

# STATES OF JERSEY

## Environment Scrutiny Panel Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services

**MONDAY, 23rd APRIL 2012**

**Panel:**

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman)  
Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin  
Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John

**Witnesses:**

Deputy Kevin Lewis, Minister for Transport and Technical Services  
Deputy John Le Fondré, Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services  
Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services  
Director of Transport  
Director of Engineering and Infrastructure  
Head of Finance  
Project and Planning Manager  
Acting Director of Operations

**Also present:**

Scrutiny Officer

[14:00]

**Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman):**

Ladies and gentlemen, everybody, thank you very much for attending this afternoon. This is our first public meeting with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services that the Scrutiny Panel has held. Our plan is to hold these meetings quarterly. Just to introduce myself: Deputy John Young; I am the Chair of this panel. On my right, Deputy Stephen Luce of St. Martin, and the Connétable of St. John on my left. I am sure you know these members very well. And our Scrutiny Officer. For the record, I wonder, please, if Kevin, you and your team would state their names and positions, so we know who is here, please?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Thank you, Chairman. I am Deputy Kevin Lewis, Minister for Transport and Technical Services.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Deputy John Le Fondré, Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Director of Engineering and Infrastructure.

**Project and Planning Manager:**

Strategic Planning and Project Manager.

**Chief Officer:**

Chief Officer of Transport and Technical Services.

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Acting Director of Operations.

**Acting Director of Finance:**

Acting Director of Finance.

**Director of Transport:**

Director of Transport.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you very much for bringing us a very impressive team, if I may say so, today. Obviously, you have come well geared up to deal with our questions. Just a bit about running order: we have started slightly late, so we have targeted this meeting to finish, at the latest, by 4.30 p.m. We will try and stick to that. For the members of the public, we have given the Minister an agenda, and we have got a broad list of subjects to cover, and we plan to spend about 15 minutes, 20 minutes, on each of those subject areas. The rules of these hearings are on the wall, for members of the public. I am sure you will not step outside those rules; no interruptions, please. If you want to speak, please leave the room quietly. Also, witnesses, there is a piece of paper in front of you with the rules about privilege and so on, which you should all see, and if you could just confirm for the record that you have read it and are aware of the rules at these meetings.

**Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin:**

There is one piece we will need to circulate.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, one piece of paper.

**Chief Officer:**

That is very environmentally friendly.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

If there are any questions on that, but of course, we are all on the record, but the rules of these meetings are covered by the arrangements on that piece of paper. I am going to open the meeting, and I am going start with similar questions that we put to the Minister for the Environment: Minister, after your election, what are the 5 most important things you plan to achieve during your ministerial term of office?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

My department has had significant input into the medium-term financial plan, and we have submitted a significant number of bids to bring our asset base up to a suitable

standard to secure funding for liquid waste improvements and provide a sustainable solution for ash. We must, however, be aware of the huge pressures faced by the Treasury, particularly around the needs of health and the hospital. This will dominate the medium-term financial resources and will require Transport and Technical Services to develop alternative funding sources. In my second term of office representing Transport and Technical Services, I have focused the department with 3 overarching priorities: to continue to advance the sustainable and environmental focus of the department; act as a responsible custodian of the £1 billion worth of our Island's infrastructure; and make sure that safety is kept at the forefront of what we do.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you think you can achieve all those things in your 3 years, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think we can, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How about the funding issues that you have identified there? Can you summarise what those issues are? Are your resources adequate, for example, to do the job that you have got to do?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Maintenance-wise, yes. We will need additional funding, but that is to be sought.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, maintenance, yes, you have enough; but you need to do other things?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What are they?

**Chief Officer:**

T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services) traditionally has struggled for funding, certainly over the last decade. In terms of all the operational areas and capital areas, every area has had a review in terms of the funding needs, and all the outputs from that have been put towards the medium-term financial plan. As the Minister alluded to, the pressures on the medium-term financial plan are significant, particularly from other departments, and health is the one that has got a huge agenda and a huge capital requirement. What traditionally happens is the elements that T.T.S. are responsible for are not very politically desirable compared to some other issues. I think champions of infrastructure like the then Deputy of St. John, now Connétable of St. John, are few and far between, so we have had very few people who have supported us for capital. What has been beneficial has been the G.A.A.P. (Generally Accepted Accounting Principles) accountancy practice, which has shown the value of our assets, which is over £1 billion; shows the depreciation of those assets, and shows that we, as the States of Jersey, must maintain them and enhance them so that we can keep sustainable.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How much capital do you need, then, to sort out our infrastructure?

**Chief Officer:**

It depends what you want, is the simple answer. If you want to maintain it to the standard it is now, or if you want to enhance it and move it forward with regulation changes and demand changes. So, it is a difficult question to answer, depending on the infrastructure.

**Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John:**

Can I come in on that one, please, Chairman? Given that you are holding an asset of £1 billion of infrastructure, any prudent businessman would put between 7 per cent and 10 per cent of their income away, or that is what it would cost to maintain the structure of any particular plant, and therefore you would be looking at between £70 million to £100 million per annum just to keep it up to scratch.

**Chief Officer:**

The majority of assets we have are long-term assets: sewers, roads, sea defences. We have a provision within the States funding for 1 per cent funding per annum, which effectively indicates that those assets will last 100 years. We have put a bid in in the medium-term capital plan for that to be increased with inflation, an increase based on the asset value. Actually, that is not a bad funding arrangement for maintaining the existing assets. What it does not do is enhance, and that is the key difference. To make it better, to improve it, to enhance the facilities, you have got to have additional funding for that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, you have got funds to maintain what you have got to the standard it is now?

**Chief Officer:**

Correct.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But that is not good enough, I take it, from the implication of what you have just said?

**Chief Officer:**

That is right.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The standards are always changing and improving.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And it is based on, if I understood, the assets lasting 100 years?

**Chief Officer:**

We have got to be a bit careful, and I do not want to get into too much accountancy speak, because I am out of my comfort zone there, but infrastructure assets, as defined by those, are the ones which have long-term lives, and the accountancy treatment for them is different to a normal asset which is depreciated. So, if you look at an Energy

from Waste plant to sewage treatment works, they are not infrastructure assets, they are fixed assets, and they are the ones that need the mechanical and electrical equipment, we need to replace it every 15 years. There are shorter term maintenance requirements, and that is a different funding mechanism.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, you have put forward some bids; you have not told us what they are, but you have put them in?

**Chief Officer:**

We have put lots in, but until the capital programme is decided by the States of Jersey, then we do not know how successful we will be.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We will come back to those in turn, as we go through the session. You put those bids in; can you tell me whether these issues of infrastructure need to have been discussed at the Council of Ministers?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How much discussion have you had the opportunity to ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is an ongoing discussion. They are well aware of the projects we have in hand.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you getting the support you need for those matters there?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are getting support, but whether that turns into financial support is yet to be seen.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We will know that in the medium-term plan?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

If I might ask, Chairman, given, in the long term coming up, you have impositions, if I can use that word, from Health or from the Environment Department, to increase the specification of infrastructure, do you think it is right that maybe Health or Environment, to quote those 2, would dip into their own budgets to help you with the additional requirements they might impose that you might not otherwise see fit to put forward?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think we all have to fight our own corner in that respect. A lot of things that we do are health-related, anyway. So, no, I think these are worthwhile projects and worth pursuing.

[14:15]

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Sorry, if I can just clarify? Does that mean that if the requirements change, the environmental regulation becomes more onerous, that in fact enhances the standard of the plants and the amount of money that would be required; is that correct?

**Chief Officer:**

That is correct, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I would like to shift to one other question, without getting bogged down on funding; I am sure we will come back to that. Do you see yourselves as an operational department, or do you see yourselves as responsible for States strategy in these areas of waste management and transport policy?

**Chief Officer:**

I think we are in a unique situation in T.T.S. in that we have expertise in both areas. The strategic expertise I think lies pretty much in this team, with some supporting officers, and we also have the responsibility to be the ownership, to do the operational elements of operating the T.T.S., as well.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Perhaps it is more of a political question for the Minister, since when we met with the Minister for Environment, he expressed the opinion that issues to do with traffic policy and waste policy were broader matters tied in with the environment, and therefore felt that that should sit within his ministry; do you have a view on that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, I am quite happy for that to sit within T.T.S..

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you, Minister. Do you have any questions?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Not at the moment.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I think that is our opening introduction; thank you for that, Minister. I would like to move now to the subject of ash disposal. By way of introduction, I think you will certainly be aware, and members of the public may be aware from today, that the panel does intend to commence a detailed Scrutiny review of this, but this is a long-term plan and we do not plan today to go into all the details of it. I think what I want to do is to put some initial questions to you to get some initial responses which set the brief and the direction for us to move in. First of all, can you please sum up for us,

Minister, your present strategy for disposal of the residues which are generated from the Energy from Waste plants?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Remember with my speech to become Minister for Transport and Technical Services, I made a firm commitment to avoid a legacy of hazardous waste at La Collette for future generations. I am progressing this, and I have asked my officers to review the planned disposal route for ash from the Energy from Waste plants. I would like to take this opportunity to thank Scrutiny for focusing on this issue for the first review. Would the Chief Officer or Director of Engineering and Infrastructure like to go into the details of the present system of disposal?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

The present system for disposal is that there are 2 types of ash residues. One is the incinerator bottom ash and one is the air pollution control residues. Both of those are disposed of in what we call lined monocells at La Collette. It is the same operation as what was happening for the old incinerator, the only difference currently being that rather than being co-mixed, they go into separate cells. As ash is continually produced on a 24-hour basis, we have to have an ongoing storage disposal route whilst we develop strategies for going forward.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is that arrangement safe?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Yes, we believe it is. It is to all industry current practices. We have had it independently reviewed, and as far as we are concerned and the independent review is concerned, it is having no detrimental effect on the environment whatsoever.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What are the risks with it?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

I think the perceived risks are that the ash may escape from the cells in some shape or form and into the surrounding sea; that is the general view, either through blowing out the cells, some rupture or escape. But we have had that reviewed, and we believed before that review took place and since the results of that review, are that we are completely compliant.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is that waste defined as hazardous waste?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

The air pollution control residue is hazardous waste, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As you are aware, Chairman, the officers are looking into various new systems, one of which is accelerated carbonation, which seals everything in. Another possibility is plasma vitrification, but there are very few plants operating in the world at the moment, so we are looking at tried and tested systems.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Perhaps we could come back to that in a moment, Minister? I am just trying to establish where we are now. Can you tell us what permissions you have got in place vis-à-vis this current arrangement you have that the Director of Engineering and Infrastructure described?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Through the environment? Chief Officer?

**Chief Officer:**

One of the planning obligations for the Energy from Waste plant was to submit to the Planning Department a strategy for managing the residues, which is the one we are working to at the moment, and that was agreed with the regulator. That is currently being written up in our draft licence. Any alternative solutions will have to require a licence for modification to that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So the current licence allows you to store it, basically, under controlled conditions?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

You have mentioned that obviously we have got a change between the type of ash generated by the new plant compared to the old plant; can you tell us what happened to the old residues from the old plant at Bellozanne?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes, all the residues from Bellozanne were co-mixed and put in lined pits at La Collette.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can you tell us how many tonnes we have got there, or what proportion of the whole site at La Collette is made up of this material?

**Chief Officer:**

We have got 34 pits above mean high water full of ash from Bellozanne.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can you estimate the number of tonnes in there?

**Chief Officer:**

I cannot estimate that at this time; it is substantial.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

In terms of area of the whole of La Collette, we are probably about, I think currently a quarter of the footprint of the whole site.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It is a few acres, is it not?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes, substantial.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So that would make that area sterile for a considerable period of time, then?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

When you say “sterile”, I mean ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Or we cannot use it for anything else because of the ash mountain that we have, or will have. So therefore until we have found a way of resolving that, that area of land that would have been earmarked under the previous Island plan for development or recreational centre, falls away; correct?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

It is correct, yes. But the current Island plan designates that area of land as a waste management activity. That designation is formed (1) because of the actual ash that was already there, and (2) because the location of the fuel farm and the outcome of Buncefield now means that leisure activities cannot happen on the site in the future.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That was a change, was it, between the 2002 Island Plan, which did designate the area for recreational use, and I remember that policy, that allowed the residents of St. Helier and the Island to enjoy the use of that site; that is no longer possible?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

No.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is that a permanent position? Can anything be done about that, ever?

**Chief Officer:**

The reason that the general public are not encouraged to go to La Collette is because of the issues with the fuel farm, and not because of issues with ash. It was always the plan for the headland to be for public access and would be remediated back to a position where it would be open parkland.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Things changed a lot after the Buncefield report.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Getting back to today, what are the present volumes and costs of disposal of the ash that is coming out of the Energy from Waste plants?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is approximately 20,000 tonnes per year of bottom ash and A.P.C. (Air Pollution Control) residues which come from the incinerator each year. It is costing

us around about £1 million a year to deal with those. That £1 million is for the construction of the lined cells and also for the transport of the material from the incinerator into those cells.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can I clarify? All of the material goes into the cells now, not just the A.P.C.?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Yes, all of it goes in, but the difference from before, the A.P.C. and the bottom ash used to be mixed together and go into one cell. What happens now, they still go into cells, except it is separated out.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The bottom ash is separated from the A.P.C.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, going back to what you plan to do in the future, are you planning to review that strategy, and which of those elements, or both, are you planning to change?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, definitely with the A.P.C., and if possible also the bottom ash.

**Chief Officer:**

Just a point of clarification, the old Energy from Waste plant did not have A.P.C. residue. It had fly ash, which is the fine particulate that was taken out at the waste stream, but we did not add anything to the waste stream; there was no lime or carbon added, so it was not A.P.C. residue.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is the new E.f.W. (Energy from Waste) plant more efficient at extracting toxic residues than the old one?

**Chief Officer:**

By about a thousand times, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What happened to residues from the old one?

**Chief Officer:**

They went up the chimney, which is why we had a tall chimney.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Into the atmosphere?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Getting back to the A.P.C., which is now classed as hazardous I understand, how long before the pit, that monocell, is full, that first A.P.C. pit?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

About a year.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Another year from now? So we have got another year's use out of it before we need to construct another one.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

You said you have got consents for this; how high is the ash mountain going to be under those consents?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

At the highest point, it is about another 7 to 10 metres high.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What is it now?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

In...?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

In height, above ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

It depends where you measure it from.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

All right, mean high water springs.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

I would say 20 metres, at the highest point. But bear in mind, the cells which we are going to be building, certainly in the next 5 to 10 years, will be coming from a lower level, and to catch up with the highest point.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just make a comment? I know it has been commented on previously, the picture that has often appeared in the media when they have been talking about ash, which is the large mound on the end of La Collette, is nothing to do with the ash, you understand? That is the granite. Just for clarification.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I would like to have that explained; would you mind?

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Shall I pass that over to the Chief Officer or Director of Engineering and Infrastructure?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

I can do that. It is part of a large project we are doing at Bellozanne. We have excavated a hillside to create more space for the sludge facilities which are part of the S.T.W. (Sewage Treatment Works) replacements. That stone is being recycled and going back into the industry as secondary aggregates, so it has been excavated at Bellozanne, it has been carted to La Collette where we have got our aggregate recycling contractor. He is now storing that and he is then processing that over an amount of time, and he will be pushing that back out into the industry.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So that is a separate project?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can I briefly ask you about Guernsey? Can you tell us, Minister, what discussions you have had with Guernsey about their waste and the interest and the mention that has been made publicly about what Jersey may or may not do?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have had preliminary talks with Guernsey, but as you are aware, Chairman, they have just had recent elections, so we are not quite sure where they are going. They have voted recently to export their waste, which may or may not come to Jersey. But as you are aware, it will come before the States of Jersey whether we do or do not accept that waste. We at T.T.S. do have the technical capability to accept it; we have the capacity.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you see potential advantages that are worthy of investigation of Jersey considering doing that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think there are advantages there, yes. I would like to use some of that money we will be charging to offset any remediation process that we have.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Could I ask, Minister, there is a lot of speculation about how this waste, if it does come here, might arrive but have you done any meaningful research into the ways of transporting it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

They would do their own transportation; we would envisage it, if it does happen, coming in at Victoria Pier.

**Chief Officer:**

There are basically 2 options on the table, I think, in terms of preliminary talks. One is roll-on, roll-off, and the other is lift-on, lift-off. The lift-on, lift-off solution offers advantages in that it can be done at Victoria Quay, and Huelin Renouf, one of the

shipping companies, has put quite a bit of work into this to look at an innovative solution to facilitate that.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If that does happen as a roll-on, roll-off, it will be in sealed containers, so there will be no odours.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But that is a subject that you are investigating?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is a bit down the line, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Could I ask, are the environmental team involved in those investigations? For example, the traffic aspect of transport, increased vehicle movements, and so on?

**Chief Officer:**

The traffic aspects are down to us and our transport regulator who sits along the end there.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Two seats away.

**Chief Officer:**

We are looking at the traffic implications of that. In terms of the environmental implications we have been working with the Environment Director hand in hand on this from the start.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One last question on Guernsey: if we did do that - and this is a hypothetical question - obviously, their waste is going to generate ash. Are we therefore setting ourselves up, potentially, to increase the volumes of ash that we have got to deal with if we were to do that?

**Chief Officer:**

I believe if Guernsey ash stays in Jersey, Guernsey waste will not come to Jersey. So I think we have got to find innovative solutions that deal with ash in the most environmental and sustainable way.

[14:30]

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, funding-wise? At the beginning, in our first session, we spoke about funding bids. Presumably there is a big price tag on doing these improvements you have described, for the treatment of ash. Is that one of the bids that has gone forward?

**Chief Officer:**

It is indeed.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

If you do not get the support you need, what then?

**Chief Officer:**

Then we will be struggling.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will carry on fighting until we do get it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you. Are there any more questions on that?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, I have, getting back to this ash mountain. How long, given that we are putting 20,000 tonnes per year of ash in stockpiles, do you realistically think it will be before you get a solution, and then how long would it take to clear those many thousands of tonnes that you have already got, as well as the 20,000-plus that you will be producing?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So, remediation for the process?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, the whole lot, because I have got real concerns that some kind of accident could happen with some of those old liners, et cetera, and all our fish beds up the road could get contaminated.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am trying to progress it as fast as possible, but these things do take time.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

But, time-wise ...

**Chief Officer:**

Just to clarify: the legacy of the Bellozanne ash, the 34 pits, we are not planning any sort of remediation on those at the present time. Any remediation and any new solution will be based on the new Energy from Waste plant and the ash that has come out of the new energy ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are talking about the priorities, the A.P.C. ash.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What about the wash-through that we currently take from the ash pits to Bellozanne to be disposed of? Will that continue for ever and a day, then, given that you have just had leaching at Beauport for the last 15 years over the potato scenario. The leachate that comes out of those ash pits goes to Bellozanne, gets tipped into the digesters, and, because it has heavy metals within that water, some of it finishes up in St. Aubin's Bay, other gets into the sludge and finishes up on the land. Is that going to continue for ever?

**Chief Officer:**

When an ash pit is finished and capped off, we monitor water levels and unless there is damage to the ash pit, water levels are not prevalent in there. It is only ash pits that are currently being worked that we take the run-off from, and we are monitoring that very closely and basically the standard of the effluent that comes from them is equivalent to what comes off the road after a dry spell in terms of the amount of effluent contamination and the levels of dilution in there. I mean, that delivery to the sewage treatment works is not an issue and it is not something that causes a detrimental long-term effect on any form of disposal of sludge or water going into St. Aubin's Bay.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What about the heavy metals which are concentrated, could they not come up, in fairness?

**Chief Officer:**

There are heavy metals in everything. What happens is that heavy metals over time are locked in, in terms of bottom ash. One of the processes for bottom ash is you store it in an area where it gets weathered, and then in the UK and Europe, that becomes a recyclable product; that is what we are planning to do here. That is what we do in those lined pits. So I am not ... and if you look at the relative scales of things I do not believe that is an issue that is of a major problem, long term, for the Island.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Picking up the issues that the Constable has raised there, obviously if there were to be any pollution or any leachate from the site, this would need systems of detection. Can you tell us what monitoring arrangements are in place in that area to show that there is no leak into seawater?

**Chief Officer:**

We constantly monitor the water levels and any water ingress into the ash pits. We do testing of those samples, and also around the La Collette area. We have just done a thorough baseline test of the water quality in that area, over the last 18 months, and it has monitored whether there is any detrimental effect to the marine environment, because of the activities at La Collette. The output from that report is that we have not caused detrimental effect.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is that the long-term information? Have you got information on those studies going right back to when La Collette was first reclaimed?

**Chief Officer:**

No.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

When have you got that information from?

**Chief Officer:**

There has been long-term information that has not been collated from the Environment Department and what studies they have done but we have basically started again 18 months ago. We have done the full range of works and we will continue that work on a slightly more practical basis moving forward.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I would like to move on, if we could.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I want to come back on the heavy metals like the chrome and other things, lead, zinc, these other things that are in there which do not break down very easily, and others still worry me in their quantities. No matter how small they are, some of those do not break down.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well we are trying to take more and more out of the waste stream before it goes in, the recycling has been increased. Most supermarkets now have been very good to us in that they have battery collection points outside of the front door so little tiny mercury batteries and suchlike are no longer going into the waste stream and that is something we need to increase.

**Chief Officer:**

Just as a point to note here, I think looking back in terms of the environmental practice that occurred in the 1970s and the 1950s, we cannot apply environmental standards in reverse. Now, the difficulty we have got is I think it was a great decision in the 1990s to put ash in lined pits above the mean high water level at La Collette. Do not forget what we did before that, which was to bury it in the ground next to the sea in land reclamation sites with no barrier between that and the marine flora and fauna. So I think we have got to take stock of that. I do accept there are potential issues there but any reverse environmental engineering becomes a very difficult and perhaps philosophical argument as opposed to an argument about practicalities at this time.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Since you have raised that, I would just like to ask one question on that before moving on to a different subject. Legacy minus one, as it were, you spoke to about previous methods, is a lot of that ash residue still there or have they all been moved?

**Chief Officer:**

The majority of them I think have been moved. Well never say never when it comes to the previous land reclamations but I think the hotspots have pretty much gone. But the Island has had 100 years of dumps and tips and La Saline, Mont Mado, Trinity. It is a thing that people do, when people live is they put their waste somewhere. The standard of how we do it and how we improve it is down to us as custodians to move that forward and keep that going.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I think that is a convenient point to finish that subject. Thank you very much for your openness in the answers. We will be coming back to that in much more detail in the hearing. I would like to move now to having moved from solid waste disposal to the

subject of liquid waste, and here I am going to ask my colleague, the Deputy of St. Martin, to lead us on some of those questions please.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Thank you. Minister, medium-term financial plan and liquid waste obviously sits side by side. You, in the years to come, have got some money to spend on liquid waste. Could you just tell us where you are with that and also the life expectancy of what you have currently at Bellozanne in the way of liquid treatment works?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think Jersey should be very proud of its liquid waste infrastructure. We have invested millions into the system since Victorian times and this means we now have a comprehensive and robust network. Unfortunately infrastructure wears out and standards change, what was acceptable 20 years ago is not acceptable now. Therefore, we need constant funding for this unseen and unglamorous essential infrastructure. The sewage works were built in the 1950s and has now grown and been modified since that time. The plant has reached its limit in terms of performance and we believe we need a new facility to see us through for the next 50 years. The current plant successfully treats Jersey's sewage and meets all parameters with the exception of total nitrogen.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

When you say it has "reached its limits" could you expand? Did it reach its limit a week, 2 years ago, or is it coming up to reaching its limit?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It has been an ongoing modification for many, many years. If you think the plant is 50 years old and what our population was 50 years ago and what it is now, I think the plant has stood up extremely well. It has been expanded over the years. Chief Officer, do you want to add anything?

**Chief Officer:**

When you build a sewage works in a valley your ability to keep modifying it and changing it becomes more and more difficult. What I would say is when you build in a valley going upstream when it utilises gravity to flow and goes from upstream to downstream it is working against the actual lie of the land as well. The sewage treatment works was probably modified to its extreme position in 2000 and has not met the high standards that were set for it since that point.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So we have had over 12 years now with a liquid treatment works which are struggling to cope with capacity?

**Chief Officer:**

Just to clarify that, the struggle is with the total nitrogen parameter which is set. It does not struggle with anything that is related to human health or any other environmental detriment; it is just the nitrogen standard, which was a very stringent standard set.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I ask if you consider that nitrogen standard as harmful to health?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would not consider it harmful to health, no, it was a very high bar to reach, is what I would say.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Do you know where the vast majority of that nitrogen comes from?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is difficult to say, I mean, obviously some from the sewage plant, some comes off the land.

**Chief Officer:**

The World Health Organisation standard for total nitrogen in clean water is higher than the standard that we have set for our outfall from our sewage treatment works. So basically everything that comes in will have nitrogen levels at or above the level we are trying to achieve.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

How soon do you expect to be replacing the liquid works at Bellozanne? Well, 2 questions, when would you like to do it and when do you expect to do it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We would love to do everything yesterday but it is not feasible. The team are currently installing new sludge digesters, you may have seen a picture of myself on the front cover of the *J.E.P. (Jersey Evening Post)* in front of the old sludge digesters, which have seen better days. But across the other side of the valley are the new sludge digesters going in, which is why the hillside was removed, which is the mountain that has been described down at La Collette which will be recycled.

**Chief Officer:**

We have not got the money, this is the first step we need to make. If we could secure funding we could build a works within 3 years.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is this one of the bids in the medium-term plan?

**Chief Officer:**

It is indeed.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I ask, given the constraints of the pressures on population and maintaining it roughly where it is, do you expect to be receiving more sludge as you go on or are volumes of liquid going to reduce as we continue to separate our water and rainwater?

**Chief Officer:**

A sewage works deals with 2 things, it deals with the flow and it deals with load. The load tends to be in proportion to the amount of people who are here. I think there are strategic views in terms of the tourist industry, the sewage works was designed for a

tourist loading. The tourist industry has become I think less peaky in terms of when people come across and there is definitely less bed numbers. But whatever infrastructure you put in that is going to last you to the next 50 years has got to be able to cope with Jersey changing. So whatever provision we put in, if we size the plant for the needs now we have got to have provision to be able to expand it in the future, and the master planning we are doing at Bellozanne at the moment means that we will not be locked into a valley which is where we have been in the past. Because we have got to make sure that if Jersey changes its direction completely and doubles the population, or whatever happens - I am not saying that will happen - the infrastructure has got to be able to cope with either the growth of the population or a diminishing population.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So if you needed seriously more capacity than you will have at Bellozanne you would be looking to do that elsewhere?

**Chief Officer:**

No, what we would do is we would engineer the Bellozanne solution with enough expansion. The sewage works is fairly modular and what you would do is you would parallel up additional treatment facilities, designing from the start so that there is provision for that so it makes it future proof. When you are in a valley with a road on one side and a steep cliff on the other side your parallel up and hydraulic capacity of that plant is severely compromised.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Moving away from Bellozanne and talking about the system, the infrastructure if you like which feeds into it, where would you say, Minister, are the parts of the Island which are most under strain from under capacity?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well there is lots of work going on in town, there is a lot of work going on in Val Plaisant, which is storm water and foul water separation and, as you know, there is the Phillips Street shaft that will help out quite a bit too, taking the pressure off. Rural Parishes obviously like St. John and all points north obviously need better infrastructure but it is very, very expensive.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can I come in there?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes.

[14:45]

**The Connétable of St. John:**

The infrastructure, per se, in recent years has been picked up in a lot of cases by building in St. Helier, you have got a lot of new infrastructure, whether it is on the waterfront, et cetera, and there is a lot more to go, I presume, with all the developments. The services you have within St. Helier over the years have been lining drains, et cetera, will they cope with the additional work that, shall we say, is

being put in place or about to be put in place on the gas site, whatever is going to go on the Anne Street brewery site, the Anne Street site, because the demands are there. Are the services going to be large enough or are you going to have to put larger services in to cope? At the same time, I say that because the town has been getting the bulk of all the funding in most areas in the last 20 years to the detriment of the country areas which are the poor cousins and, in fact, people are being told they have to have tight tanks, they cannot any longer have soakaways, therefore, they are picking up the bills and paying twice to have their sewage removed through their taxes and then having to pay for it afterwards. Now, when are we going to see that resolved and get a level playing field right across the Island on the infrastructure?

**Chief Officer:**

Two questions there, the first question I think is, is there enough capacity in the town network to cope with more developments in town. The simple answer is yes, and we are very fortunate in that the Victorian systems that were put in here were called combined systems where rainwater flushed the sewage out to sea. What we have done over the last 10 to 15 years, and in particular over the last few years, is prioritise, separating the foul sewers from the surface water sewers which means you provide more capacity within the foul network for additional loading. So we are happy with the principle of changing the prioritisation of the sewers to meet demand and also improve the environmental benefit. The issue of rural people on tight tanks and septic tanks, soakaways, I think is very emotive, I think it is very unfair in a lot of regards and the J.C.R.A. (Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority) I think said it was unfair as well. It is a very difficult issue because the cost per household to extend sewers into the countryside comes to a point where it became unaffordable for the department in terms of priorities. Part of our local waste strategy funding long term is to increase that funding again and commence that but relative to the other needs within the system I think there should be more equity in terms of how we charge for some of the offline systems. But that will be a political decision and no doubt very emotive.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

On that point then, you have done one satellite system out in the country, i.e. Bonne Nuit, against my recommendation, it was the wrong site at the time.

**Chief Officer:**

I agree with you.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

But there were other prime sites like Mourier Valley where you have 60 or 70 households which could be all coupled up and a successful satellite site being put there where you do not have public access or a great deal of public access. Are you still looking at satellite sites or have you given up on the idea after the problems you had in the early days at Bonne Nuit?

**Chief Officer:**

The great thing about problems is they allow you to learn a hell of a lot about what to do and how to do things better in the future. We would definitely progress with more package plants in those cluster areas and I think it is a very innovative and sensible solution as opposed to connecting everything back to the mains.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I just make that a very convenient end? Do you want to add anything? I have just got 2 more questions I want to get in. We use ultraviolet at the moment as the final testing process, is that something we intend to carry on with in the new plant?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

In the new plant?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

When we update the liquid, is ultraviolet treatment going to continue to be there?

**Chief Officer:**

Jersey was the first large scale U.V. (ultraviolet) plant in Europe and I think our reputation and standing as an area where really high levels of clean beaches and excellent quality of sea, we would not lower that standard regardless of the treatment process. Tertiary treatment through U.V. has proved to be an excellent solution.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

There is nothing new on the horizon which might be better?

**Chief Officer:**

There is always different things but U.V. seems to be the most ... it fits us, it has got quite a high power demand but it is a small footprint and has proved to be very reliable.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Final question before we move on to the next subject and that is to do with the disposal of sludge, which is another one of those in 15 or 20 years time we might look back and say we did not do that as well as we can now. But is it your intention, Minister, to carry on drying sludge and spreading it on the land?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

For the foreseeable future.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Before we move to the next subject I would just like to pick up a question. Discharges from the waste plant, presumably you have to make the outfalls. Can you tell us about the arrangements you make for monitoring and checking those to make sure it is safe?

**Chief Officer:**

It is all within the licensing agreement with the regulator, yes, so we monitor ourselves and the regulator monitors us independently.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It is often said that discharges take place in other parts of the Island, not just from the Bellozanne outfall but elsewhere. Have you heard those things and do you have any response to those things that are said anecdotally? Places like, for example, in Grouville, a low lying area of the Island with the extent of development out there that

this has resulted in outfalls at certain times of high rainfall into the marine system, have you any thoughts on that?

**Chief Officer:**

Three years ago we undertook a full survey and study of every single outfall, low point, combined system overflow across all of the Island and we particularly focused on the southeast of the Island because of the issues with oysters. That was part of our update of our telemetry system and we recalibrated every single alarm and prioritised every point so that we knew what was happening. From that point, for any public system, we are very confident and comfortable if we do have a problem then it comes up on our telemetry system and then we inform the regulator who will act accordingly.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, well I think we will leave the subject, I think that this subject will be probably coming back in the future. If I can move now to some questions on transport and particularly picking up, not in detail, but the issues arising from the sustainable transport policy. Minister, this was a document that I think you were probably involved with before your present appointment and so you would be very, very familiar with this document. Can you tell us what your progress is, sum up your progress in implementing this and what your main priorities are for improving Jersey's sustainable transport?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well my department is delivering the sustainable transport policy in a number of ways. The key area is the retendering of the bus contract which you are aware of, with a number of additional work streams ongoing.

**Director of Transport:**

The biggest area at the moment is the retendering of the bus contract for 2013 and that is where a lot of our efforts have been applied at the moment. But we are also undertaking other actions required by the sustainable transport policy including undertaking a review of how we regulate taxis in the Island. In addition to that we are increasing the cycling facilities in the Island and improving pedestrian facilities. Also we are working on an active travel strategy which will encompass the aspects around cycling and walking and encouraging people to do that more which is an area of potential big gains, not just in transport but in health as well and encouraging people to have more active lifestyles. Then finally we are working on the road safety strategy.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can I just ask you, in the work that you are doing can you point to any tangible results as yet?

**Director of Transport:**

Well traffic levels on a whole in terms of the traffic peak levels and the annual daily flows are static at the moment, but that has got to be looked at in the context of the last census which showed a 10 per cent increase in population, so we added a 10 per cent increase in the population but we managed to hold the traffic level static. We are getting about 2 per cent per annum increase in bus usage and about a 1 per cent

increase in cycling. I think it is going to be a sort of S-shaped curve, you have a slow start, it builds up as it gets momentum and then obviously you get the peak to how much the population is willing to change and then it will level up again and then you need a new initiative to get to the next stage.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So we are in the slow start stage of implementing it?

**Director of Transport:**

I would describe that. In terms of public transport, I anticipate them improving more when we have got the new bus contractor on board and then we have got risk aligned with reward for the bus contractor and he is more incentivised to market the bus service to the community than in present arrangements.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I wonder, Minister, I was planning to include in my list some questions about the contract, do you want to talk generally and come back to that or would you like us to follow it up now?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Regarding the bus contract?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, regarding the benefits.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well we have a preferred bidder, as you are aware, which is CT Plus and negotiations are ongoing. It does not mean that other bidders are out of the picture but they are our preferred bidder and we are moving forward with that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What do you expect the benefits to be of a change in contractor, as it were?

**Director of Transport:**

I would not describe it as necessarily the benefits of the change in bus operator. I really think the big benefits come from moving from what is at the moment a minimum cost contract whereby the bus contractor is paid to operate the buses and drive them but the revenues return to the States, to a minimum subsidy contract whereby the operator has more incentive to use his commercial acumen to increase ridership, knowing that the revenues will come to him.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Does that mean we get more service for our money, as it were?

**Director of Transport:**

Ultimately, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It will do. It means that the new operator will be hungry for business.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But will it improve the quality of service?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am sure that it would do.

**Director of Transport:**

It has to do that to achieve the rewards provided for within the contract. If he does not increase the patronage then he will not receive the rewards in extensions of time and hitting his performance targets. But to be able to get that increase he has got to improve the quality and the quantity of the offering.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are key performance indicators which they must hit.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

A lot of people in Jersey express worry about are we going to lose the double-deckers, are we going to lose the nice new buses where we have got nice new buses on the route. What assurances can you give about that, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well that will be part of the new contract with whoever it would be, it would probably, I would say, increase the double-deckers, not a decrease in the double-deckers.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The buses which people like me can squeeze on the seats?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The double-deckers operating at present were at our instigation and they used me as a template and I am 6 foot 3, so I can get into all the new buses very well. I mean, apart from the old blue Caetanos which are in use at the moment, there is the new Enviro 200s which offer more leg room, that is the white buses, and the Enviro 400s, which are the double-deckers, also with plenty of leg room. So whichever contractor takes over it will need to be of a very high standard and I believe the buses will need to be approved by the department.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, concerns have also been raised about the arrangements for the transfer to a new contractor, safeguards for existing employees, what is going to happen to the existing bus fleet and the use of the garage; can you give us a summation of what you have got in your mind over that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would imagine that the garage would be transferred. Regarding the fleet and the staff I believe T.T.S. use their best endeavours to transfer the fleet but if it is not required then a new fleet will be brought in. But I foresee if all goes well there will be an increase in drivers taken on, not a decrease.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I just step in, just sort of an aside involving buses as well. Park and ride, Minister, we are seeing an increase in levels of people parking outside St. Helier and getting on buses and in some areas, St. Aubin and others, bit of an issue with the number of cars being left in those areas during the day. Do you envisage park and ride as a success that we can yet to attain and, if so, do you envisage fields or areas of land taken for specific parking for park and ride?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think that is happening genetically at the moment. In your neck of the woods, Deputy, it is St. Martin, a lot of people are driving from St. Martin down to Grouville, parking at Long Beach car park in Grouville and getting on the bus and coming in and reverse process going out. So I think this is something that is happening, if you like.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes, I realise that, Minister, but the reason for the question is should we now be creating facilities specifically for park and ride because at Long Beach we have commuters using what we would like in the summer to be classed as tourist parking areas, and the same at St. Aubin?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

What I would like to see is the bus system improved greatly so that satellite systems will be coming right up through St. Martin and picking up everyone not from their door but from very near by.

[15:00]

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just add briefly to what the Minister said, I mean, the department has looked at the opportunities for park and ride in the past and the classical U.K. model of park and ride where you have a very large out of town site with cheap parking and then a bus every 5 minutes to provide that convenience is not really suited to Jersey. But, as the Minister said, there probably is an opportunity for commuters in terms of, say, commuters travelling to a car park which is not well used, say in St. John for instance, and arranging for the bus to pick up there, something along those lines. That is certainly an opportunity and once the contract is awarded we will expect that operator to go out and meet with the Parishes and discuss their transport needs and how they can best be met.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you for that, I think we may come back to the issue of car parking.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No, while we are on that one, I - under the previous Minister - raised this several times and I even suggested to the Minister and to the C.E.O. (Chief Executive Officer) that Les Fontaines car park, the big one on La Route du Nord, was the perfect type of car park, likewise Les Platons, but nothing ever happened. I would sincerely hope that the new contractor, whoever he or she may be, runs with some of these bus hubs and that way the people from St. Mary can come in or Trinity to one of these hubs and use it. Because currently it is a big problem, they all park in our village for 12 hours or 8 hours in a day and create mayhem.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am more than happy to take that up with the new operator.

**Director of Transport:**

Cyclists too, because you do not want to cycle all the way into town.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Phil, do you want to get back in or is that ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Well, no, because I notice it also covers taxis and other things, are we going to get into that now or not because if we are moving on I would like to know where we are on the review on the taxis. I know you have got a review ongoing, what kind of feedback have you had and when will you be moving forward?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As you are aware it has just gone out to consultation.

**Director of Transport:**

I have probably got the most up-to-date information on that. We are at the consultation with our Green Paper now until 28th June. What we are endeavouring to do is to meet with everyone who expresses an interest in taxis or evolved an interest so we set up a series of drop in workshops where taxi drivers, taxi associations, and taxi companies can come and speak to us directly. We are hoping a lot of drivers will come to speak to us so we can discuss with them their view of the industry, but also we are arranging workshops where we invite people such as the Consumer Council, the Chamber of Commerce, Age Concern and the like along where they can discuss with the industries what their aspiration for the taxi industry in Jersey is. I would describe the situation at the moment as the beginning of the change curve. People are fearful of change, we are very mindful of that, we have got what is effectively independent businessmen who are driving the taxis and this could impact severely on their livelihood. So at the moment we are gathering information but ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I wonder, have we covered that, Phil?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No, carry on.

**Director of Transport:**

The questions posed really I suppose are who says 312 taxis is the right number to serve the population. So far no one has been able to answer that question. Can someone tell me why a 2-tier taxi system would serve the Island better than a single tier, and so far there have been no answers forthcoming. So we are basically saying what we have got now, why is that the best system and what could we have in the future and what might that look like. Bearing in mind that to achieve a high quality taxi service we have got to attract and keep professional drivers who can deliver that. If people cannot invest in their vehicles and cannot invest in a stable future in taxis then they are unlikely to provide the high quality service we are looking for.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What percentage of taxi drivers and cab drivers, call them what you will, have contributed to date into your survey?

**Director of Transport:**

The response so far has been low I would say, but the associations have asked their members not to respond immediately because they have got plenty of time until they have agreed a common position. But the level of engagement by the associations has been high.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I wonder if I just ... there is a lot of material to cover so thank you for that, Minister. We may well be coming back to that subject but we are all interested to see what it produces. Minister, are you in favour of further pedestrianisation in the urban area?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

In the town area?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am personally in favour of limited pedestrianisation. The town does, in fact, carry many of the main arteries to the Island and if we pedestrianise too much, I think we could be in danger, in my opinion, of killing part of town.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you think there is scope for further pedestrianisation perhaps to help business in?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Further limited pedestrianisation.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can we take that to mean, then, that bus lanes specifically just for buses and bikes might not be something we can look forward to seeing?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Bike lanes I do not have a problem with. Bus lanes are a little more tricky because most of the roads we use in Jersey were built by General Don. Unlike the U.K., we cannot build bypasses. We have to retrofit everything we have so it is very difficult without demolishing houses, which obviously we would not do, to make everything fit.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about traffic management schemes, Minister? Do you feel that there is any scope for improved traffic management schemes in town, for example, to improve the quality of residential areas and help with urban regeneration?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely, it is ongoing. The Director of Transport is constantly working on this. We have announced today that we have more filter in turns going in the St. Helier/St. Saviour area and they are very successful and it does promote good driving standards but we are always open to suggestions and the team are always looking at ways of improving traffic movement.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you taking a lead in that, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is this something you are working with the Minister for Planning and Environment on?

**Director of Transport:**

I am unaware of any specific initiative that has been raised with Planning and Environment but every time there is a new development in town, then we look to improve pedestrian access, sustainable transport links and that sort of thing. A lot of money has been invested in St. Helier over the decades with the St. Helier renewal schemes and various other funds so we are also starting really to look at costs. We need to look at the wider picture and look at where we can improve the lot of other Parishes ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you involved in those groups, Minister, these groups on urban regeneration and urban improvements, are you involved in that, your department?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not me, the department is involved.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The department is involved?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Director of Transport:**

The urban renewals group has been pretty ...

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

The problem with urban renewals is finished now. We were involved with Planning for many years and we jointly implemented things ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So that stopped?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

There is no funding for urban renewal.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

No money?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So all that money has been spent in St. Helier, not in the country then?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

It was predominantly spent in ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Why?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

The schemes which were highlighted by the group and the officers and politicians on the group were highlighting schemes in St. Helier at the time and that is where they have been spent. The schemes have been very successful for the town but, as you say, they were not spent out in the country.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The team does attend meetings of the St. Helier Roads Committee now and again and you say “town” but town has expanded into other Parishes, if you like. Town is not just St. Helier. The north-east of town is St. Saviour, going way up to the Parish Hall, et cetera, and all points east and west. There has been a lot of infilling so to say just St. Helier does not really apply any more.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Just looking at what has happened, the town seems to have taken 95 per cent of it. The remainder, the other 11 Parishes have taken very, very little if anything at all and what are you going to do about finding some funding to make sure it happens in other Parishes?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are working with all the Parish Constables, including yourself, Constable, to remedy this. We are looking at village treatments for all the Parishes and that is something we wish to progress.

**Director of Transport:**

We have been encouraged also to get out and start meeting some Roads Committees and we are getting around the Parishes meeting the various Roads Committees and I think the thing that we have found is that there is a surprising number of issues that have been going on for decades that have not been addressed because the funding is not available. Every Parish has got an extensive wish list of things they would like to happen and some of those have been longstanding and we want to work closely with the Parishes to try and achieve those.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Through your officers, Minister, you will be picking those issues up?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, I just wanted to close this one with one question on cycling. Priority routes for cyclists; have you any plans and are there any actions you feel you can take to help cyclists, for example, deal with places like Beaumont Hill where we have got signs that say no cycling on the footpath there.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I thought it was the other way round.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Sorry, no pedestrians on the ... no cycling signs where places are dangerous for cyclists to ride up hills.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, Beaumont Hill is a good example of where it is safer for a cyclist to cycle on the pavement going up there. Very very few pedestrians use that particular route. It is now possible with the cycling route to cycle from the west of the Island from Corbiere all the way down to Havre des Pas but the last section of that is joint use. Pedestrians on the front there, joint use Havre des Pas pedestrians and cyclists, but pedestrians have priority.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So you are in favour of shared use wherever it can be done?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am in favour of shared use as long as it is used sensibly and pedestrians have priority.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So is there anything that can be done with cycle lanes up at you know hills, Mont Les Vaux and others, the difficulties up there, the cyclists going up there in the dark in the night in the winter?

**Chief Officer:**

As the Minister has said, we are stuck sort of with the roads we have. The cycle provision we have got in some areas along the front is probably the best one you will see anywhere in the world. We are very fortunate to have that but as soon as you start going north and you start going up the hills, then the cycling provision becomes difficult and sometimes intimidating to such people as casual cyclists. My view is I think we should have arterial routes out of St. Helier which are prioritised with cyclists. Waterworks Valley is one which comes to mind straight away which is a nice steady gradient where you could do a shared scheme similar to the one that has been on West Hill for many years where you have got a demarcation and bollards there. The bollards could be on U.V. so they have small light-emitting mechanisms in there so you can light up Waterworks Valley at night because if you ever go cycling

in Waterworks Valley at 5.00 p.m. on a winter's night, it is black and so there is lots of provision we can do. We have got to be brave and take on one of these ... and I think we have got to try and engage with the green lane scheme which nearly worked whenever it was put in many years ago where we can get linkage. One of the issues we have got with the Havre des Pas cycle network which goes right the way past the Energy from Waste plant right the way round the steam clock to connect on is that you have got points of difficulty of the English and French harbour which we are discussing with Planning at the moment to extend the harbours out a little bit to put a decent cycle track across there and also the bit around the S.o.J.D.C. (States of Jersey Development Company) land where it does not quite work in terms of road surfacing so if you can get those ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What do you call the S.o.J.D.C. land?

**Chief Officer:**

Just by the cinema there, there is a bit which is not tarmaced.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I see, right. But you are working on that?

**Chief Officer:**

We are working on all that connectivity and we have just extended the width of all the cycle provision in front of the harbour and round the steam clock and the difference between another adding another metre to metre and a half on the cycle lane is extremely good in terms of shared use where you have got multiple road users and cyclists using it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

If you want to go on to electric cars.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes I have been talking about the environment and being brave, Minister. I have recently been fortunate and very surprised to have used an electric car, which I found wonderful I have to say, and I was very surprised to say that after 10 days but anyway I was. Can we look forward to seeing some plug-in points in our car parks and some free parking for people who buy electric cars?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is something we are looking into. I too borrowed the car for a week and I was very impressed as was the Chief Officer. It motors very well, it is quiet, it has enough motor to get you going. Plug-in points is something we are looking at for multi-storey car parks. Having them free might be another item but we are looking for a sponsor for that possibly.

**Chief Officer:**

Just to add on that, we had a meeting with J.E.C. (Jersey Electricity Company) last Friday who are very supportive of the plug-in points within the car parks. Free is something we would not support. I think in terms of the hierarchy of transport, electric car is high up but it is not as high up as cycling and some of the other modes

of transport. So if we are going to incentivise good behaviour, I believe we should incentivise all the good behaviour so whether there is a cheap bicycle scheme, maybe tax breaks on bicycles would be something that I would be looking at prior to free parking for electric vehicles.

[15:15]

We do do subsidised parking for any vehicle with an emission level less than 100 grams per kilometre in terms of CO2 which obviously electric vehicles fit into that.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Do they fit into that once you take into account the disposal of batteries?

**Chief Officer:**

Oh ... [Laughter]

**Director of Transport:**

Just to add to the answer, I think that you will see that there will be some plug-in points by the end of the summer if not before.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We spoke about car parking there. There was a nice convenient lead into our next subject. Have we got the right level of car parking in town for the needs of business and residents, shoppers, et cetera? Where do we stand on this now, Minister, bearing in mind the loss of Gas Place and the proposed loss of Green Street extension? Where do we stand on this?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Parking in St. Helier is a very controversial subject especially with the pressure that is put on by the loss of spaces. The north of town provision is a concern and a temporary capacity issue. We are trying to maximise the utilisation of spaces and in the pipeline you probably know we have A.N.P.R., the automatic number plate recognition system, which we will be trialling in I think about 6 weeks; a bit longer?

**Director of Transport:**

The end of June.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The end of June, which we will be trialling in Sand Street car park. The automatic number plate recognition system means that if you park there, on your way in, the camera sees your car it, logs your registration and you are charged for the time you use. So if you meet a friend in town and want to go for a coffee, it is not a question of rushing back in case you get a ticket.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So how do you pay then, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

On your way back you can have a prepaid card and you put your card in the machine and then you have got about a few minutes to exit and it logs your vehicle on exit.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And so that is your favoured system, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is the preferred system at present and it is something we are trialling in Sand Street and if it is a success, which I am sure it will be, then we will probably be rolling it out to all our multi-storey car parks.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are there simpler systems?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, it is something that is tried and tested.

**Director of Transport:**

The problem with car parking infrastructure is its age and to have a barrier system. The simpler system ... the other system is a barrier system but you need to have more than one exit because if the barrier breaks down, the car park just locks up, and this particularly is true of these car parks where everyone enters and exits at the same time. You could not afford to have an issue. So A.N.P.R. seems to offer all the benefits without the drawbacks.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If you have a car park that is used by commuters, then people can exit in a relatively fast ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

There is no barrier to go through.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, completely barrier free.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

No, there is no barrier at all.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It may be my naivety I don't know ...

**Director of Transport:**

To sum up. The car park automatically times your stay in the car park. You have an option then to pay on foot when you arrive at the car park for the parking used. That is it in its simplest format but the benefit of having this particular system is you could set up an online account because there are no barriers to go through so every time you enter and exit a car park, it will just take the money off your account.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You could sort of prepay. You could set up an account. It registers your registration on the way in, times it, registers your registration on the way out, times it, and that's what you pay for.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So you are working on that now, you are trialling it at the moment?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are trying it, end of June.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So I think this may be a subject we will be talking to you another day, I think, about this.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you think the level of charges in car parks at the moment are about right or do they need to be increased in view of the need to be able to achieve the sustainable transport policy?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is a very tricky question.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It is a political question, Minister, but it is your personal opinion I am seeking because I accept ... is there a States policy on car park charges?

**Director of Transport:**

There is ... [Laughter]

**Chief Officer:**

It is a very political question and I will answer it as a non-political person. The success of the Minister for Transport and Technical Services is inversely proportional to the car parking charges. It is a very emotive subject. I think it is one that under the last Minister we put the charge up substantially at the start of the term of office because the previous Minister had held them back, and it is something that without political intervention I would do tomorrow. I can afford to be unpopular, just, and it is something that we would do to incentivise better behaviour but it is a very emotive and political and a very heartfelt subject.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Well, maybe I could help you out because I can perhaps lead the question in a slightly different direction. Going back to our earlier discussions about infrastructure and the lifetime of our car parks, how long will they last? How much is ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

About 25 years, I think.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

We have just been given a number of 100 years. Now you are just telling us it is 25.

**Chief Officer:**

Just to clarify, car parks are not classed as infrastructure in terms of a G.A.A.P. process but they are a long-term asset but the realities, a lot of them were designed in the 1950s-1960s when cars ... you know, an Austin A35 was a small car. Minis are not small cars now. The size of the spaces, the provision of a car park, getting in and out of it, there is a point when they become less fit for purpose. However, the good thing about this car park trading fund is it is an autonomous fund but it keeps getting money taken from it for other initiatives which then means that we have got to make the assets last longer. So we are always on the breadline in terms of ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But are you at the point where you will need to make major investments in those car parks? Would that not lead you to an issue of reviewing charges if you did?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you at the point of having to make major investments in them?

**Chief Officer:**

The next investment from the car park trading fund will be Ann Court. The Ann Court provision which is always the ... and that is why the issues of north of town are temporary, is the underground car park at Ann Court, which is the plan at the moment, would require funding from our car park trading fund and we would be happy to pay for that as part of our long-term assets.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Moving just a couple of 100 yards away, what is the current situation with Minden Place then?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, there was a plan, I think part of the North of Town Masterplan to demolish Minden Street car park and build, call it a miniature park there, and I campaigned to reverse that then. I would like it to stay. It is quite an old car park now but it has got a few years left in it. It is quite popular with people visiting the Arts Centre, people visiting the market and visiting town generally and I would like to keep it going as long as reasonably possible.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can we move on from there?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What, from the car park?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Well, yes, because I want to know about motorcycle parking in ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We will put the question in afterwards so then a couple of questions on car parking.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Well, motorcycle parking in the north of town. What have you got, or very little in the Midvale Road area given you have got a car park there, but nothing per se for motorcycles or anything in Midvale Road, et cetera?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is parking for motorbikes provision in Minden Street car park.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Minden Street?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Minden Street.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, but I am talking about further north up towards Midvale Road.

**Director of Transport:**

What I want to say about motorcycle parking is we are always looking for opportunities to increase motorcycle parking so we have increased the total quantity of motorcycle parking over the last couple of years by about 30 per cent. Admittedly, most of that is in the south of town.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, on the Esplanade.

**Director of Transport:**

We have managed to provide some additional motorcycle parking, I cannot remember the proper numbers, but in Ann Court/Charles Street car parks there is more parking there. Where we find opportunities, we will increase motorcycle parking and that is one of our priorities. This year we will be developing a car parking strategy and that will be one of things that we will be looking as part of that but we are going to do it where land becomes available.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

But remember you have got street parking all over the north of St. Helier. Can you not take some street parking and resident parking out and put ...

**Director of Transport:**

That is Parish of St. Helier resident parking zones.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

That is on a public highway which is owned by us, the States of Jersey, and there is revenue going to places in St. Helier so that cannot be right. If we have got to resurface roads, et cetera, so that the Parish of St. Helier can get a revenue off of it, surely you should be taking that up, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, this is something that has been before my time. It was all set up ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But you will look at that, will you, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I will look at that, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Fine.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

May I ask a question then which relates to Green Street car park. There are plans at the moment afoot to possibly put a police station there. That loses us about 80 car parking spaces. If a police station is built in Green Street, there will be need for parking for the people who are working at the police station and who are visiting the police station. So on one hand, we lose parking spaces and increase the number of people who might want to be parking in that area. Is there not a case to be made here for multi-storeying Snow Hill and then using that as an access to Fort Regent and killing 2 birds with one stone?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I hear what you are saying regarding Green Street. I will start by saying I am not the sponsoring Minister for that but in the plan there will be underground parking at the police station but that will be predominantly for police cars, police vans, et cetera, so I hear what you say regarding the uptake. With regard to Snow Hill, we have had to have 3 or 4 sets of plans before us and because of the shape of Snow Hill, it is not really economically viable to make a multi-storey there, bearing in mind we need a certain height to get access to the cavern for the trucks to get down there. I think we have had about 3 sets of plans recently.

**Director of Transport:**

In the files is I think it is 8 schemes that we developed at various times for Snow Hill for different multi-storey schemes. The problem, as the Minister alluded to, is the geometry at the site you get a very poor yield. We are looking at 2 things at the moment. One, we are looking at how we can better utilise the existing surface parking we have got there and we think we can increase that and that could be done short-term. In the medium/long-term, we are also going to revisit the multi-storey schemes and have one last bash at designing a multi-storey scheme. The problem with the multi-storey scheme is that you lose most of the car parking spaces to ramps and roads because of the narrow space but, in particular, we would have to do further stabilisation work on that rock face and that really pushes up the prices to a prohibitive level. So typically we would be looking at about £20,000 for a parking space for a normal multi-storey car park.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

May I ask why you need to stabilise the rock face if you build a multi-storey car park and you do not need to stabilise the rock face if you do not?

**Director of Transport:**

Access. At the moment we have got access to clear the rocks that fall down so what we have got at the moment ... there is a stabilisation area. It is a passive system where the rocks come down and come to the bottom and then once a year we go to get them out. In the future, we will need to have something which actively bolted the rocks into place.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But you do accept the fact that Green Street car park is a sort of a dugout anyway. Naturally putting a roof on it and parking more cars would be quite a sort of a natural progression, notwithstanding the expense.

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, we could do that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, would you not agree that there is an opportunity potentially in the Snow Hill cut and the comments just made, keeping in mind the fact we still have not failed to find a solution to Fort Regent and the key to that is clearly the access. Do you not think that that subject is something that should be discussed intra-Ministers to see whether it is possible to find a solution that ticks several boxes as it were?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Oh, absolutely. The department is working on other possible plans for the Snow Hill car park. I would agree 100 per cent that we need easy access to Fort Regent from Snow Hill, a scenic elevator or such like taking people straight up there. I remember as a young boy going for a swim, up on the cable cars, having a swim, back down again straight into town again and it was terrific but Fort Regent was built as a fort to keep people out so when it did away with the cable cars, it did just that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But it is a great asset going to waste, is it not, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would say so, yes. But on the subject of car parks, the other side of Fort Regent we have got Pier Road car park where we have spare capacity. We have about I think 100 and ...

**Director of Transport:**

Depending on the time but yes, it is around 150 to 200 spaces.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

About 150 to 200 spaces but it is not in the right place. People do not want to use that. They want the other side of town.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay. I think, Minister, before we move on from this subject, we would like a clear answer on whether you support the loss of the Green Street to the Police Headquarters or not.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Would I support the building of the police station?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, to lose the capability of an existing surface car park and the potential that exists there to increase its utilisation for car parking in town.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am in favour of the new police station being built. I would rather it was built elsewhere.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you, Minister. One last question on this subject. Do you think it is necessary for Government to own, run and operate car parks itself?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think it is quite good. T.T.S. do an excellent job. It is cost effective. If you think of similar car parks in the U.K., then the fees would be probably twice as much. I think if you are looking at London or Brighton or elsewhere, to park your car for the day would be horrendously expensive. So I think it is good value for money.

[15:30]

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But if you had to make major investments into a car park, Minister, would that not be an issue to look at?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, I like to look after the people of Jersey. That is my main priority.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I was not suggesting otherwise, Minister, thank you. I think now if we can ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Could I just get one last question, John?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Go on then.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Minister, we see a lot of commercial vehicles parked in car parks and on roads lately during the nights when they are not working. Do you have any views on the businesses that send their commercial vehicles home with their employees to let the employees find spaces to park them?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am not in favour of that at all. I think it is unfair to residents in the area and I would rather that employers kept their vehicles in their own yards and people took their cars home or made other arrangements.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you, Minister. We are going to change the subject on to roads and my colleague, the Constable of St. John, will be leading the questioning on this one.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, I will. The road resurfacing which you have got on your list there, et cetera, and traffic calming roads for road safety, given the poor state of many of our roads, and even the quality of the work that we are seeing being done by some of our contractors, do you feel that we are getting value for money? I will refer now immediately to Queens Road where I see potholes in there and it has only been done about 5 years and some of the work that has been on the airport main road.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

To start with the airport main road; I went and had a look at it myself with my colleague the Assistant Minister last Friday and I take the Constable's point but it is up to standard. It is unfortunate that apparently because of the way things are, we had to keep the road open during the daytime because obviously it is a working airport. To close it at night, there were a few problems inasmuch as the temperature dropped rapidly one night which means that several sections of tarmac did not set properly. This was unfortunate and it had to be relaid which meant that in several sections there were one or 2 ridges where the joins were made and this coincides with a few drain covers. So there are one or 2 bumps as you go along but it is up to standard and up to specification.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Could I just step in there? Is it not possible for the contractor to look at a weather forecast and to say: "We are not going to lay tarmac tonight because it is not going to warm enough to set??"

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, they were under pressure.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

There are 2 issues. It is not purely temperature and this relates to funding and sort of how the industry has changed. Previously all the road resurfacing was done by one gang which was Ronez's road laying gang. Ronez made some decisions. Due to the reduction in funding from the States, there was not sufficient continuous work for them to stay in 2 gangs. They have now gone down to one gang and there was a period of where the road resurfacing programme went down to a very low figure where we almost had no road laying. When I say road laying, I am talking about with the big machines. With the current level of funding which we have got, there is only 2 roads being relaid with the big machines this year and the industry has diversified which is good for us because we can now get some competition in the prices but it may mean that you know, for example, on the airport road Ronez, as it was, did not win it. Another company won it. It may mean that Ronez's road laying gang may not get that machine out all year. So it is a lack of skills not perhaps being able to do the actual laying. The more money we can get back into the resurfacing programme, which we are creeping back to somewhere near where we were, gives more continuous work and enables those gangs to regain those skills. A lot of the people who were in the resurfacing industry have come out of the industry completely and those skills are lost. So (1) it is the actual skill level; (2) is the fact of the location of

where we will be laying these roads now. In reality, the previous people who were involved in T.T.S. did all the easy ones. The roads we are laying now are all very difficult areas. Now, I do not say that lightly but the airport road is a very difficult road when to do it and how to do it. It must be done as a night job. You know, we have got jobs like the tunnel this year. We have done Queens Road. There is a lot around the ring road in the last few years. They are very difficult jobs not to lay but in order to get the logistics right so you can get the machines in there to lay without disrupting. Now, the fact that it was a night project, the guys are looking at the weather all the time. There are various issues why the asphalt did not go down at the right temperature, but that is between the contractor and the material supplier. They got it wrong. They paid to put it right. Now, I will go on to what Kevin said, everything which is currently on the ground, on the airport road, meets our specification. Anything which was wrong was taken out and replaced.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Everything is guaranteed for 52 weeks, is it?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Yes.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Twelve months. Of the infrastructure, I believe you are saying 1 per cent was spent on the infrastructure. The life of your asphalt is 15, 20 years maximum.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Twenty-five years.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

It is not 25 years since that road was done previously.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just interject? It really depends on the level of traffic. So, the busiest roads, which would be the airport, Victoria Avenue, Beaumont Hill, you would expect to get about 10 years out of them; the less busy road, but still main distributors, 20 years. Then the smaller States roads, which do not get that much use, you would expect to last about 30 years. But they are not being resurfaced at anything like that rate. So, they are basically being patched up to make do and make them last longer.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So, your 1 per cent does not meet the target then?

**Chief Officer:**

The one per cent is an arbitrary figure. We have not said our infrastructure will last 100 years. It is just an arbitrary figure that works out ... that is how much we are spending on that amount of assets. You are quite right, for the road surface that means replacing on a more frequent rate than once every 100 years. But the road, as a whole structure, it probably does last 100 years. So, there is no correlation between the 100 years and all of the assets.

**Director of Transport:**

The road surface is a sacrificial layer.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, but can you give me the numbers? How much per annum are you spending on road resurfacing, say for 2012? How much are you going to spend?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

2012, £3 million.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

How does that compare to what you spent on the roads, shall we say, in 1994, 1997, when you were spending anything between up to £14 million?

**Chief Officer:**

We were very fortunate in that era, were we not?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No, I am saying ... so, in real terms, that £3 million you are going to spend this year, compared to what was being spent in the 1990s is in fact 12 per cent.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

In the 1990s we were spending a significant amount. In the early part of 2000 there was a significant drop, certainly in 2005/2006 we were spending very little at all. We then applied for more funding and with various policies supporting us we have now gained the infrastructure money on a rolling vote. Previously you had to apply in the capital process for every single, individual, resurfacing project. We lost a lot, because you were up against things like schools, hospitals, et cetera.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

But we are never going to catch up at the percentage of £3 million a year.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

We agree completely. I mean to give you some facts, there are about 160 kilometres of main road and our resurfacing monies currently does about 1 kilometre.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How much do you need to spend now? What is the value of the shortfall?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

On our higher asset programme, the funding which we currently have now will allow the roads to, what we say, stand still, not have further deterioration. In order to gain back and start improving, we feel we need about double of that. In the medium-term financial plan, we have applied for some inflation on the existing amounts which we have and also an increase to take account of the backlog of funding, which we have not had before. We have applied for a second lot of £3 million in 2015/2016.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Could I ask, Chairman, what percentage, would you say ... the deterioration of our roads is going at a great pace. They are getting really, really bad. How much of that is made up in the lack of quality and resurfacing of trenching by supposedly

contractors that are supposed to know what they are doing. But a couple of weeks after they have laid the tarmac it became obvious that they really have not come up to spec.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

The issue of trenching. Service companies have got their services below the road and they do need to maintain those, so, there will always be trenching in the road. Historically that has always happened. It causes significant damage to the road, not just to the surface, but the overall structure of that road. We have increased the requirement now. How that trenching work is done. We have recently taken on some additional inspectors to make sure that the contractors who are doing it are doing it as they should be. I think we are in a position now where we are changing to a permit system as well, with our new Street Works Law, which means for the moment service contractors go in where they want. Now they have to ask us and we will give permission. We will know exactly where they are. When they are doing anything, we will be able to inspect anything. So, we are doing everything we can to make it better. But any trenching of an existing road will cause accelerated deterioration.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is great co-operation at present between the service providers and T.T.S.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But that is informal, is it, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Informal, yes. But, as the Director of Engineering and Infrastructure said ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And it is ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

... they will need our permission.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And that will be coming forward to the States, will it? Sorry? This year?

**Project and Planning Manager:**

Early 2013.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Would it be possible for my colleagues to see the Street Works Law? Because I have had the presentation twice and I thought it was very useful.

**Chief Officer:**

I am very happy to give that to you.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yeah, we can do that at a later. I mean, the Street Works Law, presumably models the situation in the U.K. where you get statutory control of what interventions are done in the road and so on.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

We can give you that presentation and also there will be a presentation on the new street works system, which is in place now.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But at the moment we are relying on informal methods and it sounds to me as if we are having to pick up the costs as a result of damage to roads in the long run.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

As I say, any trenching in the road will cause damage to the road and, yes, we are picking up those costs, long term. The service companies are now working in the same way informally as they will be when the new law comes in. But it has taken years to get them to that position.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That effectively means that they pay for the cost, does it? So, we do not have latent costs as a result of that?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

No, we do not pay toward ...they pay for the costs of a high ... we have increased the specifications for repair to those trenches. So, they repair those. But, I think it has to be accepted that the utilities which are below the road do need to be maintained and updated.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I understand. Phil, do you want to carry on?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes. Can I move on from there to traffic calming? What is proposed ... because you did briefly mention about the street works, traffic calming that you were going to hopefully put in place across the Island. When are you going to move forward with that and go and meet the various roads committees and see what the needs are or are they going to have to be proactive themselves and contact you?

**Director of Transport:**

We have met with some of the most interested roads committees. We are developing 2 schemes at the moment. However, the schemes are not cheap and will need funding. That funding is not available. We do not have funding available to develop the schemes in any other location at this present time. But, if any Parish is willing to contribute and provide funding we will be very happy to work alongside them to get a scheme in place. Then, obviously, the implementation is another issue.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can I come in on that funding issue, Minister? Given, for some unknown reason, while in the position of Assistant Minister on your ministry, you were in a position where you allowed the Parish of St. Helier to get the funding they required for Cheapside and the like. You worked with them and you currently did something, not dissimilar, I think, with the new park, they picked up 50 per cent, I believe, of the work on the little road there and picked up the remainder. If you had funding until

then, how come you have not put a bid in for funding for the rest of the Island on traffic calming and improvements to the various country areas that need it?

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Cheapside was an economic stimulus project and the money was funded from that. What we are looking to do, when we do resurfacing, we try and do what we call “route improvement”. So, we are not just doing the resurfacing. We are trying to look at, as we come through that, doing any signage, barriers, cycle/pedestrian improvements. It is unlikely that we are going to come back and be resurfacing the road based on the programme I was describing every 30 years. So, the Cheapside project was a road which needed resurfacing, but as we came through and resurfaced it, we did some of what I would call “urban renewal” on the footpaths and street lighting as we went through.

[15:45]

**The Connétable of St. John:**

If I could stop you there then? Given that the Council of Ministers have just found another £27 million, which they are throwing into housing, et cetera, why did you not put in a bid, Minister, to do economic stimulus on traffic calming measures on the rest of the Island?

**Chief Officer:**

Can I answer that? I am currently working with the Treasurer to facilitate that. The economic stimulus packages we were, I think, very successful in securing in T.T.S. and we have undertaken a lot of work and got some of the backlog maintenance undertaken in that period. I see the village gentrification that will facilitate this, in terms of more of a French approach to our village centres, which we spoke to your Parish about, is something which I think would be great for Jersey and a great way for keeping people in work and developing local skills. That is the angle we are developing at the present time. We are going to take it to the Minister for Treasury and Resources, hopefully.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Should there not be a meeting with the committee of the Constables? In my own Parish there are certain issues there where roads are, frankly in laymen terms, minor roads, but they happen to be main roads, in the way they are used, because the way the development is happening. There are big issues of traffic calming and road safety for pedestrians. Is there not a case for some sort of co-ordination of a programme, to spread this principle of safety and traffic calming around the Island generally?

**Chief Officer:**

There is. The difficulty is to promise too much. We have talked about the priorities that the Minister for Treasury and Resources faces in terms of the funding gaps, looking at the medium-term financial plan, are massive in some areas. This is a bit of cheeky one and one where there is a great opportunity here, but it has to go through a prioritisation process. I do not want to set a huge amount of hares running and then not be able to deliver.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

No, but from what you have said ... I mean, the Director of Transport started the dialogue by telling us these were Parish driven, that there was no money. So, what I think ... I certainly heard that exchange mean there was a case before the nation, looking at an overall plan, which seemed to sit with you, Minister.

**Chief Officer:**

Just to add a bit of a note of caution here. These schemes, to work successfully, are expensive.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just add something to that? They are quite innovative. What I would like to see really is a proof of concept scheme to see how they were received by the public as well.

**Chief Officer:**

We are anticipating these schemes to cost of the order of £1 million each. Now, it is not something we want to be dishing out willy-nilly.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Could I just put a question there? In my own Parish there is talk about putting flowerboxes in the roads and things like those. Do we have to be that sophisticated?

**Chief Officer:**

I think, certainly the latest thinking in terms of traffic calming is you have to look at the psychology of the driver and how then to protect the vulnerable road user. In some areas you can do it with flowerboxes, you are quite right. But, in other areas and some of the sort of test cases and ... the French village is the classic 'N' road through the centre of the French village. When you get there, these days, you are treated as a very different person. You feel as though you are going into places where you should not go fast. There are different road surfaces and different noise levels from the road surfaces. The thought you want in the driver's head is they are going through a school playground. So, they drive accordingly.

**Director of Transport:**

Once you have invested that money, it seems like a large capital cost, but you have changed the public realm in those areas for the future. It will be like that for 100 years. Once you have established those footways, et cetera, they then last. They are just maintained.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I wonder, Minister, is this a subject you might take away and have a think about?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

This is something that is ongoing. If you remember my election speech, I did say that we would be going around meeting all the Constables, not in a boardroom, we will go to their Parishes and discuss their requirements in their Parish and how we could work best together.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can you put a timescale on that, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As soon as time allows.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Would you be able to commit to getting around all the Parishes in the period of your ministry?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I look forward to seeing you in St. Martin. If I might just ask you one question, who decides ... obviously T.T.S. decides when you resurface a main road, but what is the criteria? Is it because it is used a lot and it is coming up to its 10 years' life and you need to resurface it regardless of whether it needs doing or is it the fact that there is a bumpometre in the car somewhere which says: "This road has to be done"?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, the roads are inspected regularly. Would you like to respond?

**Director of Transport:**

Basically, there is a model which assigns different types of roads different priorities. So, a road near a hospital where you have a lot of vulnerable users crossing it and you cannot afford to have potholes would get a higher priority than a road out in the countryside. Then there is a survey done once every 3 years, where it is a snapshot of the conditions of the Island's roads. Then that information as to how the roads have deteriorated are applied to the model. That produces a hierarchy and then the officers have to go out ... that is your coarse filter, then the officers go out and verify and select the schemes.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Anything in there about the Royal visit?

**Director of Transport:**

No.

**Chief Officer:**

The only positive of not having much money is that it means that we will get very good at prioritising the biggest need and the Royal visit is a complete coincidence.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you for those answers. I would like now to move now towards the penultimate subject on our list, the subject of D.V.S. (Driver and Vehicle Standards) regulation. My colleague, Steve, is going to be the questioner on this one.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

In response to a question in the States last time we sat, about the number of people over the age of 65 with a licence to drive a public service vehicle. The answer was 74, of which 3 of those were over the age of 80. It is unfortunate, but it would have

been nicer if the question had also asked what the licence permitted that person to drive, so we could have a breakdown of what sector of the industry those people are driving in. Are you in a position to give a bit more information?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I believe they were taxi drivers, who undergo a stringent medical? Do you have that information?

**Director of Transport:**

There or thereabouts, taxi drivers over the age of 65 have to have an annual medical. They also do not have to do the same mileage as other taxi drivers.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Is there an increase in the medical requirement once they get to 70 and 80 or is it still the same?

**Director of Transport:**

At present, no there is not. The States are increasing the retirement age and they are effectively self-employed businessmen. So, it depends on how far you want to intervene. There probably are things that you could do. You could look at maybe reaction times and things like that. What I am trying to say in a roundabout way is there are some 80 year-olds who are as fit as 75 year-olds. It depends on the individual a little.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What about the other end of the spectrum when you have tractor drivers driving these 80/100 horsepower tractors on the road at the age of 16? When is that going to be reviewed? That law was put in place in 1956, I believe, half a century ago, when we had 15 horsepower tractors and the like. We now have super-machines. They carry over-width a lot of them, towing machinery. I have seen all sorts of antics in the countryside with 2 tractors meeting each other. When are you going to be looking at that law?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, they do have a voluntary code at the moment, the big ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Not the voluntary code, when are you going to look at the law?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is being looked at now, but it is with D.V.S. Where are we with it?

**Director of Transport:**

The tractor review was undertaken last year. Unfortunately, there has been some long-term sickness in D.V.S., which has reduced the amount of resources available to complete that. We will be looking to address that resource issue this summer. But, I could not tell you exactly when the document will be completed unfortunately.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I mean, would it be true to say, Minister, that the whole of the Jersey Motor Traffic law needs updating from start to finish and we should be getting on and doing that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would not say updated from start to finish. Obviously, things need upgrading constantly.

**Director of Transport:**

There is a significant list of laws that need to be reviewed and the problem is basically resources. I mean, D.V.S. from its heyday has been reduced down from, I think, 15 traffic officers down to 4. There have been significant reductions over the years in the number of personnel in that section.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you able to provide the service, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is also a backlog with the Law Officers' Department.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But, are you able to provide that service? I mean, is it one of your priorities, D.V.S.?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Provide the service, in what sense?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Well, meet regulatory needs adequately.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

You are saying: "Yes," Minister, but ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Meet it adequately, yes.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, but is adequately something where you have to queue to get documents and then if you have not ticked the right box you have to go back and go to the end of the queue again? Now, you cannot say that that is adequately being ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, sometimes you have to queue, but obviously we try and minimise that. We need obviously more information to the public, more assistance.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What is the waiting list for driving tests at the moment, please?

**Director of Transport:**

I could not tell you. It is not too bad, my understanding. I mean, compared to what ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Months? Weeks?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, weeks.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

If you are bringing a vehicle into the Island, say from Guernsey, how long do you have to wait to have it checked?

**Chief Officer:**

It is about a week waiting list at the moment for P30s, I know that.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

Just in terms of laws and the views of the laws, to give you a sort of scale of the time it takes, especially where it ... the law affects a considerable amount of people. The Street Works Law has taken us from initial inception to review and change to where we are going to get to the States next year, over 5 years, almost one officer virtually full-time and a significant input from the law officers of which you have to bid into their timetable. It sounds easy to change and review the laws if you are doing small parts of it which need reviewing and just changing those. That is doable in a much more practical time. If you are rewriting and starting it, it is about a 5-year process.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I would not want the Minister to think that I do not understand how difficult it is to get law changes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

No. I too know. But I am hoping that this is a more focused task.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Well, I will just keep going. Given what has just been discussed about the reduction in the level of money at D.V.S., where do you stand on M.O.T. (Ministry of Transport) tests versus road checks, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. I would also just add that D.V.S. are highly involved in the taxi review, which is also taking more of their time. M.O.T.s, my stance is that in the future there will be a reasonable expectation by U.K. authorities and mainland European authorities that any car entering their territory would have some kind of certificate of road worthiness. There have been a few eyebrows raised in road checks in the U.K. where someone has been stopped: "Oh, you are from Jersey. We do not need an M.O.T." Heaven forbid should anything happen, but I am pretty sure that in the future some kind would be insisted upon. I am not willing to pursue that at present in Jersey. But we are looking at certificates of road worthiness for heavy goods vehicles in the not too distant future.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Okay. Will we get some consistency with heavy goods vehicles where at the moment I believe P30 vehicles are inspected every year and ones under P30 are not.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, correct.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Are we going to come to a consistent arrangement then?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think they will move ...

**Director of Transport:**

The proposal within ... it is States policy that there will be ... basically organisations will provide auditable records that they will implement their own system and D.V.S.'s role will then become to be auditors. I am sure that companies will be following their system, which is prescribed driver vehicle licensing. So, commercial vehicle operator licensing is the proposal.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Are you happy, Minister, that the policy for P30s is being properly policed and that we should not be moving to a stage where we allow everybody to have P30, on the basis that the vehicle itself is inert and it is the driver that causes the accident or the damage and not the vehicle?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think P30s, by its very nature, have to be limited.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Getting back to the bureaucracy in the department, how are you going to give a better face to the public? From within that department, people are going to have to attend at D.V.S., because, that is a comment that I hear regularly. They feel as if they are getting bullied when they go in there by not having filled in a box or whatever it may be.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, as has been said, we have had staffing problems. However, we will endeavour to up our game in that respect, with public relations.

[16:00]

**The Connétable of St. John:**

That is important.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes. I think all of us, Minister, have certainly anecdotal reports of such things, if you are prepared to look at those.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Will do.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, can I just ask, can you clarify a misunderstanding of mine, when importing vehicles from Guernsey? I understand they have to pay some emissions duty tax, which the D.V.S. charge. Could you clarify, please, is this a local tax or is this a tax levy of the E.U. (European Union)? Is it for environmental reasons?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It was implemented by the previous Minister for Planning and Environment.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is States policy.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Voted by the States.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, but what I am really trying to get at is what is it for? What is its purpose?

**Director of Transport:**

The emissions duty is ... D.V.S. is only the front office. We just collect the cash and hand it straight over to Customs and Excise. It is Customs and Excise who raise that tax.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, it is purely revenue raising?

**Director of Transport:**

No ...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not know if this helps. There used to be V.R.D. (Vehicle Registration Duty) and then when G.S.T. (Goods and Services Tax) was brought in, I think initially it was mooted that the whole thing would go. Then V.E.D. (Vehicle Emissions Duty) came in. I think part of it was to do with loss of revenue, loosely, but then I believe it was also about trying to have some form of environmental benefit.

**Chief Officer:**

It is an environmental tax.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I will stop there. There was a report and proposition to the States.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I suppose where I am headed is that I have heard reports, for example, of people who have imported vehicles into Guernsey, very modern vehicles, with highly efficient engines, having to pay a duty in Guernsey and then when that vehicle is taken into Jersey you have to pay it again.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, they are a different jurisdiction.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Beg your pardon?

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I said Guernsey is a different jurisdiction.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, but if it is an E.U. tax ...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, it is not. It is a Jersey tax. It is a Jersey tax and it was, as I said ... the reason I paused about revenue is I have a feeling that at the moment V.E.D. brings in less than V.R.D. used to. Both of them were effectively import duties. Sorry, V.R.D. was effectively an import duty on cars or vehicles and that was then replaced because it got switched to emission levels rather than ...

**Chief Officer:**

That is correct. It is based on CO2 emissions, parallel to the E.U. and U.K. guidelines.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a Jersey tax.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Just so I understand it correctly. It is a tax raising measure.

**Chief Officer:**

It is.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But, the amount of the tax is based on the vehicle size.

**Chief Officer:**

Size of vehicle, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But that leads me to the question ...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Sorry, can I caveat that, I have a feeling that you have to check that the purpose of the money raised was then to go to ... there were various environmental things brought in. I think it is like the ...

**Director of Transport:**

I have it here, if you like: "The States have approved the introduction of vehicle emissions duty from September 2010. The income from the duties is expected to raise £2 million per annum. It is to be used to fund environmental initiatives which reduce waste and energy usage and help the Island meet its international

responsibilities. It is proposed £550,000 per annum would go to the sustainable transport policy.” It does fund the sustainable transport policy. I understand it funds other waste initiatives that are administered by this department...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, presumably you, as a department Minister, do the accounting for that money then, if that is what that ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No. That is Customs and Excise.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay. The end result of this question is I am puzzled and I would like to know, why is it, Minister, that the tax which is related to environment places a high tax on those that are bringing in vehicles which are emissions free. Yet, vehicles which are here, pumping out a lot of emissions, pay nothing? I am really puzzled by this.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is very hard, when you think in retrospect. It is an import duty. I think the view, if I recall correctly, was there not talk about putting a penny on the price of petrol as well or something.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

That was an option.

**Head of Finance:**

You also have G.S.T. on the value of the vehicle imported from another jurisdiction as well, so it is not ... there are a range of taxes ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, I suppose the point I want to try and understand is, are there measures in place to encourage more environmentally friendly vehicles being used in the Island?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do the discounts with the parking cards, for environmentally friendly vehicles.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Also, depending on what you are getting, your V.E.D. is worked out on the emissions, as you can see from green down to red.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you for clearing that up.

**Chief Officer:**

I think in terms of clarity you are quite right. There is not a mechanism to promote someone to buy a new vehicle which is more efficient. The tax almost encourages you to keep your old vehicle ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Instead of buying a newer ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is this something, Minister, that you might think about discussing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

With the Minister for Treasury and Resources, with the Minister for Planning and Environment and ... yes.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I suppose one of the arguments is that ultimately you are going to replace your car at some point.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

With something more ...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Therefore, at that point the more efficient car incurs less ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Perhaps I can ask you. You have the D.V.S. records. What do the records show you about the average length of life of a vehicle? Is it getting shorter in Jersey or are we accumulating old vehicles?

**Director of Transport:**

I could not answer you directly. We do know that over the last few years vehicle registration has slowed down. So, certainly this drop in the economy has meant that the average age of a vehicle in Jersey is getting older, because they are selling less vehicles.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. People are holding on to their vehicles, because of the slow down, obviously.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I just get one last question in, Chairman? Minister, over the last few years we have had a big thing about our driving test becoming compliant and standardised across the E.U. We now have cards for driving licences instead of our lovely little old books, which I used to enjoy so much.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Given that we have the licence and the test equalised across the E.U., is there not a case to be made for not having to have ... if you have a Jersey licence, driving a Jersey registered vehicle in Jersey? Is it not time that people who are resident in Jersey, who want to bring over French registered or English registered or whatever registered vehicle are told: "If you want to drive that around in Jersey for the next 3 or 4 weeks you have to get it registered over here. It has to go through D.V.S. and get a Jersey number plate put on it."

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It depends. If they have the intention of living and working here, they must re-register their vehicle. But, if they are a tourist visiting, then there is no such requirement.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

What about rally cars?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Does that count as working?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I throw that in, because it does seem that occasionally we have a huge amount of bureaucracy thrown at us for the most petty of reasons.

**Chief Officer:**

Someone hired a U.K. car, did they not, for the rally?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

A Jersey resident hired a U.K. registered rally car to drive in the Jersey rally and had to register it in Jersey for 3 or 4 days before he sent it back, at quite an extreme cost.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I was not aware of that one.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can I pick up on what you said about working in the Island? So, all these foreign nationals that we see working, shall we say, in cafés or on the farms, et cetera, driving foreign registered vehicles, do they have to be registered?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

They do? Because I was asked yesterday and I was not 100 per cent sure.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As far as I am concerned ...

**Director of Transport:**

There is a period you are allowed to have a vehicle in the Island before you need to re-register it. I could not tell you off the top of my head I am afraid. I would have to check.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I thought my information was if you have the intention of living and working here, regardless of how long, then you should re-register.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So, if you are working for 6 months, you should be registered?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not think there is any particular time. If you have employment here and you are living here, you are a resident here, then at that point ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think it is a very grey area, Minister. Because if you came to Jersey and said: "I may well go back in 6 months' time", I do not think there is any compulsion to re-register your vehicle. If you came to Jersey and said: "I am going to stay here permanently." You have to register it almost immediately.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Presumably, Minister, on that point, if a resident of St. John's moved to St. Brelade, for instance, he has to change his driving licence within 7 days. What would D.V.S. do if that person comes from France, Poland, Portugal, wherever, with his foreign registered vehicle where a local resident has to change his within 7 days, he takes up employment somewhere, does he not have to also register his vehicle in Jersey and also change his driving licence, surely?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As far as I am concerned, yes.

**Director of Transport:**

If they do have to re-register the vehicle, they would also exchange their driving licence. We can get the timescales and send them out to you, if you wish.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will get back to you and clarify that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But, Minister, it sounds as if this is an area that is worth considering tightening up. Is that a thing you are prepared to take away?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I was under the assumption that that was already firm. But, I will get back to you on that; regulations-wise.

**Director of Transport:**

It is my ignorance of that part of the regulations, I am afraid. I will confirm it to you ...

**Chief Officer:**

Just to clarify, the policing of this, D.V.S. ... we have talked about the limited resources of D.V.S. Unless someone comes to D.V.S., the only time this is flagged up is through road checks.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Chief Officer:**

So, to be more proactive on that and I think that is probably the issue we are talking about here. It needs to be an issue dealt with by maybe talking to the Parishes and ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think there is certainly a need for some clarity here, because my experiences in the past 2 or 3 years is that in the Parishes there is a lot of ... I would not say confusion, but the clarity is lacking and there is an option for different interpretations ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will clarify that with the department and get back to you.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It sounds as if it is worth discussing with the Constables. Apart from anything else they do not tax that ... it sounds to me we are in the situation you bring a vehicle in from Guernsey and the U.K., you pay the tax, but if you bring it in on a foreign registered plate from wherever I mean you just drive around in it ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Likewise, if anyone gets a parking ticket on a foreign plate.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

If there are any offences, it is not easy to ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Exactly, tracing somebody.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

... to follow up.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

We are going to move on now to the last subject on our list, metal waste, where all these vehicles finish up in the scrapyards. Could we have an update, please of exactly where you are with the contract on the scrapyards? Also, while you are giving me that, give also at the back of your mind some thought to the answer you want to give me of cleaning up the scrapyards before it is handed over, i.e. the ground, the contamination.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Okay. The department is in the process of tendering for the scrapyards contract. This has generated an awful lot of interest, both on Island and off Island. We are applying a rigorous process to make sure the new contract is robust and promotes the best environmental sustainable solution for Jersey. With regard to the clean up ...

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Sorry. Just going back to the contract as well, we have gone out for expressions of interest, I think, as everyone knows. We are now going into that invitation to tender stage. We have effectively 6 companies that will be bidding. We are hoping to go through that process and get the returns from the invitation to tender by the end of June and hopefully going to the selection of the preferred bidder by the end of July and hoping to start the new contract at the beginning of January. At the moment we

are doing studies and site investigations of the existing scrap metal yard, because obviously for the new contractor that is going to be working from there, they have to have a site that is fit for purpose. At the moment we are just looking at the extent and looking at what the issues are on that site.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So, there is no question about moving the scrap metal? It will stay at Bellozanne?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Certainly during the short term and it depends on the state of the site, we are hoping that it will be staying at the existing site. There might be something that we have to do, while we are doing some of remediation of the site, like maybe looking at other areas of Bellozanne. That certainly, hopefully, worst case scenario.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Does this include from within your 6 contractors the original contractor?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

He will not be one of the preferred contractors?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Are they not willing to partake in tendering or not?

**Chief Officer:**

I am not sure if this is the right forum for those discussions.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Okay, fine.

**Chief Officer:**

There are some confidentiality issues.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Okay. We will do that in another forum. While we are on that, the remediation of the site, who picks up the bill? Is it the current contractor or is it going to be the department?

**Chief Officer:**

We currently have legal advice on that position. Again, I think it is a question I do not know the answer to yet, but I think it is a question which we can perhaps ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Right.

**Director of Engineering and Infrastructure:**

What I would just add to that, there is no proof that there is any contamination there at the moment. That is being investigated.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Okay, fine.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I ask, do you think the physical size of the current site is big enough moving forward?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Certain from the studies that we have done, looking at other sites in the U.K., the size of the site is fine. You know, there are different ways of being able to deal with that scrap metal. We might not be dealing with it as we do at the moment. There might be other more efficient operations in the future. That is all the things that we are looking at at the moment now and hoping that future contractors will come forward with.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

We have not spoken about paying for services very much today, but obviously the recently imposed costs to take green waste to La Collette. Can we be assured that the public are not going to be charged for taking scrap metal to the scrap metal yard?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not as far as I am concerned. We were not in favour of the green waste charge. A States Member brought that proposition and it was passed by the States. That is just for commercial green waste, not domestic green waste.

[16:15]

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

As an ex farmer, I am very grateful to hear that we will not be charging for scrap metal, because heaven knows what the countryside would look like the moment we start charging people to take cars to Bellozanne.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Fair comment.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can I come back in on the ... I do not want to go into the confidential side of things. I need to know, within any contract that you are putting together, the company will be a Jersey registered company, paying Jersey tax. Also, will there be the lifeline that the current operators have? Will that continue?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

The successful bidder will have to be registered as a Jersey company. Sorry, what was the second part of your question?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Will it employ Jersey people? Personally, I would not want to see 'J' cats coming in to run something that can be run by local people. So, would there be a licence for a 'J' cat if that was the case? Thirdly, the lifeline which currently exists for the operator in the event of the downturn in the scrap metal market, would that be transferred to any new operator?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

I think that is what we are going to reviewing as part of the contract process, is that there has to be both benefits for the States of Jersey in times when the price of scrap metal is very high. I think if we go back into the late 1990s where the price dropped and the States subsidised the scrap metal market, no ... you know, we have to get something back and I think that is what we are working on to try and make sure that we get the best financial return for the States of Jersey. With regards to the successful company, then yes there will be requirements on them making sure that they do have people that are locally employed. But, again, I do not really want to get into the detail of that. It is something that is commercially sensitive.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

You say that piece is commercially sensitive. I would say it is very sensitive to the Island. Currently we have operators who are, shall we say, all local staff from the directors down. I do not think it would go down too well in the Island if you were to be bringing 'J' cat people in to run an operation that had been run, I would say successfully, albeit in an old-fashioned way, over the last 20/30 years.

**Chief Officer:**

I think we are aware of the political overtones of this scheme and the emotive nature of an old-fashioned Jersey company running an operation and has done very well running it for many years. What we are trying to instigate is a mechanism where the shared risk between the States and our private partners is a bit fairer and one where we can incentivise better behaviours and we can support them when the price of whatever the commodity is dropped, a similar relationship we have with paper and cardboard. But, when the price is high there is some either environmental benefit or benefit for Jersey. But, we are fully aware of the sort of sensitivities of this contract, which is why we have tried to get a very good basis in terms of the tendering companies.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, what is the objective of this? Is it to get a better ... you know, to basically save money? Is it financial motivation or are there environmental benefits and gains why you are doing this?

**Chief Officer:**

The key benefit for me is environmental, because scrap yard residues fundamentally go into the Energy from Waste Plant, then traditionally have caused problems with bottom ash and heavy metals.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are they a major component in the ash mix?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is something you have made clear to the operator?

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is the current operator co-operating with this tender approach that you have explained to us?

**Chief Officer:**

The current operator has been part of the process all the way through, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I do not know what you think, Phil. I think this is an area to think about and ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, because there are areas here ... can I ask a question? You probably cannot tell me because it is sensitive again. All this review of the permit for operating this plant, did it not come about because the department saw the books of the company and thought they were making too much profit over recent years?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

I think times have changed and I think the contract comes to the end. It was a 7-year contract that came to the end ... or comes to its end on 24th December. Any contract that the States department entered into, we have to go out to review and get expressions of interest. We have not done that for a long period with scrap metal, but with changes to finance directions, we have to be making sure we are getting the best value contract for the States of Jersey. That is what we are doing. We went out to the market and allowed other companies to come forward with bids about how they would run that scrap metal process. Our intention now is to get the best economical, economic and environmental contract with regards to dealing with scrap metal for Jersey.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So, just to clarify. You have reviewed it, you invited expressions of interest.

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Now you have selected another bidder or ...

**Acting Director of Operations:**

We are going into invitations to tender.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is invitations to tender.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is where we are at?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We are in the middle of a process, that is what you are saying?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Obviously, we cannot go further.

**Chief Officer:**

Just a final point here, scrap pricing in 2000 was £30 a tonne. The scrap price current is of the order of £300 a tonne. There is a significant change in the market.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes. Irrespective of the sort of final numbers, can we be assured, Minister, that the public will not find the new scrap metal contractor, whoever that might be, no less easy to get on with and the whole process of dealing with scrap metal might become even easier?

**Acting Director of Operations:**

Certainly that is our intention.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Have you had problems?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

No, but I might if it was not open when I wanted to use it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is that. Obviously the bar is constantly being raised on that, as the Chief Officer just said.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I do not think there have been problems with opening times and that type of thing in the past. Obviously, if one is moving to a new contract you would not want the public to find ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, the public will not be disadvantaged in that respect.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Right, that is fine.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I think we have covered that, thank you very much. One last item on the agenda, forthcoming legislation. You have told us about the Street Works Law. That is obviously imminent. I think you have told us there is a review of the Motor Traffic Law, but that sounded as if it is a bit more distant. Any other ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The taxi review is ongoing and the new bus operator contract will be end of June.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I was thinking about legislation. The taxi one may end up with a law.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Possibly, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is there any other ...?

**Director of Transport:**

There are things on-going like ... the Parking Law is being drafted at the moment. It does not need to go to the States, does it?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Parking Law?

**Director of Transport:**

The on-street changes, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Oh, okay.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

It is about motorbikes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you for that. Scrutiny Officer, do you have any points you want to put on the table?

**Scrutiny Officer:**

No, I do not think there was anything else.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Phil?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No. Maybe this is a good time to close the meeting and go into camera and discuss other things that we have. That way you can turn the machine off.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We will close the meeting first of all then.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

No, I am fine then, thank you.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, thank you. I would like to formally, before we close, say thank you to you, Kevin, and your whole team. Thank you very much for your openness. Thank you very much and I very much look forward to our next meeting with you, hopefully in 3 months' time.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Excellent.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Anyway we will be seeing you before on other reviews, I think.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Thank you, Chairman.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

With that, I will close the meeting, thank you.

[16:24]