



Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny

Panel

Quarterly Hearing

Witness: The Minister for Infrastructure

Tuesday, 28th January 2020

Panel:

Connétable M.K. Jackson of St. Brelade (Chair)

Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence

Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville

Connétable S.A. Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour.

Witnesses:

Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour, The Minister for Infrastructure

Mr. T. Daniels, Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings

Mr. S. Skelton, Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population

Ms. E. Littlechild, Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment

Ms. E Richardson-Calladine, Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment

Mr. T Dodd, Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment

Mr. G. Forrest, Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment

Mr. J. Littlewood, Head of Finance Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment

[11:31]

Connétable M.K. Jackson of St. Brelade (Chair):

Good morning, Minister, and your team and welcome to the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel, this quarterly public hearing. We will start just by going around the table and introducing ourselves.

Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence:

Deputy Kirsten Morel, member of the panel.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Mike Jackson, chair of the panel.

Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville:

John Le Maistre, Constable of Grouville.

Connétable S.A. Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour:

Sadie Le Sueur-Rennard, Constable of St. Saviour, a member of the panel.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Tristen Dodd, Head of Transport, G.H.E. (Growth, Housing and Environment).

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Kevin Lewis, Minister for Infrastructure.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

Tim Daniels, Interim Director of Jersey Property Holdings.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

And at the back.

Ministerial support:

Allyson Holmes, Ministerial Support.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Gordon Forrest, Head of Driver and Legal Standards.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

Steve Skelton, Director of Strategy and Innovation.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Emma Richardson-Calladine, Recycling Manager.

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Ellen Littlechild, Group Director of Operations and Transport.

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

John Littlewood, Head of Finance and Business Partnering supporting G.H.E.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Thanks very much. We will start with Property Holdings and the foreshore encroachment compensation issue. At the quarterly hearing in September you told us that a review of the policy was taking place and would be ready at the end of the year, end of 2019. We understand it has now been delayed until April this year. Can you explain why that has been necessary?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We have had problems. Obviously, we are being assisted heavily by the Law Officers' Department and they have a shortage of officers there. But it is quite complex work, as I am sure you would understand. That is progressing quite well, and we are definitely aiming for April to be finished with that. Anything to add?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

No, I think that is ... there is a problem with resources. We have outsourced it to make sure that it is an objective view of the situation and we are told that the study will be complete in April.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Are you not concerned that this ongoing matter influences the ability of owners and properties that are bought at the foreshore, the ability to enjoy their properties, particularly if they want to sell them?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

From J.P.H.'s (Jersey Property Holdings) perspective, we are progressing it as quickly as we can. So, we acknowledge that there are potential problems and issues, but we do not believe we can move ahead with any more alacrity.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you have law officers within the department or is it the Government law officer who is dealing with this?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The Law Officers' Department are assisting with this, yes. There is somebody assisting from the Law Officers' Department, yes.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I see, so there is an individual assigned to that particular area?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Chairman, if I can, the Deputy of Grouville has lodged a proposition this morning. That is surely going to concentrate your minds and address this matter with a bit more urgency?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

That is, I understand, due for debate in March and obviously we aim to be complete by April so that does complicate matters, yes. I was under the impression that she was not going to put that in, but she has. So, we are where we are.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So, what will your approach be? You are going to have to speed things up a bit?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I am not sure we can go much faster than we are going. As I say, it is very complex.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

It is a complex conveyancing issue and it has been outsourced to an individual who has specific knowledge of the area and of the issues. There are not, I believe, too many other people who have that knowledge. So, we are putting as much pressure, if you like, as we can to get it resolved.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Do you not think it has been going on for so long that this is possibly why the Deputy has brought this forward? To bring it to the fore because somebody is dragging their feet somewhere along the way, are they not?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I do not believe they are, Constable.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

You do not?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I do not believe that anybody is dragging their feet. I believe that it is a resource issue and I do believe that it is being approached with an understanding of the issues, the impact that it has. It has not been treated lightly, I can assure you. And it is something that is approached with as much focus as we can apply.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

We just heard that it is a complex conveyancing issue. So, Minister, do you think that the department's approach back in 2015, when I appreciate you were not Minister, was acceptable, given that we are now hearing that it is a complex conveyancing issue?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Which particular matter?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The way the department went ahead on a piecemeal basis property by property rather than establishing the foreshore boundary in the first place and working for the ...

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It was quite new to us then. Obviously, the land was transferred from the Crown at that time. So, it was something relatively new. But this has not just happened with Property Holdings. This was happening under the Crown, that arrangements were being made such as this.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Would you not agree that it is down to this interpretation of the clause in the contract which transferred the foreshore from the Crown to the States of Jersey that: "Any right of access or exploitation exercised as a matter of longstanding and recognised custom by the general public of the Island or by any member thereof shall be and remain unaffected by this contract of gift cession and transfer." It seems really it boils - to me, perhaps to the panel - down to a loose interpretation that rather ... which has been to the detriment of the landowners on the foreshore; I presume the law officer allocated to the case is looking hard into that.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Absolutely, yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Did you say that when the land was under the control of the Crown similar arrangements were being made?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I believe that was the case.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

Absolutely. If I could just go back to the belief that this is a piecemeal approach, the 2 cases that I believe we are thinking of, occurred because the individuals wanted to sell the property and the people who were intending to buy the properties were not happy with the transfer of the title and so in order to facilitate the sale the public were, at the behest of the transactors, invited to help resolve the scenario. So, it was not an attempt by J.P.H. to start picking away. It was an opportunity for the public to assist in a transaction. So, we did not start the process. We were invited to support and to facilitate it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

When you said that the Crown was coming to similar arrangements, were similar sums of money being demanded by the Crown?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I believe in 2013, but I do not have the exact cases but there was a case transacted for the sum of, I believe, £70,000 about an issue to do with foreshore access. So, I believe that considerable sums were ... and in fact, again it may be worth recognising that one of the individuals in the 2 cases we are discussing, is a surveyor and acted on behalf of Jersey Property Holdings in a similar transaction previously. So, none of this is new.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

You indicated to us in September that you were establishing a boundary between the foreshore and the properties on a case-by-case basis. I think the message came across that every case was different. Have they been established now?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

They are in the process of being established. They have not yet been completely undertaken. Effectively this is trying to determine where the mean high-water springs were prior to the sea wall being constructed, which generally was built in front of the high-water mark. If you identify the location of one side of the property, then you have got a starting point. So, it is a question effectively of following the evidence along the coast.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Have any agreements been reached with any property owners? Obviously, properties do get sold fairly regularly.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

If the rights are uncontested then there is no reason for us to get involved. I believe that there have been some transactions, but I do not know the specifics.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Can you confirm what you said just before that it was the conveyancers that approached Property Holdings about confirming where the boundaries were rather than your department being proactive?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So, it was not initiated by Property Holdings?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

No.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

So really if it can be established that there has been an encroachment, once the boundary has been agreed will the approach to the property owner be changed? I mean, if so, what will your future policy be once the law officers have settled things? Have you any idea what the future policy will be with regard to this?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I do not at the moment because it depends what encroachments may have occurred. If there is a line that is determined by the study to show that a piece of your garden is in fact in public property but there is no encroachment, there is no development, you have not, as a landowner, profited from that encroachment, then we have no claim on any value. In those circumstances, it is likely to be that there will be no action to take. But if the value of the land has been increased to the benefit of the landowner by an encroachment on public territory on the public holdings then it seems right and indeed we are directed to recover the full value ... a commercial value for the public on behalf of the public.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Directed by whom?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I believe that there was a proposition, I think maybe in 2006, before my time, but I believe that there is a proposition that directs that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Of course, Mr. Daniels, one reason why you would not know what the policy would be is because the Minister is meant to set the policy rather than the officer. So, Minister, do you have any idea what the policy may be?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Once the report is concluded, then we can study the findings in full and obviously we would discuss it with senior officers and take it from there.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

In September, we discussed whether it should be a pre-requisite of a planning application that the applicant provide proof that he owns a property. Has this proposal been taken forward with the Minister for the Environment?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I have discussed that with the Minister for the Environment but no proposal as yet. But I would like to complete everything before we take that forward. I believe on planning applications, I may stand corrected, but you have to sign to say that you have the landowner's permission before you submit a planning application. So, it is a grey area that needs firming up, I suppose, to a declaration that you do own the actual land.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

So that would be concluded with the work that the law officers are presently undertaking?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes, I have asked for that to be put in.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Could I just ask: with regard to the 2006, it was a Ministerial Decision on 9th November 2006 on the statement on land valuation. It said it was to extract the optimum benefit from the public's property assets. "Optimum benefit" can be defined in different ways, not necessarily the highest commercial value. Would you agree with that idea?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Optimum benefit is not necessarily commercial value.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I agree.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes, no argument with that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So, when you are referring back to the 2006 decision, we are talking actual benefit, we are not talking about commercial value?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

No, indeed. I think in the case of the consideration that was exchanged for the 2 cases at hand, that was not the full commercial valuation, there was a discount, given the context of the situation.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Given that you were criticised by the Jersey Complaints Board regarding the handling of the claims, how would you respond?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

My predecessor, not myself, which will be fair to ...

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

The department, should I say?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The department, okay. You would like me to comment on that?

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Yes.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I am not sure I see we are in possession of the full facts. These are extremely complex issues that ...

[11:45]

We have somebody very, very experienced in conveyancing going back centuries. It is very, very complex.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are you saying the Complaints Board did not understand?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

There could have been some confusion, but I think some of the Complaints Board's comments alluded to the way it was done, not necessarily what was done.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Can I hypothetically ask, Minister: if you were to have handled the situation, would you have handled it differently?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Very hypothetical question. I was not there at the time, I must admit, but there is a basic principle that you should not build on land that is not yours. We have to protect the public. I mean this protection works both ways. The public have the right to enjoy the foreshore by walking along it. Had the foreshore not have been built on over the last few centuries then we could have had a walkway going around that part of the Island. In fact, part of the cycle track could have run that way. But we are where we are. There have been encroachments for whatever reason over the decades, possibly centuries with some of them. But this is what we are trying to firm up now exactly where we are.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

In all reality, lawyers who are acting for property owners after April will be in a position, I would imagine the report will be produced in April ...

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

... will be in a position to offer their clients ...

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Greater clarity, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just go back to that optimum benefit idea from the 2006 decision? If we concentrate on the 2 properties that I think have been highlighted most, what was the total sum of money that the land was transacted for in the end?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The total value of the property or the fee that was paid?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The total money that the Government received from them.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I think one was £30,000. I am not sure about the other.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I do not know the exact figures but I think it was less than 3 per cent of the property values and I will get the numbers for you.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The question I want to ask basically is: let us say it is £100,000 in total.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I believe it was less.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It was less, fair enough. Given that this is now, as a result of those transactions, complaints were filed. We have had officers having to work on those complaints. We have had the complaints board constituted and obviously you are still working on establishing a foreshore, would you think it is fair to say that more than £100,000 has been spent dealing with those 2 transactions since they were made?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

From our side?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, the Government side. Including the cost of complaints.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I would imagine so.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Exactly, so would you say that optimum benefit was therefore ... did you meet the optimum benefit threshold as a result of those transactions?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I would not like to comment on that. I do not have that information.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, just from your knowledge, do you think we did meet the optimum benefit threshold?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

There is a principle that we need to uphold but from the actual benefit I am not sure of the money situation.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I do personally believe that it is a very fundamental principle in terms of encroachment and public land. I think we have to be very careful when establishing that precedent. I do think in this scenario, having a clear understanding of what we are talking about and how we are managing it will enable us to make sure that when we go forward we do not ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Absolutely, but in terms of those 2 transactions I think it is fair to suggest that we are probably in a situation where the Government has paid more than they have received in dealing with those 2 issues.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I would not like to hazard a guess at the moment. But, as we say, there is a principle to uphold that we would ... nobody was gone after for these fees, that the people offering to transaction came to us for a clarification or my predecessor.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is correct.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

And the department.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But in the process afterwards you did not extract optimum benefit because you were in negative territory.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

That is a possibility. I would not like to hazard a guess at the moment how much it has cost.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

There has been a suggestion that some of the properties are pressured sales, shall we say, and that the department took advantage of that situation. What would your comment be to that?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I was not there at the time but, as I say, my understanding was they wanted to complete and that was the fee that was arranged.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Can I ask how many properties ... we mentioned 2 but I think it is more than 2 since Property Holdings have taken over. How many properties do you think it might affect long term?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

As a whole, that is what the report will come up with.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I cannot give an exact number, Constable, but it is effectively any property that abuts the foreshore. So, hundreds.

The Connétable of Grouville:

To date, since Property Holdings have been, we have 2 or 3?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

There are only 2 where there have been contentious issues. As I say, if the purchaser is happy with the prospect of the rights then they have no reason to come to Property Holdings to authorise any transaction. The rights of holding the access, if that is not in question, then we have no input. So it may well be that there have been transactions that we are not aware of.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I think it was mentioned earlier on, there is a difference between somebody encompassing this land within their garden and building on this particular bit of land.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

To move on, if I may, Minister, to perhaps a better story. Family parking in public car parks, there were complaints recently by members of the public indicating that the family friendly parking areas were inadequate. What have you done about that?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We have just increased it; put another 8 spaces. So, we now have 14 in Sand Street Car Park, which is a huge leap. We do have provision there. There was alleged abuse of the parking, somebody parking without a child. We do have C.C.T.V. (closed circuit television) for the area. It is on level 4 because it abuts the parent/child parking and also the disabled parking because it has got access to the lift service there. As I say, it is covered by CCTV. At peak hours there is a parking control officer on duty there to assist in the flow of traffic coming out and into the car park because there could be a bottleneck on the fourth floor. So, there is always somebody there. If somebody parked there but is not a parent/child scenario then they will be asked to park elsewhere. If they refuse to or were a repeat offender, the parking control officer is authorised to ask them to leave the car park.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you consider there are enough spaces now that you have increased the number?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is 14 now. There is a good turnover. Obviously at peak times it is quite busy but if you go down now you will probably see 2 or 3 spaces vacant for the parent/child parking. Which also, I might add, would apply to grandparents, if grandparents have a grandchild with them. We are not that specific.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I am sure many people would appreciate that.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

If I could just stay on that. The one at Minden Place, that is abused. I have seen it myself quite a lot. Is there C.C.T.V. for that as well?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

There is C.C.T.V. there, yes.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Because that is abused.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

When people are caught abusing they are tackled.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

They are?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes. C.C.T.V. is sometimes monitored directly but all our multi-storey car parks have closed circuit T.V. in now.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Talking parking controls and restrictions, slightly deviating from that.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Sorry, can I just add that sadly people will abuse. Sometimes we see people parking in a disabled space in the street, which is illegal, and if people are caught they can be fined heavily for that. But they still do it. Whatever we do, somebody will abuse it. But we do our best to control that.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

In that regard, there are yellow lines painted on lots of roads throughout the Island and there are continual changes on that but there seem to be glitches once again within your department with regard to these changes. Some proposed changes are taking years to put through the system. Is there any reason why this is occurring?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The department, as you know, is a shadow of its former self but we have got an excellent team. There could possibly be backlogs in the Law Officers' Department. If you want to switch over to ...?

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Well whoever might know about it but at the moment it is taking some 2 years to get yellow line variations; we have got 3 Constables here which have a problem.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I recognise it is a sensitive subject. There are various constraints and resources within the department and also within Law Officers, so what we try to do to make the process as efficient as possible is we tend to batch each Parish's changes to the traffic orders, so each Parish gets a change each year. So if St. Brelade's order change, for instance, of schedules for the end of the year and you come at the beginning of the year we will not put them through individually in advance of that and the reason for that is because the law officers cannot be spending time changing each individual traffic order every time there is a small amendment, so they are batched up for efficiency. However, we do recognise that this could be managed better so we have got a project on which is to review all of our highway laws and see how we can do things better. One of the things that we might be able to do in the future, but it would require changes to the law, is to perhaps have a G.I.S. (geographic information system) based system whereby it is not a law change. A law change refers to a map and the map is updated and that could be updated by officers rather than having to go through the law drafting process, which involves a description of the locations. So, we are looking at all that. But obviously law changes take a significant period of time and we are looking at the whole set of laws that govern how we use our highways and it will be incorporated in those changes that we are bringing forward.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you have a timeline on that?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Only that it is a medium-term plan. To do the type of review we are talking at realistically will probably take 5 years to bring legislation forward.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Given that some of the lines are 2 years overdue already it just seems unreasonable and I just wonder how this might be expedited within the present structure you have.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think where there is an urgent need in terms of road safety, for instance, if there are collisions happening and that type of event or people being pushed off the kerb with prams and the like, then of course we will make every effort to expedite them. But I think the system we have got is a system we have inherited, and we are stuck with, for the moment, until we can reformulate the law and do things in a different way and change how the powers are allocated.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

So, the yellow lines that we have applied for at this moment in time, they are shelved at this moment in time? Or you are dealing with them or we are going to wait for the new 5-year plan to come through?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, so all the requests we get from Parishes at the moment for yellow lines, we go out, we survey them, we write up the description, we compile law drafting instructions and then we batch them through for each Parish a number of times a year. I cannot tell you whether it is once a year or twice a year each Parish gets served. I cannot recall, I am afraid.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Which year, the same year as we apply or the next one?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, typically the same year the application is made.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

This is not happening.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

It is not happening.

The Connétable of Grouville:

It is interesting, we discussed this earlier with the 3 Constable and all 3 of us came to the same conclusion that the system is not working. We have understood that you wanted to do one Parish once a year and we have tried to fit into that system but it is taking years to get the department to come out and sort things out. Parking, we all agree, is getting increasingly difficult. It is a problem we probably get more complaints at the Parish Hall about. We have got some solutions within our Parish. We have agreed them within the Parish municipality.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Roads Committee.

The Connétable of Grouville:

We just need, and I appreciate the law officers have to be on board as well, but we need to get things moving and it is just taking much too long. It was eventually done but we had a line put where there was a danger, and it took a long time to get it sorted.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Perhaps some improved communications as to what is going on might help.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

All I am saying is operationally we can get back to you with the programme so that you have got some information out when your changes are likely to come through. Where there are specific items that have not gone through, I suspect that there is an issue with that particular item but I would need to check and come back as to why that was not being taken forward.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Quite a few backlogs at recent times. We were requested by the Constable of St. Helier to reduce the speeds within the ring road to 20 miles an hour and you can imagine how many roads are within the ring road that was ...

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Indeed. I am going to move to plastics and maybe something for Emma. We would like just any information on the amount of plastics being recycled at the moment. Has it gone up in recent times?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, good morning. We have just been finalising the 2019 waste statistics.

[12:00]

There has been, specifically its plastic bottles, which I know we have talked about in the past, is that has increased. So there has been an increase in just over 6 tonnes of plastic bottles that were received last year as compared with 2018.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So that is 6 times more than ...

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Six times more year on year. And thinking with the general statistic there is about 20,000 plastic bottles to a tonne. That is 120,000 more plastic bottles that were collected for recycling year on year.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you think there is more we can do in the public realm with regard to picking up plastic or dividing plastic out from the waste? In that we do not seem to be terribly good at public recycling bins all

over the Island. We see a few in King Street now, a few here and there, but it is not very consistent. Do you feel there is more we should do?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I absolutely feel there is more we could do but I think with other items on the agenda there has been the issue of resources raised. To the risk of sounding like a broken record, again with the panel, I think we are focusing at the moment on getting the basics right and so part of this basics is working with all of the Parishes to deliver these home recycling collections so that that brings it to the doorstep. It makes it the norm in everyday home life. In parallel with that, we are working with a lot of businesses. Very positively though, with businesses, although we are working with them to develop recycling collections for their staff, quite often we are talking more about reducing their consumption of the single use items so that they are not there to collect from recycling in the first place. So an example may be to remove a vending machine and provide drinking water, for those companies to be providing glass carafes for meeting rooms, like we have here, or there are water bottles. Those types of things. So that we are eliminating that waste in the first place, which is brilliant to see that effort being made there. I think once we have got the basic recycling access to facilities in everybody's daily life then the next stage will certainly need to be plugging in those gaps, so the gaps between home and work. So looking at exactly what you have said, the on-the-go, as I refer to it, recycling in the High Street. A few years ago we did a trial of some recycling bins on some popular beaches within the summer to see how that would perform. I would love us to be in a position to be able to revisit that. But I think it is all about the planned approach because of resources and focused effort. So that is the plan that certainly we are working with at the moment.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I think in terms of percentages, when we did our review I think it was 2 per cent of plastic bottles were recycled.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Six.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Was it 6? Pretty low, and I just wonder in terms of the things you were just quoting what that percentage goes up to.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, that jumps ... well, I say "jumps up" but it jumps up to 8 per cent, or just over 8 per cent in 2019, but I have to say a big "but" here. Because that calculation is based on previous waste composition analysis of the amount of plastic bottles that were being thrown away. Now in the past, certainly a

couple of years, there has been considerable focus on plastics - the plastic-free Jersey initiative being one of them - on focusing people's attention on reducing that waste. So, it mentioned about having personal water bottles, not using single use plastic bottles. So, if the amount of plastic bottles being used has declined that figure of 8 per cent will be more. So, it is a minimum of 8 per cent, and that is something we will need to look at in the future of composition so that we have got a more accurate gauge.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

As a rough calculation from your 120,000 more plastic bottles for that 2 per cent jump, that would bring it to about somewhere between 5 million and 6 million plastic bottles every year being used in Jersey; does that sound about right?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It does sort of startlingly. I have done this calculation before of working out what that would mean per head per year sort of per week and narrowing it down. It sounds a ridiculously high figure. But without looking at the maths ... I think it is probably right, thereabouts.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you keep a separate record of the plastic bottles that come from bring banks?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, we do.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Have you any idea what percentage is collected through that process?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, I do not. What I do know is that the plastic bottles that the department receives, so this would be the household recycling centre, the bring banks, and also the Parish recycling schemes that come through our supply chain, there was a 10 per cent increase on the amount of plastic bottles that we exported.

The Connétable of Grouville:

From those ...?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Not just from bring banks, so from all of those 3 elements combined. We do have the tonnage of all of the materials that we collect through the bring banks but unfortunately, I do not have ...

The Connétable of Grouville:

The 8 per cent figure includes plastic that is not collected kerbside and I know you put a lot of work into it yourself and your department into encouraging people to recycle their bottles but that figure is still miles too low, even allowing for the fact that there is probably less plastic bottles coming into the Island.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Even if we made a guess that it is about 10 per cent, yes, absolutely. It is still shockingly low. So a lot of work would need to be done.

The Connétable of Grouville:

We, as a Parish, are looking at kerbside collection when our contract runs out. It is not for a little while but we are trying to encourage people to use the bring banks and it is quite useful to have that information because if that is going up then people are going out of their way to recycle, which has got to be good news.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, absolutely. I can share those figures with you after this meeting, once I have gathered them. Not a problem at all. I think definitely with the bring banks the people that are using those are taking a lot of trouble to be able to recycle because they are storing the things at home, popping them in the car and taking the time and trouble to go to those mini recycling centres. So it is great news to hear that your Parish is looking at the possibility of a household collection, as we always say that brings it to the doorstep, it makes it a lot easier. There will be people that cannot access the bring banks, they do not have private transport, whatever reasons, and by having the household collections obviously that eliminates all of those barriers.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just ask, moving away from plastic recycling to aluminium recycling? Do you know how much aluminium we recycle at the moment?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I do. I have not brought those figures with me thinking we were focusing on plastics. I am very happy to share them with you.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Absolutely. I beginning to think we need to widen out from just plastics.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That would be very welcome. The percentages of materials that we are receiving when we are thinking about the 8 per cent of plastic bottles, when we are looking at the metal packaging, so the household cans, foil packaging, those types of things that we collect the figures, the percentages are very similar. It is very disappointing. There has been a huge focus on plastic, which has made significant changes but certainly for the department the metal and metal packaging is going to be a focus for us. Obviously, we do not want the metal going through our energy recovery facility and it is always a huge topic that we talk about in our education programme as metals can be recycled for ever without losing any of their properties.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I was going to say, given the efficiency of metal recycling and the mining and refining processes involved in creating them, would you think that maybe it should be a higher priority for the Island and the department?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The other thing I was going to say is: do you ever look at the environmental impact of a piece of waste in terms of an aluminium can, have you ever kind of looked at the processes involved in order to prioritise which waste you should be kind of focusing on in your recycling within Island?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, absolutely, we have looked at environmental impact from start of manufacture right through and there is lots of data available for us to do that. Metal will always be a priority because it is not an acceptable material to be putting through our energy recovery plant, and also the environmental benefit that it can be reused again.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But equally a personal bugbear of mine is having a can of drink out in the street and having nowhere to recycle it because we do not have, as the Constable said, these bins which allow you to do that. So when I am outside the States building it just goes in a bin. In the States building we have recycling facilities. Do you see us moving to that point?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, definitely.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Because we are wasting a lot of material at the moment.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, and I think it is exactly the same, coming to almost the first question about making recycling easy, and that has always been our key message, that to engage more people has to be easy. But we do need to deliver it in a structured approach so that we can allocate those resources and make progress. But definitely, I do agree with you.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Given it is detrimental to the incinerator, the Energy from Waste plant, has the department ever looked at the costs of the aluminium and the metal going through the Energy from Waste plant versus the cost of more actively recycling that? Because it may find that it is cheaper for the department to be recycling it as opposed to ... because at the moment it all goes to the Energy from Waste plant and you are saying that is not a good thing.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, obviously if it is proactively separated then it will not go through the energy recovery plant. A cost analysis, quite possibly. I do not think that has been recently done but quite possibly that exercise has been collated.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Developing on those 2 elements really is glass. Obviously, that is an issue in the plant. Once again, separation on the street would not hurt. Where is glass going these days? Is it still landfill?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Glass is still delivered to our aggregate recycling centre at La Collette. So, there it is stockpiled and crushed for still our use within the construction of the reclamation site. So, going forward we will not need glass for that purpose so we are already ... we have a project team looking at the future application of Jersey's waste glass. We would still like to be seeing it used as a local re-use application, so within the building industry, that makes lot of sense for lots of different reasons. So there are currently our engineering colleagues looking at different opportunities. Then at some point that will come out for commercial involvement.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is whether that can be used as an aggregate in roadbuilding, et cetera. It would be an excellent project, as you have just touched on. We certainly do not want glass going through the energy recovery unit, it causes a tremendous amount of damage if it is allowed to be on it.

The Connétable of Grouville:

When we visited the site you were concerned about the contaminants within the glass and I know you had a similar programme trying to encourage particularly the Parishes; has it improved?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, definitely. Yes, very good news so working that project, so the just glass project, was focused on engaging the whole supply chain, including the households of the people that collect from commercial establishments, yourselves and your officers within the Parishes to help answer questions, writing to the people that work on our site. So absolutely contamination has reduced. We will never, I do not think, get to it perfectly clean but we have definitely made an improvement and potentially looking at maybe revisiting that campaign later this year as well and maintaining that momentum within the public eye.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What I was going to say, you need to reinforce that message from time to time because people get into bad habits again.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

So if you could take the tops off your wine bottles and rinse your mayonnaise jars thoroughly, thank you.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

One of the things that we will, which is why the impetus for revisiting it this year, is we have been working on a current waste acceptance criteria for our site in regard to glass so what that means is more for potentially Parish staff and also commercial entities collecting glass from hospitality outlets, is we can say, black and white, what we define as clean and dirty. Then we can move forward in communicating that.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

A big piece of work you have been dealing with, the sustainable transport policy, which is lodged for debate next month. What initiatives do you plan to introduce that will address the frequency of buses and accessibility in bus routes?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We have got 2 very quick wins that we are looking at, at the moment, which I am very pleased with. There are 2 small bus lanes going to be introduced as soon as possible. During frequent travelling time, at rush hour, there is obviously a bit of a bottle neck on the dual carriageway. What we are

putting forward is 2 separate routes. So as the bus, who is going east, exits the bus station normally they would have to come out, turn left up to the junction, take another left up to the roundabout, left again, down the slip road and merging with traffic to go through the tunnel. What the team are working on is a small slip road, which comes out in front of the Pomme d'Or Hotel and a small break in the road opposite so it can join traffic just before the tunnel, which during ... it would be a bus lane only and during peak hours could cut up to 9 to 10 minutes off travel time.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Of course that would not have been possible if you had joined the 2 squares together.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

I was going to say.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It would not, no. But that did not happen we can take advantage of it. Likewise, going west, the bus has to come out the bus station going west and up again to the junction, take a left up to the roundabout, go right around the roundabout above the dual carriageway, take a right, merging with traffic coming down the other side.

[12:15]

Again, during peak hours that can be problematic. With the new scheme the team have come up with, you would be able to travel right to the end, come out of the bus station, drive right along to the end of the Esplanade and one set of traffic lights will be moved and there will be a signal from the bus itself, which could trip the lights, so it is the bus in the vicinity, a small bus aerial, cut across and come out towards La Frégate Café area, again cutting about 8 minutes of time. If you add those 10 minutes and 8 minutes up throughout the day there are some more efficiencies brought in. As I say, the team have come up with this and I am delighted to put that forward.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

So there will be some work on the Gloucester Street traffic lights in terms of signals, I would imagine.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

So that is to use the existing, what they call the intergreen allocation, which is where the green man comes up to allow people to cross and you would use that period to allow the buses to pull out and

give them priority. So it would effectively create a hurry call to get the buses to the head of the queue.

The Connétable of Grouville:

That seems quite good for people leaving St. Helier but there are no proposals for people coming in to St. Helier is there?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Coming back in that way?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, so in terms of coming in, because the buses can turn off left at the moment and go to Liberation Station, the advantage it provides is for cross-town travel so the school buses, it allows the school buses to pull off and then rather than queue up to go through the tunnel but to jump that queue and get to the head of the tunnel so hopefully that will make the school bus offering more attractive, particularly when you consider that in conjunction with a shuttlebus service of the school what we can potentially use as some of the existing school buses to stop at this station to collect students whose parents have driven them into town, say, or who live in town, to hop on the bus there and that would give them their shuttlebus up to school. We are still working on the detail of that so do not hold me to any specifics. That is part of the concept.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

That would assist the congestion in St. Saviour by the schools?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We would hope so because it would discourage people driving across town and then back through the tunnel, so that is 2 trips through the tunnel which would not need to be made if those students can travel on the bus. That is also in conjunction with ideas such as a walking bus to encourage students or teach students how to walk through town when they are younger to get up to their school, that type of thing. So, they are all small measures. You might consider them marginal if you are the Constable of St. Saviour but they will hopefully start to add up and hopefully reduce some of the traffic problems around St. Saviour in the fullness of time. We cannot promise that immediately.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

In terms of school buses, maybe things have changed in the past few years, but there did not seem to be any arrangement whereby school bus journeys were booked. It seemed to be a fairly ad hoc affair. I just wonder how much work you do with the schools with regard to the provisions of the

school bus service and which students might require a place. Is there any correlation between the 2 rather than just turning up?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is interesting that you say that because, as Tristen just alluded to with the frequency, I think because of the parents coming into town to work maybe dropping their children off at school at Mont Millais, going down Bagatelle Road and down Wellington Road, it does cause a lot of congestion but we take home, I think 500 more school children than we take to school. There are 500 journeys in the morning that are completely unnecessary. Obviously, there is a time lapse that the parents start work possibly in town and the children starting school but in the afternoon obviously schools finish at 3.15, parents finish much later. So, there is that disconnect there. That is something we can really sort of work on to try and iron that out. But you could see there is at least 500 journeys in the morning going up Mont Millais and around Bagatelle that are completely unnecessary.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you work closely with the Education Department in the provisions of service?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, we have a good sense from running the school service for such a long time as to where the peaks and demand are going to be and it is always difficult to design a service around peaks. So, after a couple of weeks when the first term starts then new students are trying the school bus for the first time and then it gradually drops off, particularly as you go into exam time. But we do work with Education and do travel surveys and the like periodically. We do not do those every year, they are not required every year. We look at also the catchment areas as they change and how we can best serve them. So, there is ongoing work ... has been historically ongoing work with that. Going forward in the future, then that has got to be a big part about how we redesign the bus services and how we can best serve those students. So that is part of the first commitment in the strong delivery plan. So, in the sustainable transport plan on the page is the optimum distribution design and frequency of routes. That includes the school bus network.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

This plan looks fabulous and as someone who has got most of the schools and the traffic coming through most mornings, this is fabulous for St. Helier but you have got the people in the rural areas who are coming through to St. Saviour because that is where their schools are, I cannot see where this system that you have got is going to alleviate the traffic problems that I have in the Parish.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The one we can speed up, the buses, because one of the major complaints we get from the students using the buses: “Oh, it takes me over an hour to get to school” because obviously there is pick-ups on the way. The more we can speed up the bus service by these routes through town and give priority to buses in certain areas, then it will dissuade people from driving their children, which will have a knock-on effect. But this is just one small cog in the wheel.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

I cannot see it because you have got people coming from St. John, Trinity, because they have to come across to the Island to come into my Parish because I have got the schools. So unless you are having school buses picking up children in the areas to come in, and they are still going to be held up in traffic because you have got the mums and the dads wanting to come in to work. As I say, St. Helier is going to be fantastic. These lanes will help but you are only going to put a bottleneck somewhere else. I do not want to rain on your parade but you are just going to put them someone else. But I need help to stop people coming through my Parish and that is only going to help if you have a designated bus service to pick up school children. Even if you have that you are still going to be caught up in traffic because the mums and dads have got to get to work. Some mums and dads will say to the kids: “Get in the car, we are spending family time to get in.”

The Minister for Infrastructure:

That is part of it, yes.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

As I say, I do not want to rain on your parade but a policy ...

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The main point I would make throughout this conversation is just to draw the distinction between the 2 things. We know the scheme set out in the 2020 plan will help but they are not the entire answer. That is just one year’s worth of kind of delivery. That is a step in the right direction but by no means will it get us to where we want to be. The work that we outline in the policy agreement needs to set out a much longer-term plan, which addresses a wider range of issues, work with schools to understand how they plan transport, build the infrastructure that people want to be able to cycle safely or walk safely or access schools in other ways. So, these will make a start. They will not get to where we had hoped to be, but we hope to have a longer-term set of delivery plans and, crucially dependent on a number of Assembly discussions this year, we potentially have additional funding through the Climate Emergency Fund to effect some of these changes in a way we have not been able to previously. It is a start, but it is not the entire the solution.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Bad weather affects cycling and walking, probably throws them towards public transport. Do you think there is capacity within public transport to deal with that? I mean it is a chicken and egg, is it not? If you get more people on public transport then it makes it safer for cycling and walking. But bad weather does have an effect. Have you noticed in your statistics the effect that bad weather might have on usage of the roads?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

When we got things like the “Beast from the East”, the winter cycling numbers were basically wiped out for a month, so, yes, cycling and walking is that. I think that the main opportunity to get people to change from private motoring is, for the majority of people, public transport for those longer journeys. So, part of the strategy will undoubtedly be using existing resources we have got more efficiently but also increasing the frequency and increasing capacity.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I have heard recently of bicycle accidents on Victoria Avenue. Do you monitor this in any way and does that influence any policy in how cycle lanes might be laid out?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

On the avenue itself?

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

On the cycle lanes of the avenue.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The cycle lanes of the avenue at the moment is a little bit of an anomaly, so where there is a road traffic accident with an injury the police are always called when there is a vehicle involved and so it appears on the road traffic accident database. For information on the cycle path we have to enquire specifically for that to try and collect that. So, we will speak to people like the health service to see what their injuries are. But there is not a codified way of collecting that information as there is on the actual road network at present.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you think bikes ought to be registered, as they were in the past?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think that would be counterproductive. I think that cycling is a relatively safe way to travel and that anything you do to impede its accessibility, especially to young people, then that should be resisted. I think there are studies out there that support that.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Do you not think it would be a good idea to try and educate cyclists because at this moment in time they have free range? They can go up, down, round anyway they like. They do not have to conform. They do not have to wait on crossings. They do not have to do traffic lights. They are a law unto themselves.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

They do.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

No, sorry.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is an enforcement matter.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

They are supposed to but because they are going to save the planet, cyclists, they are given carte blanche for whatever they want. I am not the only one. You see them riding up and down in the main street here. I have them in the Parish. For someone who is trying to save the planet and thinks it is a wonderful way, they cannot be seen of a night because they do not have lights, most of them, and they do not have reflective gear on them. They do not wear crash helmets because they can do whatever they like. I just feel that may be the wrong thing but it has been a policy that has been given to them, you can do what you like.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It has not been given to them. I mean apart from not wearing a crash helmet, which they are not legally obliged to do unless they are a child, everything you stated there is against the law. You must have a clear light, white light, on the front of your bike, a red light on the back of your bike in the dark or you are breaking the law. You may not cycle along the pavement unless you are specifically indicated you can do so. Obviously going up Beaumont Hill where it says you can and that is for safety reasons. You are not allowed to cycle on the pavement unless it is a shared area specifically designated. So, it is one of enforcement.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you have an education strategy for cyclists at school level?

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

No, they do not.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

If I could add to that. So, Jersey Sport is running an initiative called Move More Jersey and part of that is bikeability, giving students training. But it is also reaching out to other groups to try and give them the skills to go to cycle. As a department, we have been working since we visited Delft with the Dutch Cycling Embassy. The type of things you describe are not at all unique and Holland has been through that and they have been on a 30-year journey. They are not at the end of it in terms of developing the cycling infrastructure. The biggest difference that you see when you go to somewhere, which is more mature like Holland, is there is not a term called "cyclists". There are people who cycle so you, I and everyone else, and through the development of that culture becomes a greater understanding of the needs of both the pedestrians and the other users of the road. So, there are concepts such as the bicycle is a guest so you have an area where bicycles can travel through but it is signed as a bicycle is the guest so that they give way to pedestrians. Equally on the equivalent of our estate roads and the equivalent of probably our green lanes there is signage, which is the car is the guest and the car is supposed to give way to cyclists, walkers, or people with horses and the like. So, what we want to do is to work more closely with the Dutch Cycling Embassy to see how that learning can be applied to Jersey. But the reality is, as you get more people cycling and more people walking, there becomes a herd protection in terms of motorists expect them and you tend to have less accidents. Also, the community also benefits from having better health outcomes. So, the overall benefit to community increases and if you look at Holland, Holland is the only place where the body mass index is dropping in Europe. So, people in Holland are getting slimmer while the rest of Europe are getting more obese.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

They have not got hills.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

There are sections of Jersey that are very suitable to cycling where there is not a great change in elevation, particularly around St. Helier for shorter journeys.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Yes, but you get cyclists who come down this side of you, down that side of you, they cross in front of you. I really think that they need to be educated. That they are not the only ones on the road. There are rules on the road.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, absolutely.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

For their own sake, as well as everybody's else's and for their own sake, it would be wonderful if they took them into account.

[12:30]

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Continuing on that, if you look in the Road Traffic Law there are very severe penalties for cycling without due care and attention.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Yes, but cyclists do not have to do a test. They do not have to register their vehicle. They do not have to have it insured.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

A car owner has to do all those facilities and we cannot go up and down a one way where the cyclists can do whatever they want. It does worry me that we are making the culture that we are fabulous and you are on the bike so you have it carte blanche, you can do whatever you like. That does worry me as far as cyclists are concerned because I do not want them to get injured. I do not want to be responsible for injuring somebody.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think the difference between cyclists and car drivers is car drivers are protected from the environment by quite a sophisticated piece of metal. The cyclists have skin in the deal. So, if a cyclist has a collision they are going to hurt themselves. So, there is a motivation there to behave sensibly. However, I accept that not all people behave safely and sensibly all the time. I listened to a really interesting view of a policeman from the U.K. (United Kingdom) and what he basically said is that people who cycle stupidly are the same people who drive stupidly. They are just stupid all the time and you got a portion of the population that just behaves badly. I think that is probably a truism.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I do not think we can disagree with that.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

A point just to add as well regarding the highway code. Most of the highway code is enshrined in law. If you are a cyclist and you are approaching a red traffic light, by law you must stop. Now we have all seen cyclists cycle through a red light but heaven forbid anything nasty happened, that would be brought up in court that they rode through a red light.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Penalties are in the order of thousands of pounds. If they are caught there is a very heavy penalty.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Bicycles are not covered by a speed limit though, are they?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, because they do not have the means of measuring the speed.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

They do not have a speedometer.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Again, the vast majority of cyclists do not exceed the speed limit. But some do, some train so they can specifically do it.

The Connétable of Grouville:

They would in a 15 mile an hour.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think the majority of cyclists probably can get up to 15 miles an hour but there are people who can go faster, you are right, yes.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

When we were young, you and I, all of us, had an old Raleigh bike that was steel and if you got up to 15 miles an hour with the wind behind you, you were doing very well, but nowadays with modern carbon fibre bikes that you can lift with your little finger ... I remember dropping my daughter home one day, coming down Beaumont Hill a chap ... I stopped at the roundabout, a chap came in front of me, was wearing shorts, T-shirt and flip-flops on one of these carbon fibre bikes, turned, went down the hill. I looked at my speedo, I am doing 30 miles an hour and this chap is gone. He was well ahead of me.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

That is my case.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We have been criticised in the past when there have been accidents on Beaumont Hill that we should make it safer, which we have done with anti-skid and slow signs but you are doing another point to worry about. If you are doing 50 miles an hour going down a very steep hill that little bit of polystyrene helmet is not going to help much if you fall off or, heaven forbid, you hit somebody.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

It reinforces the need for an education programme.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Just a very final piece, sorry. G.H.E. in terms of the road safety part of it, who looks after the road safety infrastructure, D.V.S. (Driver and Vehicle Standards) who look after the vehicles and the police meet on a periodic basis to discuss issues and look at how they can best be addressed, whether it is by infrastructure, enforcement or by education.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I just ask: going back to the bad weather and buses? You mentioned you wished to increase people seeing accessibility of buses and bus routes. I believe in the sustainable transport plan there is also ... in fact there is a Ministerial Decision for making more bus shelters available. I was just thinking between ... is that part of your plan to make bad weather more acceptable?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have got 7 in train at the moment. That will probably increase as the year goes on because we get additional shelters through the Planning Obligation Agreement but it is not just about the shelter, it is also about how you get to the shelter and improving the connectivity of those to where people live.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Absolutely. I know between the M.T.F.P. (Medium Term Financial Plan) in 2016, so part way through 2016, and the end of last year, £391,000 had been spent on bus shelters, 23 bus shelters in particular. Do you have any evidence that those specific 23 bus shelters did see, after the bus shelters were brought in, an increase in the number of people using them?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We can certainly get that data but I can give you a very interesting anecdote.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I am looking for evidence rather than anecdotes.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is an evidential-based anecdote but we can also give ... we can do that analysis for you as well and bring you that information. In St. Mary when we built the footpaths and installed the bus shelters there, we got a 30 per cent increase in bus ridership in St. Mary. We were not anticipating that but that was a good turnout.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But when you decided to do the 7 new bus shelters did you look at any evidence on these previous 23 that had been built in the last 4, 3½ years? Did it increase bus ridership at all those shelters?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

There are 2 parts to it really. The first part is how can we make the journeys of existing bus users more comfortable so we prioritised them by the high usage stops but we also get requests from individuals who would like to have a shelter. They may be existing bus users or they may be people who would like to use the bus shelter, and we use that information as well to prioritise them. As to whether you get a specific increase at each site, I could not tell you that but I am sure that my colleague would know.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Would you mind finding out because it is interesting spending £100,000 a year without knowing whether it is increasing the usage of those sites.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think the interesting thing to do would be to try and correlate it with the weather because obviously you get a drop off of all types of travel when you have to go outside when you get poor weather.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Absolutely. This is all part of gathering the evidence, absolutely. But essentially you have not looked at the evidence to decide whether to continue with that plan or not?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

What we use primarily when we decide to put in bus shelters is the usage of those shelters at present so that we are giving those people who use those shelters at present the most comfortable journey that we can provide.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Electric buses, Minister; where are we?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We are - I say "we" - our colleagues at LibertyBus had an electric bus over not so long ago and it worked very well. There was an electrical problem with the bus. It was not a new one, it was quite an old one, and the bus drivers loved it, the passengers loved it, and it performed very well apart from the electrical glitch that it had. They are very expensive at the moment like when everything is relatively new; prices will come down. I believe they are getting over a single decker as a second electric. LibertyBus, are they getting another bus over? It was planned, a newer bus should one become available. I think it was one single decker electric coming over in the not too distant future.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They are certainly working with their suppliers to see what can be provided and provide the best mix for the fleet.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

So is one coming over or not?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

That is the plan.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

The Minister seems to think a new bus is coming over; Tristan is not sure.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is a loan bus that they are bringing over; a new one.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

So we are getting one?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. Saviour:

Do you know when?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I do not know.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Have we ascertained yet, and this is more I guess at Steve Skelton, whether the batteries in any electric vehicle are less environmentally impactful than motor vehicles, combustible engines?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

What we have done is to look in the round at the life cycle environmental impact of electric vehicles and fossil-fuel vehicles. From a point of view of carbon emissions, electrical vehicles across their life cycle are significantly less impactful, produce less carbon emissions, ultimately it depends on how they are driven. Whether there are wider environmental impacts associated with rare earth metals, et cetera, obviously you do not have the same ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

There are wider environmental impacts associated with rare earth metals.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

So, the question for any consumer is where there sort of environmental concerns lay. I think from a point of view of progressing a policy of reducing fossil fuel emissions electric vehicles are absolutely ... current technology that is ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But it is quite possible that our desire for electric vehicles in order to reduce carbon emissions could be harming the environment in many other ways, as of yet we do not know what they are. I mean for instance, I read an article the other day about the race to mine the seabed, which in itself will see various species destroyed, possibly made extinct in certain areas, in order to get rare earth metals. As battery demand increases worldwide that is going to become more and more likely. So we could be seeing the destruction of the oceans while trying to reduce our carbon ...

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

I think unfortunately we are in one of those situations where there is no technology that has no negative environmental impact at the moment. The consensus is, particularly where there is a low carbon source of electricity, in the order of priorities oceans are going to be significantly damaged by rising temperatures. I am not able to say that all people will want to make those trade-offs in those ways.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But do you think the public at the moment are getting the appropriate information from Government to make those decisions?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

I think the appropriate information is available. Whether they would seek that information from Government; I would not if I was buying a car.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Government is driving the strategy.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

Currently Government has not adopted the policy in this space so were we to adopt an advanced carbon neutral policy and to bring forward measures to try and encourage people to take electric vehicles then I would agree that we would want to improve the level of information that is available.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Looking back more at the Infrastructure Department, with regard to the disposal of car batteries, et cetera, is there a policy on that and how is that undertaken?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Yes, we have that.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We receive from the households at the House Recycling Centre, then it goes through the recycling part.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Sorry, for car batteries?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Batteries generally.

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

For fossil fuel cars.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, for electric vehicle car batteries do we have a disposal policy?

Recycling Manager, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. We work with a recycler in the U.K., we are exporting batteries once or twice a year there. So, there will be a specific criteria of what we can send them and what they do not accept.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I think we will need to see that as well.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Could I just try and close off the S.T.P. (Sustainable Transport Policy) discussions? I just want to know how exactly is the Island Plan and the migration policy being informed by the S.T.P. or is it the other way round?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

The relationship between the sustainable transport plan and the Island Plan and the migration policy, I mean the sustainable transport plan is kind of an infrastructure plan or the transport system as a piece of infrastructure, in many respects, has to provide for the population of the Island. I think our assumption, and you will see there is nothing in here about expanding the network, is the network is as is and our challenge is to make better use of that, which is why there is quite a lot of focus on fewer journeys, fewer vehicle journeys, making better use of public transport modal shift, that sort of stuff, so that we can get to a level of network usage which is more sustainable and allows people to move faster and be more active in the way they move. In terms of the interrelationship with the Island Plan, I think that is quite close. There are a number of pieces of work and opportunities as we move forward to look differently about land allocation for transport related issues. So, one of the studies we have to inform the Island Plan policy is around movement in St. Helier. So, we might see that Island Plan bringing forward policies to suggest different ways of categorising roads and then prioritising the access to those roads. So, at the moment different vehicles can use the roads in St. Helier as they wish. That includes adding, for example, delivery lorries stop being on major thoroughfares at peak time. Those sorts of things could be better prioritised and allocated. The strategic policies in the Island Plan around transport already accord with the sustainable transport principles because we have had the S.T.P. for a while, so we already try and encourage development near sustainable transport routes and discount the sustainability of development where it is not connected to transport routes. So those things are likely to roll forward the sustainable development principles. But there might be some specific choices around allocation. As we get into some of the work around parking we might want to think about reimagining the parking estate for the future and that sort of thing as a land use.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Thank you. Moving on to carbon neutral strategy, which is lodged for debate this month. We noted a proposal to create a citizens' assembly to consist of a Government appointed chair and 79 Jersey residents selected at random. It will prepare a report and recommendation for the States Assembly. Can you explain how random selection will take place and how you will ensure participation from a true cross-section of the community?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

We would access that from an organisation called the Sortition Foundation who provide this service. We would have to make a choice around our source data. It might be electoral roll, it might be Population Office data but effectively we would start with a long list of Jersey residents based on a certain criteria.

[12:45]

Then we have some choices to make. In order to get a sample of around about minimum 50 you would probably need to invite perhaps, say, 10,000 households to take part. We might write to 10,000, we might choose to write to every household in Jersey, we are not quite sure exactly how we'll do it but we would write to a large sample and ask people to provide some information about themselves and then express an interest. Then that is run through a piece of software which randomly selects those people in accordance with the set criteria that we put in place. Certainly, we would want to account for things like gender and age. We might want to account for where people live. If you look at the U.K. parliamentary citizens' assembly, which is underway at the moment, they chose to weight people in line with a recent survey that suggested what people's overall views about climate change were. We might take some of that information into account or we might not, but effectively there will be set criteria and the software makes random allocations from a long list in order to give us the right number.

The Connétable of Grouville:

It is not truly a random selection then because you are asking people to self-select initially and then you are going to do a random selection of those people.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

That is true, yes. Without kind of the power to compel people to take part you do need a desire to give up that time and to get involved and that does have an element of self-selection in it. The idea is by casting the sample wide enough you will find people of all dispositions that self-select. So, self-selection can be a bigger issue with a smaller sample but if you get into the multiples of thousands then the law of large numbers, aggregates, smooths it out.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

How exactly is the Island Plan and the migration policy being informed by the carbon neutral strategy? Or is it the other way round?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

So, these things are in dialogue with each other and I think exactly how we will manage that will depend very much on timescales. I think what we said through the carbon neutral strategy, the main driver for the interrelationships with the Island Plan with the sustainable transport policy are outwards from the carbon neutral strategy and the migration policy or the population policy, as agreed by the Assembly later in the year, will set a direction that the other plans will need to respond to. Equally, I think the carbon neutral exercise by the citizens' assembly and subsequent States Assembly decisions will set parameters that the other plans will need to respond to. So that is one of the reasons why we have a 12-month delivery plan for the sustainable transport plan because if we decide by next year that we have an ambition to become carbon neutral by, for example, 2030 that will mean significant things for later sustainable transport plan delivery plans. So, your next 3-year plan might need to make significant inroads into improving the public bus system. That will come at a cost. Equally, with the Island Plan we might need to see some Government amendments brought at the appropriate point in that process to make changes that might count for the outcome of either the population policy or the carbon neutral strategy. So, they are primarily setting the agenda and the other plans will need to respond, I think.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Vehicle road worthiness testing regime. This may be one for D.V.S. In regard to the cost of implementation that Government Plan details a total of £6.5 million just about over 4 years against the £5 million that was initially voted on, at the last hearing you could not explain the reason for the differential. Can you tell us what that is?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Did we not forward the original figures to the panel within a few days of the question?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

You can tell us now.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Remind us.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We did and it clearly showed that a 6.49 ...

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

6.475.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

6.475. So, we are at a loss to understand where the £5 million came from.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

That was voted on in the Government Plan. That is where that figure came from.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, it is from the report on the Brexit.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

My thinking of that, one was fitted out and one was not fitted out. One was a shell of a building and the other ... because obviously it is the kit inside it.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is the department now up to full manpower that will enable it to resource the reporting tool, if you like, that you are developing? There was a question of manpower.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We are moving on with addressing everything but we are still one traffic officer short of where we want to be. Not out of choice but a traffic officer has just recently retired. So, we are looking at replacing him now.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

What about when it comes to the testing? I know you are working on that. But what about getting it done privately rather than the other central operating centre that has been spoken about as well. Which direction are we going?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is one of the options. So, if you recall, we went out for the pre-tender for the options appraisal in May. We got a lot of interest, but we did not get any responses. No one came forward to undertake the work. So, we waited for a little bit until we were absolutely sure that we had the funding secure. We have gone out again now at the beginning of January, 5th January, and combined the prequalification tender and the actual tender document together to save time. We

passed it by procurement and they agreed with that strategy. We will know by 3rd February who has responded.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

For this options appraisal tender, you have used a consulting firm to undertake the work on developing the tender itself for the operations.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I ask why you have done that?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Because it was thought the best way possible from a resource point of view. We are pretty busy down at D.V.S. with ... we have taken on 6 projects at the moment over the last couple of years, which we are progressing, and we just have not got the resource to do it ourselves. So, we had to take on a very well-qualified consultant.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That was the same consultant that apparently consulted on the development in the Vienna Convention proposal itself?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

He was one of 2, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That was the same consulting firm that still ...

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So, I am trying to understand how much of the Vienna Convention proposal was driven by the department and how much was driven by the consultants.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I was involved in that at the time. The Vienna Convention ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I do not believe they were ever mentioned at the time that you were outsourcing this to a consulting firm.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

So, the background work and the development of the Vienna Convention was entirely undertaken by the department, largely by myself, with advice from law officers. The work that I think you are referring to ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

If I could just stop you there. The consulting firm says that they: "... supported the development of enabling legislation and detailed orders to ensure that the Island could become a signatory to the Vienna Convention." That is their own website saying that.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

So, the work that was undertaken by the consultant was to provide a project management framework and then to basically detail up the report and some of the detail. So, the strategy and the approach was all set by the department, the work in terms of road safety and its potential to have a benefit and justification was all done by the department, the negotiations with the Department for Transport, for the measures that were put in place was all done by the department. In terms of providing some structure to that and detailing it up then we had to enlist some consultant report in order to do that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

They worked on: "Legislation that was required to extend the compulsory use of seatbelts, adopt the new format for I.D.P.s (international driving permit), implement a scheme for the registration of trailers and implement a regime for the inspection of all Jersey registered vehicles." Their own claim suggests that they did a lot more than just provide a framework, that they worked on legislation.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is not ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

They: "Developed briefs working with the law draftsman to develop draft legislation and supporting its progression through the States Assembly." This is their words on the work they did for you. As part of this IPM - sorry, I did not mean to name them - "... developed the report and proposition to the States Assembly and worked with the States of Jersey communications team to develop public information." That is a lot more than just a framework or programme work.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Well, it depends on how you are trying to describe it. So, the ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

They describe it quite clearly.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, but I mean I am trying to describe the same. I am not disagreeing with what they have got on their website. What I am saying is that the original thought about how we would approach it, how we would come up with a series of measures and how we would get that through the Department of Transport in the approvals process, all came from within the department. However, when it came on to the detail of various measures we needed some support to write that up. Now, the writing up of that was not done in isolation by the consultant. They had to rely on the technical expertise of the traffic officers within D.V.S. They also had to rely on the technical expertise of the advice we received from the law draftsman. So we worked hand in glove, if you like. We were all party to the same information but, as I have said already, the original thought, the strategy and what was going to be done came from the department. The detailing and recording of it was done by the consultancy.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Are they going to be able to tender themselves for the options appraisal?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

How much have you spent on their work already so far, since the Vienna Convention work began?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I would have to get that figure to you.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Please do.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Just for clarity, my involvement was up to the point where we became signatories to the Vienna Convention and then the department restructured and it is now ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Sounds like both of you will have to put your heads together to tell me how much you have spent on them since the work began on the Vienna Convention through until to date.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We work together basically.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We work very much as a team and the work would not have been done without enlisting the help of the ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

My concern is if they are involved in legislative drafting.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think that is an ill-founded concern because you are not drafting legislation, law drafting instructions are where you explain to the law draftsman what you wish to achieve. So, the role of the consultant was to collect the technical information, to pull that all together into a short report, which then can be provided to the law draftsman. The technical expertise that fed into that was D.V.S.s, the strategy that underlined it was the work that we did as a department and how we were going to implement the Vienna Convention in a way that was appropriate and proportionate to the Island's needs.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You have gone out to tender to see if somebody would do the road worthiness testing privately. Are you looking for one supplier of that facility or are you expecting garages to do their own customers, a bit like the M.O.T. (Ministry of Transport)?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is called an options appraisal. This is not going out to find out who is going to do the testing. This is an exercise to establish the best way for the Island to go forward to carry out the testing. Is that government building and testing? Is it government building, going out to a third party for the testing? Is it the garages testing? It is a piece of work to establish the best way of carrying out testing.

The Connétable of Grouville:

We have always got the impression I think that the Government have thought that it should be doing it. Is there any chance of it being done within the private sector similar to an M.O.T., for example, where all garages do it?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think we have to be aware that if the garages do it themselves there is quite a high risk of the level playing field of garages at the moment disappearing. In other words, the smaller ones may not be able to carry out the testing themselves. They may not have the land, they may not have the resource to do it and the larger ones could eat up the smaller garages.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Will the options appraisal be looking at that?

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. It is within the options appraisal.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I think in the U.K. M.O.T. started, was it 1960? So, the small garages have had years to build up in the U.K. but from a standing start in Jersey it would be unfair for ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But yet in the 1960s those small garages would have been from a standing start as well and yet they still exist in the U.K.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Well the car use percentage-wise was very, very small. Not that many people had a car.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So the garages were smaller as a result.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Everyone has grown with it, is what I am saying there. But we are starting from a standing start and we want to see fairness all round and everyone get a fair slice.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

One of the concerns I have is that back when we were discussing the Vienna Convention, information coming from the department about whether or not consultations had been taking place adequately with the mechanics in Jersey, the trades in Jersey, was inconsistent. So as the chairman has suggested, it seemed very much as though the decision had been made that it was going to be a centralised facility and then we discovered that the consultation had not really taken place with the trade. So I am concerned that there is a bias towards moving down one route rather than the other.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What has been said this morning sort of reinforces that because what you are saying is that if it was done in the private sector smaller garages would be disadvantaged. So it seems as though you have already made up your mind.

[13:00]

The Minister for Infrastructure:

No, it depends what the offers come in.

Head of Driver and Vehicle Standards, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is the impression we get. That is what we think may happen but that is the very reason we are carrying out the options appraisal, to establish the best way to go forward. There are no preconceived preferences. We consulted on a regular basis with the motor trade industry. If you talk to them, if you talk to the Motor Trade Federation now, they would agree that we have consulted with them.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

During the Brexit convention before you were involved it seemed to be very inconsistent. I remember saying it. It was inconsistent and led to a lack of trust in the information we were receiving.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Professional bodies.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

My recollection, and Gordon was part of the team at the time, is we had spoken to members of the motor trade however we had not spoken to everyone in the motor trade. Some people who were within the motor trade had a different view and they, if I recall correctly, had not come to the meetings and then they later went forward to go to speak to Scrutiny to say that they had not been spoken to. But they were part of organisations that had been approached. They just had not talked within the organisation. In terms of what we were intending at the time, and I think Gordon said it within the operations appraisal, it is incumbent upon us to achieve the best value for the public of Jersey and so the options appraisal is to look at where that value lies. That value may be in the price you pay for all your certification. It may be in terms of how it sustains the industry, and that needs evidence. We do not have that evidence at this point in time until the options appraisal is completed.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I hope to see unbiased evidence in shortfall.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Who is going to talk about sewage?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Can I just finish off while Ellen is getting herself together? There has been a lot of nonsense reported of what I said that I have not said and other people's opinions. The sustainable transport system, the clue was in the name, the framework. It is the framework, the minutiae of detail obviously is not there. But that is progressing. Things have been reported that it is complete rubbish, it is unworkable. Well it is happening as we speak. The team are working on it as we speak. There are bike racks going up in Sand Street Car Park, as we speak. That is the long term. The short term is the strong start delivery. That is what we are doing this year. That will be thundering ahead. So, we could be judged by results at the end of the year.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

We look forward to it. Thank you, Minister. Sewage, we have had apparently 40 instances of sewage being discharged into the sea in the last 6 months. No doubt several of these will be due to stormy conditions in the Cavern. Are there any other times where there have been discharges perhaps not due to weather factors?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, it has been due to the weather and inclement weather and serious amount of rainfall. As you are aware, Constable, the Cavern was closed down for a period last year, as we did major refurbishment work, so the Cavern was shut down from April until November last year. During that time we had 40 spill events. The Cavern is 20 years old and it had some major work as well as some re-modification that we did during that period. Had the Cavern been in operation it would have prevented some of those events and spills to sea but we would have still had some. If we are looking at the rainfall that we had in October and November, it is double the amount of the previous 2 years and it has been significant, as we all know.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is it coping with the amount of rain we have been having of late or are we still getting overspill situations?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Occasionally during this time of the year we still get spills to sea and that is what our network is designed to do. How we are trying to prevent some of these spills we see in the future is obviously

the building of the new sewage treatment works where we will have an additional 8,000 cubic metres of capacity for storage. We have also now, from within the Government Plan, got some additional money for the drainage works and will be undertaking more foul and surface water separation schemes starting this year and again in future years as well.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

As Ellen just alluded to, this only happens during severe thunderstorms. It is something that has been ongoing for some time, stormwater separation. There has been major works happening on the eastern side of town to avoid any flooding of that particular district, which works well, but there is obviously more work to do with stormwater separation. People's downpipes should be coming down and spill into the road and going down the road drains. It should not be going into the main sewerage system. So, we do have engineers that are advising people to relocate their downpipe, shall we say, so it does not spill to the drainage system.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Have you overcome the scenario with seawater getting into the system on high tide situations?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

There is a minor one at Beaumont, I believe, because it is below road level but that, I understand, from the drainage team that we are planning a further pumping station there because rain events are happening now. Global warming, in my opinion, is not happening; it is here. The air can hold more moisture and that is the increased heat so when it rains it really rains in areas like Beaumont. We do not just have the problem coming in from the sea. We have to pump it out from the water coming down off the roads. More and more people are also cementing over their driveways to make parking, et cetera. If I could just add, regarding the spills to sea, no one is opening a valve or anything. It is a series of underground weirs that will automatically flood the sea in a major event.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you see there being any environmental consequences as a result of that, which have been mitigated?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

During the wintertime, it is heavily ... because of the very nature of it, it is heavily diluted stormwater. So, sewage is heavily diluted by stormwater. It is very unpleasant, we would rather not have it. The sunlight will destroy bacteria in about a day or so, but it is unpleasant and we would rather avoid it. Obviously, Ellen's team are working hard to get everything sorted out.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

In terms of focusing on St. Helier, is the surface water system, which included the last bit of Phillips Street shaft, is that now complete and operating?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Phillips Street shaft is obviously complete. We have still got to do a lot of connections to Phillips Street shaft on that side of town. We are looking, we have been doing studies about how we can connect more areas certainly of the north of town and separate out from the combined sewer system. We have got schemes as well in Springfield. We are looking at Beach Road and Dicq Road as well in 2020 and effectively it is just trying to take as much of the combined sewer off and separating out those networks.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

So effectively you are prioritising that area to try and get the plan completed?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

There is an immense amount of work been done in the last few years. I mean the drainage is so big I have walked from Phillips Street to Snow Hill. It is that big and I am 6 foot 3.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

With regard to the rest of the Island and providing facilities to outlying areas, which is always a contentious subject with regard to funding, particularly putting main drains out to the northern Parishes where they are lacking. what is the policy on that at the moment?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Ellen's team, at the moment, is concentrating on getting the new sewage treatment works up and running with a greater capacity.

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

There are 2 schemes that are in the pipeline for 2020, which were the schemes we have looked at previously and again can rely on gravity so they are quite straightforward schemes. What we are looking up is designing a team and having different representatives, States Members representatives, to go through and reprioritise where we should be spending our money on private connections and effectively we have now got money within the Government Plan that we will roll those schemes out year after year, subject to us still having the resources to be able to do that.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I like the term “in the pipeline”. Ideally, I would like as many people as possible in Jersey on mains drains but whether that is feasibly possible I do not know. What are we up to now?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think it is 92 per cent.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

92 per cent on mains drains, so we are making inroads. Where we do have problems is where we have a mains drains in the road and then maybe a hamlet of half a mile east or west of that, that would like to connect but they have to go across farmland to do it. I believe there are negotiations in hand that the landowner, shall we say, might wish to extract a fee for that.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I think ransom is a word.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I am not getting into all that. It is out of my jurisdiction.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

When the States of Jersey is the landowner do you believe that their undertaking, similarly to the foreshore negotiations, is an appropriate manner or do you think they are trying to extract the maximum?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We do not have anything, to the best of my knowledge, where drains would need to come across. So, this is private ... it works both ways. The landowner may say: “Oh, if there is a hamlet of 5 houses then I want £5,000 from each of you to bring your combined drain across my land.” You could say that is very unfair. But the value of those houses has probably gone up twice as much.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Would you say that would be very unfair?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I would make no comment on that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The States of Jersey has asked me and my neighbours £10,000 per household ...

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The States of Jersey?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

... to cross a short piece of land.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I was not aware of that. Is this your particular area?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Can I ask what the ... perhaps Tim might answer, what the policy would be from Property Holdings perhaps if a connection were to be made into or through a public piece of land road?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I think it would be a principle of a valuation would need to be undertaken and a decision on that value would be made.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So if typical market value was £5,000 per house Property Holdings would expect to levy that as well?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I just drew that out of the air, I am not saying that ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is £10,000 per house according to my own personal circumstances on the estate I live in.

The Connétable of Grouville:

It seems to me the Government is trying to persuade people to go along to main drains and yet they are putting a fairly large charge on it happening.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

You could argue that per house is an incorrect way to do it because you do not lay 15 pipes for 15 houses. You lay one pipe for 15 houses.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Exactly. That is what I am ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So per house is an interesting way to ...

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Should it be an individual house I said or a hamlet, where there would be a collective pumping area which would pump into a mains drains.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Talking of the sewage works, what is the timeline for completion of the work down at Bellozanne?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Should be completed by 2022, the end of 2022.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

What advantage will that give the public? Nobody really sees what goes on underground and I know there is an awful lot. What would you describe as being the advantage? What would the public see?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The main advantage is that we are going to be able to treat more flow, so at the moment we would treat, when it is full flow, 600 litres per second, but the new sewage treatment works will be able to treat up to 830 litres per second, which is a big difference. As I mentioned before, it has got increased storm capacity so there is an extra 8,000 cubic metres where we have got increased storm. It is a better design, so it can cope with the future population increases that we are looking at, but also the way that we have designed the new sewage treatment works from the flows going down, so we are not spending lots of money in electricity trying to pump sewage up a hill, which we are doing at the moment but trying to use the flows as the treatment work and process goes down.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Two other questions on the back of that. Is it still having U.V. (ultraviolet) treatment?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, it is.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is that part of the plant being updated as well?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, that is.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Secondly, will it smell from the point of view of the residents at Bellozanne?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The States voted an extra £3.5 million to cap the settlement tanks.

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, so we have got lots of new odour control facilities in the new sewage treatment works and, as the Minister said, the States agreed what was £4.5 million to cover all the primary settlement tanks. So effectively all the sewage treatment works that go through the process will be covered. New inlet works will be inside a building. The primary tanks will be covered and again with odour monitoring facilities there.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is that a notoriously difficult thing to do and I just wonder will it be 100 per cent achievable?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I do not think you can have 100 per cent achievable. I do not think I am giving anybody any secrets when I say that sewage smells.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Does covering this plant reduce its efficiency?

Director of Operations, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Certainly, in some of the primary tanks it does make it more difficult when you are having to take out pieces of kit and do those things. But again, with modern designs and such like that, we can work around it. I am not saying it is .. there are added complexities, but it is certainly workable, moving forward.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

In the area of recycling, you probably know that we have methane generators down at Bellozanne operating on methane and it saves us about £1,000 a day or something on electricity by using methane generators.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Just taking you, Minister, to the response to the Government Plan report, finding 4.3 under G.H.E. £500,000 spend reduction. You suggested that some posts had been left vacant following retirement of staff. Is that the only matter of reduction? How many other vacancies are expected to remain unfilled?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Who has that one?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Hopefully the Minister has.

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is £500,000 from the target operating model savings.

[13:15]

Some of that is by redesigning senior managers - structures - and there are the sort of posts that have been either left vacant for some time or will not be recruited to in the new structure. But it is part of the overall redesign of the organisation structure as a whole.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Do you, Minister, feel that this restructuring is working? It is all a bit of learning curve I know for all Ministers, and perhaps your colleague in the Environment Department is not so confident. I just wonder what your thoughts were.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is early days yet. There has been a lot of upheaval, a lot of changes. There are bits that I am not happy with but we are getting around that. There are certain readjustments to be made. I do share officers with the Environment Department in certain areas and, as you know, we are all located now in Broad Street. There are minor tweaks that need doing. I know that the Minister for the Environment is unhappy and would like some changes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

As the chair mentioned, the Minister for the Environment is unhappy. We have seen in the paper today that the Economic Development Department cannot wait to leave G.H.E. That in itself suggests that it has not been successful. Would you agree?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

That is a matter for them. They feel there are better synergies by associating themselves more with the finance area. There are things that I would like to change personally, which the Chief Minister and chief officer is well aware of. But nothing too drastic that cannot be handled.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What areas are those?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

What areas? I relocated myself back down at Bellozanne for meetings because we share so many rooms in Broad Street that I would like my department to have a separate office as opposed to a communal office. Just minor things like that. It was handy when we were at South Hill, for instance, if I needed some information I could shout down a corridor as opposed to having to phone people and get meeting rooms set up. That people are somewhat dispersed now. But we are working on it and I think it does need more tweaking.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

The second point: the recommendation 4.7 about fuel duty, impact assessments and consultation with the commercial sector were due to be carried out prior to January 2020. Has this been done and if so, what are the results of those assessments and consultations?

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

I think they must be still ongoing. I have not seen any outputs on that.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Recommendation 4.8: "The state of the nation report on existing and planned infrastructure is due to be made available early 2020." Is this available yet and if not, when it might be expected?

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I am not sure. Sorry, what was the ...?

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

This is in the Government Plan, the ministerial response 4.8.

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That was a joint one, Minister for the Environment, Minister for Infrastructure, yes, that is the infrastructure capacity one.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

That's is the infrastructure capacity, the study work is still under way.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

4.9 then, Jersey National Park; are you able to give us the quarterly update on that?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Not the National Park. The Minister for the Environment is more leading on that one.

Director of Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy Performance and Population:

If it is in the Government Plan National Park I believe it is the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

E.D. (Economic Development), is it not?

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is, yes.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is there any part that your department has an involvement with that?

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Not specifically within the Infrastructure side so the Jersey National Park one was primarily about an awareness officer and promotion of the National Park. The Minister for the Environment has an additional £165,000 I think in 2020, which is about the countryside access strategy, which also ties into this. So, there is a sort of joint effort there. Where the infrastructure side are looking at some assistance with the access strategy and some of the car parking in the countryside as well, which is currently managed under the Environment portfolio. So, there is some joined-up thinking going on within G.H.E. as a sort of ...

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

It does seem that there are synergies to be taken advantage of. Certainly with pathways, car parks, and roads.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The Government Plan makes reference to an infrastructure fund, Minister. Has there been any further work done on this?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Infrastructure fund?

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I can take that one, if you want. The infrastructure fund, which is within the prefeasibility in capital, I believe there is some funding within that. That is currently a Treasury and Exchequer project, which is looking at how we fund infrastructure in the future. So, at this point the Minister for Infrastructure, although there is a feed into it, it is being led by Treasury and Exchequer, I believe. But I do not know if that work has started yet.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Is the Minister feeding in because surely it makes sense that the Minister who would receive those funds ultimately should feed into that progress in itself?

Head of Finance and Business Partnering, Growth, Housing and Environment:

As I say, it is very early days on that at the minute, I think. I am not personally involved in it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Maybe the Minister is.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is early days yet, not at the moment, no.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

It may be one for Tim. Piquet House, what is the state of play there?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

The money has been made available and the Bailiff's office are in the process of putting the plans together to complete the transformation of the children's court so that ... I understand that project is ongoing.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Have we got a timeline on that?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

I am not aware of the timeline, but I will get it to you.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

It is just quite pertinent in terms of visibility, I suppose.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

Through the windows we can see, yes.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

I am not sure whose area this will be. What has been done by G.H.E. to address the means of access for the disabled to public premises?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Disability?

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Yes.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

There is an ongoing study to determine what access is required. The Disability Act comes into enforcement later on in the year and that sets a standard to make sure that accessibility is provided so we are looking to see exactly what that means. For example, I think the example was given in an answer earlier this week or last week. It may be difficult to put a lift into the gallery here. This is a Victorian building. But it would be possible to put access into a room, say like this, where an audible and video feed would be made available to anybody who wanted access. So, a review of premises is being undertaken to determine what is reasonable and what measures will be put in place.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Will that review incorporate some of those responsible for, shall we say, disability bodies who represent ...

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

Absolutely.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

We do have disability access here but it, shall we say, is very long-winded. There are ramps going up the outside and you can go into the Bailiff's entrance at the end here. There is a lift that goes up to bring you on another floor and there is a ramp at this end and there is another lift. But it is not perfect, far from it. But retrofitting old buildings, it is very, very difficult. But that is the challenge.

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

But certainly for the modern buildings, like the new Les Quennevais School and the new hospital in due course and the new office block, they will be built fully complying with the requirements. So, it is the traditional estates proving a challenge.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

What about glass in buildings, such as this? I mean we have got broken windows in this room. Is it due to the fact ... is it age, glass can be broken? Are you replacing it with something else?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

No, the glass apparently is on order for these windows. It is a special glass and some of the windows are curved glass so they are on special order. But I would like those replaced as soon as possible.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Is your department responsible for the security of the building?

Interim Director Estate and Asset Management, Jersey Property Holdings:

No, it is the Bailiff's Department.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

The Bailiff takes care of the building but I think ultimately it would be Jersey Property Holdings but on a day-to-day basis it is the Bailiff's.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

One final one from me. The Jersey events and street works law has stimulated a lot of, shall we say, roadwork furniture all over the roads. We see orange railings all over the place. Do you consider that we have gone a bit too far in emulating U.K. practice, probably where it is not particularly necessary? Maybe it is one for Tristan, I do not know who deals with that.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I would answer the other way that we have done a lot to make it bespoke and from Jersey, so we start to look very much looking at what U.K. practice was and we realised that we could not replicate that on our roads, they are too narrow. So, we have looked at what Guernsey did because Guernsey

did a lot of work in this area as well. We have come up with, which I think is appropriate to the Island, but things like the barriers with the bottom rail and the top rail are important because if you are visually impaired you need a tap rail to be able to navigate your way round a set of roadworks that may be incurring on to a footpath and it is the same with the ramps to get wheelchairs and buggies on and off. I think that we have moved things a step forward. It is always under review, how can we do things better? Obviously new technology has come along and help you manage things better as well. Things like variable message signs, which we tend to use a bit more. So I think it has been proven. What there has been though, and I think this may be where people get the impression from, there has been a huge increase in the number of roadworks over the last 15, 20 years. We are up to about 15,000 events of one form or another on ... sorry, 5,000, excuse me. Events of one kind or another on our roads. If you went back 20 years, the number was nothing like that. It would have been roundabout probably - I am conjecturing here - about 1,000 would be a reasonable number. That is because a lot of our infrastructure was put in, in the same time, it has been ageing. But also, there have been great movements forward and things in terms of telecoms and the like. So there has been a replacement of infrastructure and smart metering.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

That leads to the fact that obviously many of our services are under the roads and there are some roads once again in a dire state. You have put forward programmes for reinstatement of roads and I know some in other Parishes will be overdue. Are you able to stick to the programme that you have submitted or is there any deviation from that?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Extra money this year.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The road maintenance programme is always a moving feast. We try and fix it as early ahead as we can and we try to develop it so that we can provide information in advance about which roads we want to go into. So, we at least have an opportunity to go in there before us, hopefully share a road closure and also to give that notice to developers. But there are always instances and things that occur on the network which upset that planning but generally I think we are keeping to our programme and where we do not obviously have a programme we also have a contingency programme inside.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is quite strictly controlled now by the department, who can or cannot dig up the road but if it is an emergency, it is an emergency. If the mains cable goes or the mains water goes the road has got to come up.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

But one still sees very poor reinstatements and I just wonder ... I know we are supposed to have an inspector out of your department I suppose, have an inspector; I just wonder if they are doing their work?

The Minister for Infrastructure:

They are. If you cast your mind back to Five Oaks roundabout, the tarmac lane was not up to specification there for various reasons so the contractor had to come back and re-lay the tarmac at their expense.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Thank you.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You have got a programme for what I would describe as the main route into town on the main roads and that is sort of planned ahead and there is more money available this year, when will you get round to the sort of less used main roads? Because some of those are in a terrible state.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It has to be prioritised so none of our roads are designed, they have evolved over the years and what we have inherited is an historic road network, which we strengthen and patch to the best of our ability. Where the most damage occurs is on the main roads and that is where the most people travel. So that is where we must focus our efforts. As we get through that work we will then go on to the secondary roads and the tertiary roads. But they tend to last much longer because they have significantly less traffic. So, a main road will go, say, 10 years between resurfacings whereas a secondary distributor will go 20 years between resurfacing, and a tertiary one which is local access will last for up to 30 years. But we have got a backlog, for the first time since I have been in the department, we have now got enough money to stand still so we have basically ... previously we were just slowly managing the decline in our network, we are now able to halt that decline and hopefully start gaining some time back on it and each year we report on the resurfacing need on the road through the Government Plan or the department's business plan and how much work we can do which contributes towards that. So, the return period is to the roads. There have been changes in technology which have helped us, which is the micro-asphalt. So, we are able to apply these thin surfacings on some of the secondary roads such as, I do not know, the approach to Beaumont Hill. What that does is really seal the existing structure, stop the water ingress and stop it deteriorating.

[13:30]

So, you can basically put it on hold and it buys you a little bit more time before we have to go back and do the full resurfacing. It does not add anything to the structure of the road, it just preserves what you have got a little longer.

The Connétable of Grouville:

I think the road life in my Parish, which is a bit close to home, and by coincidence they are patching it up again this week. They spent the best part of a week, a gang of people, patching it. They have done it every single year. Basically the road needs redoing.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, that is an unfortunate ... the amount of reactive maintenance we have to do to keep the road safe for users has gone up over the years. That is because the Government has not invested enough in their assets in order to halt its decline. This goes back generations, decades.

The Connétable of Grouville:

It cannot be cost effective to keep coming back and repairing it.

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, it is not. You do it purely to try and keep the user safe. It does not do anything really in terms of improving the longevity of that road.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

It is also a chicken and egg aspect there as well because there has been under investment previously. A lot of the road gangs have disappeared so there are only a few now that lay tarmac. So, it is getting the right price for the job.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yesterday in St. Lawrence we had a Parish Assembly about reducing speed limits. One of the concerns that was raised was not about the speed limits themselves, it was about the signage that accompanies the changes because many lanes are 40 miles an hour officially, they have been dropped to 30, perhaps some new green lanes crossing them and suddenly you have 5, 6 signs that need to be installed at the entrance to each of these roads. It was mentioned by the representative from Infrastructure that work is ongoing about the idea of changing the law so that perhaps the speed can be painted on the roads, particularly in lanes as opposed to not major roads but lanes. I was wondering how far this work has progressed?

Head of Transport, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It really remains a concept that could be pursued at some point in the future when we do the law review. It is not without its own problems because obviously ... and it can be argued lots of different ways. If you rely on roundels on the road the first thing is they get worn out quickly, and the second thing is because they can be obscured by the vehicle in front. Someone could claim that they have not seen the repeater signs, that they were unaware of what the speed limit is, which is less likely with pole-mounted signs. So, part of this is a dialogue with the courts, in some respects, because it is the courts who are particularly keen on repeater signs so that when they apply a fine they can be confident that the person had knowledge of what the speed limit was.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

And I always thought ignorance of the law is no defence.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

I do get criticism now and again you would be stunned to hear. One of them is urbanising the countryside, which obviously nobody wants to do but it ... as Tristen has alluded to, it is that fine line of staying within the law but keeping everything exact. We do not want too many signs cluttering the place up but enough that people can register what the speed is.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

Minister, thank you very much, and your team, for your time today.

The Minister for Infrastructure:

Thank you, Chair.

The Connétable of St. Brelade:

We very much appreciate it.

[13:33]