

STATES OF JERSEY

SHADOW SCRUTINY PANEL

BLAMPIED ROOM, STATES BUILDING

WASTE MANAGEMENT STRATEGY

Present: Deputy Phil Rondel (Review Chairman)
Senator Ted Vibert
Senator Jean Le Maistre
Deputy Gerard Baudains
Deputy Rob Duhamel
Deputy Bob Hill

EVIDENCE FROM:

Constable John Germain
Mrs Sue De Gruchy
(Comité de Connétables)

on

Friday, 26th November 2004

(11:01:03 - 11:46:00)

(Digital Transcription by Marten Walsh Cherer Limited,
Midway House, 27/29 Cursitor St., London, EC4A 1LT.
Telephone: 020 7405 5010. Fax: 020 7405 5026)

DEPUTY RONDEL: Good morning. The time is eleven o'clock and I would like to thank the

Constable of St Martins and the Secretary for the Comité de Connétables for their presence at this hearing. Before we start, I have to read a notification. It is important that you fully understand the conditions under which you are appearing at this hearing. You will find a printed copy of the statement that I am about to read to you on the table in front of you.

Shadow Scrutiny Panels have been established by the States to create opportunities for training States Members and Officers in developing new skills in advance of the proposed changes of government. During the shadow period, the Panel has no statutory powers and the proceedings at public hearings are not covered by Parliamentary privilege. This means that anybody participating, whether a Panel Member or a person giving evidence, is not protected from being sued or prosecuted for anything said during hearings. The Panel would like you to bear this in mind when answering questions and to ensure that you understand that you are fully responsible for any comments you make.

Thank you, Connétable and Mrs De Gruchy, for attending. We have your list of meetings you have had with the Comité de Connétables.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Would you like to give us a résumé, a verbal résumé, of your views on waste management, please?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Right. Now, you have got all our minutes, I know, from 20th March. Is that what you have got?

DEPUTY RONDEL: They go back to 1996.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: 1996, yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: All the way through until 22nd September.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: As you can see, over the months and the years, we have had different consultations with different people and most of them are as read. Basically at all our Connétables' meetings it has always been supported by whatever anybody is trying to do. There are various things that, as I say, we have had various people talking to us. I think the first one was Mr Cannon for recycling and then we have had other people -- Salvation Army do some of them. We have had Public Services who have come to talk to us about recycling and other

aspects of the waste disposal. Most of them we have agreed to. If you go straight through all these minutes, as I say, various meetings since '96, but I suppose the ones if you go ... do you want me to go through them one by one giving you our comments as we go?

DEPUTY RONDEL: It is entirely up to yourselves how you wish to do it.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: But I was hoping you would give us a résumé and then we would put questions to you.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Right, okay.

SENATOR VIBERT: We take those minutes as read.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: If all Members of the Panel are happy, we will put questions on those minutes.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: If you would like us to do it that way, if it is easier for you.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes. Some of the meetings that we have had I haven't been ... I wasn't there. I notice that you have got a green ... this leaflet **here**.

SENATOR VIBERT: The Waste Strategy document.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Which apparently was left for all States Members. If it was distributed in September, I was away in September and beginning of October. Sue showed me this today, and this is the first time I have ever seen this.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Thank you.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: That is the first time I have ever seen this.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Senator Vibert?

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes. Constable, I wonder if I could take you to the minutes of 22nd September 2003, which were the last minutes that actually deal with waste, because, looking at them, Mr Richardson said that "*The final Waste Strategy Proposal will be available for consultation in October/November 2003*" -- now, I take that in fact it didn't happen because there are no minutes anywhere -- "*and all parishes will be contacted regarding the proposals and*

opportunities for green waste and glass collection services to increase recycling opportunities.” Now, again, I take it that, in view of the fact there is nothing else in the minutes past 22nd September 2003, you actually have had no discussions with the Committee at all about the Waste Management Strategy or about recycling since that particular period?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: To be quite fair, I was approached by Senator Ozouf, who is coming to talk to us in December at our next Constables' Meeting re this.

SENATOR VIBERT: Prior to the publication of this document, you have had no contact with them at all?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No.

SENATOR VIBERT: We were told actually at one of these Scrutiny Meetings by the President of the Committee that the Constables were a stumbling block to collection and separation, that they didn't accept the need for a separation and they were not prepared to co-operate. That doesn't appear to come out of the minutes.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No. I think what the Constables felt at the moment is that most parishes have a first class service which they thought couldn't be bettered. For me in St Martins I defy anybody to find me a better system than what we have got at the moment. The people we have got are absolutely first class. Some establishments are collected three times a week and they are first class. Now, you know, I have seen them work on Saturdays. They have got their special days, but they do overlap.

SENATOR VIBERT: Do your parishioners separate their waste?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes. We ----

SENATOR VIBERT: Can you tell me what the separation is?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Well, we have just ... basically ----

SENATOR VIBERT: Bottles, I take it?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Bottles and then ... but I have a problem with waste collecting. We just collect household waste.

SENATOR VIBERT: Hmm hmm.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Now, every year we send a letter to the ... a newsletter to the

parishioners telling them when the dust collector is going to come and we always say that the dust collector, our refuse collector, collects household refuse waste, not tins of paint or bedsteads or stuff like that and glass is a separate day.

SENATOR VIBERT: Hmm hmm.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: My main concern ever since these wheelie bins came out, probably a good idea, but we have had problems where our refuse collectors collected these wheelie bins, tipped the wheelie bin in and on one occasion at the bottom of the wheelie bin were some paint pots. When he squashes this, the lot came out in the road. The problem with wheelie bins is you just don't know what's inside. I know the old fashioned system where you had a bin, you tipped it and you could stop, but one's got to move on, but, you see, I see these wheelie bins, and down Gorey, especially down Gorey, we've got the ... we've stopped it now, but we've had these hotels who, you know, if you want to put seaweed on your garden, you've only got to go down on a Monday and get all the seaweed out of the bins and you can ... you know, everything goes in the bin. Luckily we've got a good team at St Martins. They will notify me and say "Look, I've been to such and such a place, there's all this fat, all this stuff, what are we going to do?" I shall write to them and I say "We're going to stop for a week". We do not go for a week to that establishment or to anybody who is putting stuff in that it is reported to me it's more than waste. I will stop the collection and they are going to make alternative ways. But that is a problem that I find I get from our refuse collector. It is these wheelie bins.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Continuation Deputy Baudains?

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Thank you. If further separation of household waste is required in order to achieve the Waste Strategy policy, how difficult would it be for the parishes to implement that, because the information we seem to be getting from the Committee is that the parishes could not implement that and it would require an Island-wide operator to do the collection. I have difficulty understanding that. It seems to me that if the parishes require a collector to collect glass, tins and something else, then they will do that.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I can't see a problem. We do glass now, glass on separate days. Ours is on the third Thursday in every month and all that is separate. Tins could be done on the

same thing.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: So, in your view, the people that do your collections, whether it is contracted or done by the parish, could adapt to alternative working practices.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I would have thought so. Apart from tins, what other things are you thinking of could be ----

SENATOR VIBERT: Plastics, for instance, plastic bottles.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Only household waste, not ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Well, if there is going to be ----

DEPUTY RONDEL: Please, gentlemen, through the Chair, one speaking at a time and allow the witness to give his evidence.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Absolutely.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: If you are going through various components of refuse, i.e., plastic bottles and tins, then I can't see any problem in at the moment our waste collector doing that because at the moment he uses his same wagon for household refuse as glass. He shoves it all in and squashes it. So I can't see any reason why not. Plastic could be a problem because plastic wouldn't crush. But he has a vehicle there with cattle sides on, which, you know, you could shove it in, so I can't see ... tins I am sure would be squashed. Originally glass was on a special wagon he had and he just tipped all the glass in, but now it goes into the same refuse collector and quashes it to pieces.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Duhamel.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Yes, on a similar line, Constable Germain, would the separate collection of the putrescible wastes be a problem to the parishes? Putrescibles are all the organic factors, the things you were referring to like people's seaweed or grease and fats and things like that.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: If those are actually separately collected or if it was said to you could we actually set up an Island-wide collection of those materials in order to make what is left a cleaner collection service, would that actually pose any problems to the collector?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: You see, the only problem with, I said, it was seaweed and oil,

basically comes from just a few establishments, the hotels basically where they do fruits de mer and that kind of thing. That is where we get all the seaweed stuff.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: But there are food items as well, kitchen waste.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: We don't take that.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: You don't?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: We shouldn't take it and if they ring me up and say "Look, I've just been to so and so and there is stuff in there which shouldn't be there and we've had crab shells and all sorts", to me that is not household refuse.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: So are you telling us that for your parish in particular, the household collection of the organic part of the bin isn't actually undertaken by your parish collection service?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: It's not. It probably is, but it is to define what household refuse is, I suppose, but um ...

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Do you collect a mixed bag, a mixed bag from every householder?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: We do. We do. We do.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: And in that bag could well be ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: And in that bag could be, yeah.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: But you are saying that you would prefer not to do that?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I would prefer not to collect it.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Is that view shared by your other Constables?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I haven't gone that deep with them, to talk to them about it.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: So certainly the argument is that if indeed a separate collection of all the organic waste could be undertaken, then the dry recyclables that were left would be easier to collect and cleaner to collect and you would be attaching greater value to them.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think what we would need is clarification of what ... like they did for glass. At one time everything was taken in the same wagon and causing problems, and a couple of years ago when you came with a mixed load, you had to pay for it to be sorted out. I think we have gone one step ahead of that now, which is much better, because we don't put any

glass with the waste, so we are going on. I think, personally what I think I would like is to find out exactly how this waste management system is going to work to see if we can adapt to it. That is what I would like to know before deciding whether we are going to accept this or accept that or the other.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Senator Le Maistre?

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Can we start again actually from the premiss that as you haven't seen this, I think that it ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Can I just say that I haven't seen it, but other Constables might have seen it. I happened to be away.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: It puts you personally at a big disadvantage, I think, in fairness to the debate around the table today, because clearly a lot of what we are talking about is based on what is being proposed in the public consultation process by Public Services in terms of how they are going to deal with the waste. Secondly ----

DEPUTY HILL: Jean, can I just interrupt because I think this is important? I think the Connétable is here as the President of the Comité of Connétables, not as the ... I understand that his overview of the whole ----

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: But in fairness to him as an individual, he has not actually seen this and it makes the task a bit more difficult because the questions we are asking, for example, on the Strategy, which is that thing **there**, if he hasn't seen it, it is actually difficult to understand perhaps some of the questions, so I will continue with the questioning.

DEPUTY RONDEL: For the help of the Connétable, you can use your officer, who may have information from other Connétables, in giving your answers.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: That is right.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Can I just say is it possible that if I am stuck or something that Sue can answer?

DEPUTY RONDEL: Yes. That is why I interjected.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: The next point I wanted to make before I get to the questions is, as you haven't been consulted, as was promised in the minutes that were read out by Senator Vibert

of 22nd September, it puts you at a further disadvantage.

SENATOR VIBERT: 22nd.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: So the first question very simply is have the Connétables up till now discussed, in the absence perhaps of the Chairman of Connétables, the Waste Strategy document?

MRS DE GRUCHY: Do you want me to answer that?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: You can answer, yes. He said ----

DEPUTY RONDEL: Will you please speak into the mike when you answer? Thank you.

MRS DE GRUCHY: Sorry, no.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think what Jean is saying is have we discussed it whilst I haven't been there.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Correct.

MRS DE GRUCHY: No. You have had all the minutes that there have been in the last couple of years.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Okay. So we are starting from an interesting base because here is a key partner in the delivery of this document -- and by "*partner*" I mean all the parishes -- who seemingly has not been involved at any real stage in the development of this document. Now, the importance of this is in two aspects, and maybe you would like to comment on it. The first is that the Waste Strategy is going for this very expensive solution of the incinerator, which you are well aware of, I am sure.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: But, as part of that -- we will talk about the incinerator in a moment, but as part of that -- a key part is that of recycling of as much material as possible. To deliver the recycling operation, the parishes play a key rôle.

SENATOR VIBERT: Crucial.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: A crucial rôle.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: And what is being suggested is that there are difficulties, or will be difficulties, in working with the parishes on the delivery side, and this is not a reflection or a criticism of the Connétables or anything, but it is the public as well, who will not be prepared to separate as is required. Now, the first question I would like to ask on that one is are you aware of what is happening either in the UK or in France in terms of separation at the collection point, because, as partners in that aspect, it seems to me that that would put you at a disadvantage if you didn't know or had not seen those operations?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I have seen those operations in France at various ... a lot of them are basically at big supermarkets, the superstores -- we are talking about the tins or what-have-you -- and I have seen them in Guernsey. Now, we are, as you know, going to start that system in St Martins, whether you want to know it or not and the other, because, as I say, Bob will know that we are now building this ... we have been approached by the Salvation Army for putting in stuff. I have ... they wanted to put it round the Public Hall and I wasn't keen because I was concerned about fire and basically taking car park spaces away. We are now building a car park outside the Public Hall, which is a 80 space car park and what I hope to achieve with that is an area there where we can put collecting points for various things which are required.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Right.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: And basically the reason why I want it there is because people can drive to it and dispose of it and then ... because otherwise they won't drive there and carry the stuff there. So my objection at the moment, and Bob is part of it as well, is to be able to designate an area in that official car park where we will have these bins provided. I would like to know basically, you know, what, how many containers they need for various things.

Now, there was, you know, we have got the Salvation Army who want to do blankets and other stuff. We have got telephone books and waste paper which we could do. So we have got space available, and that is what I hope to achieve in St Martins. Now, whether that is the way to go, but I think basically one has got to be very careful where you put these things. If you are going to put paper an blankets, my concern was fire, you know, kids going around and just

lighting the container. I think you have just got to put it in an open space where, if they do catch alight, at least nothing is going to happen.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: But you are saying effectively that you are not opposed, either yourself personally or as a group of Connétables, to the principle of recycling?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: But you recognise that it may require resources and help from Public Services etc.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: But as a principle you are totally supportive, which I think is important to establish.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Hmm hmm.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: You said you have seen it in France because you have seen it in supermarkets, but do you think it would be useful for the Connétables individually as a group to see how -- and we have seen an example just around Grainville ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: So you want to take us there, do you?

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes. But do you think it would be helpful? It is actually a serious question ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah, yeah.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: ---- to see how systems are being operated, because I think, if one hasn't seen that happening, it is actually probably difficult to envisage and the sort of questions you are asking are absolutely spot on in terms of how will it work, you know? If you have seen examples of how it works, I think you then have to tune it in to maybe even individual parishes would be different, but the principles should be the same.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think, yeah, like most things, you have got to educate the public and it took us a long time to get people to stop ... because a big problem we had was St Martins and Grouville when Frank Amy was there. Now, I remember meeting with John Richardson many years ago, whether this was before this or not, where there were complaints of people putting everything in the refuse and causing a big problem down at Bellozanne. Now, we were

instructed by them, I can't remember when it was ... when was it? Anyway, we were instructed to say that we have got to keep things apart and we in St Martins did. It was very difficult. You know, we just went in like I said. We refused to pick up. In those days we didn't have wheelie bins, we just had the ordinary bins and we wrote to everybody saying they had to be separate. When the dust cart went and tipped out and he found bottles and stuff, we would warn the people and, if it carried on, we would say "We're not going to, we're stop" and we have educated them now, it's okay.

But what was annoying was Grouville, where my daughter lives, everything went in. That was the annoying part. When you're trying to educate your parish and another parish, with due respects, they couldn't care and everything went in and people were saying "Well, Grouville are doing it, why have we got to do it?" It's like most things, if we can educate the people that there is a specific place in St Martins or any parish where you can go with your tins and your paper and God knows what ... because at home I burn all my paper. Okay, I'm lucky, I've got a space to be able to burn it, but I haven't been for a long time. Now, the amount of paper that I've got -- mine is probably more than most people -- is huge. My father burns his paper. My son has got an old thing to burn his paper, but when you see the amount of paper, you know, that's picked up, it's unbelievable.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Connétable, when I wrote to you on 1st November and you replied for the 10th, have you had opportunity to discuss waste management with your fellow Connétables since that date?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Okay. Thank you. Senator Vibert.

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes. Following on what Senator Le Maistre was talking about, the systems that we saw basically in France, where the separation was actually done by the public because they had bins marked "*bottles*" or whatever and full instructions as to what you put in, which were actually alongside of the equivalent of the Parish Halls, right?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR VIBERT: But they were environmentally beautifully done. They were in timber.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Oh yeah.

SENATOR VIBERT: They looked terrific and the whole area was kept immaculate. The reason for that was because it was one company who was actually doing that section of it. It seems to me that the argument the Constables could put up to Public Services is that, in terms of your collecting areas that you set up around in the parishes, in fact there could be just one organisation that comes and picks all that stuff up, because the way it works in France is they just come with a crane on a truck, it picks it up, the bottom of this thing opens, drops all the stuff into the one truck and it goes straight to wherever it has to go.

Now that could in fact be funded and financed -- there is not reason why that shouldn't be -- by the general taxpayer rather than spending £85 million on building an incinerator. So I would have thought that they are the sort of things that you would be able to discuss with this Committee and also as a result of going on a trip to actually have a look at it. I think, as far as the Constables are concerned, it would be crucial. You could do it in a day. You could fly over to France and just have a look at that one system. That is all you need to do. We have got some photographs that we could actually let the Comité have of how it was done so that you can actually see it, but there is nothing better than actually going to see the system.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No, no, no.

SENATOR VIBERT: You couldn't see any problem with something working like that?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Not at all, not at all.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Hill?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think, yes, that is fine, but I am sure the Constables are knowledgeable enough. I think one has got to be careful. It is all very well to have these things, but you have got to be able to drive to this thing. It is okay, you can say "We have got all this" --

--

SENATOR VIBERT: No, you have to have them in the right place.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: If you have got to walk more than 250 yards with two bags, then they are not going to do it.

SENATOR VIBERT: No, they are not going to do it.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: But if you can drive to the actual place, I think it is ----

SENATOR VIBERT: You have got to have good parking.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

SENATOR VIBERT: And good facilities.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Hill.

DEPUTY HILL: Yes. I wanted to clarify just one point and reinforce what Senator Le Maistre was saying about the Constable's rôle. The Constable's rôle here today is as the Chairman of the Comité rather than speaking about the Parish of St Martin, but the point I want to come to is if indeed we have to look at the separation of waste etc, it might mean possibly one or two different lorries coming in. Senator Vibert was talking about that, so this is possibly where Public Services are getting the idea of how it probably wouldn't work if we have got different collectors for different parishes. But if indeed it came to be, and we have seen in other places, where we are having paper in one bin, tins in another bin and whatever, it may need to go in separate bins on a separate day or a separate lorry, how would you see the problem there so far as financing goes, because it could well be additional expense ?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: To the ratepayer?

DEPUTY HILL: It could well be, yes.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think Senator Vibert said it could come out of the general revenue.

SENATOR VIBERT: Hmm.

DEPUTY HILL: So, okay ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Can I say that I am finding ... I am confident sitting here, but I am finding it difficult in answering some of the questions when we haven't discussed it with the Connétables themselves ----

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: That is the point I was making.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Through the Chair, gentlemen. This is being recorded and the witness is giving evidence. Please don't have any alternative conversations going.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Please, carry on, Connétable.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes. As I was saying, I find it difficult to answer some of these questions because I am speaking personally as the Connétable of St Martins and we haven't had an opportunity to discuss this with all the Connétables. So basically it is very difficult for me to give an overriding theme of what the other 11 are thinking.

DEPUTY HILL: Yes. That was the point I was trying to make earlier, the fact that, because you haven't, I can understand the difficulties you are having, but probably you can see now, because, again, you have not really been involved in this and you are finding it difficult to understand actually, but anyway, that has come about. Anyway, can I just go on about an aspect you had at your meeting last September? It talks about improving public participation: "*The Connétables stressed the need to promote recycling and that waste products were actively being reused and recycled.*" Do you think that should be the parish's responsibility to do that or do you think it should be more directed at Public Services?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: That was the 22nd September?

DEPUTY HILL: That was just a statement. It is in the last meeting you had 12 months ago.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Right.

DEPUTY HILL: Really what I am saying is do you think there should be more education, promotion etc coming from the parishes or do you think there should be an Island-wide responsibility under the Public Services or whatever they want to call themselves?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think, as I said before, you know, we have got to educate the public. It is in everything now. There are certain places where you can't dispose of waste material. I appreciate that if you are living in a block of flats. But they are in ... I have been brought up to dispose of all our stuff in the garden. We haven't got a garden. Some people haven't got gardens. I find it difficult. I find it difficult to find how people find it difficult to get rid of stuff, whether it is because I have been brought up on a farm and you did it automatically. You know, you chucked everything on the garden and the birds came and it just rotted and you dug everything in. Of course, I haven't ever lived in a block of flats or stuff like that, I've

always lived in the open spaces where I've always been able to dispose of my waste without a problem.

DEPUTY HILL: Yes, but what we are getting to really at the end of the day is the Connétables, like probably a lot of other organisations, haven't given sufficient thought to in the past, but now it is coming to the fore and we have actually got to direct our attention more to the use of waste management and recycling, so it is going to be part of the Connétables', as the Comité of Connétables', responsibility to discuss further.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah. What are you defining as "*waste management*" to dispose of?

DEPUTY HILL: Well, anything that has got to be disposed of. I think "*waste*" is fairly general.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah.

DEPUTY HILL: So, at the end of the day, it has got to be a partnership between not only Public Services' responsibility, but also with the Connétables and the only way you are going to get that is by having the public raise more dialogue.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Okay, fair enough, but, you know, I was trying to think of waste management, like hotels, you have got all this grease and seaweed and God knows what. Are you thinking of another collection to get rid of all that stuff?

DEPUTY HILL: No. What I am saying really at the end of the day is I don't think ... we know now that there has been a lack of consultation between the Committees to you, but also it is probably making yourselves much more aware that there is a problem ahead and of the incinerator etc. I just wanted to find out how much, you know, how aware are you of the problems leading on to that, about the problems at Bellozanne? Is the Comité of Connétables aware that there is only a short lifespan of the incinerator?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think the only thing we know is what we have been hearing from Public Services or whatever they call it, saying ----

DEPUTY HILL: But as a committee you haven't ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: As a Committee ----

DEPUTY HILL: As a committee, you haven't pursued the matter. You have taken as a given that this has got to go by 2008?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes, and basically we are, you know, as I said, we would like to know, I am sure we would like to know, of what can go there or what can't go there or what they want there, you know, and what we have got to do parish-wise to get rid some of the stuff that doesn't go down there.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Thank you. Deputy Duhamel?

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: It was stated earlier by one of the Panel Members that it was perceived by Public Services that the Constables were a "*stumbling block*" to the introduction of further kerbside collections of waste streams and/or further advanced recycling initiatives. Could we perhaps have a comment as to how you think they could have come to that conclusion?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I've no idea. I think, if you go through all our minutes, we agreed with most of the things that they have suggested. If you through what I have got here, where it says the waste collection services, "*At the end the Connétables stressed the need to promote recycling.*" We've tried all along. I think what the stumbling block was was that we wanted to know a little bit more about the cost of this collecting, okay? We were all happy, I think all of us were happy, with the ones that we had for each parishes and I think to be told "You know, we're going to go big scheme and big lorries ..."

You see, in St Martins, you know, if you go to that, run by Public Services and, you know, they only work five days a week, we do get problems. You know, as I say, our blokes, sometimes four times a week our bloke comes. Are you going to get that service from these people? We organise like they don't go on Gorey Pier at six o'clock in the morning. We wait to do it. Now, we do that. Are we going to be able to tell these people "Don't go there at six o'clock. Can you go there at ten? Can you go there at ..." which we do with them at the moment individually because, like the nursing homes, we keep well away, Gorey care with residents, we keep well away hotels and like the campsite as well. I know its personal, but, I mean to say, you don't want to ...

The problem we get at the moment, talk about consultation, we've got this road sweeper thing and I know you've got to -- this is about waste management -- but the problem I can see is if they pass home at half past five in the morning and I know they've got to start early and I have

tried to say “Look, I’m running a business. To be woken up at half past five once a month or whatever it is with the road sweeper, why don’t you come back at nine?” They are still working at nine o’clock, ten o’clock. That is why. Are we going to be able to transfer? We say “Look, don’t go to Gorey Pier until nine o’clock in the morning.” Are they going to do that? If they are not, we’re going to have big problems.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: So if I can just finish on that.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: So broadly, you are stating that, as far as the Constables are concerned, the provision of the service that is undertaken by the parishes is more directly tailored to the needs of the parishioners.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes, yes, definitely.

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: And that wouldn’t actually be exemplified if Public Services introduced an Island-wide system.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: We are quite happy, and I think all of us are.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Baudains?

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Thank you. I have a two part question. If I understand you correctly, what you are saying is that the parish’s collection would be adjusted to dovetail into what is required by Public Services at Bellozanne or whatever.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: So you would fit in to them.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah, provided ... we would have to know the cost and who is going to pay for what, you know. I think Senator Vibert was saying, you know “Are you prepared to do this bit and they will finance that bit”, like you were talking about the bits of it. That is fine, but, you know, I’m not going to commit myself to say “We will do everything, provide the bins, provide the wagons, provide this.”

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: No. The way I see it is that there would be discussion of the way forwards and where you are aiming.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Fine.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: And then each party would work out how you work together. If I could go to the front of the submission, the first three entries of the first three minutes, we read here about a recycling proposition.

DEPUTY HILL: What month are you looking at?

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: I am looking at the 20th March and the ----

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: 1996.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: And the 9th October and the 13th November, all 1996. It seems to me that this really is the answer to what Public Services say is the stumbling block. What became of this proposal?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think ----

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Why did it not progress?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I think -- can you help me, Sue -- I think Mr Canning was involved in where we parked ----

SENATOR VIBERT: The weighbridge.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: The weighbridge.

SENATOR VIBERT: The Island site.

MRS DE GRUCHY: The Island site.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: The Island site, and I think there was a bit of a problem. My understanding then was that I think they found it difficult to find alternative places to use.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: But the problem wasn't with the parishes.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Oh no, no, no, no.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: There was no particular difficulty?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Can you please allow the witness to answer the questions because this is all being taped. The interjections make it very difficult when this is being typed up later.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Sorry.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: I had finished my question. Thank you.

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes. On the question of ... really what you have told us was that the

stumbling block was not about recycling or separating, the stumbling block was an all Island collection service that they wanted to impose on the parishes. Really what you were saying was “Hold on, let’s have a look at what this all means. What are the financial implications, etc, etc?” Whereas we were given the impression that the stumbling block was relative to recycling and separation. That doesn’t seem to be the case. Okay. Thank you.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Senator Le Maistre.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: The plan, as you well know -- it has been stated many times -- is to have a debate very early in next year. On the Waste Strategy and making a decision on the possibility of an incinerator, although we are told that everything is still open. Realistically, do you think that it is feasible for Public Services to meet with the Connétables between now and the time that a projet could be lodged, which I imagine is the beginning of January, to achieve an understanding, let alone an agreement?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: We are meeting with them on ----

MRS DE GRUCHY: 13th December.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: 13th December. But, with Christmas coming, I can’t see that there will be ... I mean, you are talking about almost a day there.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: And more.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: That is what I am saying.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: Because the whole principle of waste management depends on to what extent the recycling operation will be successful. It seems to me that until there is that kind of understanding and commitment, it is very difficult to come up with a strategy that embraces that key element. So you would think that that is going to be difficult to achieve?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I can’t see it, no.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Could you give any indication, even if you started talks on 13th December, when you would probably be able to come to a conclusion?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Um ...

DEPUTY RONDEL: Weeks or months?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Senator Ozouf asked me, I think it was, last week if he could come

to talk to us. I think it was last week.

MRS DE GRUCHY: Either that or the week before last week.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: The week before. We had already drawn up our agenda basically for December, so I said “Yes, we will fit you in”, but, you know, we can’t ... From what he was saying, he is going to broadly outline the proposals, I suppose, but to give it serious thought, we can’t fit in a day because there are other things we have got to discuss in December which we have got to do.

DEPUTY RONDEL: So you would be talking about the early part of next year?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yeah, definitely.

DEPUTY RONDEL: So would it more than likely be February and March before you come to your conclusions than, say, January?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I haven’t spoken to anybody, as you know.

DEPUTY RONDEL: That is correct.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I would envisage that after he has left us on the 13th we would have to get together again and put bullet points and then have a specific day for that, you know, have a brief discussion and then fix a whole day to discuss this project, you know.

SENATOR VIBERT: And if you wanted to visit France, for instance, that will also need time. It is a big project. It is a huge project.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I can’t see it. I can’t see we can do it.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Okay, that’s fine. The reason for putting the question is because the EPS, Environment & Public Services, would like our response in January and obviously if you haven’t been consulted and you won’t be able to do all your work, including your visits to the centres out of the Island, it won’t be feasible that this will actually happen probably until late February/early March.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I suppose Senator Ozouf might say “We haven’t consulted with the Connétables”, which he will do on 13th December, but as far as I am concerned, he hasn’t, but we won’t have made a clear decision and we won’t even have discussed it.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Deputy Hill?

DEPUTY HILL: No, I think it is difficult because unfortunately you haven't had an opportunity to discuss it.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: As I say, all I can say about **this** one is that I saw it this morning and I see "*September*" here. I was away in September/beginning of October. I can't say if the other Connétables have had it. I can't say that, but I personally haven't had it. I haven't gone through that.

SENATOR VIBERT: I think the crucial element is that the Comité of Connétables was not consulted in even the preparation of that document, because there is nothing in the minutes to indicate anything other than in September of 2003.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Could you confirm or otherwise, please, that the Comité of Connétables, either through yourself or your officer, have actually been consulted in that particular document of September 2004?

MRS DE GRUCHY: Unless the consultation formed part of the discussion in the minutes, which you have had, there is no further discussion.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Thank you. Deputy Duhamel?

DEPUTY DUHAMEL: Yes, just one final point on that. If indeed it could be shown that, as a result of the discussions that will inevitably take place with the Comité des Connétables about potential recycling initiatives, that the overall cost of the Waste Management Strategy in the Island could be reduced, would you be in favour, on behalf of the Comité, to actually support the move to actually delay the project until such a time as a proper consideration has been given to establish what the sensible option would be, or would you prefer to actually back the discussion of the proposition in the House at an earlier date, where those savings haven't been addressed?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: I would be more than happy to defer everything until we get to know exactly where we are going. I think somebody said on Monday or Tuesday, you know, when you build a boat, you build the hull and you launch it. If it floats, then you build. I think it is the same thing with this. Let them tell us exactly what they want and see if we can accommodate it parish-wide, but I am sure we want to keep as much as we can in the parishes. We have done it for yonks of years and we can continue, but one has got to be very careful that

they are not going to burden us with extra costs beforehand. You know, we have got to be prepared to pull our weight, but, you know, we don't want to get caught in something where they are going to turn round and say ...

DEPUTY RONDEL: Any further questions, gentlemen, please? Deputy Baudains?

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Thank you. The only query I have relates to a previous question from the Senator. In your minutes of 1st November 2001, you received the Chief Officer designate of Public Services and there was a presentation on the Waste Strategy and waste minimisation and such like. I take it that, since that date, there have been no further meetings either at departmental or committee level.

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: There haven't.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: So it has not been progressed?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: No.

DEPUTY BAUDAINS: Thank you.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Can you confirm that you said no?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Sorry, yes, no, no.

DEPUTY RONDEL: Thank you.

SENATOR VIBERT: Other than that one in 2003?

CONSTABLE GERMAIN: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: If there are no further questions, I would like to thank the Connétable and Mrs De Gruchy for attending. Thank you very much on behalf of the Panel.

SENATOR VIBERT: And lunch is on St Martins.

SENATOR LE MAISTRE: That is going to be transcribed.

SENATOR VIBERT: Yes.

DEPUTY RONDEL: When will you gentlemen learn not to interrupt?

- - - - -