

STATES OF JERSEY



**SCRUTINY REVIEW OF THE
GOVERNMENT PLAN: 2020–2023
(S.R.13/2019): EDUCATION AND HOME
AFFAIRS SCRUTINY PANEL
FINDINGS –
JOINT RESPONSE OF THE MINISTERS
FOR EDUCATION AND HOME AFFAIRS**

**Presented to the States on 10th January 2020
by the Minister for Education**

STATES GREFFE

**SCRUTINY REVIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT PLAN: 2020–2023
(S.R.13/2019): EDUCATION AND HOME AFFAIRS SCRUTINY PANEL
FINDINGS – JOINT RESPONSE OF THE MINISTERS FOR EDUCATION
AND HOME AFFAIRS**

Ministerial Response to:	S.R.13/2019
Review title:	Scrutiny Review of the Government Plan: 2020–2023
Scrutiny Panel:	Education and Home Affairs

MINISTER FOR EDUCATION’S INTRODUCTION

The Minister for Education welcomes the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel’s comprehensive review and report into the first Government Plan.

MINISTER FOR HOME AFFAIRS’ INTRODUCTION

I would like to thank the Scrutiny Panel for its work on the Government Plan and especially in relation to the areas that fall under my ministerial responsibility.

FINDINGS

	Findings	Minister	Comments
1	The Minister for Education has requested further details as to how the £1.78 million worth of efficiencies within her remit will be undertaken.	MED	Not all of the £1.78 million will be apportioned to the Minister for Education, but the exact split with the Minister for Children and Housing is not known at this time. The Minister for Education is being provided with further information.
2	The Minister for Home Affairs has identified £700,000 of efficiencies in 2020 which will be achieved by a combination of additional income, vacancy management and reshaping of long-serving posts where the post-holder has retired or resigned.	MHA	£700,000 was stated by the Minister during the public hearing in September. At the time this was accurate. Since then, JHA have agreed to make £1.59 million in efficiencies, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - £450,000 (TOM Phase 1, including removal of JCIS Director posts and removal of 4 posts at the Prison) - £380,000 (removal of 2 unfilled but funded posts at the Prison, and further restructuring, supported by a rapid review, which is already underway) - £193,000 (JCIS income) - £367,000 (Cross-Government efficiency programme) - £200,000 (SOJP).

	Findings	Minister	Comments
3	The Minister for Education has commissioned a review of the funding of the education system in the Island which will be conducted by an external agency. This is currently within its infancy. The Panel cannot comment on the implications of the review until such time as further information is available.	MED	The Minister for Education is expecting the final report in February 2020, and this will be shared with the Panel.
4	The post-16 education strategy will contain some actions which can be implemented immediately and other actions that will require further policy development. Upon confirmation of the strategy, resources will be allocated to meet the needs of the various areas of the strategy. Further information is required as to whether current budgets are sufficient to address all aspects of the strategy.	MED	<p>The implementation of the strategy is phased over the next 10 years. Immediate agreed actions will achieve a level of re-alignment of the budget to ensure efficiency and effectiveness. This includes the review of Supply and Demand for skills delivered through CYPES, CLS and other Arm's-Length organisations, such as Jersey Business and Digital Jersey.</p> <p>With the review of the second phase of the target operating model in full progress, with an implementation timeline of Q1 2020, it is envisaged that the service reviews and target operating model for positions below level 4 will commence immediately post-implementation of TOM 2.</p> <p>The current budget includes skills projects highlighted for CSP3, the review of funding for Highlands College core provision (16–18, Apprentices, 14–16, Adult Education and professional courses).</p>
5	It is intended to bring forward a new student finance scheme to be in operation by September 2021. Until such time, the current scheme will be maintained. This is in order to provide certainty to students.	MED	The review of the current student finance system which commenced in January 2019 is continuing following the publication of the Post-16 strategy in October 2019. The relevant departments of the Government are involved in ensuring all aspects of any policy change are fully assessed. A multi-disciplinary steering group has been formed and is tasked to support and lead the review of the current system. It is anticipated that their work will be concluded by September 2021 with a view for any changes to take effect for those studying from September 2022. There will be some minor changes to the current scheme for September 2021 entrants, which will be communicated well in advance of this period.

	Findings	Minister	Comments
6	There is an acknowledgment that the current tuition fees level in the United Kingdom may be reduced from £9,250 per academic year. In the event of a budget surplus, the Minister for Education has expressed a view to utilise this in order to bring vocational courses on a par with higher education courses.	MED	Agreed.
7	The Jersey Music Service is due to identify a new delivery model which is intended to allow all children to embark on a musical learning pathway that is clearly signed. This will be developed throughout 2020. Given the ongoing development required, the Panel has rated this project as ‘amber’.	MED	The development of delivery mechanisms to allow all children to embark on a musical learning pathway are now at an advanced stage and will be ready for implementation at the beginning of the 2020–2021 academic year. The plans will be shared with the Panel as soon as they are complete.
8	There is significant work being undertaken to review the education system as a whole in the Island (including the review of school funding and Big Education Conversation), of which the Jersey School Review Framework is one small part. Depending on the outcome of this work, there could be further implications for the Jersey School Review Framework.	MED	The Jersey School Review Framework (“JSRF”) is an ongoing rolling programme of reviews and not a one-off. It is not anticipated that there will be any further implications for the JSRF. Most modern jurisdictions have a method of reviewing and assessing schools and the outcomes they deliver for children and young people.
9	The Languages Strategy has been piloted successfully in 8 primary schools, and will be rolled out across all primary schools. It is, however, too early to state whether the requested funding for the project will achieve the expected outcomes at this stage.	MED	Phase 1 of the French Experience (Autumn 2017) involved Bel Royal School and La Moye School. Three Year 5 classes, with a total of 75 children, were part of this pilot. Phase 2 of the French Experience (Autumn 2018) involved 220 children from First Tower, St. Saviour’s, St. Martin’s, Trinity, Grouville and St. Luke’s Schools. In both pilots, across this wide range of schools, pupils made at least one year of progress with their French over the 6-week programme, and pupil enthusiasm and confidence for language study was significantly increased. It is therefore reasonable to propose that the Languages Strategy will impact on outcomes in a similar way when it is rolled out across all schools.

	Findings	Minister	Comments
10	There is a multi-stage review of the Education system underway, the first stage of which is the 'Big Education Conversation'. Due to the expected stages of the review it will take significant time to finalise any outcomes and further details will be required by the Panel prior to giving any assurances over funding levels.	MED	Agreed, the Minister for Education will ensure that the Panel remain informed at all stages of the reviews that are progressing.
11	The business case for Early Years within R.91/2019 states 30 hours of nursery provision, however, this is only an indicative figure based on discussions of the Early Years Policy Development Board which has yet to make a firm policy decision at this stage. It is therefore not possible to state whether the funding identified is sufficient to meet any proposed scheme.	MED	Agreed, although the business case involved some modelling to define the investment required, the final policy proposals of the Early Years Policy Development Board will require more detailed analysis at the appropriate time.
12	The funding for this project covers the costs of the hardware devices in the new Les Quennevais School, however, there is no confirmation as to how much budget will be available centrally to manage upkeep of the equipment.	MED	Agreed.
13	If the Primary Schools Meals pilot scheme is a success, funding for the continuation of this project will come from the business case for 'reducing preventable diseases' (R.91/2019 , p.33). Until such time as the pilot is evaluated there is no certainty over how much funding will be required.	MED	Agreed. If the pilot is successful a decision will be made on how to progress the roll-out of hot school meals in primary schools, and cost will depend on various factors, including provider selected and number of schools taking part.
14	Students accessing the Digital Leadership Programme will (once the qualification has been registered with Ofqual) be eligible to receive support through the student finance scheme. The Panel is concerned that this funding is in addition to the funding provided by the proposal and could create a double funding scenario.	MED	Currently, learners on the Digital Leadership Programme are not eligible for support through student finance. This will remain the case until the programme is registered with Ofqual. The source of funding for learners will remain a single source in the event of this change. All effort is being made to ensure that the programme receives its registration in time for September 2020 and beyond. The project remains on track to achieve this.

	Findings	Minister	Comments
15	The new roles created under the Skills Jersey additional funding request are designed to increase engagement across the range of services offered. It is, however, too early to state whether they will achieve the outcomes stated.	MED	Agreed, the achievement of outcomes can only be measured once the roles have been recruited to.
16	The Legal Aid guidelines which govern the scheme have yet to be agreed by the Legal Aid Guidelines Committee. Until such time as a proposed scheme is agreed the Panel cannot give assurances as to whether the level of funding is appropriate.	CM	The additional funding requested for 2020-23 is to meet the costs of the Legal Aid Office and the fixed-fee Duty Solicitor and Duty Advocate service. The funding has been requested based on a review of legal aid cases in recent years, and on an inference that the future Legal Aid scheme (made and published under Article 7 of the Access to Justice (Jersey) Law 2019) will be broadly similar in scope to that which exists at present. There are no reasons to believe that the scheme will reduce or expand in a manner that will significantly reduce or increase the level of funding required for the Legal Aid Office and Duty Solicitor/ Duty Advocate service. Nevertheless, it is accepted that absolute certainty cannot be provided until the new scheme has been brought into effect.
17	The final funding requirements of Le Rocquier School facilities and community sports facility capital project will not be known until such time as the feasibility study is completed.	MED	Agreed.
18	The final funding requirements for new school fields at Grainville and St. John's Primary School will not be known until such time as the necessary agreements and planning permissions are granted for the proposals.	MED	Agreed.
19	The final funding requirements for the Les Landes nursery capital project will not be known until such time as the feasibility study is completed.	MED	Agreed.
20	The final funding requirements for the La Moye Primary School extension capital project will not be known until such time as the feasibility study is completed.	MED	Agreed.

	Findings	Minister	Comments
21	The Panel has noted the need for additional music facilities at Jersey College for Girls and Jersey College Prep, however, further details are required over the proposed use by outside agencies. It is a concern of the Panel that similar investment in music within non-fee-paying schools is not being made.	MED	There is investment in music for non-fee-paying schools. This is both in revenue, in the Government Plan 2020–2023 , through enhanced funding of the Jersey Music Service (“JMS”), and in capital. This specific capital investment for JCG/ JCP is relatively small and specific to developing music facilities. Larger capital programmes, including the new Les Quennevais School, will see significant improvements in music facilities. We are still awaiting details of the use by outside agencies of these new planned facilities.
22	The completion of capital projects for new playing fields and JCG and JCP is dependent upon the acquisition of the fields and change of use under the Island Plan and the costs are estimated at this stage. Further information is therefore required prior to assurances over the level of funding in the proposal.	MED	Agreed.
23	A schedule of replacement equipment for CYPES is being completed between now and the end of the year. It is expected that the funding within the business case will not cover all items and some will be delayed to later years.	MED	Agreed.
24	Capital improvements to schools will be prioritised to meet set objectives in order to comply with the Discrimination Law, Safeguarding and Regulation of Care requirements. At present there is no clarity over how funding will be apportioned between these improvements.	MED	Agreed.
25	Capital improvements to Youth Service/ Community Hubs will be prioritised to meet set objectives in order to comply with the Discrimination Law, Safeguarding and Regulation of Care requirements. At present there is no clarity over how funding will be apportioned between these improvements.	MED	Agreed.

	Findings	Minister	Comments
26	Due to the need for an options assessment to be completed, there is no certainty as to the proposed costs of the new passport project at this time.	MHA	<p>‘Jersey variant’ passports issued by the Lieutenant Governor to British citizens in Jersey are important and valued by Islanders.</p> <p>The current contract for issuing Jersey variant passports ends in April 2022. The technology underpinning the process and procedure for applying for and issuing passports is no longer fit for purpose and requires updating.</p> <p>The project is a joint initiative between the Crown Dependencies and Gibraltar. It is being undertaken in close consultation with H.M. Passport Office. The cost of the project is shared between these jurisdictions. This will reduce the overall cost to Jersey as a result.</p> <p>Uncertainty over the timeframe of the project and the overall cost is caused by the UK’s decision to leave the EU. This has produced uncertainty around the technology, processes and procedures for issuing British passports in the future.</p>
27	The Panel recognises the possible benefits of the combined control room, however, further clarity over the long-term implications of co-locating the services is required.	MHA	<p>The Fire and Rescue Service, the Ambulance Service and the States of Jersey Police control room staff have been co-located since the beginning of January 2019. There have been several instances where co-location has improved these services’ response to specific emergencies.</p> <p>The second phase of the project will involve closer integration and collaboration between the services, including the use of IT and other systems.</p> <p>The aim of the project is to improve call handling and response times for Islanders, and to provide a more co-ordinated and joined-up response to manage demand across the emergency services.</p> <p>The project is regularly reviewed by the services involved, which informs continued development of the project.</p>

	Findings	Minister	Comments
28	Whilst it understands the need for the new system, the Panel has not been able to establish how the proposed Electronic Patient Records system for the Ambulance Service would integrate with other whole Island health systems that are due to be developed. It is concerned that without assurances over the integration of this proposal with future health systems the proposed funding could be wasted.	MHA	<p>The benefits of a new Electronic Patient Records system for the Ambulance Service will be enhanced data security, improving record-keeping and enabling clinical audit, allowing us to improve the care the Ambulance Service provides.</p> <p>The Ambulance Service currently use paper records. Moving to an electronic system will allow the Ambulance Service and staff in the Emergency Department to work together more efficiently. For example, it will also allow transmission of data to the emergency department ahead of the crews' arrival, allowing them to prepare to receive a patient. This will improve patient outcomes.</p> <p>The Minister is committed to ensuring that the electronic patient records system is compatible with the future Island-wide health system.</p>

RECOMMENDATIONS

	Recommendations	To	Accept/ Reject	Comments	Target date of action/ completion
1	The Minister for Education should publish further details of the efficiencies relating to her remit as a matter of urgency prior to the Government Plan debate.	MED	Reject	<p>There are a range of efficiencies apportioned to the Minister for Education as documented in the Efficiencies Plan (R.130/2019). Further information was also provided to the E&HA Scrutiny Panel, detailing the apportionment where possible.</p> <p>Of the efficiencies within the Minister for Education's portfolio, the agreement of £1.78 million is still subject to the provision of further information and analysis by officers. If/as these outstanding efficiencies are approved by the Minister, further supporting information will be provided to the appropriate Scrutiny Panels.</p> <p>In the event that some/all of this amount remains outstanding at the time 2020 budgets are allocated, a commensurate reduction/re-profiling of CYPES growth will be proposed to ensure balanced budgets in 2020.</p>	–

	Recommendations	To	Accept/ Reject	Comments	Target date of action/ completion
2	The Minister for Education should ensure that in the event tuition fees are reduced in the United Kingdom, any budget surplus within the Higher Education Fund should be maintained within the Education budget and not returned to central contingencies.	MED	Accept	Treasury has confirmed that, in the event of underspending on student tuition fees, the Minister would be able to redirect unspent budget to fund different activities in Higher Education. It is not possible to apply it to the wider Education budget, and it would be returned to contingency if not required for Higher Education.	–
3	The Minister for Education should review the implementation and effect of the Jersey School Review Framework on a termly basis during its first full year of operation.	MED	Reject	<p>The Jersey School Review Framework (“JSRF”) has been created, developed, adapted and improved over a 3-year pilot period. This pilot period was independently reviewed by external experts; this report has been shared with Scrutiny. The Minister does not agree that termly reviews of the implementation and effect are required. She would like to see a tri-annual review, to allow for the consistent application of the newly amended JSRF across the next 3-year cycle.</p> <p>The Minister agrees with the comments of the NASUWT Jersey Secretary who wrote to the Panel that “the JSRF acknowledges that where areas for development are identified, the Government of Jersey has to recognise its responsibility for the quality of education provided to all children and young people and to play its part in assisting all schools in their improvement journeys. This sharing of responsibility for securing and sustaining school improvement is a distinctive and positive feature of the JSRF.”</p>	–

	Recommendations	To	Accept/ Reject	Comments	Target date of action/ completion
4	The Minister for Education should prioritise the work of the Early Years Policy Development Board and bring forward the Early Years Policy by the end of Q2 2020.	MED	Accept	As part of the EYPDB's research, is it clear that Early Years policy spans a much wider landscape than just Education, and that service design and delivery is the shared responsibility of a variety of agencies and voluntary organisations. The Board is committed to publishing high-level policy recommendations within the timescales set by the Panel.	30/06/20
5	The Minister for Education should provide further clarity as to exactly where the funding from the student finance scheme will be utilised within the Digital Jersey Academy and ensure that there is no duplication with the proposed funding under this business plan.	MED	Accept	There is no funding provided from student finance to the Digital Jersey Academy provision unless they are eligible for funding. The current provision is undergoing an approval process, and until this process is concluded there will be no financial support from student finance for this programme. In the event of the necessary approval is granted mid programme each case will be reviewed based on its merit.	–
6	The Minister for Education should ensure that further information is provided by JCG and JCP as to how the proposed music facilities will be used by outside agencies.	MED	Accept	The Minister will provide further detail to the Panel.	30/01/20
7	The Minister for Education should ensure that the schedule for replacement equipment for CYPES is provided to the Panel with information detailing how projects will be prioritised. This should be completed by December 2020.	MED	Partly accept	The Minister will provide the schedule, but is unable to do so currently as the department has implemented a new procedure for minor capital requests and the school's deadline to respond is not until the end of January 2020. The new procedure will provide improved governance and oversight of minor capital priorities, and once the schedule has been agreed it will be shared with the Panel.	30/03/20

	Recommendations	To	Accept/ Reject	Comments	Target date of action/ completion
8	The Minister for Home Affairs should pause the delivery of the electronic patient records capital project for the Ambulance Service until such time as assurances have been provided that it will integrate with any future whole Island health systems.	MHA	Reject	<p>The electronic patients record system for the Ambulance Service will enhance data security, improve record-keeping and enable clinical audit, allowing us to improve the care the Ambulance Service provides.</p> <p>This will improve patient outcomes.</p> <p>The Minister is committed to ensuring that the electronic patient records system is compatible with the future Island-wide health system.</p> <p>The Minister does not think it is necessary to pause the delivery of this valuable new system.</p>	–

MINISTER FOR EDUCATION'S CONCLUSION

The Minister thanks the Panel for the constructive dialogue and looks forward to providing further updates as plans progress throughout 2020.

MINISTER FOR HOME AFFAIRS' CONCLUSION

I believe that this Government Plan will continue to ensure that Jersey is a safe place to live, work and visit.