X
12 Nov 2020	✓	✓	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓

2021									
	Deputy R. Labey of	Deputy G.J. Truscott	Deputy J.M. Maçon of	Connétable D.W. Mezbour	Connétable P.B.	Deputy S.M. Wicken	Deputy R.E.	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of	Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence

	St. Helier - Chair	of St. Brelade – Vice Chair	St. Saviour	ian of St. Lawrence	Le Sueur of Trinity	den of St. Helier	Huelin of St. Peter	St. Clement		
14 Jan 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	✓	✓	
	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade – Vice Chair	Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat of St. Helier	Deputy S.M. Wicken den of St. Helier	Deputy R.E. Huelin of St. Peter	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of St. Clement	Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence	
10 Mar 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓	X	✓	
11 Mar 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	✓	✓	
31 Mar 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	X	✓	
1 Apr 2021	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	X	✓	
6 May 2021	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	
27 May 2021	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	
24 Jun 2021	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	X	✓	
15 Jul 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓	
	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade – Vice Chair	Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat of St. Helier	Deputy R.E. Huelin of St. Peter	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of St. Clement	Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence	Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour	
29 Sept 2021	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	X	✓	
30 Sept 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓	X	✓	
	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of	Deputy G.J. Truscott of St.	Deputy S.G. Luce	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St.	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat	Connétable M. Troy of St.	Deputy R.E. Huelin of St. Peter	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of	Deputy K.F. Morel	Deputy J.M. Maço

	Trinity - Chair	Brelade – Vice Chair	of St. Martin	Lawrenc e	of St. Helier	Clemen t		St. Clement	of St. Lawr ence	n of St. Savio ur
21 Oct 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	X	✓	✓
18 Nov 2021	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓	X	X	X	✓
2 Dec 2021	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓
9 Dec 2021	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓

2022										
	Connétab le P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade – Vice Chair	Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin	Connétab le D.W. Mezbouri an of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarar of St. Helier	Connétab le M. Troy of St. Clement	Deput y R.E. Huelin of St. Peter	Deputy L.B.E. Ash of St. Clement	Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawren ce	Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour
13 Jan 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	✓	X	✓
2 Feb 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	X	X	X	✓
3 Feb 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓
9 Mar 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	X	X
10 Mar 2022	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X
7 Apr 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓
5 May 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	X	X
20 May 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	X	X
	Connétab le P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Connétab le K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour	Deputy S.G. Luce of Grouville and St. Martin	Connétab le D.W. Mezbouri an of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarar of St. Helier North	Connétab le M. Troy of St. Clement	Conné table R.A.K. Honeyc ombe of St. Ouen	Deputy T.A. Coles of St. Helier South	Deputy A. Howell of St. John, St. Lawren ce and Trinity	Deputy A.F. Curtis of St. Clement

29 Sept 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓
20 Oct 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓
27 Oct 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
10 Nov 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X
17 Nov 2022	X	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓
8 Dec 2022	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X	X	✓	✓	✓

2023										
	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Connétable K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour	Deputy S.G. Luce of Grouville and St. Martin	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat of St. Helier North	Connétable M. Troy of St. Clement	Connétable R.A.K. Honeycombe of St. Ouen	Deputy T.A. Coles of St. Helier South	Deputy A. Howell of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity	Deputy A.F. Curtis of St. Clement
26 Jan 2023	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	X	✓	✓
23 Feb 2023	X	✓	✓	X	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	X
16 Mar 2023	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
13 Apr 2023	✓	X	X	X	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓
2 May 2023	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
18 May 2023	X	X	✓	X	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓
8 Jun 2023	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	X

(f) The number of occasions over the last 12 months that each Planning Committee member has recused themselves from hearing a planning application owing to a conflict of interest, if any, together with the nature of the interests declared.

2022										
	Connétable P.B. Le Sueur of Trinity - Chair	Connétable K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour	Deputy S.G. Luce of Grouville and St. Martin	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat of St. Helier North	Connétable M. Troy of St. Clement	Connétable R.A.K. Honeycombe of St. Ouen	Deputy T.A. Coles of St. Helier South	Deputy A. Howell of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity	Deputy A.F. Curtis of St. Clement
29 Sept 2022	X	✓ (1)	X	X	X	X	✓ (2)	X	X	X
20 Oct 2022	X	X	✓ (1)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
27 Oct 2022	✓ (3)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓ (4)	X
10 Nov 2022	✓ (1)	✓ (4)	X	X	✓ (1)	✓ (1)	X	X	✓ (1)	X
17 Nov 2022	X	X	X	X	X	✓ (2)	X	✓ (1)	✓ (2)	✓ (3)
8 Dec 2022	X	✓ (1)	✓ (1)	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓ (1)
2023										
26 Jan 2023	X	✓ (4)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
23 Feb 2023	X	X	✓ (1)	X	X	X	X	X	✓ (1)	X
16 Mar 2023	X	✓ (1)	✓ (3)	X	X	X	X	✓ (2)	X	✓ (1)
13 Apr 2023	✓ (1)	X	X	X	✓ (1)	X	X	X	X	✓ (1)
2 May 2023	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
18 May 2023	X	X	✓ (6)	X	X	X	✓ (1)	✓ (2)	✓ (3)	✓ (3)
8 Jun 2023	✓ (3)	✓ (1)	X	✓ (2)	X	X	✓ (1)	✓ (3)	✓ (5)	X

In the vast majority of cases, members withdraw due to the fact that the application under consideration falls within their constituency. Members of the Planning Committee operate under an agreed Code of Conduct (attached).



Planning
Committee Members