



Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel

THURSDAY, 16th APRIL 2015

Panel:

Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville (Chairman)

Connétable M.J. Paddock of St. Ouen

Deputy S.M. Brée of St. Clement

Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary

Witnesses:

Mr. M. Stevens - St. Helier Boat Owners' Association

Mr. G. Feltham - Rozel Boat Owners' Association

Mr. R. Thompson - St. Aubin's Boat Owners' Association

Mr. J. Barber - St. Helier Yacht Club

Mr. C. Parlett - St. Helier Yacht Club

Lt. A. Bonjour - Jersey Sea Cadets

Mr. S. Carter - Bonne Nuit Boat Owners' Association

Dr. R. Perkins - St. Catherine's Sailing Club

Mrs. L. Perkins - St. Catherine's Sailing Club

Mr. C. Russell - Jersey Rowing Club.

[11:00]

Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville (Chairman):

Welcome to the Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel meeting. Before we start, in the interest of openness and transparency, I would just like to declare that David Johnson is a member of the Rowing Club, Constable Paddock is a member of the St. Helier Yacht Club, I am also a member of the St. Helier Yacht Club and a former member of St. Catherine's Sailing Club. My sister and her family are active members and Dr. Perkins is actually my cousin, just so that everybody knows that. I think you own a boat, Deputy?

Deputy S.M. Brée:

I have mucked around in boats for years.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What I intend to do is to go around each club and give you a couple of minutes for you to tell us a little bit about your club, how many members you have, the relationship you have with Ports and anything else you think that is positive about Ports' incorporation or any concerns you have should the Ports be incorporated. So perhaps if I could start ... I know Dr. and Mrs. Perkins have a flight to catch so we will perhaps start with St. Catherine's Sailing Club. So, Mrs. Perkins, if you would like to introduce yourself and tell us a little bit about your club.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

I am Louise Perkins. I am the principal of the training centre based at St. Catherine's. I am a past Commodore, as is my husband, who has also been associated with the club for the last 30 years. St. Catherine's Sailing Club was primarily set up to be a dinghy sailing club - family dinghy club - set up over 60 years ago down at St. Catherine's Bay in what was the old carpenter's shed. In the 1980s the club members financed an extension to the club and the club has remained in that state ever since. Initially we were just racing, we just used to do racing. About 10, 15 years ago we decided to start a teaching programme. We followed the R.Y.A. (Royal Yachting Association) structure and have ... the training has improved and numbers have increased over the years. Five, 6, 7 years ago we were very fortunate to receive some money which enabled us to set up an RYA training centre down at the club. This was for power boating only. It was not for sailing, so we continued to do our "learn to sail" and under the RYA we were able to teach power boating. These courses attract not only our members but also members of several other clubs and associations that come to us for instruction. After that we then became an R.Y.A. centre for first aid. Again, for members and again outside organisations. Last year we were delighted that we were given recognition to become the R.Y.A. official training centre for sail as well as for the power boating and the first aid. The club has continued to grow. It is very active. Last year we put over 300 people through one of our training courses. We train all year round. The outset for the dinghy sailing ... dinghy racing, the outlook for this is that we now regularly on a Sunday during the

summer months have in excess of 20-plus boats down at the club, so we are a very healthy club in that respect. We have got a fantastic committee with social events and whatever. Do you want to know the position with Ports; is that what ...?

The Connétable of Grouville:

Yes, please, if you can.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

The position with Ports at the moment is that we have been without a lease now for a couple of years. We have had a lot of negotiations with Ports and, in fairness, just recently they have listened to the concerns we have raised with regards to renewing monies. They have come forward with a proposal ... a heads of agreement and some of the items that we were not happy about in the heads of agreement they have come back to us, but at present we have not seen sight of the lease. So going forward if things are equal to what they have proposed we are hopefully going to have a 9-year lease. The committee at the club is split a little bit on this but one of the concerns that we have going forward is that although Ports are prepared ... they have increased our rent from £3,500, which is what we have been paying, and they are now going to propose that we are paying a rent of £15,700 a year, so they have gone from a reasonable rent to a commercial value rent. They have put a commercial value on what we do down there. But as part of their corporate and social responsibility they have said that they will give us a grant of sponsorship to the effect of £12,000, which effectively will bring our rent back down to the £3,500. In the heads of terms it shows that they are suggesting that the rent will go up with the cost of living every 3 years and where the disquiet is at the club is there is no commitment other than they say they will keep our rent affordable as to what will happen to that sponsorship. There is no guarantee that the sponsorship will continue and keeping the rent affordable is a bit of a subjective ... I am not sure what that means. Whether they will think that we can afford £7,000 or £10,000 or whatever. That is the position. But, as I say, we do not have a lease at the moment.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Did you mention that you have done some extensions which were ... or an extension that the Sailing Club paid for itself?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Have you any idea how much that was?

Dr. R. Perkins:

That was the early 1980s so I do not know ...

The Connétable of Grouville:

But the club has reinvested itself in the building?

Dr. R. Perkins:

Absolutely. I mean it is over twice the area that it originally was, the old carpenter's workshop, so that is now a smaller proportion of it than the building that we do have now.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Who is responsible for repairs?

Dr. R. Perkins:

We do not have a lease at the moment so ... it used to be that Ports were responsible for the external. We were responsible for the internal. That did change in that we are now responsible for external and internal although there is some ... not quite sure of the position with ... if there is any weather problems and things like that whether Ports would still be responsible for any sort of water ingress. We have got a problem at the moment with some leaking tiles and Ports have said they will come down and look to see what the problem is. We are awaiting that.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you think that the lower rent of under £4,000 covers the cost to Ports for their maintenance of the club?

Dr. R. Perkins:

To my knowledge they have not spent anything on maintenance because at the moment, because we do not have any lease, we have been maintaining it throughout so, yes, at the moment we do not ask anything in the way of maintenance. We are doing it all. But since these new heads of terms ... that is why we are now seeing what their position will be as far as the maintenance on the external is.

The Connétable of Grouville:

If you had to pay the full £15,000 or £15,000-plus rent would the club be able to do that?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

No.

Dr. R. Perkins:

No, absolutely no. No. And at the moment they have acknowledged that that is just ... that is a commercial rate. We do not have ... apart from the club members we do not have any other income. We do not have a bar. We do not have any other source of income. Historically when we ... we have always just sort of survived, but survived hand to mouth sort of thing in the past when finances were not looking so good for replacing guard boats. We did at one stage up the fees more significantly and the following year we had a decrease in income because lots of ... we do have a lot of old members who just keep up their membership as a thank you really. But when we upped the fees the membership dropped and our income dropped. So I do not think we can raise funds by increasing our membership because we do not have anything else to offer. We do not have a bar. That would not be sustainable. But, to be fair, I think they acknowledge that. But what the situation would be is our concern.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are there any other facilities you would like down there that the Ports could maybe, you know, or are you happy with all your club and what is provided for you or what is available to you?

Dr. R. Perkins:

One of our problems, which the Ports are well aware of, is without having a lease or certainly a longer term lease we cannot spend money on the club of any amount because there is no security. As a committee we have looked at certain improvements that we would like to be able to do but until we are sure what the situation is we feel that we cannot go ahead, but certainly there are a lot of improvements that we would like to be able to make.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are there any protections that you think could be put in place that would put your minds at peace?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

In the lease you mean?

The Connétable of Grouville:

Yes.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

I think the problem with the lease is having that £15,000 having that commercial rent in the lease and knowing that that is going to go up by cost of living every 3 years, knowing that they have got this corporate social responsibility, which they have acknowledged and they will give us that, but there is no guarantee. There is no guarantee that that is fundamentally linked. That the

net affordable rent will be in the region of what they are paying at the moment, which is what we can afford.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Does anybody else have any questions?

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Just to clarify this commercial rent of £15,700. You say it is offset by a grant.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Who is that from?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

That is from Ports.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Ports is giving the grant?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes. So they are putting the rents up but they are giving us ... it is corporate social responsibility. This is the new term that we have learnt. That they will give us this but there is no ... when you look at the heads of terms there is no ...

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay, I understand that.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

If I can just ask a question. Just to clarify the situation. The heads of terms at the moment is asking you to enter into a 9-year lease. Is that correct?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes, it is.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

At a rental for certainly the first year of ... is it £15,800 or £15,600?

Dr. R. Perkins:

Just under £15,700.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

£15,800, I think it is.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

£15,800 we'll say. They are offsetting that commercial rent by offering you a grant for the sailing centre, is that correct? Or is it just a general grant to the club?

[11:15]

Mrs. L. Perkins:

That was one area where they did come back to us. Initially they linked it to training. They said we had to provide X amount of hours. We had to maintain this training at a level comparable to what we did last year, which we felt completely uncomfortable with because you cannot ... we have had a good year but you could not. So we did go back with suggested wording that they would take out this link to training, which they have done. Now they have said that this grant would keep the rent at an affordable rent.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

But only for 3 years?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Guaranteed.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Yes. It would keep it at the £3,500 for the first 3 years.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

For the first 3 years.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

Then the rent of £15,000, £16,000 would go up cost of living but the sponsorship would be open to negotiation with their aim of keeping it at a level we could afford.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

So let me just the question hypothetically. If, say, after 3 years the sponsorship ceased and the rental was remaining at £15,800 would the club survive?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

No.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

That is what I wanted just to make clear. So basically you have 3 years where you know the club can survive. After that you do not know what is going to happen.

Mrs. L. Perkins:

No.

Dr. R. Perkins:

It is a difficult one because this is all in heads of terms. We have not seen the lease. We were hoping that we would have had the lease by now. In the heads of terms it does state that they will keep it at an affordable level. So although it does not now ... I do not know who says what is affordable. There is a clause in it that says that at any time after the 3 years if ... because it is a 9-year lease, if we do not ... if we want to we can terminate the lease. Why would we? So that we are not stuck with £16,000. But at the moment, as I say, they are ... we have got to be fair, they are saying they will keep it affordable.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

But there is no definition of affordable to them?

Dr. R. Perkins:

No.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

The building work that you said that you did some years ago, what was the terms and conditions of that with Harbours because the building that you paid for yourself, so what was the conditions? Was it that all that extension work would be maintained by yourselves? Do you know?

Dr. R. Perkins:

I am afraid I do not know.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

So can you remind me, when was that done again?

Mrs. L. Perkins:

In the 1980s.

Dr. R. Perkins:

Early 1980s.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

If I can just say something, I was a member of the club in the early 1980s and the building work was funded and carried out by members of the club, and I think the intention at the time was that the club would maintain whatever extensions they had made. I, myself, built concrete walls.

[Laughter]

The Connétable of Grouville:

I am conscious of the time so thank you for your input. Obviously we have noted what you said and we will take your concerns on board.

Dr. R. Perkins:

We would like to stay a little bit longer if we can just to hear other people here.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Please do. Mr. Bonjour, from the Jersey Sea Cadets, could you do likewise? Explain a little bit about your club and what your relationship is with Ports in the past.

Lt. A. Bonjour:

Jersey Sea Cadets have been here since 1949, when we were first affiliated to what was then known as the Navy League. That has moved on. In today's society we are now part of the Marine Society and Sea Cadets, which is the parent charity. You generally see some 400 sea cadet units across the length and breadth of the United Kingdom, as far south as Malta and the Falkland Islands and of course the Channel Islands. We are currently a unit of 67 cadets and some 23 uniformed members of staff with 19 other helpers, as it were, who provide ad hoc assistance through the course of the year depending on the activities we are undertaking. So in total strength on my books currently there are 112 members of the cadet organisation. We have been housed at Fort Regent since the unit first came into being in 1949. Originally what was the old World War 2 German officers mess in the moat of the Fort and subsequently in 1970 the building that we are now in was purpose built for us because of other developments that were going on in the Fort at

that time. That was a building we moved into in January 1971. We contributed one-third of the cost of that building, the States providing the funding for the other two-thirds, and a promise at that time and, I think, earlier than that, that there would always be a home for us or that the States would ensure that we were housed or homed somewhere, if not there. Obviously things have moved on. In terms of the Ports of Jersey, I mean we have an excellent relationship with the Port but probably around this table we have got the least current draw on any resources from Ports. We are not a tenant of theirs in any way, shape or form, other than they provide space for our boats in the marina at La Collette, and we keep some 6 or 7 boats down there depending on the time of year throughout the season. They only come out in the winter months for a very brief period. Beyond that we have space at St. Aubin's for our sailing fleet which currently comprises of 16 dinghies, catamarans of various sorts, and we have use of an old bunker out there to store masts, sails, equipment that we use as part of the sailing. In more recent times obviously because of the proposals now to move the unit from Fort Regent, and that has been ongoing for the last 20-plus years but it has come to a head in more recent times, and we are now working fairly closely with the Ports of Jersey in relation to options for the development of the new unit at some location within the Ports. What we do not know at this point of time is where that will be. Over the years, the last 20 years, there have been a number of schemes that have been considered and looked at, some of which has gone to sort of initial planning stage, but nothing other than the original plans that were approved by Planning 20 years ago on the Les Galots site ... 15 years ago on the Les Galots site and we were ready to develop at that point in time with the blessing of Ports but then funding was withdrawn at that point, which meant that we could not go ahead. The more recent scheme clearly, I think everybody is aware of the current history in relation to that, and we are now back to square one where we know the Fort still want us out and we at the moment have nowhere else to go but are talking with Ports in relation to options within their footprint somewhere. The big issue for us will be the funding of that new unit. The promise of the States in relation to ensuring we will always have a home is a debatable issue and with the current state of finances I am not sure that there are funding options available currently, and that was the reason for the original scheme that has fallen flat. If the unit has to fund its own bills, clearly there are relationship issues there between the unit and Ports, but I cannot comment on that at this point in time because it is an unknown aspect really. We are hopeful that we will or are making progress. We are currently working very closely I know with the Rowing Club and with Ports of Jersey in relation to what we can now do.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Thank you. Do you pay market value rents for your property?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

We do not. We are very fortunate. We pay £100 a year and it is a peppercorn rent for where we are ...

The Connétable of Grouville:

That is for Fort Regent?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

... in that regard. The question of lease, it was interesting to hear from the sailing club because it was back in the early 1970s when the unit that we are now in was first built. There was certainly correspondence between our management committee of the day and the committee responsible for the Fort at that time with regard to bringing forward a lease that agreed maintenance and other aspects of the tenancy.

The Connétable of Grouville:

The Fort obviously is not part of Ports.

Lt. A. Bonjour:

No, I appreciate that.

The Connétable of Grouville:

But you may well end up with Ports.

Lt. A. Bonjour:

That is right.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What would you expect them to pay at market value rent for your premises?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

I think it depends on who pays for the building to some extent. I think that is a discussion for the future, which is why I say I cannot really comment on that aspect. If we end up having to raise funds to build a unit, clearly it is a question of the value of the land that that unit would then sit on, wherever that might be. That is the discussion we have yet to have.

The Connétable of Grouville:

But if Ports were to build it would you then be able to afford the market value rent for premises that you would want?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

No, is the short answer. Our running costs currently are about £25,000 per annum. We get a £10,000 grant from the Home Affairs Department, which is much appreciated, but considerably less than the £18,000 we used to get, and therefore any other funds are funds that we have to raise through our own efforts or through the generosity of other institutions.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You said you do have some moorings and you have got a unit at St. Aubin's. Do you pay market value rent for those?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

No, we do not. That is again the generosity of Ports. Storage facilities for the boats are on the harbour at St. Aubin's Fort. They are not under cover or anything. They are just out there in the open space. The bunker that we have, again we do not pay rent in relation to that. So it is with the blessing of Ports that we occupy that currently. We have been able to do the ... with the assistance of the Army Reserve we have been able to fit that out appropriately for our purposes. So we are very fortunate. That is why I said we have a good relationship in that regard and are very grateful for the charities they show to us.

The Connétable of Grouville:

But if they decided to charge you for moorings of your guard boats and for the facilities you have at St. Aubin's you would find that difficult?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

It would be very difficult for us and we have to consider what we could then do.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Got any questions anybody?

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Can I just clarify the extent of your activities in various places; the publicity would possibly be about your clubhouse. Now you have got this at St. Aubin's with the intention that they will continue, whatever, is that right?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

Yes. One of the issues for us, I mean our sailing fleet is out there because we have got ... we cannot put it anywhere else in town. What that does do is it limits the ability of the unit to sail on a regular basis. Clearly we can motorboat and row out of St. Helier because La Collette is very

easily accessible to us and we are always afloat there. St. Aubin's Fort, you will know the extent and arrangement of tides out there. We can only sail easily, as it were, on the top of the tides, which are a couple of hours either side of the high water mark, so again you are limited immediately through the course of the year as to how many opportunities you have to get cadets out on the water. The other option is that if the tides are out we have to trail the boats and of course that eats into the time available to go boating and undertake the activities that we are there to do.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

So if you had a separate clubhouse the other side of the harbour, whether it is Port Galots or somewhere else, you would ... would the focus of your activity switch then to that side?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

I think if it were possible to switch the focus, then yes. Because if we could get sailing boats back into the harbour area somewhere then that would allow us to be on the water that much more frequently and directly on to the water. We are based ... our base and the core of our cadets come from effectively the central Parishes here of St. Helier, St. Saviour and St. Clement, and it is in that very large built-up area. More than half of the cadets come from those 3 Parishes. All the others come from outlying Parishes. One of the issues for us is about the ease of access to the unit because we have some cadets that cannot make it on some parade nights because they ... parents are working, they cannot transport them. So the ability to walk and easily get to the unit is an important aspect.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

As the water borne activities are you saying it is mainly focused on sailing at the moment and again will it ... if you were moved elsewhere would you then bring rowing into the equation or how do you see it ...

Lt. A. Bonjour:

We row now. We have rowed for years. Again one of the areas for development, the Sea Cadets have more recently gone with the national governing bodies for the relevant sports. In terms of sailing and power boating, we have been R.Y.A. accredited and we are a recognised training centre, and have been for many years. Rowing until recently has been done on the auspices of the Sea Cadet Regulations but now it is very much done under the ... Clive ...

Mr. C. Russell:

British Rowing Association.

Lt. A. Bonjour:

We are moving towards that sort of activity rather than the big heavy old rowing boats that - I know Constable Paddock will remember - that we still use. So we are trying to progress and advance what we do but we need to have the right facilities in order to do that. But based in and around the port area will significantly enhance that and take that forward.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Can I just ask a couple of things? Where does the shed at Pier Road fit into what you have been explained before, and also do you feel that sharing accommodation with somebody would be practical for your organisation?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

There has been a lot of debate about the sharing aspect. If I can deal with that side of it first, new build units now in the U.K. (United Kingdom) are done on the basis of community sharing to some extent but are very much controlled by the unit itself.

[11:30]

Because if you cannot control it then that creates difficulties in terms of what you can set out, lay out, leave out and the activities that you do. Not just the Sunday and Wednesday morning parade activity. Those are our 2 parades. But we are Monday nights, we are weekends, and other events take place during holiday time. But where possible units are encouraged now to share community ... the facility with others, and we do do that, and other clubs do come and use the unit on occasions for their own activities. In terms of Pier Road, again we are very fortunate with the support we get through the States departments. I am going to say that that is now T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services) that have provided that facility for us for a significant number of years. We do all of our boat maintenance there and we have volunteers who come in and just do everything for free. Again, without that, apart from the engines from other boats, which have to be professionally serviced, the maintenance activity we would not be able to afford. So a great deal of use. If you go past, I know you see empty trailers there, one rib and a trailer full of canoes or kayaks and a couple of smaller boats at the back of the shed. So again it is used very, very much throughout the course of the year.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

But you are not in any pressure to get out of there though?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

Not under any pressure at all and that would be a significant loss to us if ever we go. Again, I would not know where we would or how we would cope in that regard. Prior to gaining that building we were in farmyards or sheds, wherever we could find, for many, many years.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you pay rent for that building then?

Lt. A. Bonjour:

Not to the best of my knowledge but I would have to check that with the treasurer.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Thank you very much. Mr. Feltham, Rozel Boat Owners'.

Mr. G. Feltham:

Hello. Yes, we have a good level of communication with the Ports of Jersey. Membership is pretty strong and it is always growing. Trying to encourage more of the neighbours to still come on board. I think just the general consensus is the Boat Owners would like to know if mooring fees are ever going to go up and what level they will go to.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What arrangement do you have with Ports? Do you organise ... does your Association organise the moorings on behalf of the Ports?

Mr. G. Feltham:

Yes, the committee basically manages the mooring names and numbers and you basically register and then just it floats down until you get the position, and it just goes from there.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Is your harbour full? Are there spare moorings or is it ...?

Mr. G. Feltham:

No, it is full. There is a waiting list but it fluctuates on the times. It could be 4 years, 7 years. I think I waited 7 years for my mooring.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What are the mooring charges?

Mr. G. Feltham:

I could not comment. I have not got that information in front of me.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do they vary depending where you are in the harbour?

Mr. G. Feltham:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

They do. So do you know if they are market value, for example?

Mr. G. Feltham:

No, I have not got that information. Sorry, I have come badly prepared.

The Connétable of Grouville:

No, that is all right.

Mr. G. Feltham:

I brought the biscuits though. **[Laughter]**

The Connétable of Grouville:

If the harbour is full and there is a waiting list and Ports chose to do so, they could generate more income because obviously there is a demand that is greater than the supply at the moment.

Mr. G. Feltham:

I think to where the moorings have ... they slightly encroach the beach area that the general public use so we cannot fit moorings further over.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Sorry?

Mr. G. Feltham:

So where the moorings are at the moment and then where the general public use the beach and the slipway the moorings cannot move over any more and I do not think we want to either.

The Connétable of Grouville:

No. But the point I was making was that they could put mooring charges up because there are plenty of people who want them.

Mr. G. Feltham:

Yes. But we do not want a harbour full of Sunseekers and jet boats and all that.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you have any questions?

The Deputy of St. Mary:

What is the arrangement with the Ports on the tenure?

Mr. G. Feltham:

We have a meeting with Myra Shacklady and also with Frank Walker next month, I think it is, so they are going to update us on what ...

The Deputy of St. Mary:

But at the moment though it is ...?

Mr. G. Feltham:

We just communicate when we need to.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So you effectively manage the moorings?

Mr. G. Feltham:

Not me personally.

The Connétable of Grouville:

No, but your Association manages the moorings on behalf of Ports and you pay them once a year or whatever, is it?

Mr. G. Feltham:

It is, yes. Pretty straightforward.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Have you got anything else?

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Maintenance of the facilities at Rozel, and including the maintenance of the pier itself, obviously that falls under the ...

Mr. G. Feltham:

Ports of Jersey.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

... historic harbours classification. Do you feel that there is work needed on the pier at the moment at all?

Mr. G. Feltham:

I believe we have got an electric crane coming this year so that will be installed. The actual harbour itself has got a grade 1 listing on it with Planning and if they are to do any sort of work on the road or anything like that it needs planning permission I understand. But generally the way everything is, it is all right. I think there has been a study done or a survey done on the actual condition of the harbour itself similar to what was done at Gorey Harbour and St. Aubin's, but I have not seen that report.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Your Association, to have a mooring down there do you have to be a member of the Rozel Boat Owners' Association, and also where do you guys meet? Have you got any ...

Mr. G. Feltham:

No. No.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

No particular club ... not clubhouse but any ...

Mr. G. Feltham:

We have got the barrack down there that we have to mingle or we just all meet each other in time and a committee comes together at one or other's houses. That is set down day and time and we just discuss options on what is happening.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

What is the sort of membership? Is it just a token membership or ...?

Mr. G. Feltham:

I think the membership is £15 a year.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

That money goes to what? Social stuff or running of facilities there, what ...?

Mr. G. Feltham:

It goes to the membership and then we make a contribution each year to the R.N.L.I. (Royal National Lifeboat Institution) and to the Channel Island Air Search as well.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

But do you have to be a member of the Association to have a mooring there?

Mr. G. Feltham:

No.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

You do not?

Mr. G. Feltham:

No. There are ...

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

So an individual would still have to come through to the committee for a mooring space but they do not have to be a member of your ...?

Mr. G. Feltham:

That is correct.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You have got new facilities going in at the moment in the form of a crane.

Mr. G. Feltham:

I believe so, yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Who do you expect to pay for that; Harbours? Or do you expect them to get that out of the fees that they charge for the moorings?

Mr. G. Feltham:

I believe that is going to come out of the bank(?) and it is basically going to be drawn off the fees of what we contribute as moorings. At the moment I understand that the inside mooring you pay more charge for that on a yearly basis and you have the privilege of an outside mooring. You cannot have an outside mooring unless you have an inside mooring as well. So that is how it is all policed.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you have any idea how many moorings there are there?

Mr. G. Feltham:

I think we have got 41 moorings. I would have to check.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Just one last thing: if you had a ... you have obviously got a good relationship with Ports. If you had a grievance how do you think that would be handled in the future with Ports as opposed to with ...

Mr. G. Feltham:

If we had a problem?

The Connétable of Grouville:

Yes.

Mr. G. Feltham:

I could not tell you until we got there.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Okay, thank you. Mr. Stevens.

Mr. M. Stevens:

Good morning.

The Connétable of Grouville:

St. Helier Boat Owners.

Mr. M. Stevens:

St. Helier's Boat Owners' Association was formed 23 years ago. I was a founder member because we had concerns of the dilapidated state of the harbours, especially around La Collette area before a lot of the development took place. We met with Captain Roy Bullen, who was harbourmaster at the time, and he listened to us very well and dealt with a number of issues but he said: "I do not want to be knocked on the door every week with individuals coming in to complain. You want to go away and form an association." That is exactly what we did. We have grown in strength. We have over 500 members. We are the largest boat owners' association in Jersey and, I believe, the cheapest as far as subs go because we have never put it up above £5. We contribute every year to the R.N.L.I. and Channel Island Air Search out of our funds, and as far as meeting rooms go and A.G.M.s (annual general meetings) we are very fortunate that the Commodore and Executive of St. Helier Yacht Club allow us to use the facilities of the building. Our working relationship with Jersey Harbours I have to say, not that we always see eye to eye on every issue, is first class, from Doug Bannister right down through Myra Shacklady, Mike Tait, the Marine Manager, and his staff. In fact last year we entered into an initiative with his marina staff on a Sunday morning where we went right through the harbours looking at dinghies that were seaworthy and not seaworthy and how they were moored, and a number were removed, unmarked dinghies taken away to be claimed and marked properly. So we have a very good working relationship. We meet regularly. We have a good response, even by email my committee will get a response very quickly. We have had some quite quick meetings when we have had something quite urgent to discuss. But we see ourselves not really as a shareholder like St. Helier Yacht Club and Gorey, et cetera. We are the voice of the boater, representing them. As far as mooring charges go, we do believe quite openly that Jersey is expensive. We are considerably more expensive than Guernsey. In fact very nearly double. We are a lot more expensive than France but in our negotiations we have had everything is compared to the south coast of the U.K. The big difference is Jersey is a monopoly. You cannot pick up and move to another marina. On the south coast if the marina you are in you think is too expensive you look for a cheaper one and you have the option maybe to move 20 miles down the coast and you might find something that suits your needs better. Nevertheless I go back to the point, we have a good communication record with them. An example being that 3 years ago Jersey Harbours spent about £150,000 on revamping the South Pier area. I would not quite call it a dredge, I would call it a mini scrape to get rid of some of the mud. They laid new ground chains, put the moorings on buoys same as Commercial Buildings end, which has been a great success. A small literally walk width dinghy pontoon put alongside the wall for the smaller boats and I believe the overall cost was in the region of about £150,000. However, we did pick up the cost because moorings were increased, and that went Island-wide on all drying berths, an increase of 60 per cent over a 3-year period. In fact we dragged it to 4 years. It was 20 per cent, 20 per cent and because we were getting so many complaints we negotiated and it was agreed that the last 20 per cent increase was spread over 2

years of 10 and 10 per cent. One could justify the increase on the drying moorings because you would have to say that they were cheap in the first place. They probably are at a more realistic rate now. As far as incorporation goes, we met twice with Frank Walker, a member of the shadow board, and Myra Shacklady. If we are to believe what we have been told, which we have in writing, the boat owner has nothing to worry about. Mooring fees, marina fees will not increase more than the R.P.I. (retail price index). We will wait and see. On face value, we have nothing to worry about. The one concern we do have, and members of the panel touched on it, is the fact which is current, before they are incorporated, we feel it is incorrect, it should not be, that the historic harbours, the total maintenance if something major goes wrong, an example being Gorey at the moment, in the region of £3 million. A couple of years ago, St. Aubin's, £1.5 million and prior to that, at the end of St. Catherine's, which I believe the States did pay for before a change in policy. If something like that happens again or another one comes along, that is all coming out of the big piggy bank of the incorporated Ports of Jersey. Now our members feel very strongly that that should not be the case. General maintenance of those areas; yes. No problem at all. A few stones, a bit of pointing, that type of thing, but a major issue such as Gorey at the moment, the States should be look at that as financing it, because somewhere along the line within the Ports of Jersey that money has got to be found, a bit on the commercial side or a bit more on the leisure side, at the end of the day that is where it is coming from. That would be our one major concern that that is still going to be. The other issue is, which is a loss-maker, but we openly accept that because it is maritime related, is Jersey Coastguard, which is a non-profit making organisation, a necessity we must have. Ports of Jersey are going to cover the cost of that, understandably. No complaint whatsoever. The concern is that we feel quite strongly that the Ports of Jersey should not really be covering the cost of major issues on historic harbours.

[11:45]

The Connétable of Grouville:

The reason you are saying that is because you think that if they had a big problem at one of the harbours they would have to put up mooring fees to help cover it?

Mr. M. Stevens:

It is going to have to come from somewhere. We have had a very fortunate winter. T.T.S. suffered the winter before last with sea walls and things like that because of the storms. You could have the end of La Rocque pier washed away, or in Gorey I believe that would have happened if the work was not taking place that is going on now.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You said that you considered the fees in the marinas to be high. Do you still think the fees in the dry harbours are high or do you think they are at a reasonable level?

Mr. M. Stevens:

I think it was a very big increase but bearing in mind that they did do a considerable amount of work they were probably a realistic figure providing they keep to the R.P.I. increase, which I do not think anybody can really complain about.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you consider the drying harbour fees to be cheaper in Jersey than in the U.K. or are they similar?

Mr. M. Stevens:

It is certainly more expensive than France and they are certainly more expensive than Guernsey. On comparison with Guernsey we are looking at very nearly double the price, whether it be marinas or drying berths, and I think Julian will bear that out. It is something we have looked at quite closely. What we have been told even with incorporation, there will be no intention to drop marina fees to make them cheaper. They do hope to offer more for your money. Possibly some add-ons in other facilities, maybe a cheaper lift out with a hoist and those type of things. Things may come about but there certainly is not any intention to lower fees.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are the marinas and harbours full?

Mr. M. Stevens:

Certainly Elizabeth Marina does have vacancies. Two, 3 years ago that certainly was not the case. You would have been on a waiting list for some time. I do believe some of the bigger boats, and this bears out the fact the bigger the boat money probably is not quite the same problem as to the working man. Nine, 10, 11, 12-metre boats, yes there is a bit of a waiting list. It is the smaller boats that you cannot get a marina berth available at this time.

The Connétable of Grouville:

The drying harbours, are they full?

Mr. M. Stevens:

Drying harbours I think generally around the Island, yes, you could probably, if you scouted all the moorings, find 8 or 10 here and there but generally they are full.

The Connétable of Grouville:

I was really thinking about St. Helier.

Mr. M. Stevens:

St. Helier is full.

The Connétable of Grouville:

And there is a waiting list?

Mr. M. Stevens:

Allocated full and they say that there is a waiting list, yes.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Do you feel as an association that there could be improvements? I mean I know there always can be but do you feel that there is a shortfall somewhere at the moment and there could be better improvement or you would like to see better improvement?

Mr. M. Stevens:

I think the big one regarding St. Helier, and if I had a crystal ball I might be able to find the answer, whether it be the marinas or around the South Pier area, there is a major problem regarding parking. That is not something one can just create parking spaces. Elizabeth Marina is a major problem. There is a number of allocated spaces in the underground car park, unloading bays which we have gone from 2, I think it is now 6 at Elizabeth Marina, which is a vast improvement. But they are abused on a daily basis and we are constantly on to the Ports: "Can you send somebody round to have a look at the situation?" because people ring and say: "That van has been there all afternoon. It has been there all morning. It has not moved. It is 30 minutes loading and unloading. For a time I was in there myself so I know the problem. But I really do feel sorry every time we hear about, you know ... It is getting worse now because we have a commercial television company which is very shortly going to move down there, and recently it has been seen that their vans have been parked in these unloading bays which are supposed to be for boating people. I do appreciate Harbours have got a problem. They have got a limited number of staff. It is not an easy situation to resolve.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Thank you very much.

Mr. M. Stevens:

Thank you.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Mr. Thompson from St. Aubin's Boat Owners.

Mr. R. Thompson:

Yes, good morning. I am the vice-president St. Aubin's Boat Owners. We are quite a small association. We were formed about 7 years ago with the main responsibility really just if boat owners have some problems we could all funnel it through into the Ports of Jersey. We meet regularly once a month and I must say that we have a harbour rep., Ports of Jersey rep., that attends our meetings on a monthly basis. So any problems that are highlighted they certainly are aware of it. I think some of the problems we have down at St. Aubin's is people dumping craft on the piers. Just willy-nilly they just turn up. We just had a clear out at the Fort and suddenly boats appeared on the South Quay. It is fine people working on their boats but they just use it continuously as a dumping ground and of course there is only a certain amount that Harbours can do. That is one problem we have got. The other problem is that everybody thinks this is the jewel in the crown in the Jersey but if any of you go down there and look over the harbour wall on the boardwalks, you see a lot of old abandoned craft in a terrible state. It is not that people want to get rid of somebody doing up an old boat, working on it, but it is just the fact that these are abandoned and they are in a terrible mess. Harbours are doing whatever they can but it is a very slow process. This thing about the jewel in the crown of Jersey really does not materialise when you look around. We are a nice association of about 130 members. Our main item is a boat jumble which the Parish of St. Brelade's kindly let us use the outside of the Parish Hall. We have various posters and what have you goes around. People donate items, sellable items, which we sell on the boat jumble day. All the proceeds, we have never taken any. It goes to the R.N.L.I. and the Life Boat. It has probably been ... this is our sixth year, and I would say we have given them about nearly £2,000 between them every year. So that is on the charitable side of it.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You do not organise the moorings?

Mr. R. Thompson:

No.

The Connétable of Grouville:

That is all done by Harbours?

Mr. R. Thompson:

About 5 years ago they wanted us to take over the moorings but it is about 350 moorings. It was just too big an issue for us to tackle.

The Connétable of Grouville:

That is inside the harbour and outside the harbour?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Yes, inside and outside.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Is it full? Are there spare moorings?

Mr. R. Thompson:

There are a few spare moorings, yes. A few around. We used to go, going back a bit, if you had a mooring in the inner harbour you used to have a free one at Belcroute, but that has all stopped now. But Harbours control the moorings, the allocation and Belcroute and the other Fort as well, so we do not get ...

The Connétable of Grouville:

So there are spare moorings inside the inner harbour?

Mr. R. Thompson:

There are a few. There are not many but there are a few.

The Connétable of Grouville:

The mooring fees were presumably put up like everybody else's. Are they now at market value level, do you think?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Like Mike said, it hit a lot of elderly people hard because pensioners have got old boats and they potter down there and they take them out. It went up 20, 20, 10 and 10, so that is 60 per cent increase over the last 4 years. Now we had meetings with Myra Shacklady and Frank Walker and they have told us categorically that there will only be an R.P.I. increase on mooring fees as from the June R.P.I. index.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are you satisfied with that guarantee?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Well, they are telling us. I mean we have got nothing in writing to tell us that this is what ... and I mean I have got it written down here from minutes.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Has the Association discussed the potential merger? Has it been a topic within the club?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Yes, very much so.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Also are there any concerns about the maintenance of the ageing harbour in the future? Has that been ...?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Exactly what Michael says. If we are led to believe what we are told then we should not have any problems. Our wonderful secretary, he has itemised every item here and as far as they are concerned we do not really have any issues with it. But I totally agree with Michael inasmuch that ... and I brought this up with Frank Walker, in one of the meetings. I said: "Why do Ports of Jersey have to pay for maintenance, big maintenance jobs, on the harbours?" I mean the North Quay at St. Aubin's is ... I mean in the winter ... we are putting boats on there now but normally it is only parking for the Boat House. It is used only as a parking area for the restaurants around there. No boating activity at all and yet Ports of Jersey are maintaining that. I mean they just do not do the stitching job on there. I think that if the States were paying for the major maintenance on harbours, this is all the stitching work to be done, surely they could ... the Ports of Jersey could drop the actual freight charges coming into the Island, because that to me is putting our charges up. I was speaking to somebody who imports goods and it is horrendous what they have to pay to go through the Ports of Jersey for a pallet of whatever. So if that was taken away, the cost was taken away from the Ports of Jersey, surely they could look to reduce that freight charge and that would lower the cost of living for everybody. But that is only my thought.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Have you got any further questions?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

No, nothing.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Just for general clarification, your boat owners' association and your individual owners arrange their moorings direct with Harbours at the moment?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Yes, yes, totally, yes.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

So does that mean there are some people that hold moorings who, therefore, are not members of your association?

Mr. R. Thompson:

Oh, very much so. I mean, there are about 350 moorings in the harbour and we have approximately 150 owners. So we are not in the minority by any means.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Okay, thank you.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Mr. Russell from the Jersey Rowing Club?

Mr. C. Russell:

Hello. Thank you very much, Chair, for the opportunity to speak to Scrutiny. I am very grateful. In 1971 the Royal Court constituted the Rowing Club, 180 members at maximum. It fluctuates between 140 and 180 members ranging from 70 year-olds to under-14 academy. Currently paying £10,000 a year rent based upon £5,000 for the storage area at Les Galots, which is on a yearly rotating lease, and the lifeboat house, which is an equipment storage and changing room facility. We pay, until recently, for our club R.I.B. (rigid inflatable boat) mooring. So we sort of do believe we pay commercial rates. That equates to £200 for a member to row. The membership is £120 and then the boat racking fees to store your boat we charge by seat. So, bigger boat, more people paying; it is about £65 a seat. The club also finances the insurance and other water and electricity. Harbours maintain the building for us. Relationship: very good, very positive, very dynamic, very helpful. Ports and Harbours, we consider them a good landlord. The recent development opportunities at Les Galots ... because it is not our lease. We do not have a lease on it. We have 7 years left on the clubhouse but we do not have a lease on the boat park and, of course, no boat park, no rowing club. So, you know, it is a real difficult area for us. But the recent development had really nothing to do with our relationship with the Ports and Harbours. Ports and Harbours approached us to discuss how they were going to treat this in the future. We are very comfortable with that. They want to know our strategy and ... we term it a discount, by the way. I do not know ... so they charge us that rent and will discount back to us. Their intention described to us is a fairness approach that everyone pays a fair rent and then the more you do, the more you get back. So they give us the opportunity to gain that by developing what we deliver. A good

example would be schools rowing that we are working on, introducing schools rowing, and for schools rowing they will give us a discount on that rent we pay. The more we do, the more we get.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Just for clarity, you pay £10,000 a year but then you get some of that back?

Mr. C. Russell:

No, we do not get anything back, but we will do.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You will get some back?

Mr. C. Russell:

The more we provide, the more we would get back. We would negotiate with them. So no, we do not. At present, we do not get anything back and we are in negotiation by developing schools' rowing, which will be a rowing boat for each of the schools. The Harbours will discount our rents to deliver that.

The Connétable of Grouville:

That is similar to what is proposed at St. Catherine's?

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes, yes, it seems ...

The Connétable of Grouville:

But at the moment you do not get anything but in the future you should get ...

[12:00]

Mr. C. Russell:

We do not get anything and never have got anything previously, and the same with the club. We run 2 R.I.B.s to support racing and youth rowing and we pay for the mooring of those, but this year we will not be paying for the mooring of those because we are delivering a service.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So you are going to benefit financially when Ports get incorporated?

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes. It could be. I think the discussion with Ports' incorporation and what their vision is and how they would support us as a club seemed very positive. All they want off us is a long-term strategy. They want us to organise ourselves properly and they want us to deliver a service for these facilities that we get off them, which seems extremely reasonable. It is very important that the commodore and the Royal Yacht Club are like our big brother. They are the St. Helier Yacht Club, so a lot of joint members, so any of our management happens at the yacht club. We are very conscious, as every other association will be, that we keep things very simple. We do not have showering facilities at the club because someone has to maintain that. Someone has to clean it and so on, so we keep things as cheap as we can to maintain for the future. That is the ethos of the Rowing Club and we support it by what we pay in membership. We need 120 members to pay our bills, basically, so that drives us to recruit and deliver a service as well to our membership. It has expanded. We compete at a world-class level as well, everyone should know, run 2 of the biggest races in the Channel Islands, you know, the Sark to Jersey in its 50th year next year. So, a very vibrant, enjoyable facility. Our concern ... I absolutely do believe what the incorporation team are telling us. They are very committed: Frank Walker, Doug Bannister, Myra Shacklady. My concern is they will change. You know, in 5 years, when value is only measured by an incorporated body by money, not by service delivered, then I would be concerned because I think you could flatten the Rowing Club and turn it into a car park and make more money out of it. So the temptation could be there for a body in 5 years' time. So what I would like, I would like off our political representatives, I would like off the incorporated Harbours, is a very long-term lease at a peppercorn rent, 100 years, yes, please. We pay our way, very happy to pay our way, do not particularly see why the taxpayer should subsidise me for rowing, but what we would like is if you apply commercial pressures to an incorporated body, they will come looking at us and, you know, we are loss-making in those terms. I would like to think that if you have people rowing in their 50s and 60s, how many strokes are you stopping? That is value for me. Kids at under-14 starting to row, lifetime of health, you know, pressures off the health service; that is real value. It might not equate to money.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Are the facilities you have at the moment adequate? Are you happy with what you have?

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes. We are expanding exponentially. The issue we have, like anyone else round the table, we are run by volunteers. Interestingly, if I could criticise Scrutiny just for a moment **[Laughter]**, 11.00 a.m. on a working day, you know, that is tricky for people and for high-pressured people. My committee are just flat out. If you paid them the going rate your membership would double in cost, definitely. I mean, it is those people for the future that you need to manage and if you do not

have the Sea Cadet instructors and the voluntary rowing instructors and people that are going to run the Association, it all falls apart. So there should be an element in the incorporation that understands that you need to nurture the future and it cannot just be commercial. So I think the model is good. I like it. I like that is what it is worth; we will discount you for what you provide. You know, if the rowing club provides the strategy, it provides the service for youth, it puts the effort in, then it does better out of the discount. You know, if you sit back and get something for nothing, I think it creates a bad attitude and a learnt vulnerability.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Let us go back to the lease you have. The clubhouse is fine. The boat park you say no lease?

Mr. C. Russell:

No lease, it is a yearly rotating lease.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes, and again it is a common theme, really. Basically, no boat park, no rowing club, so you want security on that.

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes, absolutely. It is not even a yearly rotating lease. It is a monthly ... we pay on the 6 months. So if Harbours said: "No, we want to use that for something else" then we would be gone and if the boat park goes then there is no rowing club.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Sure. Going back to the boat park, I mean, it is full now with boats, so as it is you ... is there much capacity for new membership?

Mr. C. Russell:

I think we would manage. My point would be I am not sure I could manage with a club membership of over 200. I do not think a voluntary organisation could. Yes, things ... our relationship with Harbours is good. It is going well and the future, 5-year future, looks very positive. I am worried when Mr. Bannister goes, Myra Shacklady retires, you know, maybe Harbours are not being ... or the incorporated body has more demanding shareholders, you will get someone in who has been given a ...

The Deputy of St. Mary:

If it is a commercial enterprise then it has to ...

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes. So at the moment it is all very good for clubs and ...

The Deputy of St. Mary:

What I was really getting at was that you certainly could not afford to release any part of that boat park for anything else. You need every berth.

Mr. C. Russell:

No, it is full and dynamic and growing and it is only us that prevents it growing any more. If we opened it up completely, it would be hard to stop. We would particularly like the world championship. We are aiming to bring the world championship to Jersey in the next 3 years, maybe 5, and that, as we know in Olympics and the Island Games, it just generates such excitement and such involvement. So it is a growth area. I would invest; if anyone wants shares in rowing ... **[Laughter]**

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Your current lease, when does that expire?

Mr. C. Russell:

Seven years, so ... yes, so that would be 2022.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Okay. So at the moment your rental that you are paying per annum for the clubhouse effectively will go up by R.P.I. but no more, is that the agreement?

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes, R.P.I. but no more.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Okay, and you are happy with that as some form of guarantee?

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes. It is the lease. If you could give me a 25-year lease on the whole area ... but 25 years is not a long time, really. You know, I think if you want to really nurture clubs and societies, it is that peppercorn thing, that contract between our community, really.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Okay. Just one other question: obviously, with the development plans that there were for the Les Galots area, it may well be that the Ports of Jersey, once incorporated, look at that area again for development. What are your views on that?

Mr. C. Russell:

Our views are sensible and appropriate development change; we are not change blockers. The interesting thing for how defended am I by the scrutiny, the interesting thing about the last Les Galots development was that Harbours thought they had control of that area and it turned out they did not. Property Holdings had control of that area and then T.T.S. did as well. So, you know, Harbours were very supportive during the whole process and we will do our best to use that land to the best opportunity. We are discussing now that the smaller area for the Sea Cadets, the Sea Cadets go above the boat park. You know, that could be a very profitable and successful relationship. If you are going to put housing there, you know, residential accommodation, that would be tricky because if you buy yourself a very nice luxury flat, you are not going to want Sea Cadets blowing their bugles and the Rowing Club going out at 5.00 a.m. in the morning. So it was about the use. But it is quite important for everyone to know we have no choice about it because we do not hold anything over that boat park. So that was why we were fairly quiet in the whole arrangement because we did not have a say because we could be out tomorrow anyway.

The Connétable of Grouville:

The proposal is for the new Ports Authority to own where Port Galots is, but you are quite confident ...

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes, it would make sense.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Yes, and you are quite confident that they will handle it properly and that you will have input?

Mr. C. Russell:

For the first 5 years I am quite confident they will handle it. I am absolutely confident that Myra Shacklady and Doug Bannister will handle it in the most appropriate way, and Frank Walker. I am just concerned that when you get a new C.E.O. (Chief Executive Officer), new set of financial circumstances, that things would change. So, yeah, that is what I would like.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

So can I just say at the moment your current facilities, you are happy to operate with them? You do not feel you need better but you ...

Mr. C. Russell:

Crikey, yes, please. **[Laughter]** The Carteret Rowing Club, the French authorities, of course, they invest very heavily in community and it is an absolutely beautiful location that they are getting built, but then Carteret marina is magnificent and a fraternity of the French, is it not? They aim to deliver things in a more community-minded way.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

More quickly.

Mr. C. Russell:

Yes. We could do better. I would like to do better, but I think we could do it as well. We do not want to be nurtured and ... sorry, I do want to be nurtured and supported but I do not want to be spoon fed. The rowing club is very capable of looking after itself. It is not asking for anything other than a fair deal.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Your guard-boat R.I.B.s, where are they housed? Are they in the marina?

Mr. C. Russell:

They are in La Collette. There is a nice little area that they ... where all the clubs and societies can leave their guard-boats.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

But you pay for those spaces?

Mr. C. Russell:

We pay for them. We are not going to this year because of the ...

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Of the deal that you said, yes. Okay, thank you.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Okay. St. Helier Yacht Club, Mr. Barber, Mr. Parlett.

Mr. J. Barber:

Good afternoon from St. Helier Yacht Club and thanks for the opportunity of meeting you today. Chris, our club manager, is here with me today because I will shortly be standing down as Commodore so he will be reporting back to our executive committee. St. Helier Yacht Club is the biggest yacht club in the Channel Islands. Indeed, it is pretty big on a national scale with 3,100 members. We formed in 1903 and we run a very extensive range of racing events in the coastal waters and in the Bay of St. Helier as well as cruising events and we are also an R.Y.A. training centre. We do a whole range of shore-based training courses, particularly throughout the winter months, where we get probably a couple of hundred people through our courses every winter. On the practical side, we just do the I.C.C. (International Certificate of Competence) assessments for those boaters who want to go across to foreign waters. Ports of Jersey is our current landlord so we rent our clubhouse from Ports of Jersey. We had very protracted negotiations back in 2008 to renew our lease with them and we negotiated an extension to our lease on the property until 2035 with an option for the club to extend the lease until 2056. So we are relatively safe with the lease that we had agreed at that time. We have been reassured by the Ports of Jersey that the incorporated body will be the successor landlord and that it will have no impact in terms of the lease of our clubhouse. We do pay a reduced amount of rent on the clubhouse compared to its commercial value, which we are happy with and we built that into our plans. We have also put enormous amounts of expenditure into the clubhouse itself over the last 15 years. We have developed what is called the chart room above the club. We have also developed the cellar area into a training and meeting room. We have done enormous amounts of work on our washrooms and this year, very recently, we developed the bar within the club. So all of those expenses, apart from the chart room, have been met by the club's own income. Our income comes from our membership fees as well as we run a franchise operation, so the food and beverage operation within the club is franchised out to a third party. We have had plenty of opportunity to talk to the current people involved, Myra Shacklady and Frank Walker in particular, over the course of incorporation. We have had a few meetings with them and they have reassured us on the matters that were of concern to us, which I have detailed in the paper that we sent you. They were really on the impact on the clubhouse itself and in terms of our lease and we have been reassured verbally and subsequently through minutes in writing that there will be no material impact on the clubhouse rent. We also have or benefit from a number of other ways in which the Ports support us. We have a starter hut down in La Collette with associated parking permits. We have a reduced mooring fee for the club's safety boat in La Collette and we have a number of storage boxes in the La Collette area as well for all of the tackle that we have to take out to arrange our racing.

[12:15]

Again, we have been reassured that there will be no impact on the current terms for the club in terms of all of those things they provide for us. So, in many ways they are very generous to us and it is reassuring to hear that that will not be impacted in the future under incorporation. A bigger concern to us is really our raison d'être, which is, you know, a boating club, we are dependent upon having members who are interested in boating. It has already been referred to through Mike there the compound increase in mooring fees, in the mud mooring fees, which is the most affordable way to get into boating, between 2010 and 2014 was 78 per cent. It is not just 20/20, 10/10, the compound impact of that was 78 per cent over 4 years. The rise in the cost of parking for Elizabeth Marina berth holders was 100 per cent over those 4 years, and the increase for marina berth holders over those 4 years was 18 per cent. Now, this is at a time that Jersey R.P.I. only went up by 12 per cent, 20 Means 20 was kicking in and net salaries were going nowhere. In fact, net salaries after 20 Means 20 meant that most people were earning less. Over that period, demand for boating in Jersey has certainly gone down. There seems to be very little acceptance by the current authorities that increases have an impact on demand. Luckily, and it again has been referred to, 2015 we saw increases purely by R.P.I. and we have been reassured on behalf of our members that under incorporation the fees for leisure boat owners will only go up by R.P.I. We do have a hope that incorporation ... I mean, one of the advantages of incorporation might be that they look at their own costs because there certainly has been very little of that activity going on as a States department. So we are very hopeful that under incorporation Ports of Jersey might look at cutting their own costs rather than just increasing prices. So, yes, we are also ... we have concerns about things like the Coastguard which have to be in place and we have been reassured that, again, that will not be affected by incorporation.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Your current rent for your clubhouse, you said that was below market value. What are you paying and what do you think market value would be?

Mr. J. Barber:

We are currently paying £30,400. We have a bit of a problem with market value at the moment because a number of years ago a calculation was made to look at what that £30,400 was based upon. I cannot remember the exact discounts that we were getting on market value, but earlier on this year an estate agent had been employed by Ports of Jersey to re-evaluate all of their property values and they have come up with a market value that is significantly higher than what was previously agreed. So we have disagreed in writing with their market evaluation. They have said even though they have re-evaluated the market value it will not have an impact on what we pay, but we just do not agree with what they have evaluated it at and we are suspicious about the motives behind undertaking such an exercise.

The Connétable of Grouville:

What have they valued it at?

Mr. J. Barber:

Do you have the figure there?

Mr. C. Parlett:

Can I give the details?

Mr. J. Barber:

Yes.

Mr. C. Parlett:

The original valuation in the renewal of the lease was £40,000 a year but we got an agreed 33 per cent discount, so our rent at that time was £26,500. They have retrospectively estimated that the rental value at that time should have been £53,400 and at today's prices £69,000. So, clearly, if the 25 per cent ... sorry, the 33 per cent subsidy was applied to that, we would be paying half as much again roughly as we are at the moment. We do have, as Julian said, a pretty good term on the lease and a clause that makes sure that we pay R.P.I. It is whichever is the lesser of the 2 of increased market value or R.P.I., so currently R.P.I. But as Julian said, we are suspicious as to why; what purpose would it serve to value the market rent of our premises at £69,000 now against the original valuation quite recently of £40,000?

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Within your lease, do you happen to know whether or not the lessor has a termination clause within it and what that termination clause is?

Mr. J. Barber:

We are fairly safe on that.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

You are? Okay.

Mr. J. Barber:

Yeah. We had heavy lawyer involvement at the time, as did the Ports of Jersey.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

I am glad to hear that.

The Connétable of Grouville:

So your lease goes on until did you say 2035?

Mr. J. Barber:

2035 and the club has the option to extend to 2056 because we could not put all of that money into the projects we were doing without having the security of a long-term lease.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Your rent is now currently £30,000?

Mr. J. Barber:

£30,400.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You are tied into R.P.I. from there?

Mr. J. Barber:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

That goes on after 2035 right up until 2056?

Mr. J. Barber:

As far as I can tell from the terms of the lease, yes. The other concern I forgot to mention that we have is a number of years ago Ports of Jersey came up with a scheme to flood the old harbour and make it into a marina. They had spent quite a lot of money on consultants to come up with this big plan that was heavily resisted. We still have a concern and we have voiced this to Myra and Frank that they are not going to revive that project under incorporation. Because they seem to think that property development around the harbour is a way of making money and obviously making it into a marina makes it more attractive.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

What would be your objection to that?

Mr. J. Barber:

Mud moorings, although they have gone up by 78 per cent recently, are still an affordable way into boating and whenever you convert something into a marina it is automatic that the berthing charges will go up.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

So it is a deterrent to you guys, to the sport?

Mr. J. Barber:

Yes, and there are quite a number of boats that purposefully let their boats dry out so that they can maintain the hulls, et cetera. If you are in a marina, you have to take your boat out of the water, which, of course, then incurs additional expense.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you have any questions?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Yes. A couple of people have spoken this morning with a little sort of suspicion of the future with Doug Bannister not being there. I do not know if anybody knows something that Doug Bannister does not know **[Laughter]**, but this may slightly figure as has been sort of mentioned. Do you have any feelings the same? Do you feel at the moment while the likes of Doug and Myra are there that, you know, after they are gone that things might change?

Mr. J. Barber:

Well, there is a board overseeing ... or shadow board at the moment overseeing Ports of Jersey, so we have had commitment from the board rather than just Doug Bannister. There will be a structure in place that oversees the chief executive of the Ports of Jersey, whoever it is, so we are reliant upon agreements that are made now with the clubs and associations and the commitments they are talking about carrying through to whoever might be in charge of the Ports of Jersey.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Thank you very much. Then, finally, Mr. Carter from the Bonne Nuit Boat Owners Association.

Mr. S. Carter:

Good afternoon, everyone. Bonne Nuit Boat Owners' Association formed just over 50 years ago, currently in the region of 80 members, and we have about 50 boats in the harbour at Bonne Nuit ranging in size from 14 foot to 37 foot. Moorings are split into 3 size categories: 14 to 19 foot, 19 to 24, and 24 to 37, and segregated in different parts of the harbour. Probably 3 years ago we brokered an agreement with Harbours where we leased an area of the harbour, took over the actual management of a block of moorings for the smaller sized boats and managed the moorings ourselves by allocating the moorings, collecting the mooring dues and paying one cheque to Harbours. We have quite a good lease agreement on an annual basis and subject to R.P.I. increases. Then this year we have taken on the next sized group so we are leasing two-thirds of

the harbour now and so far it is working very well. It means we can manage the moorings, we manage the waiting lists, we make sure the boats are suitable for the harbour, and with an agreed set of rules with Harbours anyone with any complaints comes to us first and Harbours back us up with the rules. If people do not feel that they are fairly treated we have the agreement with Harbours that these are the rules, this is how it all operates. We are possibly going to look at taking over the larger sized moorings in the near future and maybe even the management of the barracks as well. We have a number of barracks on the pier which are leased to individual boat owners, plus we have a barrack which is for the use of the Association. We pay ground rent values for the Association hut and we carry out perpetual maintenance on that, thereby keeping the rental fairly low. We also, after a series of thefts from Bonne Nuit, put a C.C.T.V. (closed circuit television) system in at the harbour, which Harbours at the time contributed a third of the cost. We raised the rest of the money ourselves. We have added to that system over the last couple of years and currently have 6 cameras operating in the harbour that have led to the arrest of a number of people for theft. The cameras have a live link to the Maritime Office plus Customs and the police station. Customs have arrested people at Bonne Nuit importing drugs into the Island. We have a very good relationship with Ports of Jersey at the moment and feel that they are very happy with the way we are running our association, managing the moorings, and we would very much like to carry on in that way. Our issue would be if suddenly our charges were increased drastically we would feel that we would then give the responsibility of the management back to them because we feel we are doing more than our fair share to keep our levels of mooring dues ... although the same as within the other outlying harbours, we are doing a considerable amount of work for that. In return, we get a small discount on the moorings we lease out, which is fine when the harbour is full. If we do not manage to fill the harbour, then we potentially might lose a little bit of revenue. But it means we work hard to keep the harbour full, which it is currently, and we manage the waiting lists. Previously, when the Ports of Jersey were managing waiting lists, quite often applications did not find their way to the Association. People were on waiting lists when there were moorings available. Currently, at Bonne Nuit the railings along the pier are being replaced. They were due to be finished by Easter except they ran out of the upright posts, so there is a section that still has not been completed. Also, while they were grinding the old railings off there was a bit of damage to some of the boats on the quay with the filings flying off and causing rust spots on the boats. So these are issues that we have taken up with them and they have resolved to clean the boats afterwards. Otherwise, we are sort of fairly self-sufficient.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You said you have a third of the harbour that you do not manage but you are hoping to do that in the future?

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You say you will be managing the whole ... you expect to be managing the whole area?

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

You mentioned fees. Are they value for money? Are they market value?

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes, they are market value, I would say, certainly, although we suffer the increases the same as everyone else. But at the end of the day the fee is for outlying harbours. We do not get a great deal so we do not pay a great deal and we feel that is the way it should stay.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Because do Harbours provide the actual moorings or do you have to put your own?

Mr. S. Carter:

They provide the top chain and the bottom chain and we provide everything in between.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Any questions?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Yes. I mean, it sounds very commendable what you are doing. Do you find that ... I mean, obviously at the moment you have a willing bunch of volunteers to do all this because I take it everybody is a volunteer?

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Do you have any concerns, because some clubs or in all organisations sometimes they are run better with a keen bunch of people to others. Do you feel confident that what you are doing is

sustainable? Because I do see the advantages from Harbours of what you are doing. Do you think it is sustainable?

[12:30]

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes, I think we have simplified the system quite a lot over the last couple of years and it does not take so much to manage now. We have a very competent treasurer and our mooring secretary does an admirable job and I feel the way it is set out now someone coming in could take it over and it would not be too onerous.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

So, at the moment, your contact with Harbours, which does not sound like there needs to be an awful lot, what is it? Can you just say how much ... I mean, is there any special person dedicated to dealing with Bonne Nuit or what is your ...?

Mr. S. Carter:

There is a person within the Ports whose sort of responsibility is the outlying harbours and that is the first point of contact. Then if we have maintenance issues we rely on them forwarding those to the relevant departments.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Have you spoken to any other boat owner associations, you know, to compare what you are all doing?

Mr. S. Carter:

We are very much the guinea pig to rolling out this system which they would like to take into other ports because obviously rather than billing 50 boat owners, if they can only bill the Association and rely on us to gather the money then that is fine. But they would like to get us up and running. We have spoken to other harbours and certainly there are probably 2 or 3 which the system could be rolled out in, but relatively the likes of Gorey and St. Aubin are too big and it would be too much.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

But conflicts with members, none? Is it pretty good? People have accepted the arrangement?

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes, generally people have now realised that we, the Association, have the control so they cannot sort of trot off down to the Harbours Department and bang the desk and expect to get their way.

They will be told: "That is the rules. It has been agreed with the Association. You have to live with it." So all boat owners who are within the leased areas have to be members of the Association and virtually everyone in the larger boat area is a member as well, so we have a very good community spirit at Bonne Nuit and everyone knows each other and everyone gets on, generally.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

You might have mentioned it; sorry, I missed it. Membership fee, what is the ...?

Mr. S. Carter:

Membership fee is about £25 a year.

The Connétable of Grouville:

How many people do you have on your waiting list, do you know?

Mr. S. Carter:

For the category of boats between 19 and 24 foot, there are 2 or 3 waiting. For the larger size there is no one on the waiting list, and the smaller size there is no one on the waiting list at the moment.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Any questions?

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Yes. The maintenance of the fabric of the historic harbours, I mean, it has been raised by a number of people here that there are concerns that if the new incorporated body of the Ports of Jersey has that onus on it, it could cause a problem. Obviously, fees might go up or other costs might go up. What are your views on that?

Mr. S. Carter:

I agree with the comments of Mike and the other guys certainly because Bonne Nuit as a pier is a very old structure. At some point there is going to be a considerable amount of money needing to be spent on it and I would very much echo their views that the harbour is not only used by boat owners, it is used by tourists, it is used by proprietors of the café, swimmers, et cetera, et cetera. So we do not feel it is fair that the maintenance for the actual harbour itself, for the infrastructure, for the pier, should be purely directed at boat owners. It is an asset to the whole Island and, therefore, it should be funded by the Island for those ... fair enough, the cosmetic things like the railings, replacing ladders, ground chains, et cetera. I feel that the money that is raised by the current mooring dues more than covers that. But certainly major ...

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Major works.

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes.

Deputy S.M. Brée:

Okay, no, it is just interesting to know your views. Thank you.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Do you think there is an intention then for Harbours to try and fund the repairs of the ancient harbours by charging extra mooring fees?

Mr. S. Carter:

I think if it landed on their doorstep that they have to, then they are going to have to look at ways to raise that sort of money, and raising mooring fees is obviously going to be quite an easy one to do.

The Deputy of St. Mary:

Yes. I expect it will not make much of a dent in the final bill. I think there might be other ways.

Mr. S. Carter:

Yes.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Gentlemen, I do not know if anybody wants to add anything. It has been pretty exhaustive. We have gone through and covered a number of subjects. Many of you share things in common. We are very grateful for you coming. I do not know if you would like ...

Mr. M. Stevens:

Thank you for hearing us.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Not at all, and I do take Mr. Russell's point. Some of you have obviously had to give up work but logistically for us it is not easy to hold meetings in the ...

Mr. C. Russell:

No, I understand that and it helps and I am lucky, it is just that thinking of Scrutiny is ... if you want fair scrutiny, then people have to be able to get to it, I suppose.

The Connétable of Grouville:

Indeed. So, gentlemen, thank you all very much for coming.

[12:35]