



**STATES OF JERSEY**  
**Environment, Housing and Technical Services**  
**Scrutiny Panel**  
**Quarterly Hearing with the**  
**Minister for Transport and Technical Services**  
**MONDAY, 23rd FEBRUARY 2015**

**Panel:**

Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman)  
Deputy D. Johnson of St Mary (Vice-Chairman)  
Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier  
Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade

**Witnesses:**

Deputy E.J. Noel (The Minister for Transport and Technical Services)  
Deputy R.J. Rondel (Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services)  
Mr. J. Rogers (Chief Officer)  
Mr. T. Dodd (Director of Transport)  
Ms. E. Littlechild (Director of Operational Services)

**Topics Discussed:**

1. Ministerial Priorities	Page 3
2. Vehicle Registration	Pages 6 and 13
3. Waste Management	Pages 6, 11 and 41
4. Parish Improvement Scheme	Page 10
5. Roads Maintenance	Page 10
6. Sea Defences and Climate Change	Page 11
7. Disabled Access to Public Transport	Page 15
8. Departmental Expenditure	Page 19
9. Transport	Page 28
10. Car-parking	Page 34
11. Speed Limits	Page 36
12. La Collette	Page 39

[14:57]

**Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman):**

Welcome to this hearing of the Environment, Housing and Technical Services Scrutiny Panel. We are very pleased to welcome the Minister for Transport and Technical Services, Assistant Minister and their team, the media and the public. Thank you in advance to William, our clerk, and Leah who is doing the recording. Perhaps we could start off just by introducing ourselves for the sake of those attending and also the transcript. What we have done, I gather we have got you for an hour, certainly for an hour and possibly longer if we need it, which is good. We have divided our questions into four sections, just so you know what is coming. The Vice-Chairman is going to start off by questioning you about various matters in relation to roads, infrastructure, drainage, sea defences, that sort of thing. Deputy Tadier is then going to move on to quiz you about funding, savings, recycling and waste. I am then going to tackle the transport portfolio; some questions on that area. Finally, Deputy Martin is going to examine you about Havre des Pas, La Collette, asbestos and the Property Services portfolio as well, at this time. We are hoping that is going to cover the main areas. But we thought we would start, Minister, by asking you to talk to us for five minutes or so about what your strategic priorities are for 2015.

[15:00]

We have had the benefit of a copy of your speech made in the States in November nearly four months ago when you stood successfully for the ministry, together with the questions that were asked at the time. So clearly if there is any progress that you made in those first four months on

the aims that you set out before the States that would be helpful to hear about those as well. Can I start off by asking you to address us?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Thank you for having this hearing this afternoon, our first of what I hope will be many quarterly meetings. What I will probably do is run through the aspects of my speech first to give an update on where we are with those. I will start with one of the aspects of what was billed a closer relationship and a relationship of trust between St. Helier and the Department and indeed the other Parishes as well. We have started that process, as you will know, Chairman, because we have already had our first quarterly meeting with you, our second quarterly next week. As projects come along I would like to expand those out to more of the town Deputies present but what has happened since my speech back in the latter part of last year is that I now have an Assistant Minister, who is also a Deputy in St. Helier. So we have a direct conduit to exchange views and to get information to and from the two bodies. Building a relationship with the other Parishes; naturally I have a strong working relationship with my own Constable. But we have had meetings with other Constables, recently the Constable of St. Peter and Constable of St. Ouen on a number of issues and ongoing with the other Parish Constables as well.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Could you expand on some of those issues?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

St. Peter revolves predominantly around the flooding issues at Beaumont in terms of transport with amenities such as bus shelters, et cetera, and other projects that the Parish are working on.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

In your speech you said that when it comes to bus shelters that the funding mechanism was auctioning of J007. Is there a ready supply of those kind of number plates to pay for bus shelters?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is actually. It is something we can brief you on is that we are looking at introducing probably next month, maybe halfway through April, the public being able to buy cherished plates directly from the department at D.V.S. (Driver and Vehicle Standards) certain numbers that will be available.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is that the new way in which we will fund public services?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, it is a way...part of the previous M.T.F.P. (Medium-Term Financial Plan) and part of our savings from the previous M.T.F.P. was just over £100,000 a year. That was to do from selling off licence plates to fund priorities within that area. Predominantly we are replacing a lot of the testing facilities at D.V.S., so that is ongoing but we think that there is more money to be generated from the cherished plates that can help road safety issues and indeed new bus shelters and things like that. It falls on board that we get for the public to buy over-the-counter plates to a certain value and we will be looking at still having auctions each year to generate larger sums to reinvest back into services.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Could I just add in there: one of the things we do want to do is put more bus shelters up, more than was originally planned? **[Mobile phone]** Apologies, that is £10.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

To the bus shelter fund.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

More than was originally planned so this is one mechanism we feel that could raise additional funds to provide additional shelters or other things that we are looking at. So we are just trying to fast track and put more out there.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are also looking at effectively having bus shelter sponsors in the community. One of the larger food retailers is willing to contribute to a bus shelter in your own Parish of St. Brelade to accommodate because it is one of the busier spots that we have in the Island. We are working with the community and we are going to distribute resources in trying to find other sources to do more. Moving on to other items that I mentioned in my speech. One of the fundamental things that I wished to do and that is to make sure that we continue the funding for road repairs and resurfacing and our sea defences and to protect those from the efficiency savings wherever possible because we do not invest in our infrastructure at our peril, and effectively what we do is kick that particular problem further down the road for future generations to pick up the bill and it always costs more. So it is important that we do maintain frontline investment in our infrastructure. One of the other areas that I wanted to ensure, and it is going to be a bit more challenging, is that the Parish Improvement Scheme funding remains in place or at least a proportion of it remains in place. That is something I will be doing with my fellow ministerial colleagues and other States Members when we come to debate the Medium-Term Financial Plan 2. Other areas which we have moved forward on is the street works legislation. I instigated a meeting between myself, the

Law Officers, lawdraftsman, and the Chief Minister and T.T.S. officers to outline a detailed timetable for delivering that street works law, and that we can publish...there is no reason why we cannot publish that now, that timetable. So we can get that to you for your possible scrutiny. Effectively we will hopefully have that legislation and the subordinate and ancillary legislation that goes around it because it has a knock-on effect to other pieces of legislation, in the early part of next year. So that process will be going through Scrutiny, Council of Ministers scrutiny, et cetera, between now and then. In terms of extending main drains, this is one of the discussions I had with the Constable of St. Ouen about how we can take pockets of the St. Ouen community that are not currently on main drains and work with them and other landowners to see if there is a viable cost effective solution for them to connect to main drains. That is not necessarily government providing the money but government facilitating the individuals to pull together to be able to come up to a more affordable solution for them.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Could I just add on those main drains issues? We are going out to identify small pockets where drains may well have to pass over private land and trying to persuade or ask the landowners to be lenient, obviously they are due compensation, to see if we can get small closes to join on and we have had one recently through Planning that they have allowed a development of one property providing they join, I think, it is five or six other properties on to the main drains. That is going to be a good thing if we can do things like that.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry, I will just chip in then. To go outside the introduction, once we have got the overview I think we have got our own more specific questions to ask. We will tackle you again on that later.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the areas I mentioned about recycling but we will probably pick up about that later. We have got a live planning application now for La Collette to produce the recycling centre down there. Taxis, I spoke about. The Assistant Minister and myself have been carrying out extensive consultation with the taxis and the cabs and cab firms, I use the term taxis and cabs to try and differentiate the two. Taxis have got a rank. Cabs have got a private hire. We have the last of those meetings later on this week, early next week. After that we hope to be in a position to be able to make some decisions by Easter this year because effectively it has been a year now since the White Paper consultation finished and the industry and the public have a clear sense of directly what we are going to do. We have not made any decisions at the moment. We are still in our information gathering exercise.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have met with quite a large number and anybody who has asked to meet with us we have, whether they are individual taxi or cab drivers. They have been in and given their own views and we are collating all that information. I used to think that farmers used to be difficult to deal with. Some taxi drivers are a little bit unique as well, like farmers. So we will have to wait and see.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Other areas that I mentioned was improving our cycle network and things. We have got the planning application in again off the St. Peter's Valley to extend the cycle works there. We hope this year to complete the Tesson Mill to the Vic in the Valley stretch. We are also carrying out a similar thing at Grouville, the stretch from La Motte Garages to the main junction there. There is a plot we want to stake there that takes you to the entrance to the golf course. But we have also managed, literally last week, to persuade our colleagues at the States of Jersey Development Company to tarmac a bit of gravel pathway that was on public land alongside the temporary car park that they are building to improve that facility as well. So where we are seeing opportunities we are trying to take them and enhance the provision for cyclists generally. Liberty Bus are pursuing their rural Parish scheme by their volunteer bus service, that is hopefully starting this summer.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

I think it is starting sooner I hear.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If that is successful we hope to use that as a model for an urban scheme as well. The T.T.S. Department are looking at a voluntary system for safety certificates for vehicles, predominantly for private vehicles to assist people buying and selling, something that they are working on. Then they are working on this policy, as I said, they are delivering it either in March or the latter part of April about increasing the revenue opportunities from our cherish plates. Officers are also working on charging for commercial waste. As I outlined in my speech there are some anomalies there where developers can effectively turn up at the Energy from Waste plant with their burnables and there is no charge. Some of those burnable things like plastic windows, et cetera, add costs actually to treat...to incinerate is something like £500 a tonne because of the treatment they need including lime.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I ask specifically because we may not come back to it, is there a legal issue with the covenant at Bellozanne, does that affect being able to charge for any kind of waste?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are looking into that. We asked for legal advice on that and depending on the outcome of that will be depending in whether or not we proceed on the commercial charging. If it is caught by the covenant then we will have to start negotiations with the Parish to see if it is something that this is deemed sensible in the Island's overall interest to lift, even if it is to lift for that specific purpose. But we are waiting for that legal advice. One of the final things that was in my speech is, and I care considerably about, is to make sure that the Department is used to train the skills that we need within our community going forward. We have apprentice schemes and graduate training schemes and those need to be enhanced and protected from any efficiency savings because we do need to make sure that we have got the critical skills on Island, not just for today but for the future as well. That is really a tour of the items that I had prioritised back in October.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Before we go on then, is there any one thing that in the first nearly four months of your term of office you feel most pleased about having made progress with?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Probably the one that has taken up a considerable amount of time for myself and for my Assistant Minister is the work that we have undertaken with the taxi and cab industry to give us a better insight because we are talking of 300, 350 individuals and their families that our decisions will have an impact on those individuals and their families. So we must make sure that decisions that we make are informed and are the right decisions. That is something that I believe that the work we have done there has been quite extensive and hopefully the decisions that we will make in the next month or so will be the right ones.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Perhaps we will return to main drains, a subject close to my heart in the rural St. Mary. You say in your address on seeking election that you were committed to working towards finding solutions for dealing in unfairness in the current system for those not on main drains. I mean, certainly a lot of households do think it is unfair. I mean can you elaborate on what steps you have taken to or are taking to address the problem?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is no new money. There is no magic carpetbag with money in it from the government to be able to extend the main drains.

[15:15]

But working with the Parishes and working with landowners we think we can achieve a number. We have already had success, probably seven or eight this year already, through different methods and I set up quite a modest target for twelve by the end of this year which we will easily meet so that target will probably get extended. But we need to look at it in the round of our whole liquid waste strategy and what we are doing at Bellozanne at the moment and the new treatment works. It is something that the Minister for Treasury and Resources mentioned in a media article a week or so ago about the Island, that perhaps we might have to start looking at a liquid waste charge and that can be...part of those funds could be used to extend the network.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

I was going to go on to that. That was said in the context of filling a general black hole. I mean if there was a sewage charge would that be ring-fenced to apply to put to those not on main drains?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a big if. But if there was a sewage charge I would like to see it ring-fenced to fund the sewage works, the capital works that are involved there, and the running costs and to extend the drains. Or it may be that the drains are not extended but those people do not pay twice particularly for their tanker service. Effectively they are paying currently for their taxes and they are paying for their tanker service on top. So by combining it and having it effectively in a ring-fenced pot then they would not at least get the double charge.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

On the costs side, and presumably when you determine the overall economic value of putting people on mains drains, presumably there is already existing cost to the Department, is there not, in providing the tankers, so that presumably is set against...do you see what I am saying?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. That is all part of the liquid waste. If you take it as a link into corporate entity that is part of the cost.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

The focus on this is that people argue that drainage is an essential supply. Now if it comes to something like electricity you...the J.E.C. (Jersey Electricity Company) can compel the owner to grant a wayleave agreement over his property; has thought been given to that that you can compel landowners to allow their field, for instance, to be dug up?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is something that we could have the power under the law to instigate.



**Chief Officer:**

We have got the power now.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

But it has not been used though, yet?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It has not been used. It was tried...a previous politician 8 years ago tried to bring that in and got a lot of push back.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Became previous.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is an area where it sounds good to say, yes, enforce it. That is a bit Big Brother-ish. I do not think it is a sort of big government wielding a stick. I would prefer to do it more by negotiation than...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

But it will be looked at again, will it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have a situation in St. Helier we have been looking at and trying to work with the landowners and their neighbours who are effectively landlocked. It is difficult to get people to agree because they have different expectations but we have to look at overall what is the benefit for the good of the Island.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

For this sort of example that we have been looking at, I mean, maybe that is the right road to take eventually but we want to try and negotiate properly and we are doing it in St. Ouen's and looking at other mechanisms that...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

It would be easier to negotiate with the backup of legislation behind you, would it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have that power.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So that is what we are aiming towards.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

That is all on drains for the moment. Just moving on, you refer to Parish improvements and again I am fortunate to come from a Parish where it has already been funded but you set your...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Very fortunate.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

We had to wait a long time. You set your sights on doing further improvements elsewhere. Is there funding in place for that or...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, the funding ends at the end of 2015 because it was part of the M.T.F.P. It was not built into base budgets. That is something that is a commitment that I made in my speech and I stand by it. I want to try and ensure that that funding continues in some way or form going forward. As a Deputy of St. Lawrence that is sitting on the board about the Parish...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Yes, I am aware of that. I spoke to your Constable the other day.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I have got skin in the game in that respect, so obviously any decisions about that scheme would be done by my Assistant Minister. But I do believe in the Parish Improvement Scheme. I think that they are vital to our communities and we need to find a way of funding one way or the other, but we might be a bit more patient and take maybe a bit longer and we might need to be a bit more definitive into how we think about funding it.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Moving on from village developments. What about road resurfacing which there are quite a few projects in hand now? We have identified already that is crucial to keep the roads where they are. Again, are you...where are we on the funding stakes?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Again we have protected those budgets along the sea defences and the other main capital infrastructure type spends, so we have got a programme over the next five years, is it?

**Chief Officer:**

Five year rolling.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a five-year rolling plan and you will have seen at the moment with the link from Trinity to Gorey being done. We are going to be testing out some different road surfaces later on this year that may be able to give us more mileage per pound so to speak. But that is something we are waiting to see contractors and experts from the U.K. (United Kingdom) to see if their product is as good as it says.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

My final question on this sort of general restructure, and you have already touched on it, was the sea defences. I see again at the time of your election to the ministry, I think it definitely raised the question about the ones down at St. Peter. I mean you said that you were talking to the right people and you have just said now, have you, that funding is in place to pay for that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are trialling a temporary scheme at the moment. It did not get that much of a test this weekend luckily because the weather conditions were more favourable. But we have got those, for the remainder of this winter season, to test. We had a mock-up of what the raised sea wall would look like at Beaumont from the gun site moving east and it was a quite substantial piece of structure that may take the residents in the area some persuading for it to be built, so I have asked engineers to go and see if that can be reduced in height and what level of protection that will give over one in 20, one in 50 storm occurrence. That information I think was received earlier today and I will probably get a briefing on that in the next few weeks.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

There are funds in place to support it and so forth?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are funds in place for those.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Finally to wrap up, and you have already touched on it again, the liquid waste project. I say again, I see it was one of three major projects agreed by the previous Assembly and a spending envelope of £75 million was agreed. Is that in place for that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Part of it is in place. We had some of the money last, £10.1 million last year. We have got £15...

**Chief Officer:**

£25.6 million this year.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

£25.6 million this year. After that it is a bit more challenging but we are talking to our colleagues at Treasury - obviously I am still the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources, or one of the Assistant Ministers - and we think that we have a funding mechanism to complete that project.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

We may come back to general funding after other people have asked their specific questions, so thanks for that.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Before Montfort looks at funding in more detail, can I just ask you about climate change because you talked about the sea defences and the fact that the Island needs to defend itself against rising sea levels. What is the Department's involvement in the Island's commitment to helping tackle climate change?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is predominantly, as you know, led by Planning and Environment. We play a supporting role in that and we will continue to do so. There are regular quarterly meetings. We had one in December so we are due one in...probably just after Easter. But we are a close supporter. I am not leading on it, it is the Minister for Planning and Environment.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

What areas of Island activity and Islanders' behaviour do you think T.T.S. can influence to help address our commitment to a world player?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It will not just be T.T.S. It is a cultural thing. It is an Island pressure. We will put pressure on each other to act in a more responsible and more environmentally friendly way. It is a government thing. But T.T.S. themselves have strategies about to increase the use of people cycling, walking, Sustainable Transport Policy. I have got a draft here of the update from that, it has not been finalised yet, an update report on where we are with that. But it is very much...it is all of our problems and it will require all of us to buy into the decisions.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Just following on from that, what about carbon emissions from vehicles which will be within your province? You could influence that, could you not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

To be fair we probably cannot influence that. It is the manufacturers that will influence that and I think they are way ahead of us.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

But you could encourage Islanders to buy one vehicle rather than another?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We can do that through the Vehicle Emissions Duty, which is a Treasury matter. But that is something that I would like to discuss with the Minister for Treasury and Resources about how we could maybe look at that modest charge that there is to see if it will change behaviour. But most vehicles now do fall in the lower band.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

In your speech you talked about a voluntary M.O.T. (Ministry of Transport). Is it not the whole point of an M.O.T. that it is compulsory, particularly if you are going to tackle the more polluting vehicles that are chucking out a lot of the pollution?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are two different aspects there. I do not think Jersey is quite ready yet for a compulsory M.O.T.-type scenario. I prefer to introduce a voluntary safety certificate which has a benefit for those selling their cars privately and people buying cars privately. I am sure the retail...the motor trade will participate in it as well. So we are looking to get that...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Why would they though? I mean if they can sell cars at the moment without having to pay for a certificate what is the incentive?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It makes your car more saleable and gives more comfort to the person buying it.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If you are buying a car that has got a certificate with it people will generally feel...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But surely from a road safety it is the cars which are not going to meet the M.O.T.s that you need to be tackling and is it an issue to do with the Parish Hall? The Parish Halls want their inquiries so they can keep on pulling over cars that are not fit for purpose and issue fines; is that the issue?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, the issue for me is the fact I do not think the Island is ready yet for compulsory M.O.T.s.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

What makes you say that though because people have been talking about it for years and certainly some of the motor bodies have been quite supportive of an M.O.T.?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not think the general public are necessarily...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Have we asked them?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think if it would have been popular it would have been done. That is why we have been talking about it for many, many years, so I believe in being a realist and I would sooner introduce a voluntary scheme first and take the fear away from people about it and show people that there are benefits and persuade people that they are...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Because you are obviously not finding tackling...you are tackling taxis which is a first, Minister, probably since we have had a Minister or Government to do it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Probably the last Minister to do it as well.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

We have not seen the decision yet but I mean I would certainly, I think the Panel probably agrees with me, that it is certainly something perhaps we ought to return to, which is surely in terms of emissions and in road safety that the M.O.T. is something that needs to be given a bit more consideration.

**Chief Officer:**

It is probably worth expanding. We had a workshop recently focusing on imported old commercial vehicles from Guernsey because that is an area where behaviour change in terms of emissions will have a bigger effect and I think you are quite right about the vehicles at the bottom of the food chain, which we all see. I think the Minister's plan for doing the voluntary scheme is the first step, so it becomes less frightening. From the commercial side of things, we have allowed the private sector to run itself too long and at the moment I think the tax system almost incentives older vehicles to come into the Island, someone has recently imported from Guernsey, which I feel is quite unsatisfactory. So we are looking at a vehicle operator's licence scheme for the larger vehicles and running that down to the three-and-a-half tonne and above vehicles, again. So you are trying to bring everything to conform from both ends in quite a short timescale. It is focusing on the ones that are most important. Because the commercial vehicles are the ones that are doing the mileage and the ones that perhaps are not quite up to scratch...they are the ones when we stop in a road check that we seem to have a lot of commercial vehicles of the smaller variety, the under P30 and above three-and-a-half tonnes, that are not in very good condition.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

If I can ask a specific question which is related to the next question, which is more general of funding. You gave a commitment in your speech in question time and you said that disabled people need to have access to public transport, which is free, which Hansard notes as receiving approbation from States Members. You also said that you would implement this in short order. Can I ask what progress has been made?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Shortly after my speech I instigated a meeting with the Assistant Chief Minister responsible for social policy with the Minister for Social Security, myself, the Minister for Housing...

[15:30]

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Senator Routier, is that the one...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. The Minister for Housing and various officers and we have charged officers in the Chief Minister's Department to look at this in a holistic way because we realise that it was a cross-departmental issue. It is quite a complex issue. For example, if you provide subsidised bus passes for disabled then should you be also providing them with a fully subsidised parking system or should there be some more equality there? So currently those on income support that have got

a disability component to their income support that is on a means-tested basis, whereby if you are a driver of a car you get your disabled parking for free without means testing. So there are some anomalies there. There is also some disabilities like - and I have parishioner of mine which I will speak to today - that do not ... that are on disability but do not come under the social security, such as epilepsy.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I accept the fact that there are other issues, but the specific issue of free bus passes for disabled people, there is a precedent. We know that anyone who is over 65 gets a free bus pass.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Exactly, and that is not means tested. So we are looking at this holistically, including the over-65 element of it to make sure that whatever we come up with is a fair and best fit for Jersey. So it is a lot more complex than even when I first looked at it. It came about because of the hustings at Grouville. I am not sure if you were there.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I was. I think we had a conversation and you said it is just something the Minister for T.T.S. just needs to do, I think is what I recall.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, but it is more complex than that because there is no money within the Department to do it.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We have hit the nub there. The issue is funding. So it is one thing for you to stand up in the States and make a promise that disabled people will be given free access to transport and that you will find a solution and deliver that in short order but when it comes back to actually finding funding to do that, that is where we hit the rub of the problem. So where would the funding come from to deliver that? How much would it cost?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is the issue. It could cost a significant amount. It depends on your definition of disability. On some of the figures that we were given it could be up to 10,000 people, which obviously is very significant.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Who would decide that?



**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is why it is across Departments because T.T.S.'s budget is relatively small and so it is a government issue, it is not just a Department issue and that is why we are working at it as a government.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Do you stand by the timescale of short order? How would you define "short order"?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Unfortunately not as short as I originally anticipated because it is a lot more complex than I originally anticipated. The work that we discovered in December means that it does cover a lot more people than we first thought and it is a complex matter. So hopefully by the summer we will have had some direction from officers about what will be possible to implement going forward.

**Director of Transport:**

We are undertaking some technical studies, so we are having a look at the different systems used around the world and in the U.K. in particular what criteria they use to define who receives a pass and what circumstances so we will have that information. Then the Chief Minister's unit is going to be doing some survey work of people on the Island to see what locomotor disabilities are out there and then once we manage to complete that work we can have an idea of quantifying the scale of the problem in the Island and then you can look at how you can implement a solution which provides the best benefit to all and the Minister is going to need that information.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

One thing the Social Security Department are looking at doing to produce quite quickly is those on income support with a mobility allowance payment, which currently is paid on a monthly basis along with their income support, is to take that allowance and to buy an annual bus pass for those individuals and pay them a less amount per month because I think it comes to, from memory, about £1,000 a year and a bus pass is...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So we are essentially talking about give with one hand and take away with the other?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we are trying to make sure that whatever we introduce is fair as opposed to favouring some in society and not others because, for example, the car parking issue...actually the bus pass issue is a good one. It is free to those over 65 but not currently free to those with a disability so we need to make sure that whatever we introduce is fair across the whole of society.

**Director of Transport:**

Also, if I may, it is not just about having free transport. It is about having access to transport. So you need to have bus stops where you can get a wheelchair on to the bus, and that is a big important component of it. Things like the Parish link will be an important offering to people with mobility issues and, further to that, then there is about assistance and training for drivers of public transport. One of the things that will be happening rather faster is Liberty Bus are looking to issue a card so people can advise people and the driver discreetly as to what disability or communication problems they have got.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think these things are good but the issue is with Scrutiny, as we know, is to hold Ministers to account and when a Minister gives an undertaking in the States Assembly that he will do something quickly, which is to give disabled people free access to buses, that needs to be delivered otherwise it is a broken promise. That is the issue. All the others thing which need to be done I completely agree. I think Deputy Martin wanted to come in.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I just wanted a supplementary because, as the Minister said, it is the bigger picture and then you mention straightway you are working with Senator Routier. So we were promised, and again it is how quick are we going to get the promised disabled strategy, which will cover a lot of your Departments and then will hopefully feed issues that have been brought up in questions? Are you on the team? Who is on this team looking at the whole of the disabled strategy, which will feed in the how you will get these people with transport, their needs met, and everything else?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not know who is on the whole generic team; from a Transport point of view I am on that working group.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Has it met yet, do you know?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We met in December and we are waiting for...we tasked the officers to go away to look at this and to come back with recommendations and a policy that we can implement, and we are waiting for that to come back.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Do you have terms of reference? What is happening on that group?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I can see if I can get you the minutes from that meeting.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Yes, it would be, you know, because this will be a follow-up for other things that we need to ask of T.T.S. But we need to know where the whole strategy is.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is being led right now by the Chief Minister's Office.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

We know who it is being led by.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I will see if I can get a copy of those meeting notes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We do appreciate the fact that there is a package of work going on and no doubt issues to do with taxis and hospital transport, et cetera, will be looked at. There has already been some work.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Taxis is another thing we are looking at because there are a certain amount of disabled access taxis, some of those are driven now by older people who may not be able to handle wheelchairs and things like that, so we are looking at all this sort of thing at the moment to try and improve things.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I move on to the general issue of funding? Can I ask firstly: are you committed to two per cent cuts in your budget?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

In 2015?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

They have already happened.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Okay.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The money has been taken away from base budget and we have to live with it. The Chief Officer has no choice under the finance sector but to live within that budget so that has happened. How we make those efficiency savings will evolve as the year goes on.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The next three years, is that the same?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The next three years, those have not been decided yet. That is obviously part of the Medium-Term Financial Plan 2. There are initial targets that the Treasury have asked all Departments to look at, which is the first £50 million, that is spread across all Departments, including Health and Education. Then there are tranches of £10 million on top of that. That excludes certain Departments, predominantly Education and Health, but also some of the non-ministerial departments have been excluded from those. We are providing ideas to Treasury to see what the services will look like going forward if those cuts of certainly efficiency savings, the first £2 million of that will be effectively service cuts to do an extra 10, 20, 30.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Are there Departments, do you think, which can cope more easily with two per cent cut than your Department?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You have got to remember this has come on the back of £61, £62 million of cuts already in the current M.T.F.P. that happened, so to do another 50 on top will be challenging but I believe that they will be doable, but it will be challenging. We will have a list of things that we intend to do to make those cuts and efficiency savings by the time we publish the M.T.F.P. I guarantee that those individual items will change by the time we get to the end of that process. So it is an ongoing...all we need to do is build up a culture, which I think we effectively have done for the last three years, of making sure that we get best value and we minimise waste.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

How do we avoid false economies in the perhaps clamber to make immediate savings, short-term savings?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Through good planning and officers who know their brief, which is certainly what we...my experience in Treasury and my experience in the last few months at T.T.S. those skills that I...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry, I do not want to steal Deputy Martin's lines but in your address for election you made frequent reference to the relationship between this ministry and Jersey Property Holdings. Now I am suggesting the synergy will mean that there were savings to be achieved if Property Holdings came under your umbrella, as it were. Can you tell us where we are with that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I have to be careful to say that the savings that we will achieve will be effectively in terms of releasing capacity to do more with the same resource and to provide better cover. One of the main things between both Property Holdings and T.T.S. that they have in common is effectively project management, and it is something that we lack in the States as a whole. We have not...it is one of our finite resources and if we can create more capacity in that we can do more of the same, which is the key theme to my speech, is doing more with the same resource.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I just come in? I was going to pick up on that, I have got it underlined. In reality it is doing more with less, is it not, because you want to do more with two per cent less this year and going forward and that is before we even taken in...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You have got two types of resources. You have got the resources that have the pounds sign in front of them and you have got the resource which is the people you see that sit here round the table. The financial spend will be less but the people...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

How do the people sitting round the table feel about doing more, because presumably you are not doing quite enough at the moment? You can do more for less money. Does that sit well with you workers?

**Chief Officer:**

If we can work smarter then that would be the...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Sorry, Montfort, could I have a supplementary just on that when you say more for less, is it less for more because you actually gave an undertaking to Deputy Southern in your speech as well in supplementaries that you did not intend at all to reduce your 500 workforce and you were going to add to it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Because I was going to...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I do not think your...there are a few semantics in your answer earlier but I did not hear that...there seemed to be a reduction in workforce when / if T.T.S. and Property Holdings are merged.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There will be an increase to T.T.S. because obviously we have taken...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

There will be. On a headcount now, if you added the two together, would they be the same?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

All States Departments now are managing their headcount so as people come to retire or people leave they are not necessarily being replaced. Will not necessarily be replaced like for like.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Just to push on that, because in the answer ... I will let you finish, sorry.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So that is what we are looking at. Basically it is good people management and relooking at your business to say is that the type of role now we need going forward for the services that we want to provide? It is not necessarily always the case.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What we have not got is the 500 that was alluded to in that question and answer but that takes into account your work staff, it does not take into account the staff of Property Holdings, so what is the net reduction that we are likely to see in, say, the next five years?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If you have got F.T.E.s (full-time equivalents) of T.T.S. it is about 500.

**Chief Officer:**

A bit more, about 520.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

And the F.T.E.s for Property Holdings, 46 from memory.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The 46 essentially would be absorbed into T.T.S., is that kind of...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, so you would end up with 160...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

566.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But you need to make savings so there is no point in merging them to keep the same number of staff.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will manage vacancy management. As people retire or people leave.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So what is the aim to reduce that number by?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is no specific aim. It is about delivering the services that we need to deliver for the Island within the envelope that the States gives us. At the end of the day the M.T.F.P. and what we get to spend for 2016, 2017, 2018 and 2019 is a States decision.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Where are we going to see the savings; that is essentially the question that needs to be answered.

[15:45]

**Chief Officer:**

We have got a recruitment freeze. We have had one pretty much in place since last summer. That does not mean some key jobs will be replaced but the bottom line is recruitment comes up to my management team and there is a freeze on it. Over this period I believe we looked through natural wastage, which is a strange word for retirement. Between 50 and 60 people will leave and what I would ideally like to do is to keep the reductions within there. Whether we can do that or not is going to be a political decision.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So two questions: how many jobs do you think will be gone through natural wastage in the next five years?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a bit like how long is a piece of string.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

No, but I think we are on to something with John there because he seems to be a bit more aware, so if we can let John answer that.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The question is a political question.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Minister, you do not know the answer but John was telling us that there is a plan...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Neither does my chief officer. It is a political decision.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But he is providing specific information and that is presumably why you bring him...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

But it is a political decision about...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

That is why you bring them in here, Minister. I am not talking about political decisions. I am asking technical details.



**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a political decision of the envelope that is set. The M.T.F.P.2, which goes from 2016 to 2019 is a political decision what those figures are.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

That is fine and I am not asking a political question.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Therefore what those figures are will determine what my chief officer has to deliver.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Eddie, we can stay here as long as we need to. I am asking a question because I think John started to go down a line which is very interesting and which we are interested in as a Panel, I hope. There is a policy in place for natural wastage, which presumably is to see job reduction.

**Chief Officer:**

Can I clarify that?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes, do.

**Chief Officer:**

In the period of the M.T.F.P. there are between 50 and 60 people going to be retiring from our organisation. So that is the raw facts and data. Ideally personally, if we could stay within that in terms of moving forward that would be great but whether my Department loses 200 staff, two staff, is a political decision, but in terms of the information that I think will help you with Scrutiny is between 50 and 60 staff will retire in that period.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Are you able to tell us at some stage what those staff do because it is clearly a worry to the public if people are retiring from frontline services, people who clean, who manage the sea defences, the parks and gardens, have been affecting the public?

**Chief Officer:**

That is the real challenge of this, is that there has been lots of rhetoric in the past about recycling people to do other jobs and it is something I think we have been very successful of in T.T.S. but at the end of the day across the States if you work in an abattoir you are not going to be working in a hospital ward. The skills do not really transfer.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

How do you make decisions? So presumably someone may retire tomorrow. Someone is going to retire next week. How do you make the decision whether that job gets replaced straightaway or whether it does not get replaced?

**Chief Officer:**

We do not do it then. We are doing it a year if not two years before and hopefully through, again, the success of recruiting new engineers, and it is the first time T.T.S. have done that for the last twelve years, and for also recruiting apprentices locally and training local kids up in doing these jobs. Our ageing workforce is a big risk I think for Jersey because the critical mass of these skillsets, if we lose them we are not going to be able to recruit them on-Island or even off-Island because the skillsets of the technical ones within the mechanical workshop, electrical and vehicle workshop do not exist now. Manufacturing in the U.K. and Europe has pretty much gone and these people are not available, so we need home grown children and they have got to learn off 50, 55 year-old men and ladies who work for me who can inspire them to do these jobs in the future.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Which is exactly what is happening at T.T.S.

**Chief Officer:**

It is. That is what we are doing.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have been out to Bellozanne, the garage facility there, and it is quite an eye opener and perhaps one day we can get Scrutiny to come and have a look there because there is a lot of young people coming up.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Coming back, and I will come back to ask the Minister, this is where you must be having the discussions with...John said between 50 and 60 people but it is what the services they are providing. Now overarchingly what services, you must be having the discussion...it is obviously not the ones you have just mentioned because you let them go now and where were your apprentice...who is going to be your apprentice? What are they going to learn?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are not many services that we provide that are not statutory. The one that is not statutory I can think of is the abattoir.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Let me pick one off the top of my head, cleaning. You provide lots of different cleaning. Are you looking across the board to outsource that and have you done the cost benefit analysis of what they are earning now, what they are going to be earning, what the company is going to pay them, that you are going to pay a large contract to? This is never done but you must be having these high level discussions.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You are right. We do need to look at the overall cost to the Island as opposed to just the Departmental cost when we are making those decisions.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Which is good to hear because I do not think we do that enough.

**Director of Operational Services:**

Certainly on the operations side, whether it is cleaning, parks and gardens, and some of the services that we provide that are not statutory, we have embarked and given a commitment that we are doing service reviews in all of those services to look at what would be the impact if we have got to make savings to hit the £50 million mark, the £60 million mark, the £70 million mark, and some of that certainly with the £50 million mark the Minister alluded to will be hopefully efficiency savings. If it is 60 or 70 then it could be a reduction in service. I think what we are doing at the moment is trying to pull together all that information so we can provide the Minister better information about what the impact of that would be.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You might have a cleaning cost or a particular service of, say £200,000 a year and you could put that to the private sector. You are not going to save £200,000 a year.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I know that, it has got to be done.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So you have got to make informed decisions.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Just to wrap it up really, the Jersey Property Holdings within T.T.S., is that a sense that your dual role means that you...one of the attractions for you to be Minister, is Property Holdings still going to go under the umbrella of T.T.S. if it has not yet?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I certainly would still want it to. It has been called in by Scrutiny and so we are sort of...we cannot implement the plans that we had to, to make them more closely, but having said that, effectively my Chief Officer of Property Holdings now comes to T.T.S. and part of the management team and we started to make those direct lines of officer communication. There has been an instance recently where there was a joint project that we signed up and went ahead.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So we do not know just yet then obviously?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are some issues that we are...it is going to be a States decision but we are trying to be aware of that and not take it for granted, but we are still trying to, where it is sensible, where it is common sense, we will work together and break down the last remnants of silos.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Could you provide us with a list at some point of the non-statutory services which you provide?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

That would be, I think, useful. I think I am finished with that line. I do not need to talk about question four.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Let us talk about transport because that is important. First of all, Minister, congestion. Do you have evidence of rising congestion in Jersey or traffic congestion and the impact on the environment in terms of emissions, the cost to business of traffic congestion and the cost in terms of human health and what?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do have an update, but it is in draft at the moment, of the Sustainable Transport Policy. It indicates that things are quite favourable and probably more favourable than we originally thought.

**Director of Transport:**

There has been a small reduction in peak traffic levels of 2.7 per cent since 2010 and it has been recorded that overall traffic levels have reduced three per cent over the past six years, despite the

population increasing by round about five per cent during that period. Certainly we are beginning to notice that we have got more spaces available in our multi-storey car parks last summer. They showed about an additional 100 spaces available. At the same time we have had growth in the bus service and if you look at January this year to January 2013, when the contract started, there has been a 16 per cent rise in bus usage. So the bus service is a good success story.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

More capacity coming online this summer.

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, we are looking to bring in additional capacity. I do not want to spoil any good news stories later on but we are working on extending where we can put large volume vehicles on to the bus service.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That is very good news, but what monitoring do you do of traffic levels? I am not just talking about parking stats but in terms of do you account, for example, the number of people who are walking and cycling to work?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

How often do you do the counts and so on?

**Director of Transport:**

So every year we spend about a week collecting statistics. We take an average week, which is outside the school holidays, and we get statistics on people walking and cycling. Also we have got twelve permanent sites where we monitor traffic all the time, as well as the mobile traffic counts that we can move around the Island for specific projects.

**Chief Officer:**

One of the things we are looking at this year is there is an app called Strava, which can give you information about if you cycle or walk or run you can monitor what you do on Strava. But Strava itself can give you that big data back and they published recently data for the U.K. and for America in terms of where people are travelling and the transport. We are looking to speak to them to see if we can do a week, again probably the similar week where we can get everyone to turn their Strava on and promote that, and see where the key areas people are cycling or walking.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Do you think once a year is enough though for this kind of monitoring?

**Director of Transport:**

No, we are looking to get a...you can get counters that will count cyclists, so we are looking to get one of those and install that. We think that...our spot surveys tend to underestimate things like the total level of cycling. That is just anecdotally. We do not have the figures to say that but that is my sort of subjective gut feel. That the peak is much more peaky in the summer and the low is lower in the winter.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

If congestion is down and traffic levels are down what do you attribute...is it increased bus use? Is it increased switch to other modes like cycling or walking?

**Chief Officer:**

I think it is a combination.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is the recession playing a part?

**Chief Officer:**

I think the recession has played a part definitely in terms of the transfer on to bus. I think the reliability of the bus service, the frequency of the bus service and the standard of the bus services. Again, cycling has become quite a cool thing to do as opposed to a slightly boring thing to do, and I think that has helped as well.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

To look at the buses, one of the things people notice in the U.K. and Europe when they travel on buses is that you can get real-time information. I know there was this text scheme, you can still see the things on the road, but are you planning to bring in real-time information at bus stops?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The text scheme still works and it is still running.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

The ability to stand at the bus stop and know where the next bus is coming, as you have with the trains in the U.K. and the buses in fact, seems to be fairly old hat now. Why can we not have that technology here?

**Director of Transport:**

So we have the text scheme still working. There is real-time information at the airport so people can see when the next bus is coming. We are looking at rolling it out to other high-usage bus stops but it is expensive and so far the priority has been, because we have a relatively low number of bus shelters, is to get the shelters out so you can improve people's journeys to encourage them to use the bus. Also, I think that technology has really been overtaken by access to smart phones. So I believe - I need to double check - that you can or will shortly be able to see your bus approaching on the Liberty Bus website and so that type of technology is far more useful. With fixed infrastructure you wonder whether it is worth making that investment in it.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think that is something that you should look at because surely there are an awful lot of people who do not have access to 3G or whatever who are waiting for a bus and wondering if it is going to arrive.

**Director of Transport:**

You can be talking about £20,000 per bus stop, and with the shelters installed themselves costing in the region of £6,000 to £9,000 you are talking about a big sum on top of that.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

A lot of number plates, is it not? **[Laughter]**

**Chief Officer:**

There are not enough number plates. There are not enough people over here to pay for it.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

You did mention that you were looking at sponsorship, which we have been pushing for for years in the States, so if you are going to allow commercial sponsorship of bus shelters that would surely offset the cost of having real-time information.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have managed to persuade a major food retailer to pay...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

And planning you have to get past as well.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

...a significant contribution to a bus shelter. It does not mean it is going to be branded. When I say sponsor, it is about working with them in their corporate social responsibility and tapping into those budgets that they have.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Chairman, can I chip in quickly? I have my AvanchiCard with me just as a little prop as it happens. I still cannot travel from First Tower to Gorey, I do not think, with one fee as I could with an Oyster card, where I was just charged for one journey. It seems that there is potential with it. I know there are different price tariffs for using Avanchi, but we are seeing an increase in tariff for non-card users. What are the challenges and what is the long-term aim with regard to the card and its usage?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

In terms of being able to do more than one journey with one...?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes, that is right.

[16:00]

**Director of Transport:**

At the moment we have a good take-up of the pay-as-you-go product in terms of Liberty Bus's marketing strategy. The new marketing strategy is getting people on to the new unlimited travel card, which will in effect give you those journeys. So if you bought an annual travel pass, you could enjoy unlimited travel for, I think, it is £1.36 a day. With a monthly pass I think it is £1.45 a day. If you move from your pay-as-you-go card to a monthly or weekly pass, you can start to enjoy those benefits already. The price of those cards has gone down in real terms quite significantly. It is about a £46 saving on the annual pass, a few pounds' saving on the monthly and weekly pass. So what we would like to see is the uptake of those so that you do not think about the cost of travel when you go. You have already paid for it and you can take as many journeys a day as you like.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Could we have a dynamic card? I mean, one of the appeals of the Oyster is that once you have reached your cap...so you put your money on a card, you travel and then it will not charge you any more. I think an issue for people travelling locally on the bus is that they do not necessarily have



the initial cash injection to pay for a one-off pass for a year, but they might pay for that over the year.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is continuing. You can get unlimited travel passes for weekly; you can get them for monthly, and for the annual ones. All three are coming down from 1st March.

**Director of Transport:**

Short breaks is and the price available for tourists as well. The issue with the Oyster card type system is it is incredibly expensive and it is not really scalable to a small Island, that type of technology. Transport for London has something like a £3,000 grant per individual living in London and that is how it is able to afford that technology. The Oyster card is transitioning out now and London is going to move to the new technology, the sort of tap and pay bankcard technology, but with an Oyster card type programme somewhere between it and the bank providing the same service. But those technologies are not available to small towns or jurisdictions like Jersey at the moment.

**Chief Officer:**

One of the key benefits of going to the cards, and it is something that I did not realise until I was explained it, it makes the buses a lot more efficient in terms of time because people paying for cash, cash is very slow for getting people transiting on and off the bus. If you look at the Inner Road, the amount of transactions there, if everybody has a card the buses run more on time: more buses run and they are more on time. It is a significant benefit.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Do they still have to give a receipt, though, with the card? Because in the early days they still had to get a receipt, which is again slowing things down. You do not have that with an Oyster.

**Chief Officer:**

Do you get receipts?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, we still do the bus tickets. We do that for several reasons. One is it has all the information that you need on it if you want to make a complaint or a comment on the journey, and the other issue is to do with revenue protection. So that is the reason, but if you take...just going back to the monthly passes, they are now cheaper than they were in 2010 so...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Okay, thank you. Can I come on to parking? It is a huge subject. A couple of specific things. The traders of St. Helier certainly have been promised replacement shopper parking at Ann Court when the drainage system is completed, which it now is. There has been an ongoing issue around the possibility of expanding Snow Hill, concern about pressure on Green Street because of the police station and, of course, the promised visitor and shopper parking in the Jersey Gas development that was in the planning brief negotiated out by a former Minister for Planning and Environment, I believe for 40 spaces offsite. So what is your solution? Do you think there is a problem with shopper parking and visitor parking in St. Helier and how are you going to increase the supply and also people's knowledge about where the supply is?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, there is ample supply already in the system but some would argue that it is not in the right place. By May this year, the additional deck at Green Street will be delivered. We are looking at the feasibility studies that have been done about additional decking at Snow Hill. As you know, I have created eleven spaces there quite easily with a vote last year. We are about to put an application into planning to create some temporary spaces on the Esplanade, some 40 to 80 additional shopper spaces. So we are working towards providing better shopper spaces for the retail sector. With Ann Court, we are working with the Strategic Housing Unit to ensure that we maximise not only the housing on that site but the car parking on that site, and it is likely to be a combination of residential parking and shopper parking on that site. It is unlikely to be a commuter-based type car park. It does not mean that...like in Sand Street, some people choose to use Sand Street as a commuter car park and they pay a substantial premium for that, so there may be individuals who would do the same at Ann Court.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I heard that Ann Court there was a problem with putting it underground, the 280 spaces.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The problem that was discovered when they did the shaft is that the ground conditions are far worse than originally thought. They thought they were difficult but they are extremely difficult. There is a layer of peat, I believe...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Lots of stuff, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

...which means that it makes it technically possible but very, very risky and very, very expensive. So they are now looking to doing a semi-basement layer as opposed to two layers underground, but they are still looking at providing...ballpark, the current figures are I think it is in excess of 200 spaces overall, of which about 140 are designated so far to be shopper parking. But that is still very much in the mix. Obviously, the scheme has not been designed but they are looking at maximising both the residential element of that which is needed and also the parking.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

When are those 140 spaces going to be online, do you think, rough ballpark to the date?

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Could I say I have been particularly keen on this and particularly keen to provide shopper parking in that area, so it is an ongoing...not argument but discussion with Andium to try and create that, and that is happening.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

It is several years away, though, is it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are several years away.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

But it will be there. We still have Minden Place. I think it is vital that we have shopper parking in that area, which to me is the closest available to the central market area.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Will you be arguing for visitor parking and shopper parking to be included in any of the big schemes of the plan for North of Town? Because the previous administration had been rather relaxed about...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I take a slightly different view to perhaps my predecessor in terms of that. I would sooner have spaces as opposed to cash because cash does not necessarily mean that you get spaces at the end of the day because you still have to find the site. So I will always err on the side of preferring to physically have the spaces and each of the key sites are going to have different considerations. That is probably a change from my predecessor.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think it is important to have St. Helier's views as well on that and their input.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

To go back round the Island again, you will have noticed a multiplicity of speed limits as you drive round the Island. Previous Ministers, as with the taxi industry, have really failed to grapple with speeding, whether there should be simplification to speed limits, any changes to speed limits. What is your view? Certainly, one seems to spend more time looking at the road signs than at one's...looking at one's speedometer than at the road surroundings, which cannot be good for driving. Is there not an argument that we have too many speed limits?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I agree with you. It is a bit similar to the town centre in terms of parking. We went round with parking patrol officers shortly after we took up the post and I was amazed at the different types of parking you can have in town. It is the same with the speed limits. We have a section in St. Lawrence where it goes from a 30 to a 20 to a 40 to a 15 and a 20, all in the space of probably 100 metres and it is ludicrous. We need to work on that, but it is not just a T.T.S. issue. There are 13 highway authorities. There is T.T.S. and the twelve Parishes, so we need to work together. It is probably something that we need to take up with...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

You plan to do that in your term of office, do you, to try and come up with a solution? Because saying the last administration did not really get anywhere with this, it never even came to the States, I think, or it was pulled.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is something we have to do in conjunction with the Parishes and I think you need to get a variety of different views. It is trying to find a view that is acceptable to all 13 highway authorities and the general public. Again, it is complex.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Have you ever thought of just giving up your responsibility for the roads and leaving it entirely to the Parishes seeing as they are so efficient?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If the Parishes were willing to take over the liability of maintaining the roads, then certainly.

**[Laughter]**

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes. Could I ask in addition to road speeds, it seems to me that most drivers spend a good proportion of their time on the other side of the road, certainly when it comes to buses, because there are so many instances. Take the Inner Road going up La Haule Hill where you have to go over the white lines all the time. There also seem to be ad hoc filter-in-turns that come up. Is there a fairly ad hoc nature in which road planning happens in Jersey and is that a problem?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Far from it, actually.

**Director of Transport:**

No. I mean, what I would say is what that is is really just the roads in Jersey have evolved from footways to cart tracks and then to fit vehicles, and the roads in Jersey are narrow. That is part of the character of the Island and that is one of the reasons a lot of the roads do not have footpaths. But you are constrained really by what is developed because often there has been erosion, so the fields on either side are very high but it would be very costly to widen those roads. Also, you would really spoil the character of the Island in a lot of respects as well.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry to pull that up. I mean, I sense your point really is that there are bus stops in places where if an individual driver parked you would be in breach of the highway code. I mean, they are on bends, they are on double white lines, and that is the point. It is a safety issue as well.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think we have to take a pragmatic view. I think we all have to be a bit more tolerant of each other in terms of when we use the roads. So if you are behind a bus and it stops at a bus stop, you are likely only to be stopped for 20 to 30 seconds in your journey. Over the length of a ten-minute or 20-minute journey it is really insignificant. I think we just...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Yes, I am not disputing that. There are bus stops in dangerous places and there should not be, really.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, it is dangerous for whom in terms of it is probably...an example phrase that I hear a lot is it is the least worst solution, and so it might be dangerous...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The least bad, actually, grammatically, the least bad.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The least bad, yes. So it might be the safest place in that area for the pedestrians to wait. Everything in life is a series of compromises generally and it is one that we have to look at the individual situations.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Speaking of compromises, the incinerator and Havre des Pas, Judy wants to put some questions to you about Havre des Pas, the screening at the incinerator, which you said in your speech you would be trying to improve, and other issues around the reclamation.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Well, basically, you started saying that St. Helier...we have a new deal for St. Helier, working with T.T.S. and many others, but also you mentioned the village / Parish Improvement Scheme and that there is no money for it. We saw a fantastic scheme for Havre des Pas but I do not think there is any money for it. Are you bidding for money for that, for Havre des Pas?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are two different...the village scheme is the village scheme for the other Parishes.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Other Parishes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

St. Helier has had urban renewal projects going back many, many years and that, I am sure, will continue. I am happy to work with the Parishes and, in particular, residents of that area, but the village schemes, with experience, does take a long time to...as the Deputy of St. Mary will know, does take a long time from an initial concept and ideas to delivery because you have to take people with you and iron out the complexities. I know there is a meeting of the Havre des Pas association on 12th March.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Improvement group.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Improvement group, yes. They have seen the plans, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Unfortunately, because I have a clash that night with my own Parish commitments, I am happy to attend those meetings but I will not be able to attend the one on the Thursday.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Send your Assistant Minister.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I will happily be able to attend that meeting, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So we want to improve St. Helier as much as the North of Town. It is the whole of St. Helier. We want to make it a vibrant place where people want to live, want to work and want to enjoy their leisure time.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Does the States of Jersey Development Company, because they do not class that as the Waterfront, they do not get involved along there at all? There is no budget in there?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The only thing that they did historically, they provided some funding for the Havre des Pas Pool and I believe that was about 8, 9, 10 years ago.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Yes. You were also asked this in your speech about making La Collette a lot prettier. Where are the trees and the pictures and the...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Trying to screen the...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Screening, screening.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have looked at that. We looked at a number of schemes. We looked about the feasibility of getting 4, 5, 6-metre trees there.

[16:15]

It is difficult in terms of how the bund is constructed because there is a membrane there and it does not necessarily allow roots, et cetera. We looked at covering it in...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Artificial grass.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

...artificial grass. We have looked at a number of schemes and we can provide that information to the Panel. None of them look particularly viable. It is a big building. Probably the way we are going to hide it best is probably not to hide it but to light it up in...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

What is the word?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Project on it and illuminate it to try to...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

No, no, no, residents in the area are absolutely fuming with the lights that are on all the time anyway.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, that is the lights on the south side.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

An art installation type of thing.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Yes, I understand.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Because even with ten or twelve-metre high trees, you are still not going to screen it.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

But this was all part of the planning permit. When Senator Cohen gave permission for the incinerator and Guy de Faye was the Minister for Transport and Technical Services, one of the



conditions was that it would be screened from view by planting. So for them to build a bund with a membrane that prevents tree planting seems to me to be completely...

**Chief Officer:**

No, the trees are planted and the trees are growing but to put big trees on there will not ... they will not survive. It is a very harsh environment being that close to the sea. So there are trees on the hill.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It will take 35 years for them to mask it if they survive.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

On the actual building and the function of La Collette itself - and I have asked you in the States - how far forward are you with discussions with Guernsey of taking their waste?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Guernsey representatives came over...

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Last week.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Last week, they came over last week to discuss how we are going to take this forward. But obviously the States...it has to be...the Guernsey Parliament has to agree it and so does the States of Jersey have to agree it, so it has to come back to the States. We have to find some common ground where it is a win for them and it is a win for us. I do not want to use up our... very Energy from Waste plant has a finite life before we have to start replacing it and it is based on usage, so I do not want to use up our facility too early and be forced to replace it prematurely. But if we have some spare capacity that temporarily we can use by allowing Guernsey to bring their waste here for us to use it to create energy, then that would be good. It has to work for both Islands. It has to work financially and it has to work for both communities.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

You also said earlier you have a live planning application in already for the new recycling to go down at La Collette. I know there are other issues. I think all the green waste is...we do not have time today, but could you send us through as a Panel everything and manpower that is expected to be on La Collette and how it works with the Buncefield and the inclusion zone.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I suggest that be...

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I know it is a big question. That is why I am saying send it on...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, but can I suggest that we organise a site visit for the Panel and a presentation and take you down there and show it to you first hand?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

That would be lovely.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

We have asked the same question of the Minister for Planning and Environment because there is an outstanding Island Plan commitment looking at the feasibility of increasing public access to La Collette, and to do that we need to tackle the Buncefield problem.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, I agree, and we want to create a link from Havre des Pas cycling and walking right the way round to St. Helier harbour. That is the aim.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Under the non-existent trees.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, the trees are there. The trees are there, they are just not growing quick enough.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Okay.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is it the air quality or...? No, nothing to do with that?

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is because they are like me and Eddie.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The air quality is okay. It is the salt, it is the sea spray. There was anecdotally the rain water that...

**Chief Officer:**

Sorry, on the roof of the Energy from Waste plant we put a water tank in there so it could recycle the rain water, and we used it for the toilets and the showers within the Energy from Waste plant. Within 6 months all the pipe work had rotted because basically the salt spray on the roof, which is 34 metres above sea level, was...basically the salt...when it rains it washes all the salt into this tank and it becomes more saline than the sea. So we have had to disconnect that because it is that harsh an environment down there and, you know, you do not realise that. The waves are not crashing into it, but the airborne salt is there.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

There was never a good place to put it, was there? So, any other questions, panel, to the...?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Just a quick update on where we are with the stored asbestos; yes, that was it for me.

**Chief Officer:**

There will be a solution very quickly. The final point we are checking on is whether or not we can export for disposal the legacy asbestos that is in the containers to the U.K. That is a challenge that my Minister and the Minister for Planning and Environment has put to us, so we have been working with the officers of the environment team to try and get a package together to sell that as well as we can to the U.K. authorities. That package will be completed, which includes some elements of the bund fill and the risk it faces at the moment, and that will be completed by the end of this month from our perspective and that will be then discussed with Defra in the U.K. Once that decision has been made, and that will be an unofficial decision, if they say no, then we will look at an alternative plan, and if they say yes, we will export it as soon as we can. But it is the final sort of...hopefully final option we have to try and get rid of the legacy quantities because it is...it has been there too long. The risks are too high and through various reasons we have put our Island at risk.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Well, not for today then, but if they say no you obviously have a back-up plan which probably when we meet again you can perhaps tell us in confidence.

**Chief Officer:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So you referred to the legacy problem, which is if we get shut of it, great, but what about ongoing? There is an almighty amount around which is going to be from...

**Chief Officer:**

There is, yes.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So are your negotiations going to include the future as well?

**Chief Officer:**

No, I think that is something we can talk about when we show you round, but the difficulty is the quantity of the legacy. Ongoing, moving forwards, the Island probably has...whatever quantity we have there, we probably have three times as much in buildings and within the built environment here now but it only comes to us in small amounts. So we need a solution for small amounts, but with the big legacy we have, you cannot really engineer one for that and then one for the other. So that is sort of a part of our argument, so we need a long-term strategy as well. It would be great to export it but it is...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is the idea that La Collette will not contain asbestos when you have finished? It has lots of ash under the mound, but is the idea that there will not be any asbestos under the mound?

**Chief Officer:**

I think it is a difficult decision. Bonded asbestos has been put under the mound since 1996, which is the asbestos sheeting, and that has been the disposal route throughout that time. But the hazardous asbestos is currently where it is and we have not put any in there yet.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Thank you. Any other questions, Panel?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

No, I am fine, thank you.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

No? Well, thank you, Minister, and your Assistant Minister and your staff, officers, media and the public and our clerks very much for a very useful session.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If I could just reiterate, officers will arrange for us to have a tour, maybe not just of La Collette but also the other T.T.S. activities.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

You want to go underground, do you not?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I am not going to the cavern. They will not let me in. **[Laughter]**

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Thanks very much.

[16:23]