



**Environment, Housing and Technical Services  
Scrutiny Panel  
Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Transport  
and Technical Services**

**MONDAY, 7th DECEMBER 2015**

**Panel:**

Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman)

Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade

**Witnesses:**

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services

Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards

Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services

[15:30]

**Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman):**

Welcome to our public quarterly hearing of the Environment, Housing and Technical Services Scrutiny Panel. We have invited the Minister for Transport and Technical Services and his team to meet us today. Could we start off by introducing ourselves? I am Simon Crowcroft, Constable of St. Helier, the chairman.

**Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary (Vice-Chairman):**

David Johnson, Deputy of St. Mary, Vice-Chairman.

**Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade:**

I am Deputy Montfort Tadier from St. Brelade, a panel member.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Deputy Eddie Noel, Minister for Transport and Technical Services.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

John Rogers, Chief Officer for Transport and Technical Services.

**Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards:**

Gordon Forrest, Head of D.V.S. (Driver and Vehicle Standards).

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Tristen Dodd, Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Thank you very much. We also welcome the public, the media and thank our committee clerks in advance for writing it all down so it can be published. Welcome. I think we are going to start off by talking about taxi regulations and Deputy Tadier is going to lead on this topic.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Thank you. So there has obviously been quite a lot of interest and a lot of work going on in this area, Minister. I guess the first question is: where do you stand on deregulation of Jersey's taxi industry?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I stand somewhere between the status quo and what C.I.C.R.A. (Channel Islands Competition Regulatory Authority) want us to do, which is complete deregulation. I do not believe that the status quo is sustainable going forward and I do not believe C.I.C.R.A.'s view of complete deregulation is the way to go either.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What are the problems ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If I can finish, Deputy. What I insisted is that we need to move away from regulation by quantity to regulation by quality.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So what does that mean in real terms?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Historically we have regulated the taxi industry by quantity. That is really in this day and age, with the way the industry is evolving, both within the Island and out of the Island, technology-driven, regulation by quantity is not sustainable going forward.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So do you think there should not be any cap on the number of taxis, be that taxi rank or cab, out there at any one point in the future?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is difficult in the modern world to regulate anything by quantity. What you can do, you can regulate by quality and therefore maintain an appropriate level of unit, in this case taxis, to provide the service that the public wants.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But do we not already regulate by quality? There are standards.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do have some quality controls in there but they need to be brought up to date. The last legislation came in, I believe, 1956 and it had a minor update in 2002, but since 1956 there has been very little change to the industry. Leaving things as they are is not going to work and deregulating along the lines that C.I.C.R.A. would wish us to is not going to work either.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What are the problems, chiefly, with the status quo as you see them?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If you go back to the White Paper there were 3 major issues. One was the confusion the public had between our hybrid 2-tier system. It is not really a 2-tier system. It is a hybrid 2-tier system. Secondly, was the perceived cost to the public of both rank and private hire work. In fact we have benchmarked the rank side of things and the tariffs that we set are quite competitive when we looked

at similar jurisdictions throughout the U.K. (United Kingdom). The third aspect that came out from the White Paper was the availability of taxis and cabs at peak time, predominantly people wanting to be picked up from a private address to where their journey was. In our research, since I took office, myself and my fellow Assistant Minister, we spent a great deal of time researching the industry and a fourth dimension came out, and that was accessibility of the service to those in our community that require provision for their disability.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

How would you describe C.I.C.R.A.'s position and how is it different to your position?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I have already said that C.I.C.R.A. want complete deregulation.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Presumably with some quality control.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, they only want complete deregulation.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

They would not want drivers to pass a P.S.V. (public service vehicle) test, for example?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The chairman of C.I.C.R.A. has been quite open. In fact he sees taxi and private hire work is no different to that of a hairdresser and we do not regulate hairdressers so why should we regulate a taxi ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Okay, without wanting to ... obviously they are not here, presumably it would be a requirement for all taxi drivers to have a P.S.V. licence.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think you need to ask C.I.C.R.A what their views would be.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Okay, let us do that when they ... I guess the other point to ask: is your position ... you describe yourself somewhere between the status quo and C.I.C.R.A., is that a pragmatic position, i.e. a way

of getting to a further position of complete deregulation and one-tier system in the future? Or is it an ideological position that we should still have an element of hybrid for ever?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I believe that we should have a one-tier system with a grandfathering provision for those individuals that do not wish to move to the one tier or are not able to move to the one tier.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Which tier would we be getting rid of?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

At the moment we have a hybrid system with 2 tiers, not a pure 2-tier system, and we would be having a one-tier system. So both elements would have to change.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We currently have 3 types of plate, do we not: red, white and yellow? Would they eventually be phased out into one type of plate?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

If you discount the grandfathering provisions then there will be one type of taxi/service to the Island.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

By which date are we aiming to have this?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We announced our plan forward. It commences in March next year and it is due to finish in December 2018.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So by 2018 we can expect to see one type of taxi?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Predominantly, we would expect there to be one type of service level, there would obviously be a grandfathering provision.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Will you talk to us a bit more about the grandfathering provision?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

For example, if you are a current rank driver who does not wish to adapt to the new requirements to have access to the rank I am not going to put those individuals ... I have got no powers to stop them from working but they would have the option to remain working in the private hire side of the industry but they will no longer have access to the rank after December 2018.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I am still not 100 per cent clear. I am not sure if other members are fully clear on how that might work.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So private hire will be able to continue but not be able to join the ranks, is that what you are saying?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

At the moment it will be at the ranks if your vehicle meets certain criteria and the driver of the vehicle meets certain criteria, i.e. the normal D.B.S. checking, obviously have a public service vehicle licence, but the appropriate training as well, then that vehicle and that driver will be able to access the ranks.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Am I right in thinking that when you talk about accessible vehicles you do not just mean wheelchair accessible, that there is going to be a number of different forms of accessibility that would qualify?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is correct, Constable. There will be a range. We are looking at, at the moment, appendix A and appendix B to the Ministerial Decision that we are working on. Appendix A will be the wheelchair accessible vehicles, and appendix B will be accessible vehicles.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Sorry, what does that mean in real terms then? If you are a rank taxi driver currently and you wish to continue in the next 3 years up until 2018 and perhaps beyond, what will you have to change about the current service you provide?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Your vehicle will have to meet the criteria that we set for accessible vehicles.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Which are?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Those ones under ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is it still a plan to make all rank taxis wheelchair accessible as a requirement?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

All rank taxis will have to be accessible vehicles.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

For wheelchairs?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, accessible vehicle.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

For what?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As I said, there will be an appendix A and appendix B.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So they will have to have doors presumably so you can open the door and get into the taxi, that is one ... is that correct?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You are being flippant there, Deputy Tadier. Appendix A will be for wheelchair access vehicles and appendix B will be for other accessible vehicles.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What proportion of the rank will need to be wheelchair accessible?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

All vehicles will have to be accessible.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

To wheelchairs?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not all have to be accessible to individuals that want to stay within their wheelchair.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Just go back a second. When these regulations were first announced the impression I got, and maybe I was wrong, was that all vehicles would have to be able to take wheelchairs. Are you saying that there has been a ... that strict argument has now been diluted somewhat?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We said all along that all vehicles will have to be accessible.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I mean this is a ... can we have clarification ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Deputy Tadier, I am trying to answer the question.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I know but we are going round in circles here. Accessible to whom and to what? I mean you cannot just say that it has to be accessible.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are working on the definition of "accessible" that means that those with ... not all the people with disabilities have the same type of disability. Not all people with disabilities are wheelchair bound. So we are making sure that the fleet will be 100 per cent accessible for people with disabilities.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

But that appendix is not ready yet, is it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we are still working on that.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

When will that statement be ready, which would obviously be helpful?



**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am hoping in the next week or 2, to be honest with you. I saw a draft this morning of the Ministerial Decision with the appendices. That has now been taken away to have some further work done on it. That will hopefully be coming back ... I hope to be signing it this side of Christmas.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Will there be a percentage - to pick up Deputy Tadier's point - specifically wheelchair accessible?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is one of the issues that ... I had on Friday a letter back from the Jersey Rank Taxi Association combined with some members of the private hire side of the business, and we are looking at their findings. One of the things that I did ask them to look at was what the percentage of wheelchair access vehicles should there be across the industry and, secondly, how do I apply that percentage, whatever it is, so from 0 per cent to 100 per cent, how do I apply that fairly to the drivers? For example, if it comes out that 20 per cent is the figure, then how do I apply that 20 per cent in a fair way? I am waiting to hear back from the industry for their views on that.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

You are looking to ... because the message seemed to go out, and I do not know where this came from, that you were asking full rank taxis to be 100 per cent accessible for wheelchairs. Is that not correct?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We asked them all to be 100 per cent accessible.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

For?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

With people with disabilities.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Including people who may be in a wheelchair?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Those people in a wheelchair that wish to travel in their wheelchair.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Let us get to the bottom of this. If somebody in a wheelchair could roll up to the rank, perhaps literally, and say: "I want to get in your taxi" you would expect that they could get in any and all taxis?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

They should be able to get in a taxi at the rank within a reasonable period of time of waiting.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That is going to influence the percentage that you go for presumably because you need to take into account that the ranks are not always as busy.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The problem that we have is how do you pick a percentage that is right for the requirements of our population and our visiting population? Secondly, how do you apportion those fairly?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Exactly. So what is your answer to that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is why we have gone back to the industry to ask them to put their views on that.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Again endorsing Deputy Tadier's point. I think when we first started the impression I had was all taxis had to be wheelchair friendly and that was going to create ... every taxi driver had to have a new vehicle by a certain date.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You are right, Deputy. What we looked at there was that we did not know what the right percentage should be and we did not know how to apportion those fairly.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So progress has been made towards accommodation, shall I say?

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just maybe clarify something a little? Not everybody who uses a wheelchair will want to ride in the taxi on their wheelchair. So some people will want to ... there are transfer plates and the like used to get out of your wheelchair and into the vehicle. So as long as the taxi is able to carry the wheelchair and the passenger, it has a means for the passenger to enter the vehicle, then that meets

the requirements of accessibility. But because there is more disability than just those that involve wheelchairs, so you have to look at how you cater for all those different types of people and different types of lifestyle.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Thanks for the clarification. I was in England 2 weeks ago and I was driving people who did need to be in a wheelchair but they had to have access, and we left it, because if you have a wheelchair they prevent somebody travelling with them.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But are taxi drivers aware that you are expecting them to come up with this percentage?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Certainly at the meeting we had with the Rank Association, we made it clear that is one of the things we wanted them to look at. The same with representatives from the cab industry as well.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

That was after you told them you wanted 100 per cent wheelchair accessible?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That was after that we said that we were looking at 100 per cent because we had no way of defining what the right percentage was.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So you have done a U-turn on that, essentially?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not a U-turn; we always said that we wanted the fleet to be 100 per cent accessible.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Okay. What are the implications for the cab industry within that specifically for accessibility and for wheelchair accessibility?

[15:45]

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Explain ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Cabs, so non-rank, private hire.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will want to make sure there are sufficient vehicles in Jersey's fleet to meet the demand and we are looking at a one-tier system, not a 2-tier system. You are looking at a one-tier system with effectively a grandfathering provision for those that do not wish to access the rank and make their change in the vehicle as and when their vehicles are due to be changed.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Given that a lot of taxi drivers are independent, does this mean they have to belong to a header organisation to know which ... how they contribute to the proportion required?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

All P.S.V. drivers that access the rank and private hire will have to be associated with some type of booking entity.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

That agency idea is still on the table, right, okay.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Essentially, to answer maybe one of the earlier questions I asked, that the way to synthesise the different types of taxi and cab is to go via ... is to make them all essentially cab companies, is that ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, it was to make them all so that it is a level-playing field, so they all can do private hire work, they can all be hailed, and they can all access the rank.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Can I ask if there are any other sort of contentious issues that you feel you have made some progress towards in regards to the regulations?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have only just received the report ... the letter back from the Combined Association and the firms that were contributing to the proposal, and we will be considering those.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

When do you expect to be able to announce perhaps a more flexible approach or any changes that you may have made after the consultation?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have not consulted on this; we did not need to consult on it. But we are taking the views and we are arranging a meeting with the industry later this week. We are trying to get dates into diaries to meet them before the end of this week.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Do you think you would consider bringing a proposition to the States with a wholesale package of changes that are being proposed, once they have been finalised?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Why would I do that, Deputy?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Maybe for democracy and accountability purposes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have had that process, we have had the Green Paper and we had the White Paper, it now does not need a States' decision to implement changes to how we regulate the industry.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We can probably ask some other questions. I think the key questions have been asked, but there still seems to be some confusion about to what extent taxis will be expected to be uniform in their appearance and branding. Can you just talk us through which colour or colours you expect them to be? Is that still on the table? And what the branding will be for them.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The branding: the industry has come back with an alternative branding. They are talking about a roof branding instead of a bonnet branding, so we will look at that at our meeting.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

A roof branding?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

A bespoke coloured roof as opposed to ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

A roof sign?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So when tourists are coming into Jersey on the plane they will be able to see the taxis from above.

[Laughter]

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not know if the industry will find it useful, Deputy Tadier.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But there seems a ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

This comes from the industry.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

There seems to be a lot of confusion around it. We started off having proposals regarding wheelchairs, 100 per cent accessibility, one colour and then it became several colours, and then it became wraparound on the back.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Deputy, I suggest you re-read the documentation that we produced. There is no confusion at all. We are requiring those vehicles that access the rank to have a specific type of branding. But that branding has not been defined yet. That is a good thing, it makes the vehicles more accessible ... more identifiable to the public living on the Island but also for our visitors, as you do in virtually every jurisdiction you go to.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I thought the branding would at least be on the back or front so it is visible rather than on the top of the roof. I mean that is ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That has come from the industry not from us, Deputy Tadier.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think we will probably move on.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

We just have to wait for the detail. One of the questions is: are you still in talks with the taxi industry, and clearly you are, and it is ongoing, so have you any idea when they might be completed to the extent you are able to bring forward some regulations for us to look at, if you wanted to?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Hopefully we will be in a clearer position after the meeting with the industry later this week. So this side of Christmas we will have a clearer position of what they would like to see happen versus what we are proposing.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Okay, thank you.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

The next topic we have notified you we are going to talk about is waste management, and particularly user pays approach. If members of the public want to leave at this point, that is fine. Thank you. User pays proposals for waste management. As Constable of St. Helier I feel somewhat conflicted because this does affect the Parish quite closely, so I have asked the Vice-Chairman to lead on these questions.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

There was a target date of beginning of next year to bring out 4 proposals. Where are we on that? Are we still on course?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are still on course. We appointed ICS to look at waste across the whole of T.T.S. in terms of both liquid and solid waste. That was a 6-month piece of work and they are halfway through that currently. So we will be expecting that to be reported back in the first quarter of next year.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So you are waiting for your own adviser's report, are you?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Before you do anything?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, there was a presentation last week with their initial findings, and they are now working on their first draft.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

A presentation to your good selves?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, to me and my team.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

We presumably will be sent a copy of that report once it is available, will we?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Once it is available, yes. It is a very tight timescale, the amount of work they have got to do to fit into the budget next year, which is a key milestone, is significant, so it will be very ... it is a very short period of time to undertake that work.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

We have raised these questions before. Maybe it is not appropriate to do so again about ... we do not wish to anticipate what they will say at the moment. One question I have here is anticipate the charge, will have reference to numbers in the household, size of property or how. Are there various alternatives within that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

What we are trying to do is learn lessons from other places and try and make it proportionate and fair. That is the key thing. At the moment, looking at the early indications, what we have at the moment is very unfair and it appears that the household is subsidising commercial businesses



significantly on liquid waste and on solid waste, and that is the initial findings. So the taxpayer who pays for it at the moment is subsidising private business significantly. So we are looking at a fairer way of dealing with it and ideally we would like the charges to be proportionate to the use, so we can generate better behaviour in line with our strategies for the charging mechanism.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Could you provide us with those figures that you talked about?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I saw them last week and they have not been verified, but as soon as they have been verified, yes, you can. The Minister has not seen them yet.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, I have not seen them yet.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

They were just in a presentation to me and my team last Monday but that appeared to be quite a significant outcome, which I thought was worth mentioning. It was not a surprise on solid waste but certainly a surprise on the liquid waste.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Moving on then. The question of how would it be collected. At the moment it is collected through the Parish system, is it? Is the intention to centralise it?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

At the moment ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Waste is not collected in the Parishes at all.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

There is nothing collected through any system.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

In terms of cost, the collection of household waste is a Parish ...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry, okay.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

But the disposal of that waste is purely funded currently by the taxpayer.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

So your Parish rates pay for the collection of the waste and being taken or recycled to various outlets. The disposal of that is not currently covered by any of the Parish charges.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Again, it is probably more of an environment point, are there thoughts of encouraging people to recycle by having a charge for certain items and not for others?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Most of the western world have proportionate charges to incentivise the right behaviour to fit in with a strategy, and our strategy, as you are probably aware, is we want to promote recycling as much as possible and the charges should reflect that. The reason we do not recycle as much as we should is because it is free at delivery at the £110 million Energy from Waste plant.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So anticipate incentivisation methods in the scheme ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. Guernsey are probably a long way ahead of us in respect of charging. They have a very high charging rate for their landfill site which means that their recycle rate is far in excess of ours. I think we have to learn some lessons from them on some things and that is one of them.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Do they have kerbside ...?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

They have just lodged a kerbside collection, yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is it Island-wide?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

They are trying to do it Island-wide, yes. They are just in the process now. But their bring system has been probably the most successful bring system I have seen or anybody has seen. It seems to

really fit with the Guernsey culture. It has had a remarkable success in terms of percentage of waste that goes into their bring system. Which is meaning that their kerbside has not been quite as successful as they thought it would be.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry, going back to fairness of the system which you are advocating. I mean on liquid waste, those on private drains arrangements pay nothing at the moment; well, yes, they ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

You either pay a lot or nothing.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

They pay a lot on ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

On tankers.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

On their own septic tanks for emptying. Now how do you propose to ... not absorb them into it, but ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

There has to be some fairness. The people who are on tide tanks pay a disproportionate amount and significant amount of cost compared to people who are on mains drains or people who are on a septic tank that works. We have to go through all those iterations and that detail.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Will that therefore involve a programme of connection to mains drains more ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

What I would like to see, if any charging mechanism is brought in, is for an element of that to allow us to extend the mains drains network on the Island. It is something that has not yet ... but it has been 10 or 15 years now, the last sort of major drains extensions. There are pockets that with a small amount of funding that we could get we would be able to achieve. My own personal view is that I would like any charging mechanism that comes in to have a small element of charges to cover extending the network system. But we have to wait and see what the work from the consultants comes out at.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

One final question on this, from me at any rate, is aside from the consultancy reports, a more local one, what if any, progress you have made in relation to Bellozanne and the issue of the St. Helier covenant, which is a summary of the stumbling block?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I had a meeting with the Parish to discuss a way of maybe negotiating a compromise, a settlement. It was quite clear from both sides that the advice that we had been given and the advice the Parish have there is too much between the 2, and we have agreed to seek legal redress on that. So I am not sure if the letter has gone from Law Officers to the Parish yet.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I certainly have not had a letter from you about it. I wonder if you could just clarify for the benefit of people who might be reading these minutes afterwards, what those 2 positions are that you are going to seek a legal opinion on.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have advice that the covenant has expired, effectively, whatever the legal term is, and therefore it has no value, from the advice that we have. Obviously the Parish believe that it has substantial value. We are not going to be in a position, because of the advice that we have, to be able to negotiate a settlement because we cannot use taxpayers' money to buy ourselves out of something that has not got any worth, putting it in simple terms. So the way forward on this is to go to the court and let the courts decide what does that document mean and what is the interpretation, and to get that view from the court and to move on with the Parish after that.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

You say it has expired; do you mean it has not quite expired but it has got no relevance to the way society has evolved, is that what you are saying?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. Forgive me, I do not know the precise legal term that was used, but the advice that we had at the time was that we could not buy ourselves out of the covenant and show good fairness to the taxpayer because, in our opinion, it has got a nil value.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Is the intention to therefore make a joint approach to the court for an effective ruling?

[16:00]

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am not sure of the actual technical legal aspect of how we apply this to the court, but it something that our legal advisers should be liaising with the Parish legal advisers to find the most cost-effective way of getting the court to decide on what the document means.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Court processes are notoriously slow. Surely if this attempt to get a clarification from the court about the meaning of the covenant today were to take, for example a year, it is going to set back your timetable quite considerably, is it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do not think it will take that long; certainly we would hope that we would have this resolved in the summer of 2016.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I ask you a question about recycling: I do not think you were Minister at the time, but the States did approve a proposition, P.121, asking for a feasibility study of an Island-wide collection scheme for household recyclables, and that was due to be reporting back in 2015. Is that still on the table?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is still on the table. It will probably be lodged as an R. with the States at the next states sitting, so it will either be on Monday afternoon or on Tuesday.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We will look forward to that. I have just got a technical question perhaps for John: you spoke earlier about the perceived unfairness for being commercial and personal, which I think we can understand. How do you measure that when it comes to liquid waste? Is that still an issue for liquid waste or is it just for solid waste?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, it is for both. This is only the preliminary outcomes, but if you look at things like hotels and restaurants and businesses, basically the taxpaying public is paying for the liquid output of those areas in a disproportionate way. So at the moment it is down to our personal taxes that are paying for the services.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is that not a general problem with taxation? We have a corporation tax rate of zero so, of course, anything that corporations use will not be paid for by a corporation tax, it will be personal taxation.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, but you could quite easily turn that around: as you would do in other places you could base the sewerage charge on their water charge as a proportion, which is what normally happens. So if they are using lots of water, then you could have a proportional charge based on their water usage, which is then comparable. So you can solve it through that mechanism if the mechanism is sophisticated enough.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Okay, thank you. The third area we have identified for our hearing is the Sustainable Transport Policy. I am sure it will not have escaped your notice that we asked you about this at our last hearing in May 2015. We asked you about the promised report on progress towards the Sustainable Transport Policy and specifically you told us, and I quote: "I think you requested that we produce our update by July this year, and that is something we are endeavouring to do. I have seen the first draft; it is currently going for its second-time drafting, and that is something we intend to produce in time for your deadline."

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. Unfortunately we over-promised and under-delivered there; something which I hate doing, Constable. So we have pretty much the final draft together.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

It needs proofreading.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It needs proofreading. We can give that to you today.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I am quite good at proofreading; I will happily undertake that. So we should note that the documents are now being handed to the panel. These hearings obviously have some purpose: to get these documents done. So in answer to the question: "Why did it not happen?" obviously, it has now happened. We cannot really question you on that document because we have not read it yet. Following on, do you mean to provide annual reports? Because certainly the Sustainable Transport Policy was amended with a formal request to provide annual updates. Is that something you intend to do from now on?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

To be completely candid with you, Constable, no; I would prefer not to do it on an annual basis because you do not necessarily see that change has gone through. The Sustainable Transport Plan, although it was initially set for 5 years, many of the aspirations and many of its purposes are much longer than that. It is about long-term changing of our culture in some respects to be one less reliant on the private motor car. So in an ideal world you would not want to issue this as an update document every 12 months because you cannot see longer trends. I think there is scope there to maybe issue one every other year.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

But that was not what the States agreed.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It was not what the States agreed, unfortunately, but it is how I would personally do it. As long as the States think that we should be doing that on an annual basis obviously we will endeavour to do it on an annual basis. There have been 2 in the last 5 years: one was at the end of 2013 and this one has been updated to take us part-way through 2015.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

So once it has been proofread, this will be published?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. It will go in hopefully this week; published on either Monday or Tuesday next week.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Just to press you on that, assuming that nothing changes in terms of the States decision, you will produce another one at the end of 2016?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Hopefully we will. Now we are in a process of putting it in a format that is more user-friendly and hopefully you will find it more useful.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is the delay in producing this update or progress report caused by the fact that your department is under-resourced when it comes to transport matters?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. We have 3 main divisions within T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services), one of them is Transport, and it is also where the headcount is the smallest. On the policy side, I think it is 4 or 5 individuals.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

It depends how you put it, but certainly I would categorise it as no more than 3.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

So it is a very small team.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Yes. It is a small team. You have said that to us before, that it is a small team, but I am just curious because, given the importance attached by the public to road-traffic-related problems at the local level, do you not think this is an important area? We understand that you are cutting back in other areas of your department, but is this whole area of transport planning not one where you should be seeing a growth in your officer team?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are reviewing the whole of T.T.S., section by section, and this section is going to be reviewed. It will probably be in the latter part of 2016, early part of 2017 in the programme of the sections that are being reviewed.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the things we have done on a temporary basis to try and soften that, because you are quite right, this area is very politically-motivated and there are lots of changes that need to happen to keep the Sustainable Transport Plan going. It is difficult because there is very little money set aside for that, but we have tried to reallocate existing internal resources to focus more on this in the short term.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are some measures taken in terms of the challenges we face, for example, the sale of registration plates. We had the auction back in September where we sold zero zero plates, and those monies are being used to fund additional things like additional bus shelters and safety road improvements. There are 2 examples here: one is road safety measures at the Beaumont junction and the other is the provision of what probably will turn out to be about 6 additional bus shelters throughout the Island.



**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Despite being quite a small section working collaboratively with the rest of the department, as you would expect, we have got better and better at delivering these schemes and to bring change. There is quite a lot of good news. Not everything is perfect, of course, but there are things that should be celebrated within this report in terms of creating site infrastructure and progress; we have done bus numbers and passenger numbers.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think the last time we spoke to you there were positive signs in terms of bus usage, cycling, et cetera, but the car usage had remained fairly constant.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It has. There has been some slight reduction in peak hours but we are only talking 1 or 2 per cent; it is nowhere near the original target of 15 per cent at peak time. But that target was set prior to an amendment to the Sustainable Transport Policy, which meant that one of the levers that was supposed to be made available to the department to attain that 15 per cent was increasing the differential between the cost of coming into town by car and the cost of coming into town by other means, so it is always going to be constrained while that is in place. So, over the period of 5 years, yes, 2 per cent overall reduction in peak hours of traffic is a good achievement. It is nowhere near the target, but it is something to build on.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Are we able to provide any of the headline figures from the report about buses?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

So bus ridership in peak hours is up 33 per cent, overall bus ridership is up 22 per cent since the beginning of the new contract in 2013. We have got an extra 100 spaces available in our car parks in the morning in the peak at the moment. Obviously, you cannot identify where the modal shifts come, whether it is people starting to cycle more, or whatever, but certainly there seems to be some form of impact on how people are behaving. Although, given the huge tidal influx of people into the Island and into town and out of town, it is only a small portion of the traffic.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

When you say: "Peak times" is there any differential between morning and evening? It could well be that people are just working later.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

We are looking at the morning peak because the afternoon peak is much more spread out and less of an issue, because of the school closing times, et cetera.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I have just got a general question, and apologies if it is too broad, but to what extent do you think you are winning the ideological political battle against the car?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is not against the car, it is about getting the right balance for Islanders to have a good quality of life in terms of how transport interacts. Given the increases in population over the last 5 years and given what we are trying to do, I think it has been pretty good, because increases in population were not built into the targets either for this plan, there was no provision for that. I think to have a 2 per cent reduction overall at peak time is quite a good achievement and to get, in the last 2 years, the shift of people to using buses as being 33 per cent is substantial.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just clarify my number there a second. Sorry, John. The number was baselined in 2010 but we did not get much increase until the beginning of 2013 where it significantly picked up.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think, from a more strategic view, people are happier to use the bus now; the bus is not viewed as an additional form of transport for people of a lower class, and that is very reassuring. I think that is a fundamental change in Jersey. I think the bus becoming part of people's lives, going out of an evening, and all those things, has had a significant effect. I think if you look on a nice day the amount of people commuting on bicycles and running and walking, and doing all those other things, we are getting there, but it is a massive battle. I think the history with the car in Jersey is something that which is wedded to the car more than anywhere I think I have ever lived, and it is very much a tradition we have got to try and break, but it takes a long time.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

On a more general point, and forgive me, I am going outside the ambit of the questions, the aim of the game is to reduce vehicle emissions. Now, modern vehicles are much more efficient in that respect. To go hand-in-hand with that, are there moves to discourage older vehicles by M.o.T. (Ministry of Transport) tests or some form of taxation to get them off the road, bluntly?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, we had the amendments, the changes in the budget this year on vehicle emissions duty.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

That is on the import of cars, though, is it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is on import of vehicles.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

I am talking about the older ones which are already here.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The older ones that are already here, we have had an approach from the motor industry themselves about having an annual version of the vehicle emissions duty; they have made some early proposals to us. We have looked at those. There are some issues there because there is this whole thing about ability to pay, things like that, but generally, yes, we want to encourage replacement vehicles to be of low emissions and ultra-low emissions, and eventually those will filter down into the second-hand market. There are other things that, obviously, as a government, as the States, we could do in terms of impôts duties each year to encourage motorists to have more fuel-efficient vehicles.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Yes. My concern is there is a stock of older vehicles on the Island and we want to try and reduce them, do we not?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think the key stage is making sure they are running well, I think that is the first point, so they are well-maintained and they are tuned to minimise the emissions but, longer term, the progress in low-emission vehicles now is remarkable, the 100 grams per kilogram CO<sub>2</sub> now; it is quite normal to have cars at that level.

[16:15]

So the industry is moving forward and the more people that get onboard with that the better.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Deputy, what you may see initially is more work done with the commercial side of the vehicles on the Island, that is something else we are looking at, and they are probably arguably doing the most

mileage and creating the most emissions. So it is something that we are looking at as more of a priority as opposed to the individual private vehicles.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

All right. It is being addressed.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I ask, as an extension of that more generally, how does Jersey measure its carbon emissions?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is quite an extensive measurement through St. Helier and we have various testing routes.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

There are stations for measuring pollutants in St. Helier. The air quality is measured by the Environment Department and they have their Energy Pathways, document and group, which the Minister sits on.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is there a way though, if Jersey wanted to produce a figure for its carbon footprint, would we be able to do this and, if not, how would we go about that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think those get used by the Environment Department, their policy team; is it Dr. Magris looks after that.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

It would be in the Energy Pathway policy document and we would have fed into that.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Our biggest problem is emissions from vehicles. Now the energy from waste plants is meeting with ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Sorry, I know we are going slightly broader, but it is all useful, I think: how does that compare to air travel? Do you factor that in, or ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is out of our remit, but what comes under our remit are vehicles and the energy from waste plant, and so that is more of a question for the Environment side.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

What is your timetable for tackling emissions? You mentioned you are going to look at commercial vehicles first, which presumably, in terms of diesel emissions; they are going to be a more serious contributor. What is your timetable for doing that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are expecting some initial papers out in the spring.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. We have commissioned a team to look at that and they have been already talking to the industry, who are very receptive to this. Again, it ties in with lots of things Gordon is trying to do in terms of getting the standards of vehicles up. There are 3,000 commercial vehicles which we still need to deal with, as opposed to at the moment we deal with about 300 through the P.30 system. It is going to expand the net of that so we apply better standards to 3,000 vehicles within the same resource. So we have got to do it a more clever way.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Do you mean 3,000 vehicles that are a problem to you or there are 3,000 commercial vehicles?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, sorry, there are approximately 3,000 commercial vehicles.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I thought there were more than that. It would clearly be of enormous benefit to town, where you have got a lot of congestion anyway.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Significantly different from town, yes.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

On a related point, one of the things that was noticed by Jersey in Transition when they did their survey work in Conway Street, and there were a number of interesting findings, including I think the fact that three-quarters of the traffic, if you like, was pedestrian traffic, only a quarter were vehicles. But when they observed deliveries, they found that quite a lot of delivery days were being used by

people popping in for a coffee or people essentially were not delivering. Do you have any plans to tackle the abuse of delivery bays in town with your P.C.O.s (Parking Control Officers).

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is difficult to do. There is anecdotal evidence that people are abusing the unloading bays, et cetera, but it is a difficult thing to police. Again, we only have so much resource in that area, but it is something that we are willing to work with the Parishes, who have their own P.C.O.s as well, to make sure that we educate the commercial side of the industry not to abuse effectively what are privileges to them to be able to provide their services to their customers.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I did a drive-about, and this is slightly in relation to wearing my other hat as a Constable, with one of your predecessors, Deputy Guy De Faye, and we went around in a delivery vehicle. It was the same finding there, it may just be observational, but about half the bays we visited had people who clearly were not delivering or collecting goods, they were people who were having a coffee or eating their lunch or reading the paper. That means that you have got these commercial vehicles circulating, unable to load, and going back around the loop again, adding to congestion and emissions. So perhaps we should go for another drive together.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I know we are not going to solve this today, but the 10-minute parking near the market seems to work fairly well. Is it possible to extend that around town, so that way you can use it for whatever purpose, whether it is unloading or popping in to get a coffee and a sandwich and then just nipping off?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Those spaces at the market are designed for public as opposed to commercial vehicles. Commercial vehicles have their own parking round the market. That is really for the customers of the market to stop, collect their purchases, and ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think the point is though, if commercial vehicles are using unloading bays just for 10-minute parking essentially, why not extend 10-minute parking?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think our provision of on-street parking overall in St. Helier is quite confusing. We have the disc system, we have the scratch card system, we have a series of unloading bays, et cetera. I would like to work with the Constable and the Parish to try and simplify on-street parking.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Parking; of course, the area we are all interested in is off-street parking where you do not have the hunting for spaces that goes on with on-street parking. Can you update us with any progress on the provision of off-street spaces? We know that Ann Court is going to be delivering spaces back to the public, but are there any other potential multi-storey car parks you can tell us about?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have some, I think it is 300 to 400, free spaces every day now ...

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is 400.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

... in multi-storey car parks, predominantly at places like Pier Road, but quite often at places like Sand Street as well. So there is plenty of capacity there; it is whether or not that capacity is in the right place. From a personal point of view, I would like to see commuter car parking over time on effectively what we have known as our ring road. It is not particularly good as a ring road, and that is the historical nature of it, whereby people park on the periphery of St. Helier and finish their journey on foot to their place of work, with shopper parking being available closer to the shops. Obviously, by its nature, there is more of a turnover of vehicles over time. I am aware we have got one scheme that is being talked about on the ring road, it is a private scheme; it is obviously down to that individual entity and their discussions with Planning but, from a States scheme, there is nothing in the pipeline. Obviously there was some work done at Snow Hill, but that was for shopper parking not for commuter parking.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

There is also the new counter system that has gone in, just to remind you.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. We now have real-time data on how our multi-storeys are being used; we provide that real data to the media so they can publicise it so people coming into St. Helier can go directly to the car park that has capacity. But I think Islanders do get to know which car parks do have capacity at any time of day. As I say, the media use that.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I have probably asked you this before, but would you be minded to consider an incentivised use of certain car parks? If Pier Road is mainly empty most of the time and you would like to get people to

park up there rather than any of the other car parks, if it was cheaper to park in Pier Road you might ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would, Constable. What I do not want to do is to encourage people off the bus, so that differential needs to be there. What we do not want to do is effectively score an own goal by providing a cheap alternative for commuter parking so that people decide to not get the bus but to take their car.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

If you look at the price that we charge for parking compared to other south coast towns or towns with the same rates or land values as St. Helier, parking is exceedingly cheap and good value in Jersey already.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

You said you would talk about some interesting ideas around phones; using technology to be able to update your paycards, et cetera, so that you do not necessarily have to get a fine. Is that something which is ...?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are out to tender at the moment for an apps-based solution as an addition to the paycard system, because obviously not everybody has access to a smartphone, but it would mean that both within the multi-storey car parks, in surface car parks and on the street, there will be an alternative method of payment that allows that flexibility, so people can combine an additional unit or units of parking without having to return back to their car.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

As happens in many other towns now. When are we going to be able to enjoy this, because it is clearly overdue?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Tenders should be back in January/February-time.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. At the moment we are just sorting through some pre-qualification issues that have arisen with the companies that have submitted their initial offering, and then the full tender will hopefully be issued very shortly, and we will be in tender assessment during the first couple of months of next year. Then we have got to speak to the supplier to look at their rollout programme and how they wish to roll it out.



**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is there a general either transport app or a variety of apps you could have to encourage car sharing? So you could have a one-stop-shop which tells you where there are spaces at any one point, which will update your paycards and which will give you access to car sharing. Is it possible to have a single point?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

What we have been trying to do is get a suite of apps. It tends to work now where apps are a suite, so we are looking at a suite of apps, and you might have a car sharing app, you might have a bus app ... well, you would definitely have a bus app ...

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

I have got a beta of a bus app on my telephone.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

So what we will have is there will be a cluster of half a dozen transport ones, putting them altogether seems to be ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Maybe it does not work.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

They might go under some type of an umbrella app, I suppose; a visit Jersey app may have a transport section in it to point visitors to the Island in the right direction about how they pay for their parking or how they get access to buses, and that sort of thing.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the key changes is the payment systems through the phone now. The touch stuff is all being advertised and banks are transferring on to that. That is going to be a big change, and I think a positive change.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

Just to finish, what is happening often in municipalities now is the government is drawing back from providing apps and they are just providing open-sourced data and developers are doing their own thing with it and making their own incomes from it.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

While we are on the subject of technology and the changes in parking, one of the bug-bears I think that we all face is people who are penalised for parking improperly, and I get regular contact from people in tears about the fact that they have got a really swingeing fine, which there is no way round, because it will go up to £60 if they do not pay within 7 days, or whatever it is. Just to give you one example, when we did change round the Esplanade parking, a person who put out 8 paycards to park for 8 hours but they had parked in a 3-hour area and so they were fined £40. It seems to me that is a very inflexible approach to the user, who has clearly paid for the day's parking; the fact they are in a wrong part of the car park, would it not have been better to put an advisory notice on the car to say: "You have parked in the wrong section of the car park. We have taken your number, if you keep doing it, we are going to fine you"?

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is operational ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is more of an operational thing, but get that individual to contact ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Well, frequently we have done that; I have not had any joy. When the Constable had the power to waive fines, that was something where of course that would seem to be commonsense, that you would cancel that fine. But I think there is a lot of distress out there with people who just feel that the system is not ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think the officers that look after the fine side have quite difficult task to identify the actual true hardship cases where people have, as in your example, which was a case where a person had just simply misunderstood the layout of the car park but had paid, as opposed to those who try and push the boundaries on purpose to get a cheap parking.

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

If I can just add to that, if that is okay. We have managed some significant changes to parking arrangements around St. Helier over the last few years, and we have put a great deal of effort

operationally into providing the right information and, on the whole, what we do try to apply is exactly as you say, Constable. In the first few days we apply a soft approach, an understanding approach, and it is only after a period that we will return to the hard policing. But, with the Sand Street car park trial system and with the new parking, you are able to apply a more soft approach to policing, so it does have that benefit.

[16:30]

But on the whole these things get managed relatively well, I think. If you look at the transfer and decanting of the car park from the Esplanade to Les Jardins de la Mer, it all went relatively smoothly and very few complaints.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Going back to your point about the Sand Street Car Park, within car parks themselves, is there any intention to extend the vehicle recognition system in Sand Street to others, or does the app make that redundant?

**Director of Transport, Transport and Technical Services:**

The Sand Street Car Park type of system seems quite clumsy and clunky by today's technology, and the technology has moved away from having to have fixed infrastructure. So the app does not require A.N.P.R. (Automatic Number Plate Recognition). In terms of payment, you can pay with the app, or assuming it is going to be an app; whatever wins the tender, to run alongside the car park, then you can choose to apply A.N.P.R. as a partial policing solution if you wish, but it is not an essential part of the mix, it depends where you get the benefit.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I know it is obviously going to be controversial in Jersey, but is there an option to use A.N.P.R. to have a vehicle emissions duty? Because obviously parking is one way, one carrot and stick, duty on fuel is another, but if you have got your own parking provided free at work, that was the big disincentive, I think, as maybe States Members appreciate, to stop you using the car.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is, and that is something that other towns and cities in the U.K. are looking at. I think in Nottingham they have brought in a parking charge for private spaces within the city centre to deal with that unfairness, whereby those that work for a corporation that has an office building with spaces underneath effectively get their parking for free. That is currently the situation in Jersey; parking spaces are not necessarily benefits in kind, depending on how they are worked, thereby the average citizen, who does not have access to private parking, has to pay. There is an unfairness there. So

some cities in the U.K. have looked at that and brought in a levy on those businesses that have spaces within their premises.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That would certainly be a prerequisite to putting up parking charges, would it not, because otherwise you would just be hitting people that are forced to use the public car parks?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It would be one of the things that we would have to consider, yes..

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think two-thirds of the spaces in St. Helier are not T.T.S., so it is a significant number.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

You mentioned that parking spaces are not necessarily a payment in kind, but presumably it is outside your brief, or maybe not as Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources, that the tax legislation could be amended to make sure that they are?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is something, I believe, we are reviewing to see what things do fall under a benefit in kind and what do not. That is one of the issues that deserves to be looked at.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

The size of that benefit in kind could be by reference to the CC of the engine, could it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It could be or it could be just the rentable value of that space.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Maybe with, these days.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I guess the point I was trying to make, and it might be difficult in the Jersey context, but could you have, like London, a congestion charge so that you pick them up ... you would have to define where it would be, but is that one option of getting round that? So rather than saying parking, so if you come to town you are presumably driving about or parking somewhere and you will be charged for coming to town, unless you have got dispensation.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Anything is possible. We are in politics; politics is the art of the possible, so that is a possibility in the future. I am not sure it is something that the Island would necessarily welcome, or indeed St. Helier would necessarily welcome. The Constable wants to attract people to the town to make it vibrant and commercially successful.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The contradictions of being in politics.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think perhaps we should move on. Our final area, which is only briefly stated in our questions because we were not quite sure how much information you could divulge, is to do with T.T.S. transformation. There has been, obviously, a lot of attention to this issue of outsourcing, and so on. Are you able to update us about the current position?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are a number of reviews coming towards the end of their piece of work. The officers have had discussions late last week and ongoing this week, with the groups of staff in those areas, but it is part of a process, so those reviews have not been completed yet. But we have been tasked to find substantial savings, and you cannot meet those savings targets without a reduction in the headcount of the department. I wish we could.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

In your previous paperwork we have had you have expressed confidence in maintaining the level of public services at the same time as reducing headcount. Is that still your view?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think that is certainly an achievable target.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What is the latest? I have had Parks and Gardens people just come to me unsolicited saying that they have just found out they are going to be made redundant. Is this something that is recent and is that set in stone now, or are there still negotiations going on around that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Last week we started the formal process and the M.T.F.P. (medium-term financial plan) was agreed I think on 4th October. The briefings then in terms of how that affects Transport and Technical Services is a £4.6 million saving out of a total budget £25.2 million, so it is nearly a 20 per cent

saving. The first stage of service reviews are in Parks and Gardens, Cleaning, Solid Waste, and we have to deliver it. Of those 4 areas, the areas where the most people are employed are in Parks and Gardens and Cleaning, and it is incumbent on myself to speak to the staff straightaway to say that: "This is the situation." In February, when the reviews have been completed, they will know if their jobs are at risk, but this is the start of the process. So no one has been told they are going to be made redundant; what I have said is there will be redundancies, but there were no specifics for any person. We believe there are some areas we will be retaining. We have very successfully managed and maintained vacancies and tried not to fill any posts over the last 2 years at T.T.S and also throughout the States. So we are hoping we will try and use best endeavours to find employment for people, not in those areas if those areas go, and we are also working with the Parish closely as well on some of the areas where we overlap. But, yes, the news is we cannot meet our budget with our existing staff headcount and we are looking at ways of reducing that. Hopefully people will go through voluntary processes rather than compulsory.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Thank you very much.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Do you have any further questions? Right, well, thank you very much for your time and the information you have supplied. We look forward to another hearing in due course, and thank you to our clerks and stenographer. Sorry, I cannot think of the proper name, for writing it all down, thank you, and to the media.

[16:38]