



Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel

Government Plan

Witness: Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture

Monday, 21st October 2019

Panel:

Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence (Chair)

Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour

Witnesses:

Senator S.W. Pallett, Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture

Mr. J. Rogers, Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment

Mr. D. Scott, Director, Growth, Housing and Environment

Mr. B. Harvey, Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment

[11:37]

Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence (Chair):

We are here to talk about the last final bits of Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture's Government Plan, so it is just capital projects to go basically, which is pretty good. There are not too many capital projects, but the ones you have are quite big. Before we get going, as always, we will start by introducing ourselves.

Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour:

Deputy Jess Perchard, member of the Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Deputy Kirsten Morel, Chair of the Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel.

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Darren Scott, G.H.E. (Growth, Housing and Environment).

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Steve Pallett, Assistant Minister.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

John Rogers, Director General of G.H.E.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Barclay Harvey, Operations Manager for the Sport Division in G.H.E.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Can I just start by offering the apologies of the Minister? He unfortunately had another appointment this morning that he cannot get out of.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No problem.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

We are also covering sport stuff this morning so ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, exactly.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

... I hope we can give you all the evidence you need.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I think it is most important that you are here.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Good.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Thank you. We will start off looking ... we have got 2 here, which is interesting, which is the Fort Regent pre-feasibility vote, but also aside from that - and there is some confusion on it - we got the

Island's sports facilities pre-feasibility. Now, that is interesting because it has fallen to us. We have as the lead Minister the Minister for Health and Social Services.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

For?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The Island's sports facilities pre-feasibility studies.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It should not be.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is what it says on the business case.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

The sports facility strategy is work that is led through Economic Development and the group that I chair.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It makes a lot more sense to me, so we were going to ask you about it anyway, but it was just to let you know ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

No, I think that is an error.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

... on the front page of the business case it says: "Health and Social Services." It is an error?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

That is an error. That should be the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Brilliant. I am really pleased, because I was going to have to talk to you about that.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The confusion is, yes, the Assistant Minister has ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I have got 2 hats on, but that is not correct.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, brilliant. Thank you. Initially when you were planning this, you think: "We will talk about this project and we will talk about this project" and so on. We cannot really. We have got to start by talking about those first few projects, Fort Regent and the Island's sports facilities development. How are you going to ensure that there is no crossover between the 2 projects? Because as we look through the Island's sports facilities, workstream 1 is about an Island sport campus. There is £500,000 set to explore that next year and over 4 years it rises to £10 million. Obviously one of those aspects is the potential for using Fort Regent to develop an Island sports campus. Separately, in a different business case, the Fort Regent business case, you have got £2 million for next year, which is about - looking at the 3 options that you have put down - the possible business hub, the possible sports facilities. I forget the third one off the top of my head. Oh, botanical gardens.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Botanical gardens, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, so straight away, if you were to choose the sports facility for Fort Regent and not the business hub, not the botanical gardens and you have got this separate project going on, my concern is clear, that there is duplication going on here.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I will talk briefly about the Island sports strategy group and then I will hand over to the Director General to talk about Fort Regent. I do not currently sit on the Fort Regent group.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes. No, I appreciate that.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

So I do not have all the necessary information around how that is progressing, so I will hand it over. I hope the Director General will agree with me, they are intrinsically linked. I think what we are doing with the Island's sports strategy review is looking forward over the next 15, 20 years to have some understanding of what the sports portfolio needs to look like moving forward. The word "decay" or whatever, we have got a sports portfolio at the moment that is ageing, it is creaking a little bit at the seams. It does need some refurbishment and may need some replacement depending on the

outcome of the review being carried out by Knight Kavanagh Page. They carried out an initial review of sports facilities in the Island and came up with several recommendations, which I think you have already seen that report. It is a public document.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is 2017, is that right?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

No, 2018. I think November 2018 was when it was published. But the important thing that came out of that was as much as it gave us an idea of some of the shortage of facilities, such as a gymnasium hall, for example, and we knew about netball at that time as well, we did not have a really good understanding of what our sports centre portfolio might look like moving forward, where they might be situated around the Island and, absolutely right, where Fort Regent sat in that. I think until we have received that report and we have got the detail as to not only what they believed to be the exact fit for us moving forward - although that is up for discussion with the group and politicians and the public in general moving forward - once we have got that detail, what that would look like in terms of sequencing, so that we have to have an idea of where ... I will take an example. Let us just say, for example, Fort Regent was not to be used as a sports facility what the alternatives would need to be. Would we need an east of Island sports centre? Would we need something in the centre of town to take up gym provision, for example? All of that needs to be sequenced so that we understand the timing of that and, very importantly, the cost of that. That report, we had an update at the start of September in terms of how that has been progressing and were there any aspects that we felt needed to have a little bit more priority on it at that time. Clearly netball is one of those - I have got a question tomorrow, thank you very much - so that will be picked up within that review to give us some clear indication of not only what we need, but where they may be situated around the Island. It is very easy to make short-term decisions that could have long-term consequences of replacement of facilities moving forward, but absolutely, until we have a defined view of what is going to happen at Fort Regent, it is very difficult to sequence how we are going to move things forward. I think the decision around Fort Regent is really important, but I do not sit on that group. It would be a good time for me to hand over to ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Before you do, sorry, but feel free to both answer, I just need the sequencing of the right thing. So K.K.P. (Knight Kavanagh & Page) are currently finalising ... they are continuing their report at the moment?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

They are working on that at the current time, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

When are you expecting the final report to be delivered?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I would expect to have - I hope I am right - a draft probably by the end of November, early December to review and then it is going to take us some time to review that with them. It needs to go to the sports facility group first. I think there is a good range of experience on that board and a good range of Government departments as well. We have just included Senator Vallois on that group from an education facilities point of view, which I think is important.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, absolutely. If the K.K.P. report says: "Yes, Fort Regent, you should develop that entirely as a sports facility for multiple sports" what would then happen? This is where John comes in.

[11:45]

What would then happen to the Fort Regent £2 million that we have got for the pre-feasibility vote? Because the way I see it, if the K.K.P. report says go for Fort Regent, then your discussions about business hubs and botanical gardens fall away and they become completely irrelevant.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Before John answers that, I would be right, I think, in saying that the consultants on both of these projects have not been working totally in isolation. They do have an understanding of what their terms of reference are and their remit is. That does not mean that one is taking preference over the other, because clearly they both have terms of reference in terms of what they need to produce, but there has been some synergy between the 2. It would absolutely have an impact if that was to be the case, but until we have got that initial piece of work ... will one impact on the other? They are bound to. Like you say, there has been a sport centre for the last ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I am just looking at the possibility for savings because for John's Fort Regent ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Absolutely.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

... pre-feasibility plan, we got an astounding £2 million for a plan, for a pre-feasibility plan. So I am there thinking: "Hold on, if your report says: 'Yes, go for Fort Regent' then two-thirds of the work that John's report has to do falls away" and I can see the opportunity to save a lot of money there.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I think we are very close to the second K.K.P. report, so I do not think it is going to have a dramatic effect on the direction of the Fort group, unless John is going to tell me differently, but I do not think they are at the stage where they have made those type of decisions yet. I do not know where you are with the consultants, so it is probably best if I do hand over to John at this point.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Cool, thank you.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is sort of annoying me, you have hit absolutely the sweet spot of a discussion myself and Steve had 2 weeks ago.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Yes.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I have got my notes in front of me of the discussion we had. We have got the Fort Regent project, which is a significant capital project, and it needs to be, to give it another 50 years' life serving our Islanders. The sports facility strategy, as the Minister said, we have an ageing sports facility, very good ones, and Barclay runs the majority of them, but they are attached to schools, they are all over the place. They have served the Island well, but they need to keep having that investment in them. There is also a potential national stadium or location and discussion going on, then there is also a review of how we deliver that service in terms of making sure that is sustainable and that gives best value to the public and gets the right people doing the right things. So there are 4 big projects, and if you attach the monetary value to them, this is significant. Off the top of my head, that is probably £140 million - it is £100 million plus - attached to it. Now, your point is exactly right, they are all integrated together and what we need and what we do not have at the moment is quite that political oversight. Officer oversight is quite coherent, because it is the same people, but the political oversight needs to consolidate on the same people at the same meeting and they have got to be presented with all these streams of work to that same meeting so that there is not ... what we do not want to do is commission work that then becomes obsolete and then has a conflict and starts ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That is my concern.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, and I appreciate that completely. But I think this will enable us to innovate and come up with solutions that each individual process would not have come up with, so that spatial planning and that integration then starts working better than just doing it as separate entities. That is the theory which myself and Steve are going to try and instigate between now and Christmas in terms of resetting the political oversight on this. Then in terms of officers, there is a project director role for delivering stuff and then there is a project director role for being the client for this stuff, so there is a receiving client role there; dare I use the hospital as a ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, but it is a valid comparison.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, so you have got the people who can build it, engineer it, do the special planning for it and then the people who can specify it and say what they need to be happening in there. Those are the 2 roles underneath.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

How would you describe the political oversight of these streams of work and business cases to date?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It has been very good, but we are at that pre-feasibility work, so around Fort Regent it is predominantly about concepts and lessons learned. Fort Regent is about access and access and access; it is all about access. Once you have got access, the great thing about Fort Regent is it is a massive site and it is over many acres and I think it can fulfil a range of solutions. I do not think it is exclusive, one or the other, because it is so big. But the main thing we are progressing initially is access from Pier Road and from Snow Hill and we are looking at 2 concepts there, where we are basically building accommodation and then that will pay for public access, either attached or alongside it. Once you have got access, then Fort Regent becomes, I think, a viable space again for the big conurbation that is St. Helier.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

In terms of political oversight of the sports facilities group, I think that has been strong all the way through. Prior to the setting up of the policy board, political oversight came through the department. Myself and Lyndon had a very close association with the work in the original K.K.P. report and set the terms of reference, but the view of this current Government was that we needed a policy board

for progressing the more detailed part of the work and that group has been meeting regularly with the 2 main consultants from K.K.P. We have had regular meetings with them to see where the direction of that work is going. I have been really pleased with that. It is not partnership working because we are paying them to do a piece of work, but they clearly are engaged locally and have an understanding of what we have here and what we are trying to achieve and what the vision of the politicians is for moving forward.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But the possible concern is that the sports facilities political oversight group and the Fort Regent political oversight group, they do not seem to be ...

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

They work in isolation.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They need to join.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, work in isolation. That is a much better way of putting it.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I think John said it. You have hit the nail on the head. At the moment they are going down 2 side-by-side railway tracks and they need to be closer linked in terms of they are trying to achieve. I think the Director General has made a ... and nothing that he said in the conversation I had with him a couple of weeks ago did I disagree with. I probably made a poor decision in removing myself from the Fort Regent steering group. If I am allowed to, I will reconsider that, because it is probably important that I have some view of that, considering I am chairing the ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I think that would be very good, but that whole problem could be avoided if they just brought the Fort Regent one into the sports facilities group and used it as a sub-panel of the sports facilities group, if you know what I mean. That to me would make a lot more sense.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We will basically suggest a way of doing it. As I say, this is a big capital endeavour and a big sort of way of supporting Island life in the next 50 years. It has got to be done right and co-ordinated, because the opportunity of getting it wrong or wasting money is really high, is it not?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It is huge, yes.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The Minister has been to see lots of facilities in other places, where you can see things that work really well and things that work not so well. We had best learn from them. Fort is a particular challenge because of its historical significance, its location, access and scale. It is a very difficult building to think about what the next stage of it is. The other observation I will suggest here is these decisions are quite political in that it is not an engineering solution, in that do you need a new stream of work - I will use an example - is quite simple and as a politician the answer is yes or no, whereas with this it is far more nuanced in the community in what your aspiration is, what you want the Island to be. So the decisions are a bit greyer and that is why you need that one political voice so that those decisions are made, agreed to, stuck with and then supported through the House.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

One element that we do need to improve on is our relationship and engagement with the Education Department around the use of school facilities for community use. We have got a new Les Quennevais School coming onsite before too long, which has got some fantastic sports facilities, so I think there is a piece of work for us to do and working with the Education Department to fully understand how we can most benefit from the facilities that we have currently got. I understand the concerns that head teachers have about having members of the public onsite at certain times of the day; I accept that safety issue and security.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I have to say and I will state that they cannot see members of the public as a threat. They are part of our community.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

They are part of our community, which is why we think we need to work with the headmasters and headmasters' association to have a better understanding, because there is a lot of capacity to assist our sports clubs and associations which is not currently being used. That is a separate piece of work. I have already asked for a meeting with the ministerial team at Education so we can get some ministerial agreement about moving that forward.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I have been onsite this morning, which is why my trousers are covered in mud, and it is an amazing facility and it needs to be used by all the community.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

As I said, we build these things for the whole community. A school is there to serve the whole community ...

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, it is.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

... not just the pupils at any one time, in my opinion. Deputy Perchard may have a different view, I do not know.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Interestingly, it has 3 netball courts on it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, there you go.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

I would just like to go back. Given that we have had 2 groups working in isolation, the results seem to have been business plans that have blurred boundaries and you have expressed the need for political oversight. You welcomed some of our suggestions about merging the groups, but why has this not happened before the submission of the Government Plan? Because for Back-Benchers, having 2 business plans that seemingly do not make sense alongside one another, it is going to be very difficult to garner support for both without these kinds of questions being answered in detail first.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think it is more about pace and timing. Again, Fort Regent's start point is a long way back and sports facilities is a real focus. Currently Fort Regent is predominantly a sports facility, but the start point in terms of the strategic use of the fort starts a long way back in terms of historic context and all the options that we have been through. It is now getting to the point where if we do not integrate now and dovetail them together, I do not think we will get that coherence. It is unfortunate that the Government Plan process happened too early for these. The Fort is a 10-year project and it is really hard with big capital projects - and I bear the scars of them and let us not mention it again - when they transcend political changes and political processes, so it is really hard to align those things. I think we could align them, but then it would be a 15-year project, so we have got to just try our best. I think that again I would not disagree that it looks a bit incoherent.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Politically I think you are right, I think there has been some work in isolation. I think from an officer perspective, there is such a strong link between the officers of both of pieces of work that there has been good linkage between the 2. I think the key question here is - and I think it does need to be answered independently of the Fort Regent steering group - is sport going to be an element or focus at Fort Regent in future? I think the right people to do that work were K.K.P. and it is right that that decision comes from the facilities group, that recommendation, because it might not be something that we, as an Island, want to do. There might be an outcry about losing sport from the Fort, but that recommendation needed to be made independently. We are going to get that very soon now and I think it will set the scene as to what future direction those 2 groups take and how it will be easier for them to work more closely together. But that is the key question.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Sorry, a very simple question. Are you saying that you are going to wait for that report before spending money on other things that the Fort could be used for?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Politically, I think we need to have an evidence-based recommendation from a consultant. I know people do not like consultants, but in this particular case they have done this work all the way around England and other parts of Europe. This is their living, this is how they make their money and I think it is having a recommendation from them that clearly sets the targets for what our sports provision needs to look like and also, importantly, where it needs to be situated. It might not just be around whether sport is best facilitated at the Fort, it is whether it might be best facilitated in other parts of the Island as well. That is all rolled up in this report. Currently we are very west of Island and central-based. We have got very little to the east of the Island.

[12:00]

We need to rectify some of that. Some of the decision-making will be based on various criteria, but we need that recommendation from K.K.P. to really move forward on the Fort.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Sorry, my question was will you be spending any money on the Fort prior to that report coming out?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, because again, the Fort is not just ... I did say it is predominantly sport, but the Fort has a nursery there, it has lots of other facilities, the orchestra has a big space there. What we will make sure is there is not any abortive work being done on that, but it is big enough and the scale of it, and

I think for us to maintain the footfall there, it will be a multi-use facility and it needs to be. The bit we are focusing on the most is access and making it safe. If you look at the short and medium plans, our short-term plan is make it safe, which has covered things like asbestos removal and emergency lighting and all the other great things we have been dealing with, and then we have been developing plans for access. That has been the key thing. Then we feel the botanical gardens is basically a reset of the outside space, out of the walls towards I think it is the St. Helier end of the site.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Just specifically to answer your question, we all know the refurbishment costs of the Fort would be exorbitant. We are not going to start refurbishing parts of the Fort other than areas where we think there is a need. Barclay probably can give us more detail around this, but we have recently had some issues around the squash courts, for example, where we would have to spend some money to bring them back into use because there is asbestos damage there. That is the type of decision we are going to have make ongoing while we are deciding what the long-term future of the Fort is. So there will need to be some spend on the Fort for areas of it to remain open.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But I think Deputy Perchard was concerned in terms of the pre-feasibility work. I agree, of course you will need continuing maintenance costs, but as far as the pre-feasibility work is concerned, will any of that go ahead before the K.K.P. report?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes is the answer, but it ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Which bits?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We are talking to K.K.P. all the time, so their understanding of the Fort position, the final report has not been developed, but we understand what their direction of travel is, so we can work behind that to some degree. But we are not going spend abortive effort and time developing a dead end. If the decision from sport is to not be there or sport is to be there in a certain way, that will then feed in straight away. So we have got the same project manager managing the 2 contracts, so we will make sure it does not cause any abortive work.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Who are the consultants for Fort Regent? Have you appointed any?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have not. We are in a preferred bidder stage and we have not appointed as yet. It is imminent.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What kind of process have you used to find that preferred bidder?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We went through our standard portal and process with our procurement team.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

With who?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

With our procurement team and the procurement rules that we adopt.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So have you had more than one bidder?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Before we start going on to the separate business cases on their own, the other thing which we kind of touched on is with regard to sports facilities as a whole, including Fort Regent, we have talked about overlap in terms of spending, we have talked about overlap in terms of facilities, but what we have not mentioned is land use. To me, this is the kind of elephant in the room. I find it interesting when people talk about a national stadium and my head goes "Springfield." You have already got a big stadium, but you can count St. Peter, we have got another stadium there as well. Do we need a third stadium? No, of course we do not. The issue there for me is not even cost, the issue is land use and making the best use of the land, which is in desperately short supply in Jersey. How are you ensuring that K.K.P. takes into account the shortage of land in Jersey when thinking that you cannot point to a few fields in St. Catherine's and say: "By the way, we are going to build a national stadium out there" and how it links in with the Island Plan?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

That is a key element. All of the indicative work I have seen to date bases sports development or any new sports development on either current sports sites or education facilities where it would be

an addition to that site. If you used a sports field for a building, it is still building on greenfield or a green site. There may be some elements of that with a new building.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, I can appreciate you could choose ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

But in terms of land use, in terms of green-zoned land, no, I think K.K.P. are aware of the sensitivity of that and the need to ensure that we make best use of what we have currently got in terms of our sports sites. The rugby club is currently a sports site, which could provide all sorts of opportunities, but it is a private site, in essence.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, but we are subsidising it to the tune of £250,000 every year as well.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

We are. I think it would not be wrong to say that we talk to the rugby club. We have to because of the grant that we made to them. Again, that is part of the K.K.P. work. They will be considering various sites for an Island stadium. That is one of them, Les Quennevais will probably be another, but we have to make best use of the sites that we have. Can I envisage just building an Island stadium on a greenfield site at St. Martin? The answer is no. I think it would be on a current sport site, if we go down that route.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I have noted you did not mention Springfield.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I think Springfield is always going to be difficult. It is in a residential area. I think to ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So is Anfield and Old Trafford.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It is, but I think if you are talking about the sort of 3,000, 4,000-seat stadium that you might need, I think that is going to be difficult to achieve on a site where it is clear that the Constable and the Deputies want to see the amenity space preserved on that site and not reduced in any way whatsoever. We already have had a difficult fight/discussion with them when we had to put the 3G in there originally around loss of car parking and various other areas and things like that. I am not

saying Springfield could not be, but I think there are limitations on that site in terms of ... it is not that it will not be considered, because I think K.K.P. are considering it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Where does most of the Island's population live?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Absolutely, about 33,000.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

If they want to visit the national stadium that is in St Peter, how are they going to get there and how would that fit in with our carbon strategy?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I hate quoting you this, but it is a 9 by 5 Island and we have got an excellent bus service and transport links.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, but they will not use it.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

They do currently to go and watch the Jersey Reds play on a regular basis ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Not when I drive past there.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

... with tops 3,000 people. You are only going to get, with a local Jersey Bulls, Jersey Reds game, 2,000 to 2,500 people. I think the transport access to any site in the Island, certainly the sites I mentioned, are excellent and I do not think will cause an issue. But the point you make is a good point. It is in the centre of St. Helier, but there are so many other uses you could use ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is not in central St. Helier; it is northern St. Helier. It is an important point because it is the edge of town, so access is not that difficult.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

But it is also a site that could be used for other uses as well in terms of active living, so I think this is a discussion that needs to be had about whether that would be a suitable site and what might be compromised by turning it into an Island stadium capable of seating 3,000 or 4,000 people.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

When I was thinking about forming my questions for you about netball tomorrow, my good Deputy very rightly challenged me and said: "Interestingly, how do we select the sports we select to support?" and I think that is a really valid question. I think that from a kind of political and ideological point of view, it is really important that the public understands the rationale for supporting sport facilities generally, but also I do think we need to start asking some difficult questions about, for example, what is the rationale, what is the business case for supporting the rugby club to the extent that we do versus not supporting another sport? I was wondering if you could just talk to that point.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

The specific grant funding that has been given to the rugby club to date is very much based on the ... it is an economical decision rather than a sporting decision. If it was just £300,000 being given to sport per se, would I be necessarily happy that was going to one individual sport? Probably not, so that will be no, but I think considering the business case that was given in regards to supporting the rugby club and the potential loss of income to the Island by allowing them to drop out of professional rugby and the dramatic fall, because it was not just a division, it was going to be something like 10 divisions down - that is just the way the rules work within rugby - was going to have a catastrophic effect on the income to the club. Now, they would have carried on as an amateur club, but certainly a lot of the identified benefit far outweighed the cost of funding them for a short period of time. Do I believe that funding should be limited and limited over a short period of time? Yes, I do. I do not think we can prop them up for ever, I think they need to be made sustainable, which I think is part of the work that is being looked at by K.K.P. about a sustainable rugby club, a sustainable Jersey Bulls and Jersey football and what the benefits of being on one site might be.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Sorry to interrupt, but it is also interesting when selecting sports that the triathlon, there is a similar amount of money funded every year. Jersey does not have thousands of people engaging in triathlon activities every week, so it seems to have been based on the idea of an event rather than the sport.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Correct, absolutely.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Whereas netball, you were saying about the need for netball facilities and it is about getting people playing week in, week out constantly. How as a department are they making these decisions, choosing between one and not the other?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Just on the triathlon, the triathlon club is really popular. There was an event this weekend. They do lots of duathlons; sea swimming has become an enormous event.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But it gets an inordinate amount of support through that one event compared to other sports in Jersey.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think the Minister is right, the Super League Triathlon, it is a different ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It is a commercial event.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

... reason. I think triathlon as a sport has grown enormously and the 3 sports that are based in that are also very popular at the moment. But sports, they have their time, do they not? I played squash for many years and that becomes popular and then very unpopular. They do cycle with fashion almost.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

There is the problem with the skate park, which we will come to in a minute.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I think your point about netball is absolutely right. If there is any suggestion it is not a priority, and I will say it tomorrow, that it is very much a priority, but I think we understand what the need is. I think we need to understand where it could be sited and I think the report will give us some indication of where it could be sited. I think once we have a site for it, then I think politically we can look at what the solution might be.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Thank you for saying that about netball, but putting my own kind of agenda aside regarding the sport, I am really interested, because I think the challenge is fair. It made me reflect on my feelings about providing facilities to certain sports above others. It would be really helpful perhaps to

understand what economic models sport needs to present to the department in order to be rewarded with that kind of investment. Is it based on net profit per year? What is the model?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Darren had a very close association with the original discussions around bringing the Super League Triathlon to Jersey. Funnily enough, as you know, I did not have a lot of input into that because it was very much a commercial decision rather than sporting. I could see the sporting benefit of having role models here going into schools and what that might be able to do to support those particular sports.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Are they doing that, out of interest?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Yes, they are doing that. That is part of ... but I will let Darren in, because Darren is closer to it than I, if you want to just briefly touch on that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is not just Super League, it is also, I suggest, the same: how do you choose netball over shooting? How do you make these decisions as to, from a sporting perspective, which sports you ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I will just go on that because I think it is important. We have got - and it has been said time and time again - a fantastic range of sporting facilities in this Island.

[12:15]

Some of them are world-class, up-to-date, modern. There are others that are probably a little bit past their sell-by date. Some sports want to be left on their own and they just want to get on and do their own thing and find their own funding. I think what we have had to do is try to ... by engaging with them, talking to them, not just Government and the department, but also K.K.P. themselves have had close discussions with ... I cannot say every sport, because I do not know that is true, but certainly a vast number of sports about what their needs are. I think that has allowed us to thin down the sports that we believe are short of facilities and can offer the most in terms of development of young people, for example. I will pick 2. Netball is one of those. It is the biggest women's participation sport in Jersey and it is important that that is allowed to develop and move forward. The other one is gymnastics. They have not had a purpose-built home for gymnastics ever here; they have to beg, borrow and steal facilities. It has got enormous potential in terms of developing

young people, not just into gymnastics but other sports as well through developing them physically at the right age.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I think this is where I was coming when I was speaking to Deputy Perchard originally about how you choose. You just mentioned purpose-built gymnastics facilities. Given the land use constraints that Jersey is under, the idea of purpose-built for an individual sport strikes me as luxurious. My head says every facility that we create should be multipurpose, it should be netball today, gymnastics tomorrow, basketball the day after.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Can I just make one point and I will let Barclay answer, because he is chomping at the bit? It is that I agree with you, but I think with something like gymnastics, with the pits and everything that they have got with that particular sport, I think there are other uses you could use within a building, but there are elements of gymnastics that are very difficult to allow other sports to come in and use. They have not got pits in the Island, they do not have a purpose-built gym area where they have got pits where they can use bars kids can train over and fall into safe areas and things like that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I am just thinking of where my daughter has been doing gymnastics for the last few years and I am just thinking that looked pretty purpose-built to me.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

But they have not ... maybe purpose-built is the wrong thing to use. There may be somewhere here that we can adapt so that it is a home for gymnastics rather than a purpose-built centre for that, but they certainly do not have anywhere ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I do not mean to be awkward: how are you choosing that? Why are you choosing that gymnastics needs to have to this purpose-built facility over another sport, which may have just as good a claim to a purpose-built facility? Is it numbers of people partaking? What is it?

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

The money that they raise?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Is it money that they raise, exactly, because privately they have created their own purpose-built facilities?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It is need and the numbers that will use those facilities.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Cool. Will you send us those numbers? Not just for gymnastics, but across the sporting ... because we are really interested in how you are making these decisions. Darren is shaking his head.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Because we know how many people are currently involved in gymnastics. There are waiting lists for gymnastics, for example, so there is a need there. Like I say, they have never had ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

But strangely enough, participation drops off age 11.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I am sure it does, and it drops off ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I know it does, because they suddenly showed no interest in my daughter going back and she was not elite.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

It drops off in football at 18, it drops off in sports at different ages.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is a really important question.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Yes, absolutely.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What are they doing to develop that into a life-long sport, not just a childhood sport where you are cut off if you are not elite at the age of 11?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

But I have already said that. Gymnastics is not about just providing elite gymnasts.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

At that moment, it is.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I do not think it is because I can think of somebody that has just won a British title at weightlifting that was a gymnast that has gone into another sport, more by luck than judgment, but those pathways do not exist at the current time and they need to be developed.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I am just saying, as a parent, I noticed that my daughter was cut off age 11 because she was not elite.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

All I will comment is that is not right.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Perhaps to be a bit more objective, the figures side of things, I think the question that we really would like a clear answer to - and if that means following up with documentation and numbers, that would be great - what do clubs or sporting associations have to provide to the States in order for us to then turn around and say: "Yes, we will give you X amount a year"? Because the rugby club is obviously generating revenue and it includes thousands of people, so I can see the business case there. What do sports have to do? Is it just about the commercialisation of sport or do we also give money based on other measures like wellbeing? How do you select them and how do you distinguish between a sport that we are funding for wellbeing purposes that might not generate revenue and how do you distinguish that from a commercial investment in sport?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

We do not sponsor or grant fund sports clubs to run sports clubs. We never have and I do not think we should, in my personal opinion. I think there are ways we do help sports clubs. Barclay, with his sports portfolio, provides rates for sports clubs to use facilities, swimming clubs, for example, at beneficial rates. That is the right way to do it, but clubs have always run themselves in this Island, be it football clubs, swimming clubs. They have membership fees and they are run privately of Government. That is the way they need to remain.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

So the subsidies received by the rugby club, how have they come about?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

The rugby club grant is not based on ... for me, that is not a sporting decision.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Could you please explain what you mean?

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It might be easier if Barclay explains his bit first in terms of the first part of your question, and if we go back I will talk about Super League and the Reds briefly.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Okay.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I think to answer your first question about the sort of batting order of sport and what comes next, some of this goes back to the future strategy in 2015, where a number of sports had significant investment. If you look at football, for example, Springfield Stadium was re-laid with a 3G pitch and the use of that facility has gone through the roof. Other 3G pitches were built at Haute Vallée, for example. Hockey had reinvestment in a new surface, new lights, new fencing et cetera at Les Quennevais Sports Centre. Athletics had some money invested in it in a new track, new equipment et cetera. Some of the sports did not have any investment in ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

But that was off the back of the Island Games.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Correct. Naturally, where there was no investment in the likes of netball et cetera, that almost comes as what is next in the list? The reality with netball is it ... the physical literacy around netball is incredible. The amount of sessions and training and squads that they run is phenomenal, almost sort of pound for pound on the Island. So it does make sense to consider helping and contributing towards the vast numbers of people that play netball, not only outside of school time, but also within the school curriculum; it is an incredibly popular sport. The reality is we are spoilt in some respects here, because sport is an integral part of Island life. We have the cricket team doing incredibly well. We have the Jersey Bulls doing incredibly well. We have got Jersey Netball, who were playing in a league last year and doing incredibly well. We spoke about the triathlon. We have a lot of people doing sports that are almost good to excellent. The reality is some of the projects at the moment have not had any significant investment for a considerable period of time. You are right, some sports like triathlon or shooting are very self-sufficient; they take care of themselves. They look after their own finances and they are pretty much self-sufficient. It is just almost what is next down the line?

Cricket is an example. It is almost coming up for some support and help. We have cricket wickets that are currently floating around and moving. We have got some building infrastructure, for example, Grainville pavilion is very tired. Not only does football use those facilities, but rugby uses those facilities, so we do run as multi-use as we can.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

How much do we spend on land-based activities versus water-based?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The water-based, our pools are very popular. We have a number of significant swimming clubs: Jersey Swimming Club, the Tigers and probably 5 others. Outside of curriculum time those pools are full.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What about clubs and sport which use the sea?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Sea swimming is growing. Long-distance swimming is growing. We know that there are more people doing that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

How much does the Government help with that facility? I hear talk about rugby, but I have not heard you mention sailing, I have not heard you mention windsurfing or surfing. I have not heard you mention any of these water-based activities at all.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

A lot of the strength in sailing, for example, comes about from St. Catherine's Sailing Club. Again, it is an almost staunchly independent club and a very close-knit community. Sailing has never come to ... the facilities that I run, as I said, we need some extra help.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Do you consider water-based activities as at all as part of your portfolio?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I do not see them as part of that portfolio, to be honest with you. They are independent and they are run independently. They use the natural environment, which is mentioned in the Government Plan, but ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

They still need the land-based reception centres and places to look after and store their boats.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

One of the big strengths of Jersey is I am not sure what sport you cannot do here, probably skiing, but you can do water-skiing, although there has been talk of a dry slope.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Thank goodness. We have talked about it in the past, but let us not go there.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Most sports in Jersey are independent and do not ask for Government support or even want to use the facilities. The Breca is a recent activity, which is sea swimming and running on the north coast, trail running. There are so many things that go on. It would be very odd to sponsor dressage as a Government, would it not? Does Government sponsor dressage?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, I think you are on safe ground there.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have no horse facilities.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

You have no horse facilities, terrible. What we can do is look at the social, economic, commercial and beneficial elements of promoting those sports, particularly the social element. We need to be making sure that Jersey stays fitter than it did. That is where we make real savings. The mile walk promotion, Daily Mile, it is those things, which are not sport, but is then a step into it, the Breeze Programme with getting people cycling and things like that. It is the transformational things you can do which then step into sport.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The reason I mention water-based sports - I was not thinking of swimming pools, I was thinking of the sea - is because when I go back to what I said about land use, we talk about all these sports, which apparently all want their own purpose-built facilities, which take up a huge amount of land, whereas we have a whole set of sports which use very little land at all and are incredibly good for people and include the social side, include the well-being side and include all of that. It was just that you had not mentioned it once. It seems to me that the Government is focused on land-based sports, not water-based, except the swimming pools.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Traditional sports. St. Catherine's, for example ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Nothing more traditional than swimming.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

... should have hot showers and changing facilities, should it not?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I was just going to bring that up. Take sea swimming, it is my sport. We have had investment in showers around the Island, which we did not have at one time. They are in various spots, where you can come out of the sea and have a shower, not always very warm, but nevertheless it is a clean shower. We put events on. We get help from the Coastguard. We get help from various other Government agencies. There was a big event run in the summer where the Parish, the States and Infrastructure were all involved and provided support. When there is help required, there is help given. It is not always monetary. Support for the Super League Triathlon was provided by Infrastructure at no cost, rather than a subsidy. There is assistance to those sports, as there are with other water sports. In terms of physical buildings, one of the ones that we are trying to work a little closer with was water polo and providing them with the facilities that they needed. That has been difficult, but that does not mean that we will not work with them and provide the right solution for them. A lot of work goes on behind the scenes. I like to deal with things behind the scenes, because I think that is the best way to do it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Trouble is public eye transparency.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I like transparency, but I also like a smooth life.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

That means cutting out the public, apparently. Sorry, just saying, we have to get on to the actual figures. Darren, we will come back to the question that Deputy Perchard asked you a bit later on, if that is okay. We have to get through some of the figures. Looking at Fort Regent, the pre-feasibility study, I just wanted to go through the figures there, if you do not mind, John, just to work out where you get them. If we start by looking at the financial case, we have £150,000 for 2020 for business advisory. What does that mean, business advisory?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Business advisory is looking at the economic case for different things going in there. So if there was a botanical garden and an art offer in as well as a sports offer in, what would be the financial return on that? What is the business benefit of that?

[12:30]

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Why do you need an economist in there for £60,000 on top of the business advisory for £150,000?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Because that is how the business case is built up, on a 5-case business model, so you need an economist as well. I am not an economist and I do not really ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

We are going to spend £150,000 on a business advisory consultancy from outside - I guarantee it will be from outside - to tell us about the economics of the different business models, as well as an economist to tell us about the economics of the different business models.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, the economist will then work up in more detail the preferred option.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Why, as we have an Economic Development Department, are we not using their economist?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Generally speaking, and this will be procured through the economic advisers ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Do you mean Oxera?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, no, the economist that the States employ. They do not have expertise in this sort of model, but they will be part of it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

This is not the first time where I have seen a business case where an economist has been put in as well. It is making me wonder why we have economists in the Government if they cannot help when they are needed on these sorts of projects.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is a good question. It is similar to having Law Officer advice and specialists in contract law who come in and out. It is the same thing. The economists we procure have the expertise in these areas. The economists that are employed by the States have more of a general economy about how Government works and our country works. That is my understanding.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

£80,000 for financial modelling, is that just modelling of the project finances or is that also part of the business advisory?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, the project finances, the N.P.V. (Net Present Value) and all of that. These are estimates and we tend to make them with some optimism bias and conservative.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Oh gosh. P.M.O. (project management office) support. What is P.M.O.?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Project management office.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So this is going to be £350,000. Remember this is all before we have even got started. This is just a pre-feasibility study.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So you are spending £350,000 on a project management office for a project which does not yet exist.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What do they do for their £350,000?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They bring all the strands together and make sure that we sit at these meetings with the right information, the information is presented correctly to the boards, the decisions are in the right place at the right time doing the right things, and politically there is an assurance that the governance is being done properly.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

This is for the pre-feasibility part?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Why do we need them, given that there is not a project yet to manage? Why do we need project managers?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Because there are so many options; we talked earlier about the intricacies. Projects of this complexity need somebody at the head of it and a team looking at all these strands and pulling them together. Ideally they would be people within the organisation. If they are, that would be great, because we will not spend that money.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, absolutely. I would hope so, given that there is no project. The master plan concept and design, £500,000, how did you come up with that?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Master planning is more of a special planning specialism, an architectural specialism and a planning specialism. Again, ideally I would like to do that internally, but we put the provision in there that if we cannot do that internally we will do it externally.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

How did you come up with £500,000 for that?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is an estimate from the project manager on how much time and effort it is going to cost. Again, it depends on what the solution is. If we are talking extreme solutions ... if the solution is we fettle up the existing operation, you will not spend that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No, I appreciate that. I am assuming we are not going to do that.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. Pre-feasibility is the hardest part of the project. I personally, as a person who has delivered lots of projects, know that is where you put your time and effort in, into the pre-feasibility, so you know what you want and you have the support of that, then the feasibility to make sure you are really fine-tuning. That is money well spent, as long as you deliver it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I appreciate that. Good planning means that you usually get good results. I accept that.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Exactly, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What is the commercial manager managing, given that there is no commercial aspect to a pre-feasibility study?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That would be later on, depending on what the commercial offer is. That may be working with private sector or developers. It depends what the solution is. The solution could be a mixed partnership agreement between the public and the private sector.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Absolutely, I think that is probably quite right.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have a one chance of putting this forwards. We are quite conservative in what we are putting forward. My vote is to not spend any of it. That is my intent, but I have to make sure that there is enough provision in there, because I cannot come back to you guys in July of next year saying: "I have run out of money. We have a really good opportunity on the commercial side of this to work in partnership with another party, but I have not got any funding to look at the viability of that."

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I have asked this question before, but if you do not mind refreshing my memory, what is place-making?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It was new to me as a term. It took me a long time to get my head around it. It is something that has been very successful and I have learned from this. When a project transcends a period of time, if it is a 10-year project - and the Fort will be, it took 10 years to do the original Fort project in the 1960s - the public do not want to lose that amenity for 10 years. The public also need to be engaged in the iterations of what is happening. What these companies do is they basically keep the project and the place alive through that period. The example we saw was the King's Cross development in London, where in the intermediate steps of construction they set up pop-up markets and were doing beer festivals and doing things around there that used the space, so that the people still felt engaged with it while the project was going on. It is a really important element of this particular project, so that people do not lose faith in it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Why is that in the 2020 budget?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It has to start now. The concern we have is the Fort has got problems. It has diminishing income which we are trying to deal with. We need to keep the faith in the facility and keep people engaged in it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Who do you use for that?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We are going to have to tender for that; some people who know what they are doing in this area.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I assume they are probably not on the Island then.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I do not know. It is new to me as a project manager, delivering hard infrastructure, but ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Deputy Perchard is quite rightly pointing out that you have £200,000 for place-making next year, but nothing continuing afterwards. Given that this is a 10-year project, why is that not extended across the range of the 4 years?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It should be.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is not in your business case unless ... what is business continuity?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Okay. No, sorry, what will happen is this is a pre-feasibility bid to get us through to the major capital project. This is in the major capital project box. This is a slight confusion. There will be a separate funding source from 2021, so that is why it is just for one year.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, I appreciate that. £200,000?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It depends on what events you are putting on. If you are going to put ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It better be a local contractor doing that, I am telling you now. If we are talking events up at Fort Regent next year, you do not need external off-Island contractors to sort that out. I will be watching just to make sure. Business continuity, what is that?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Business continuity is keeping the Fort open and keeping whatever facilities are there now ... making sure that if we need to close them or if we need to change them, there is an alternative plan. There will probably be some temporary facilities, if needed, which we are looking at. We had a position this year where we were on a go/no-go of closing the Fort. It is only through a huge endeavour to keep it open, where we chucked a huge amount of resource and effort in to keep it going. What we do not want is another element like that without a better plan behind it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

You have £120,000 for next year, but then £3 million the year. What is the big step?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

K.K.P.'s advice is that there needs to be some temporary facility. We are just looking at options at the moment. That could be a temporary structure in another part of town fulfilling some of those needs.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Indicative delivery costs, £10 million in 2021. That is just the major capital project, is that what you are thinking? £25 million in 2024?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. This is a significant project.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes. That is what that is, that is just an indication?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. It is getting people used to the fact that this is not going to be £5 million and everybody is happy. This is a big project. Hopefully that will be funded in other ways and developed in the future.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I appreciate it, thank you. Again looking at the sports work, refurbishment et cetera of Island sport facilities, we have talked about the big conflict and that was the major area we wanted to talk about. You have £1 million next year for wider improvements to the "sporting estate and lifecycle planning."

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

What particular sporting estate are you going to be looking at next year?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

There is a list on there. I can go through them because I know them, but I know Barclay knows them inside out. Do you want to go through that, Barclay, what we are going to be doing with that money?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. There are a number of projects. A good example, FB Fields pavilion is very old internally, very tired, almost at the end of its life. That supports cricket and football. It needs not a structural refurbishment, but certainly an internal refurbishment. That is on the list. Les Quennevais pitch 1

has end of life lighting. It is a very popular pitch that we play a lot of evening football on. Again, we simply cannot replace the lights as the parts do not exist anymore, so we are looking to replace those completely. We have a playing fields team who look after all the playing fields. They have no shed essentially, in simple terms, to store their equipment. When we left Warwick Farm years ago, a lot of it has been stored outside. That is not good for it. We need to put it in a secure location. We have looked at Grainville for that. We have some work to do at Havre des Pas. It last had a significant investment in 1999. Some of the old original railings there around the outside of that structure need to be replaced. Sadly, that is not a cheap option. Predominantly that is an aesthetics and safety case. We need some investment into cricket. We have some very old and tired cricket nets.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Where? It says loads of cricket nets around the Island. Which ones?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

All 3 need some help: Grainville, FB Fields and Les Quennevais. Cricket squares, we have an issue with one square, for example, at Les Quennevais, which is in simple terms floating. It is just moving around the whole of the pitch, which is not good.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Might make boundaries easier to get.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. On the corner of Les Quennevais Sports there must be 100 leylandii trees that are 30 years old and starting to fall over. I cannot afford the risk of them falling over, so they need to be replaced.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I know the ones you mean. Is £1 million going to be enough for all this work next year?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

£1 million is a good start to getting us back on track and to getting us to a point where some of those what I call tired facilities can have a facelift. They need to be inspirational. We need to keep people active. To do some of that work will certainly satisfy and keep those facilities safe. Some of these are safety things and some of them are keeping people on the move.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The list you have given us is not necessarily all to be done next year. The 4-year Government Plan does give you larger amounts in following years.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That was 2020 that I spoke about.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Oh, that was 2020. Wow.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Then 2023 we have other projects. Again, I mentioned Grainville pavilion. It needs new windows. The changing rooms are very small now. Some of these facilities have been in their current format for 15 years and they need to be upgraded. We have a number of ball courts at our schools. Langford has a ball court; Oakfield has a ball court. These buildings and facilities were built in 2006, so those surfaces need replacing. It is like re-tarmacking tennis courts, we need to do the same in those environments.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Again, just to be clear here, the things you are going to look after are education facilities. Does the Education Department provide any money for you to refurbish their facilities?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Sadly not.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No. We better make sure we use them as well. If this Island is paying for them outside the education context, the Island should be using them.

[12:45]

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

As Senator Pallett said earlier, we are having discussion at the moment with Education to improve the formula to which we operate. We have a good balance at the moment between what is required in curriculum time and what is required outside of curriculum time. We would like to make some adjustments to that to continue that relationship.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

To add on to that, we have discussions with sports all the time. Cricket is an interesting one. Cricket would like to be more in control of their own destiny. We have talked for some time about them taking over the Grainville site as the home of cricket. There is a good opportunity there to work with

them, so that not only can we improve that site for them, but also to improve one or 2 of the other wickets around the Island. There is an issue around the quality of pitches at international level so that we can host international tournaments. Therefore, there is a potential economic loss to the Island by not doing that work. That is why we are working with them. I personally would like to see them and I think they have the vision to take Grainville over in the same way that the hockey club have at Les Quennevais, where they can find their own sponsors and find some of their own investment into the facility to make it their own. That is an ongoing issue. It will be of benefit to Government as well.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We know that the sea wall, for example, at Havre des Pas and the structure there will need some attention in the next 3 years. It takes a huge amount of abuse from the sea when the wind is doing certain things.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

How is John's infrastructure budget looking as far as supplementing your budget? Like you say, that helps the sea defences as well. John is delighted I have asked that question.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They will be doing the work, because they are specialists in doing it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

One thing is does the funding for repairing Havre des Pas... I guess we are talking about the swimming pool here.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Does that fall entirely within your budget, as opposed to John's wider infrastructure sea defence budget?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That would be a budget that I would bid for funding for. The delivery of that refurbishment would be done by a maintenance officer from Property Holdings. We work closely with them, but I would be bidding for the funding to be able to do that work.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I see. So sea defence funding does not help with that.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, because it is not really a sea defence.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

No, it is a leisure facility.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. We are not going to see it collapse. The good thing about the assets being all together is there is a common understanding that we are going to do it. To know the cost and value of that, that budget should sit with Barclay, but in how the work gets done is it gets done by specialist teams.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Moving on quickly, the decampment of sport from Fort Regent, the skate park, the decampment of the netball facility and a synthetic pitch is £6.2 million next year. Obviously we do not know how much Fort Regent will be decamping next year, because it depends on what happens to Fort Regent. How does that £6.2 million break down for next year?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

It is a conservative estimate, as I suggested before. Obviously the skate park is one which ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The skate park has its own separate funding.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Has its own separate funding, yes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So why is that in here?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The predominant element there is ... again, it is about the viability of the facility moving forwards and what alternative ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Which facility, Fort Regent?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, generally Fort Regent.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

So why is the skate park in that £6.2 million? The netball facility, is that a netball facility at Fort Regent?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We see netball as a huge priority in light of the loss of the facility at Les Ormes.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

So we put provision in there to find some solution for netball in the short term before we find the long-term solution, which may be a temporary structure.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is a lot of money to spend on something temporary, which might end up being sold by the Fort Regent ...

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is right.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I do not want to see the Government spending £1 million, let us say, on creating a netball facility for 5 years which is then moved up to Fort Regent, because it is all part of that. It is just a waste of £1 million.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

We will know that fairly soon.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We are confident of that, because the cost benefit is not very positive there, because your life is only 5 years. But we have a short-term problem which we need to address, so that that sport maintains its support and popularity.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The synthetic pitches? I thought Barclay was just talking about synthetic pitches.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They are additional ones, are they not?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. That is Education's bid, is it not?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I have not bid for any additional synthetic pitches.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

That is within the Education budget.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is under workstream 3 in your sports facilities pre-feasibility study.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I do not think it should be.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

No problem. Quickly moving on, we will not do sports division refurbishment. You have the separate sports division refurbishment budget. How do you ensure that this does not overlap with the work that you are doing from the Island's sports facilities budget? How are you making sure that they do not overlap?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Is that the £250,000 amount?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes. It is a much, much smaller one.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

That is the minor capital. This is predominantly 50 per cent of our income is derived from the Active Card membership, of which since the Island Games we have not invested enough in the replacement

of those gym equipment items, essentially. We have over 450 bits of equipment that need to be replaced on a ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

The thing is that this capital business case includes FB Playing Fields pavilion, which you just mentioned as part of that £6.2 million. It includes Les Quennevais pitch lighting and the Grainville groundsman shed, it also includes the Havre des Pas swimming pool railings, it also includes cricket nets and includes the temporary skate park, all of the things which are coming apparently out of this £1 million here. How come we have 2 different business cases for the same capital projects?

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I am only familiar with the one I submitted.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Which was?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

You submitted one. Somebody seems to have duplicated it.

Operations Manager, Sport Division, Growth, Housing and Environment:

I submitted a business case for minor capital, which was the £250,000 and £2 million in 2020 and £2.9 million in 2021 to 2023.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

This is what we mean about the confusion which occurs with the Government Plan.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Which one are you quoting from for that?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

I am quoting from Island sports facilities, this one, and also sports division refurbishment. Could I suggest that we take this offline and deal with it outside of this hearing?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes, let us take it offline, if you do not mind. Thank you. Apologies for that, we will find out ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Skate park. To be fair, I do not have much to say on this, because the skate park needs to be done. The issue principally is why is it happening in 2021 and not 2020 as originally promised? We discussed this briefly at the end of the last hearing.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

As the political champion for it, I would have liked to have seen this built in 2020. Having had some ... as mentioned previously, I met with the Director General about 2 weeks ago, where we looked at some of the sequencing and timing for how that project might move forward. I have to say we did not totally see eye to eye about everything we discussed. We have come to an understanding that to try to deliver that all in 2020 was probably not achievable. Although we will work towards that, it is more likely, in terms of getting that project completed, it probably would not be completed until 2021. That is the first time I have said that publicly. It is extremely disappointing for me to have to admit that. When we are looking that we are now into October, nearly November, by the time the Government Plan debate has gone through, then we are going to have to tender for a designer, we are going to have to go through a planning process and tendering process. It is not going to be 6 months; it is going to be a longer period than that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Can I ask, do you see the users paying to use the skate park?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

The intention is no, a definite no.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It is just I can see in the business case here it says participant spending you are expecting £25,000 a year. What does that mean, participant spending?

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

I can only presume that includes onsite spend for drinks, café stuff and things like that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Stuff like concessions. Fair enough. My main question is that we know the funding needs to be there.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Is it worth me just adding the challenge with building anything is you need a site and you need money?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

We have identified the site.

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

The site has been identified to some degree, but there are also satellite sites that need identifying. The money is a function of the Government Plan. The reality of the conversation Steve and I had was one of using best endeavours: when can we deliver this? Ideally we will deliver it as soon as possible, but it depends on how much money you allocate to property procurement and the process that takes, political agreement, and the key one - which is one where it could be really quick or it could be really long - is getting planning permission. I have been conservative with that. I may be proved incorrect, which is great, and we will fund it and try and deliver it next year. The reality is that is a variable beyond the control of myself or anybody else. We would put a proper estimate in place and we think confidently we would have a contract awarded in October next year. That assumes a 16-week planning window. That could be 28 days if no one objects, but this is Jersey and my experience of planning is it tends to be a bit longer than that.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Will you use that Danish company?

Director General, Growth, Housing and Environment:

There are a couple of specialist companies who design and we need to consider whether we could short-circuit at early stage and get them involved, but there is another element to this in terms of getting the design right, making sure it is sustainable and making sure there is a longevity to it.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

It feels like time has slowed down on this project, because it was a while ago when we came up with the assessment of the slides and the potential different designs. I then felt the one at Les Quennevais was the extension that you chose and you went to consultation on that.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

Can I tell you where we are?

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Please.

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

That was a really important piece of consultation with residents and Islanders, because anybody could comment on that. The officer in charge has done a report for the group that is overseeing it,

which I chair. I have seen that report. It has some recommendations in it as to how to move forward. I have asked the Director General and senior officer for a meeting in the next few days to discuss that. One is I think we need to agree the recommendations from that report and put a press release out and probably talk at the States Members' briefing as well about where we currently are. I will only do that when I have a good understanding of what the timeframe or timeline for delivery will be. As we have already discussed, we just need to firm up what that might be, so we are not raising expectations too high. I probably did that to some degree by saying we will get it done July 2020. However, we have to be realistic now, but we do need to deliver it.

[13:00]

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Thank you very much. Last thing of all - 2 minutes - Darren, if you would not mind responding to Deputy Perchard's question earlier about how you came up with the justification for the rugby fund and the triathlon fund.

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Senator Pallett referred to it earlier. I do not think those 2 specific things were looked at as a sport event. The rugby club quite simply approached the States, because they were undergoing a period of crisis. The decision that the Council of Ministers made was that - given a lot of the work that has been discussed today, particularly the sports facilities work - the business model of Jersey Reds was worth keeping going through that period. To lose the rugby club, which effectively was the position that Jersey was in, to lose Jersey's professional rugby club at that stage would have been the worse timing possible, just as you are about to begin a lot of work around sport. The Super League Triathlon - and there are a lot of questions from a variety of different sources about this - again, it was not awarded purely on sporting purposes. John spoke earlier about the leagues that are made with local amateur triathlon clubs. Again, I think it was largely a rounded argument that was made to justify the expenditure. It was not sport expenditure, so it was not £250,000 taken from sport. It was originally funded, as you probably recall, from the Tourism Development Fund as a kind of proof of concept, which is exactly what that fund is there to do. It overachieved against the K.P.I.s (key performance indicators) that were set before and the Minister determined to award them a longer contract. This again has a break clause after this year's event and again that work involves how many people watched it, how many people visited Jersey, what impact it had. That work is being assessed and a recommendation will be made to the Minister, who has a decision to take as to whether to continue. It is a difficult concept to understand. The issues that netball face and the issues that Jersey Reds face and Super League Triathlon face, it is not you back one or the other. I see why people reach that conclusion, but Super League Triathlon effectively is an event that happens with the sport. I think Jersey Reds were in a unique position in time.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

No, I certainly do not see it in that light. The question is simply that we see that a particular sport, whatever it is, may be being subsidised by quite a large amount of money and other sports are not. It is purely an economic question: what is it that that sport gives back that we therefore conclude it is reasonable to fund by that amount? That is the question. Obviously I appreciate you all mentioning that for us, given my question tomorrow, but I am not asking from the perspective of netball at all. I am asking from a perspective of the economic argument for continuing to subsidise the sport by a huge amount of money when they are no longer in crisis.

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

But they are in crisis.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Now?

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Are you talking about financially?

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Yes. Without the States ... there is a plan to secure the sustainable future of professional rugby in Jersey. That was a piece of work that we had done. That was the conclusion that was accepted by the Council of Ministers. As we discussed at the last hearing, there is a tapering-off amount of money to continue to support the rugby club, until such time as a lot of the work that we have started to discuss this morning has taken effect. So is there a shared stadium? Does the business model change to ensure that professional rugby can continue?

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

How do you define crisis in this context?

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

In terms of Jersey rugby?

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Yes.

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They approached Government and basically said that the business model that they were operating, which to be fair to them was much improved from the business model they were operating several years ago, basically did not show that they could continue professional rugby. So they were on the verge ...

Assistant Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture:

They were insolvent.

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

They were insolvent. They were effectively going to drop out of professional rugby. As Senator Pallett said, they were going back to start at the bottom again. That was the situation that faced them. They shared that situation with Government.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

From your perspective, how long is this funding going on? I know you said tapering, but for how many years are you planning to ...

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

Again, as John mentioned earlier, ideally we do not want necessarily ...

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes. No, but how long have you put it in your plans for?

Director, Growth, Housing and Environment:

We have put it in for 3 years. We put it in reducing each year.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Of course it is in the business plan, yes, absolutely.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

I do not have a political perspective of whether we should or should not be doing that. I just want to understand the rationale.

Deputy K.F. Morel:

Yes, brilliant. I feel under pressure to vacate the room; I do not know if you do too. Thank you very much.

Deputy J.H. Perchard:

Thank you very much.

[13:06]