



## **Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel**

### **Teacher Recruitment and Retention Review**

### **Witness: The Minister for Education**

Friday, 24th January 2020

**Panel:**

Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier (Chair)

Deputy T. Pointon of St. John

**Witnesses:**

Senator T.A. Vallois, The Minister for Education

Mr. S. O'Regan, Group Director, Education

Mr. M. Grimley, Group Director, People and Corporate Services

Ms. S. Bishop, Senior Human Resources Manager, C.Y.P.E.S

[14:00]

**Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier (Chair):**

Thanks very much, Minister, for your time. This is a public hearing regards our retention and recruitment review. Just before we start we should say that electronic devices should be turned off. There are no members of the public here but this is streamed live so people can see it as well. We will start off by introducing ourselves. I am Deputy Robert Ward and I chair the Education and Home Affairs Panel.

**Deputy T. Pointon of St. John:**

Trevor Pointon, I am the Deputy of St. John, member of the panel.

**The Minister for Education:**

Senator Tracey Vallois, Minister for Education.

**Group Director, Education:**

Seán O'Regan, Group Director, Education.

**Senior Human Resources Manager, C.Y.P.E.S:**

Sue Bishop, Senior H.R. (Human Resources) Manager for C.Y.P.E.S. (Children, Young People, Education and Skills).

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Mark Grimley, Group Director for People and Corporate Services.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Excellent, thank you. As you know, we have undertaken as a review panel ... one of the topics we have undertaken is recruitment and retention of teachers, so we are at the stage now where we are coming very close to publishing our findings and our report. So this is, if you like, perhaps one of the last things that we do in terms of gathering evidence and ideas and obviously it is important that we talk to the Minister and the team as well on this topic. So if we start off, what themes have you identified that may affect recruitment and retention of teachers?

**The Minister for Education:**

I have been asked questions of this in the States Assembly and, of course, I speak to different teachers and head teachers, and the department as well, the Group Director H.R. as well, around some of these issues. I think it is very reflective in some of your submissions that you have had, particularly the primary head teacher's one so some of the pressures that they are identifying with regards to behaviour or special educational needs, whether it be workload ... of course we have our meetings regularly with the unions every quarter as well so they feed back to us some of the issues that their members are identifying. But in terms of the information that they have provided us, there is not really that much difference in terms of what I have seen. So it is about how we work on that to improve particular issues.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

So there is a familiarisation with the issues that we face out there. Are you getting these things coming through ... there is a lot going on, the big education conversation, school funding review, the Early Years Policy Development Board, there are a lot of reviews going on, we understand that, are you getting these themes through those as well, would you say?

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, absolutely.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Without obviously giving too much away before you do your report.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, no, absolutely. Our report is due next month but alongside that I want to make sure there is an action plan in place so it is not just a review, there is a report and then there is a lot of: "Well, what are you going to do about it, Minister?" We want to try and put an action plan against that because there are themes that are coming through very much around the governance and support and funding and, you know, all those bits and pieces, but the feedback through the education conversation there is a particular need to support around the special educational needs areas as well.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Are you getting those themes ... sorry, I was just thinking about another area of consultation through the E.C.C. (Education Consultative Committee) meetings and so on, when you talk to trade unions who are representative of staff, are those themes coming through there?

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, well I am trying to remember back to the last meeting we had. I am not sure whether you can ... off the top of my head a regular discussion that we have had was around workloads. That is one that is always ongoing, we are regularly discussing that at E.C.C. meetings. I think concerns around planning and guidance, the recent report, what was it a year ago, that that was sent out?

**Group Director, Education:**

If I may back up the Minister's point, one of the great things about the E.C.C. meetings with the unions, and we have had those well established with the teaching unions, we have just set up a parent ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I will just say, because it is a public hearing, that is Education Consultative Committee.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes.

**Group Director, Education:**

Six times a year we meet with all of the unions who represent teachers through, as you say, the Education Consultative Committee. We have set up now a corollary review for the unions that

represent support staff in schools. Where that is helpful is that even where we have developed policy that is supporting the retention of teachers and reducing workload, where there are examples in schools where the policy is falling down, unions are very good at sharing that information with us so that we can address that to get consistency. Because even where there are positives that we have worked on together, if they fall down we want to pick that up again.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I was going to say in your opening remarks to the first question you alluded to identifying similar things to those things that we have identified. That is fine for us to understand that because we know what and you know what, the public however do not know what. I wonder if you could highlight some of the issues that you have ...

**The Minister for Education:**

Well, it is like I said, in terms of the ... so there was the workload in particular, which is a regular ongoing discussion that we have in terms of the Education Consultative Council. There is a number of issues around the behaviour and the demand that is coming around the special educational needs side of things in our non-fee paying schools. There is the time to focus on the teaching and learning element, particularly from a head teacher view because of the increased legislation around G.D.P.R. (General Data Protection Regulation) and all of the various regulations we have in place, whether that is safeguarding and those types of things. Sorry, I am going to start coughing in a minute. Sorry, my brain's not on form as it is usually is because I am not well. But that is basically some of the things.

**Group Director, Education:**

As we get feedback certainly accompanying the Minister on visits to schools, the Minister is always very keen, in fact it is part of the rule, we would have done a school visit this morning but for ill health and the Minister is putting children first by not breathing on them. This is very important. We always arrange those visits so there is an opportunity for all staff, teachers and other staff, to speak with the Minister either in the next break or the lunch break or after school, there is no compulsion on that but we have had mostly 100 per cent of staff coming to share with the Minister as well as some issues of not so much workload itself but perceptions of some work being less necessary. I do not think teachers mind working hard, teacher always have worked hard in my experience and we should celebrate their hard work and their success, but if something is seen as over bureaucratic and unnecessary it is that specific thing. There is a sense in the profession that there is growing need among some groups of children, some of that need might manifest with behaviours and the concomitant of that is while stating the central support services that might help them with psychology or well-being or family support workers and the like, again a lot of feedback is those people are really good but there is not enough of them.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you sense that those challenges are more concentrated in some schools than others and may cause, therefore, greater challenges in some schools than others through recruitment and retention? We have a very selective system, I do not think it is controversial to say that, it is very, very clear.

**The Minister for Education:**

The more pressure will obviously be in those where there is more demand in terms of the behaviours and the concerns around safeguarding things like those for children in those areas. So the pressure will follow where the demand is, of course.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you think there are any wider Jersey challenges specific to the Island for recruitment and retention?

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, cost of living.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Cost of living.

**The Minister for Education:**

But that is right across the board in the public sector, not just teachers.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Anything else in particular that you might ...

**Group Director, Education:**

Some of the feedback we get within cost of living, the biggest single component is one's accommodation. So rents and housing, the aspiration as a young professional to own your own home eventually is objectively more challenging in Jersey than most places. But that comes across not just in the public sector but in all sectors. We have some examples of young teachers who, I think as they ever did, go off travelling and work overseas, and a few have told me directly definitely coming home but they want to save up while overseas to help that long-term aspiration. So we might lose some people temporarily but they find their way back.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Just to go back to, what you could say is a Jersey challenge, the structure of our system, do you think that is challenge because there are a number of schools that do not, for example, have sixth form so you might not get access to A level if you teach there. Do you think that is a challenge for retention of staff who may want to move on for experience?

**The Minister for Education:**

Just as a kind of high level looking at it, I think it is difficult. If you look at any education system around the world, you cannot just automatically have a comparison because we are a very small Island and what we want to be doing is ensuring that we are providing the best opportunity and choices for our children. So if we were to expand, say put an A level on every secondary school, that would reduce the choices and opportunities because of the amount of people that you would have to have come in to provide those opportunities and choices. There has been a conversation around our 14 plus system and whether that moves to a 16 plus system and how you could offer a more flexible opportunities and choices. Not necessarily changing the system as such but having a more collaborative approach in terms of the teaching opportunities that we can provide by increasing the opportunities and choices for our children. So there is a balancing act that we have to play there.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Would you put Highlands into the category of being the vocational of a sixth form college, as it were?

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, it is. I see it as equivalent to Hautlieu in terms of the A levels.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Apart from those that are academically able to transfer to Hautlieu, would that be the provision that we believe we are making for 16 to 18 year-olds?

**The Minister for Education:**

I think we have to improve the provision or the opportunities and choices we are giving to 16 to 18 year-olds on Island. In order to do that you have to approach it in a more collaborative stance with more opportunities and more choices but also investing in your teachers and your lecturers to enable you to do so.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Do you have plans to extend, as they have in the U.K. (United Kingdom) the leaving age from 16 to 18?

**The Minister for Education:**

That is something that we are discussing around the school funding review at the moment, but we are looking at ... we have got a high participation rate at the moment so whether it would be a mandatory requirement to 18 or whether it would be a focus on increased participation is the discussion we are having at this moment in time.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We have identified some of the challenges and we share them, can you see any easy wins which could be taken forward at this stage? Because we can identify some, and we may be common in what we identify, but it is, as you said yourself, doing something about it, that is the key.

**The Minister for Education:**

There are always easy wins in any system but I will go back to my fundamental points I have made around the school funding review. When you have a system that has not been fundamentally properly looked at since 1993 in terms of a funding formula, you are going to have pressures in those areas. Then of course that correlates with these types of things in terms of recruitment and retention, because if there are concerns around how they can get even basics for their students, if they can support the demands in terms of special educational needs or behaviour, that is, of course, going to also help people to think twice about which particular area they are going into in terms of whether it is Education or anywhere in the public sector and the demands that come with that. We are living in a very different world than what we were living in in the 1990s, we have got a very different future coming up ahead of us. We could put quick easy wins in but it will not necessarily fix the problem. It is like putting a plaster over the issue. We do not want to just put a plaster over the issue and keep our fingers cross and hope it is going to work for the next couple of years, what we need to do with the school funding review and the education conversation is bring those together with that vision and that expectation for the next 10 years of education and put in what I would call a form of transition plan that would be bringing in some of these easy wins but will comply with a longer-term strategy so that it all fits together rather than just a tick box kind of exercise saying: "Yes, we are doing it" but it is not necessarily being seen in the frontline.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

There are obviously questions around efficiency savings that have been made in terms of pay as well, which obviously would impact on the amount of money that is available. So it does seem a slight contradiction ... we have clearly identified, everyone has identified a funding issue but at the same time we are putting pressure of funding, which is perhaps for another hearing but it is certainly an issue that we have face I would imagine. In terms of ... so we have talked a lot about some of the issues that we can identify, what are the strengths? Let us be more positive, what strengths are there that you can identify in what we do to recruit and retain teachers so far? We might be able to build on what you have seen.

**Group Director, Education:**

My considered view, having taught in Jersey and in another place for decades and returned, and talking to lots of teachers, especially those who have experience of teaching in other places, Jersey has, by and large, got great children and young people to teach, great schools, the pay is better, the holiday is a bit longer, the facilities around the class sizes and some of the pressures that teachers who have joined Jersey maybe felt in other jurisdictions, perhaps the 4 countries of the United Kingdom or elsewhere, I get a lot of feedback from teacher saying it is refreshing, contrasting some of their previous experience to be able to focus more on teaching. It is not say by any means it is perfect but if you are asking the question of some of the strengths, I would say those are some of them.

[14:15]

**The Minister for Education:**

I will just check with Sue or Mark, do you have anything to add to that in terms of strengths that you see from H.R.?

**Senior Human Resources Manager, C.Y.P.E.S:**

I do not think so.

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

I think the thing that strikes me, having not been here too long, is the stability of the workforce. So where I have come from, from inner London, the turnover of teachers causes a lot of problems in terms of the standards, the quality and I think that something we recognise as a strength is the stability of our workforce.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

So you are not seeing a turnover in schools?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

There is always a turnover in schools but it causes less issues here than where there is a larger churn or where people seek to move. My perception, and I do not want to get into the Minister or Seán's briefs, is that the standards of education here are higher, the stability of the workforce must contribute to that and that it allows us to give a very good narrative to when we want to attract people that they are coming into a supportive environment. I saw some stats earlier where people were talking about the support they receive in their profession.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

So, from a H.R. point of view, you are not seeing a churn of staff in specific areas, specific schools, specific sectors anywhere in our education system?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

I would not say ... it is well known that we do not have a huge amount of insight so some of this has to be about perception. But we will have the same issues around key or specific subjects, particularly S.T.E.M. (Science, Technology, Engineering, Mathematics), in the secondary phase, the primary phase seems relatively stable. The turnover is not as high and therefore that means that the issues that we can tackle can be done more systemically.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Right, the turnover is not as high compared to inner London, you mean?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Compared to inner London, yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

But you say you do not have a great deal of insight in terms of ...

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

So we are building up new models for workforce planning here and we will get a lot more insight about the type of turnover and the prediction, because some turnovers will be by retirement. So we do a lot more planning. I think when I arrived just over the summer, some of the questions were around how many vacancies do we have at the beginning of the year. We know where they are, we have plans to fill those but I think we are in a much better position through earlier planning to start saying ... and I think you picked up on some of this, around pooling teachers or targeting specific subjects. That is where we can improve.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I have got some questions about ... we will come back to the H.R. process because it is something that has been highlighted. Just a general question, which I think is interesting, do you think the ministerial team ... I am assuming they mean the Council of Ministers in general because, you know, it has to be an understanding, has ... have you had many conversation with the ministerial team about the challenges you have found with recruitment and retention? Do you think ... I do not know how to put this apart from do they get it?

**The Minister for Education:**

So, Council of Ministers meetings are usually set agendas. We get the papers like the Friday before and it is all kind of ... and there is always a lot of work to go through on that Wednesday and it goes all the way through the day. Where I get the opportunity to talk about the challenges that we are facing in Education, of course I do raise that with the ministerial team. Any specific issues around whether it is recruitment retention, whether it is teacher workload, all those types of things, or, for example, like we were saying before, some of these issues coming up in the school funding review, for example, I will go directly to Mark who is the H.R. director and the Constable of St. Ouen, who is Vice-Chair of the States Employment Board, who I want to have discussions and raise issues with them of any concerns that we may have so that we can take that on board at the States Employment Board, which is probably the best area that could help address the issues rather than Council of Ministers.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I was thinking of things such as the Migration Policy Development Board, if there is an issue arising with the recruitment in such an important sector of our society and our economy in Education, whether they have taken that into account. Are they informed of the issue that might be there in order that they can develop a migration policy that is cognisant with the challenges that you face?

**The Minister for Education:**

The Migration Policy Development Board is not something I sit on, however we did have, as a ministerial team, a meeting on 13th December discussing how the migration policy work will feed in with the Island Plan. There was something else on that as well. I think it was the Housing Policy Development Board things. So there was a bigger discussion, a bigger strategic discussion around those types of things. I was primarily there to discuss post-16, skills for the workforce, those types of things but, of course, if you do not have the right education system that sits behind that you will not necessarily get the skills that you need so it kind of goes hand in hand. But we have had those higher level discussions around how we bring this all together, these bigger plans that we have.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Just to go back to the recruitment process, the H.R. recruitment process, do you think that the current process and talent link is ... what is your assessment of it?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

I met with head teachers, secondary phase head teachers so whatever I think is probably exactly what they are thinking. Our candidate experience and also our recruiting head teacher experience is extremely poor. It is very clunky. I have no doubts that we probably lose candidates that we ought to be keeping through the process and it is one of the things, thanks to additional funding in the Government Plan that we are going to reconfigure. In doing that I want to work with head

teachers, as I will with other departments, about what works for them. I am acutely aware of the overheads that we are putting on them and their officers to do a lot of manual recruitment. We need to make it simpler for them. So had your question been, is it fit for purpose, I would have shortly just said: "No."

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I think we may have found another common theme.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

How long is it going to take to rectify this?

**The Minister for Education:**

Can I just make a point here? I have been in the States 11 years now and H.R. has been the poor man of the public service for way too long. When we are talking about some of the issues that you raise with us with regards to recruitment and retention of teachers, right across the public sector, particularly in specialised areas, whether that is nurses, social workers, those types of areas because we have not invested in H.R. the right way. We did put in a large growth funding bid in the Government Plan for human resources, for I.T. (information technology), all those areas in order to bring all that together and bring into the 21st century.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

It is not just a malady of human resources, it is a malady that seems to go across education, we are encouraged to see things beginning to move in education but P.82 in 2012, we are only just looking at it in real terms. I hope that this is going to be a can do Assembly and will do Assembly.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes. With the Government Plan ...

**The Deputy of St. John:**

If you can sort out H.R. that is a real boom to ...

**The Minister for Education:**

I think this is the fifth or sixth H.R. director I have seen in my time in the States so that gives you an idea of how much we have sustainability in our H.R. system in the public sector.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

H.R. became very generic with the hub and my personal opinion as a Deputy, not necessarily the panel's opinion, is that was a mistake because it lost some of the knowledge that was required for

specific areas. Do you think that that will be addressed, that issue of specialist H.R. for specialist areas, such as Education, particularly when you are looking at recruitment and packages for recruitment where you may have to ... do you think you will go out there and look to recruit with specialist H.R. in terms of Education?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

In the new operating model for people in corporate services we have put a dedicated resourcing function. So when people up there do the transactional work, so taking people on, doing the paper work, the specialist resourcing function is to look at key profession and key shortages and they will do targeted campaigns. So they will get to know what we are doing. At the moment I have kept the resourcing function for medical staffing separate because that is also another specialism. I do not want to water down professions. The Deputy asked how long these things will take. I have been very clear that there is a lot we have to put in as the basics. We will do some quick fixes now. I know we have got the resignations coming up and therefore we have to start thinking about the autumn term. We are thinking about that now to make sure that we are ready for that but the substantive improvements will not be seen until back end of the year, there is that much to do.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Will those quick fixes include engaging recruitment consultants?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Only if appropriate. There is an overhead to recruitment consultants. One of the things that we will need to do first of all is understand what is not working for schools. Now, I know, for example, the very simple example is references need to come - because of safer recruiting - at the point of interview and that is not happening. Schools are having to do that themselves. We should be working through what they need and what works for them. So the phrase I use is at the moment is a one-size-fits-all, what we need to do is look at how different workforces work, so schools specifically, and configure to their needs. It is all doable with technology, it is just not being done.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We were I do not know whether it was concerned or intrigued by an advert that appeared for an international education recruitment agency, I think it was on the States website. I will not give you the company name because I do not want to advertise for them, but it is certainly a sales driven role which offers free annual 5 star all expenses paid to Las Vegas, a summer vacation, monthly lunch clubs and even a Rolex target. Where will they fit into this? Why is that just suddenly appeared? I do not know if you have seen it but it may be something to look at. Perhaps you should be offering those to the teachers and they might stay. Do you know anything about that?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

I have absolutely no idea about that.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Okay, but is not something that we produced?

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Certainly not.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

That is good to hear. One of the things we said of the current arrangements, one of the issues that has arisen is about part-time and job sharing opportunities, without giving anything away of our report, that is certainly a theme that has come through again. What is your view on the current situation there with regards to staff who want to go part time or take on job share? It has to be said, and I do not think I am wrong at all in saying, that would be, I would say, proportionately women who would want to do that, although I do know of male members of staff who also want to do that, particularly those who have just had babies, for example.

**The Minister for Education:**

In the very basic sense of the term, I believe the issue may be slightly more difficult in a secondary setting than it would be in a primary setting because of the specialist nature of some of those areas but I think it is probably best for me to get Seán to give you a more kind of detailed overview of that particular area.

**Group Director, Education:**

I think this certainly relates to work that other Scrutiny Panels are doing. Earlier this week, Mark Grimley and myself were supporting the Chief Minister and one of the Assistant Ministers at Deputy Doublet's Scrutiny looking at the gender pay gap. The datasets considered by the model are instructive because on your point of how desirable it is for some people to have part-time job shares or short-term working across the piece, but predominantly in the school estate which has a high number of part-time, short-term jobs and not only part-time but term-time only which people with very young children who start to go to school that is desirable. But they are predominantly filled by the primary carer of children who are women.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Are you talking about teaching jobs?

**Group Director, Education:**

No, I think it divides between teaching jobs as well but the totality of support roles, some as short as hour a day, as a midday supervisor type role. So within ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We want to focus really on teachers.

**Group Director, Education:**

You want to focus on teachers?

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, that is what this about.

**Group Director, Education:**

So in our estate we have got a lot of those roles. The default for somebody applying to have adaptations to their work, to work part time or to job share, all of our head teachers have to give due consideration because ultimately they are the arbiters. If it just does not work for the good running of the organisation they have to look really hard at that and see can they accommodate.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

We gather that there is quite widespread resistance from the head teachers to offering job share or part-time roles.

**Group Director, Education:**

We discussed this at a previous hearing, Minister, you gave evidence where the majority of requests had been granted but you had had some more anecdotal feedback that ... and I think we invited through our E.C.C. process if there are cases we need to look at but I am pretty sure that the last time we furnished data the majority had said: "Yes."

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

There are a couple of things there. I think the autonomy that developed over the last 4 years or so at the schools, which was, I would say, not really clearly defined, has given heads a say in it. When you said the good running of the organisation, that is a very general term. I think what we are finding is that it is very difficult for staff to go part time when they want to and it is disproportionately women who are effected by that. It may be in a majority of case but then that is statistics for you. There may be a significant number who are not and whether you have the data on any particular schools where it is more difficult than others.

[14:30]

I am surprised that secondary would be more difficult, I would have thought primary might be more difficult because of the nature of one teacher in front of a class as opposed to a number of different ... and that relationship. I think we have some ...

**The Minister for Education:**

I think you have hit the nail on the head in terms of the autonomy issue. That is something that was in the last term's business plan to deal with but it was never broached properly. It was never completed in terms of the Education business plan and I think it is something that we can clarify and define and work properly with head teachers around that autonomy, putting in the proper governance, like I was going back to before, because there needs to be clear lines of responsibility and accountability around this. This is not about hitting people over the head and saying: "You have to do it." It is that working in collaboration together to make sure that we are all aiming for the same goal, which is a good teaching and learning environment for our students.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

But there is a contradiction in that, is there not? That if you had a corporate direction as a department you wish to go in but umpteen individuals are interpreting that direction in umpteen different ways, does that not slow down the ship as it were?

**The Minister for Education:**

No, because autonomy has been discussed in certain ways, you might have stronger leaders in terms of head teachers in other areas than you do in some of the schools, everybody is different in their style and ways of doing leadership. But the point in the corporate direction is giving that vision, the leadership, the expectation of what the public want to see in terms of a teaching and learning environment for their children, their students, but also having a supportive framework for the people that are providing that. There has to be an accountability and a responsibility between the 2. There needs to be more open and transparent ways of communicating with staff in the whole of the public sector, not just in terms of schools, so that they feel able to come forward if there are issues that they are identifying within their own environment.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Okay, so just to create an example, if you became aware that a particular head teacher was continually denying staff the opportunity to job share or to take part-time employment, that would have a detrimental effect on recruitment and retention in that school, how would you manage that?

**The Minister for Education:**

Well, I do not manage head teachers, that would be for the Group Director of Education.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I will pass to the Group Director.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Can I add to that? Not only how would you manage it, how would you know about it, because I think that is a really key thing, how you would ... you can only come and talk to us about what you know, we fully accept that, but, let us be realistic, there are times if somebody has been refused part-time work they may not want to kick up a fuss because they may be a new parent and that is difficult enough anyway but just leaving the profession and moving on might be the easier option in terms of ... because they have to work in that school with a head that perhaps they feel does not want them.

**Group Director, Education:**

On the piece of how would we know, because I do not think we can answer Deputy Pointon's question if we do not know, I think the position here is if you knew this what would you do? This is not something that is run through H.R., it is run at the school level because while all Government employees are employed by the S.E.B. (States Employment Board) they are not employed by the school per se or the department per se, they are employed by the Government of Jersey. The agent of the employer I think is probably the best way of phrasing it is the head teacher, the governing body, but those schools with governing bodies may have a role of sharing that agency. The application is to the head, so we would not necessarily know. Jersey, if I am correct - although I will defer to Sue and Mark - does not have the legislation that compels. As I was a head teacher in the U.K., I had had up to 12 job shares for 6 roles at any one time. As a manager it is complicated, balancing job shares. I got a huge benefit because in my long experience, nearly 17 years in headship, is people who work part-time tend to work more than their 0.5 or their 0.6 or 0.8. They give it back ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

This is exactly the point, yes.

**Group Director, Education:**

.. their commitment. You might have a managerial headache, but you are showing good leadership by valuing your workforce. But there is primary legislation in the U.K., certainly for schools in England, where you have to give full consideration for anyone with a child up to the age of 5 and a child with a special educational need or disability until they are much older. There is not the same legal framework, but we urge the same best practice, that you look carefully. If somebody says: "I only want to work" and this is absurd: "one Friday afternoon a month to keep my hand in" or whatever and that does not work for the good of the children, because we are fundamentally putting children

first, then you are doing some balancing. When you say about the distinction between primary and secondary, and it shows our lack of knowledge on the data, I do not know if it is less likely in secondary. You have suggested you find it strange it is less likely in primary and I do not know that to be the case.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I mean, we are just about to print a report and we do not want any ... well, you have to go through the scrutiny process. You are very aware of the scrutiny process. But yes, absolutely, I think the issue within primary, one of the arguments perhaps that could be made is that it is very important to have that relationship with the whole class and therefore part time will not work for us. Now, that I think can be solved and it is just whether that is happening, and in secondary, perhaps the same thing, you need to be here for all of the classes with a particular group as their exams come up, so therefore ... so that phrase of "good running of the organisation" is so easily open to interpretation. Do you not feel that to some extent there is no control from your side over whether that is happening, there is no standard there? I suppose that is what I am asking. Do you think there is a standard that is being set for part-time work in a changing environment, and I think I am right in saying in a profession that is predominantly women?

**Group Director, Education:**

It is predominantly women, absolutely.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

But as I say, I have many who want to do the same, you know?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I have to say, I find the concept quite difficult to grasp, because I come from a Health background. In Health it does not matter at what level you have responsibility, you will still be responsible to the people who run the show. That is a little difficult to grasp, that head teachers are the employers, not Education. I know the S.E.B. are the employer, but they ...

**Group Director, Education:**

Yes, they are charged to run their organisation and I would ... as the Minister has suggested, while it was one of the 4 pillars of the Education business plan in the last administration, the autonomy piece was not developed. I do not think that head teachers are more autonomous than 4, 8, 12, 15 years ago. I think it was ever thus that head teachers do their recruitment. They should absolutely follow our best H.R. practice in that.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you think that what has happened with opening that autonomy debate, it has uncovered some of the gaps in the system that may perhaps have exposed problems that need to be looked at - this is me thinking on the spot here; I have got a chain of thought going in my head - in terms of because it is the S.E.B. that employ, but it is head teachers who are responsible, but you are giving autonomy and then your organisation has got to be part of it? That can lead to some very complicated decisions going on.

**The Minister for Education:**

I think it goes back to the governance piece I was talking about before, so being a former head of the Public Accounts Committee, I can tell you we are not very good in terms of governance, whether that is Education, whether it is in other areas. We have to improve that type of thing. Sometimes in order for you to be able to improve these types of things is in order to have the insight and because H.R. or I.T. have been so poor in terms of the way the public sector was run for a period of time, like I said, H.R. being the poor man of the public service, you have got to invest in the right ways. If there is an expectation at that top, you need to ensure that there is that trickle-down effect. It goes back to that forward and backwards point of view, that responsibility and accountability piece. As head teachers being appointed by the department, so that would be your role, Seán, then that piece, there should be a cascading piece there and an understanding that that flows out. What I worry about and I think is the example that I have seen, certainly in other areas over my time in the States, is it is really easy to draw up a best practice document or it is really easy to draw up a: "This is what we expect" and it goes on someone's desk and it ends up on the shelf and nobody reads it.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you think governing bodies in schools may have a role there?

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Because it is different here, is it not? Governing bodies have a lot more power in the U.K. and we have never had that.

**The Minister for Education:**

No. I think you need to read the Education Law, schedule 5, Education Law.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It is not really being applied, you mean?

**The Minister for Education:**

We need to resolve it.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, okay. I do know what you mean.

**Group Director, Education:**

The majority of our schools do not have governing bodies, the way they exist.

**The Minister for Education:**

No, secondary schools.

**Group Director, Education:**

They have a role. I would say, to reassure the Scrutiny Panel, when we did some work, we expended quite a bit of time on it in the last term on the autonomy piece, where we got to was determining all the things that ... or where an autonomy would not be granted, so the red lines that said, for example, the same safeguarding standard would apply to all schools. They could not be diluted, watered down. We got to the point of saying term days and holidays. We said terms and conditions of teachers, because the risk would be if one school could afford to pay higher wages, they would draw people. So we said a lot of things that we would not do. We did not get the 3-year budget.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I absolutely understand, yes. I absolutely get that, and I think we are talking about a very specific issue in terms of part-time working which has come up and that I think we have got some information around it and it is really useful. Can I just say, if you are freezing cold it is because of me, and if somebody wants to press that green button to put the temperature up, please feel free to, because I can see ...

**Senior Human Resources Manager, C.Y.P.E.S:**

I do not know whether I am hot or cold or what at the moment.

**The Minister for Education:**

Thank you.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

That is a common thing in Scrutiny Panels. It is to make you feel uncomfortable. No, it is not.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I am not going to bring you to doom and gloom. I am going to come back. I am going to ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Okay. Are we okay to continue for a moment or do we need to pause? We will take a 2-minute pause because we are not quorate and then we will come back and that will help us also warm the room up. Sorry about that. Is that okay? Are we paused? That is great, thank you. Okay, thank you. Sorry for the short pause. One of the themes of retention challenges that came out from our review was the theme of teachers feeling undervalued as a profession. What is the assessment of the current morale in the sector and what are you doing now to address it?

**The Minister for Education:**

So at a very high level, I understand the majority of the feeling of being undervalued, that is perceived from a public perception, maybe through parents, maybe through the general public, maybe through States Members. I get that impression, that is where they feel undervalued. The strength among the profession seems to be pretty strong, I think because they are all in the same boat, but I think that is maybe the perception rather than the actual rule. The reason why I say that is because the way the public have come out for teachers, particularly around the pay dispute, there was a lot of support in terms of a large majority of the public supporting and recognising their importance.

[14:45]

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I mean, one of the things was those who are committed, the extended service, who felt perhaps that their professional value was not there. How do you respond to that idea?

**The Minister for Education:**

What do you mean, in terms of they do not feel their professional value ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It is a particular focus group, those who have been in the profession a long time felt that there was a definite devaluing of their value over time and it is particularly bad at the moment. I am not getting anything wrong by saying that, I do not think, in terms of the perception that they had. There are examples of just that they were not trusted, that there was certainly difficulty with some of the views from the public that they experienced. What are you doing to support staff who ... and do you look for that? I mean, I know you do the teachers' survey.

**Group Director, Education:**

I would like to talk to that, yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, I thought that might be the response.

**Group Director, Education:**

Well, it is important we do the teachers' survey. We committed to do it every 2 years and even though we have been part of a wider all-government employees' survey we, through agreement, held the line. The last survey evidence we had, over 500 teachers responded. It was 49 per cent of those employed, which it would have been nice to have been a bit higher. We have had over 640 responses. We broadened it to include more people this time. I will be intrigued by the findings as they are processed. The poll is ... the survey is closed and being worked on, because exactly as you suggest, the trend over time is really important. If things are getting worse, we need to redouble efforts. But the big contrast ... from the most recent survey data we have, the 2017 survey, showed a big contrast. Teachers were asked how they were valued, exactly this point, and they said ... one of the 2 questions framed is about the people you work with, people in your own school, in the Education service and the like, and the numbers were really positive about: "I am respected as a professional." It was not the case that the teachers were telling ... within the people they work with, the education sector, their schools: "My opinions and beliefs are valued. My happiness and wellbeing are viewed as important." The sad contrast is when you ask the same indicators, but not thinking about the people you work with, but thinking about the wider community, the pupils, the parents, members of the public, wider society, those numbers drop dramatically on: "I am respected as a professional. My opinions and beliefs are valued. My expertise as a teacher is valued." They drop.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Why do you think that is? Because that is definitely a theme we had too.

**Group Director, Education:**

Yes. So those of us who work in teaching or with education professionals, a teaching background or whatever, think more highly of the current workforce than the wider public. I would love to know why. I think part of your question is what we do about it and I think we need to redouble ... all of us, I think, with great respect, I think elected Members of the States are part of the constituency, to help celebrate the great work teachers are doing, how well children are turning out, those successes. We need ... you know, there is a sense - and this is not picking on anyone - across media and social media to focus on the negative and the not good or not good enough stuff. I think we need to be ...

**The Minister for Education:**

It can be down to the culture. It can be down to the culture in which you live. I mean, if you look at some really successful education systems in the world, the one thing that they value is education and their teachers. As a culture ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

They invest in it.

**The Minister for Education:**

... as a public sector, as an Island, we should be doing exactly the same thing. We should be recognising how important that education is for the future success, not just of the individuals that are going through that education system, but ultimately your economy as a whole, because you are investing so much into your future.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It could be a wider devaluing of the public sector and I think that has happened. It has become a very easy target and people not really understanding what the public sector does for our community.

**The Minister for Education:**

I think if you go over 10 years of how many times of savings programmes, then I think it would devalue anybody, would it not?

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, absolutely. In terms of I did not ask and I should have, is the pool of qualified teachers to recruit from. How is that going? Do you feel there is a good enough pool of qualified teachers in all sectors? And I include the areas where ... there is a shortage everywhere, but that still means there is a shortage here. Are you going to look off-Island to recruit more/less? Do you think we are getting a good field in schools?

**Group Director, Education:**

Focusing very much on teachers, not the grades of the workforce.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, on teachers. Yes, and lecturers, I must say that. I will be in trouble for not saying lecturers, because that is quite right.

**Group Director, Education:**

Breaking that down and including lecturers, primary, secondary, tertiary and including teachers within the early years, because much of the early years sector workforce are not qualified teachers ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, absolutely, include that.

**Group Director, Education:**

I know in the time I have been back in Jersey, we used to have - my first years back - a couple of hundred primary-qualified teachers who were not in fulltime work who, by registering as supply, because it is part of our quality assurance and the support, we used to see a disturbing number, in my view, of locally qualified in terms of housing qualified and teaching qualified folk come back who just could not secure their first post. We had had teachers who might do one or 2 of their first years in the profession on supply, which is not great. To be a great teacher takes years. You know, there is a lot of research that you might need 8, 10, 12, 14 years to reach your peak and ideally in a primary setting - and that is what I am talking with this, I will come to the others - you need your own class to do great stuff and maybe make some mistakes and learn your trade with strong C.P.D. (Continuing Professional Development) and support and supervision. We had some young people who were advised to go to the U.K. or Guernsey and other places to get that. That has changed and one of the responses to that is this year we have extended the Jersey graduate teacher training programme to include primary. We had never done that before. Since its inception, it had always been secondary and predominantly shortage subjects with the exception of one candidate, who was primary and secondary, because they worked in Mont à l'Alabbé so that was a special case. This year 50 per cent of the intake are headed towards being primary teachers because the numbers dropped. We have not done much recruitment off-Island at all in decades in the primary sector for teachers or deputy heads or head teachers, partly for good reasons, you know, it is part of our contribution to the population matter that you always default to locally qualified people, and indeed, on the odd times, somebody who might be from off-Island who is working in our schools because their partner has got status. We get quite a lot of representation, saying: "My local son/daughter" fill in the gap, partner: "cannot get a job and you bring in ..." you know, we get quite a bit of challenge, but it has not been an issue, because in primary we have had strong ... in the future, we may well have to go off-Island. That is not the position we are in now. Secondary is different because it is harder to recruit subjects. Deputy Ward, you have rightly referenced there is a national issue with some subjects, but also the numbers are small. There are not many teachers of business studies or music tech, so the pool is very small because, simply put, Jersey is too expensive to live to have that high level of graduate qualification and be sitting at home waiting for the phone call for some supply work or for the vacancy. You would probably take your skills elsewhere if you do not have a job. That I would say is a phenomenon of any small jurisdiction, it is also a micro-economy, but

exacerbated by cost, I would contend. That is not from a heavy database, but that is from a lot of conversations from school leaders. Highlands College has a high number of zero hours. They have got other challenges, because when you look at the range of vocational offers, when you want people who can teach the culinary skills or mechanical skills or what might be broadly called the hot trades, for the building trade, the pay for expertise in those sectors is way higher. A professionally experienced plumber will earn more than someone who teaches that important skillset, so getting the skills across is a particular challenge. I am less expert than my director colleagues and the acting principal of Highlands would have more expertise on their challenge, but we are aware of those.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Okay. We have got quite a lot to get through so I will just move on a little. One of the things we have got from focus groups is that the constant scrutiny is a real concern for teachers, including some teachers felt they were just simply not trusted in their profession. Do you think that that is something you recognise, you are concerned about? Has the school review framework contributed to this? It is certainly something that came through.

**The Minister for Education:**

Just in terms of the constant scrutiny, is it just the review framework, is it the wider scrutiny? Because of course being public sector, we are going to be very regularly scrutinised.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I think what we got from what we have seen is literally constancy of day-to-day scrutiny for whatever reason; there has been a change in schools. Some of the things mentioned are things like learning walks and constant scrutiny of books and so and so forth, which meant that staff felt they simply were not trusted to be getting on with the job. They had to constantly prove, if not day-to-day then week-to-week ...

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I think they felt that the pressure to achieve those G.C.S.E. (General Certificate of Secondary Education) results and so on was really interfering at times with their ability to provide an educational environment in the broad sense and that they were being scrutinised in relation to ... on an almost daily basis. Some people were saying that they were being scrutinised in relation to that narrow focus.

**The Minister for Education:**

What you are saying would tell me it is coming more from within the school environment ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Education:**

... rather than ... I suppose the review framework question is then does that add on to that or perpetuate the scrutiny?

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We have talked before in public hearings about this notion of review ready and I asked you a question about it. I believe we still have some more questions and some work to do on that from what we are seeing and hearing in terms of the school has to scrutinise a lot more closely day-to-day in order to be ready for that overall scrutiny later on.

**The Minister for Education:**

First of all, one thing. It goes back to this culture issue.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It does.

**The Minister for Education:**

The review framework is extremely important for 2 reasons. One is so we can celebrate the amazing work our teachers do, and if we cannot celebrate the amazing work that our teachers do, how are we supposed to value them? How are we supposed to share that excellent practice that they are doing? Unless you are a parent like myself, and I see what is going on in that school, or if you are a member of the governing body, you do not necessarily see that first-hand. So we need to be able to celebrate it. I need to be able to feed this back to my fellow colleagues and to the public and sharing that celebration of the good things they are doing and sharing that best practice among other schools so they can all learn from that particular good practice. But there is always going to be room for improvement because we are all humans. There is always going to be ... you know, but there should not be a culture where they are hitting people over the head in order to get high grades, because every single child is different, every human being is different and we should be celebrating that difference, not making it harder.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

That is really the nub of the difficulty. Every teacher is also different.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes. Well, we are all humans, we are all different, absolutely. So we are all going to feel the pressure and the expectations differently, but it is how the culture in that environment raises or reduces that anxiety level. It is trying to get the right ... so everywhere in the world has a review framework or a form of review framework in their education system. Every single one will be different in terms of the way that those teachers deal with that expectation.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes. I mean, the reality of teachers feeling under increasing pressure is something that we have seen and that pressure does seem to be increasing day in, day out on all sorts of areas.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

You mentioned in the conversation the board of governors again. Can you take me back to the law and Article that you referred to earlier, because I have got it up here?

**The Minister for Education:**

I believe it was schedule 5.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Schedule 5, and was it not Article 57 which seems to ...

**The Minister for Education:**

Well, it is probably Article 57, but there is a schedule with a whole ream of: "This is what a governing body is expected to do."

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Okay, fine. I have got it, thank you.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you see that as a problem or not? I mean, it is the simplest answer: do you see that there has been increased scrutiny? It is not even the word "scrutiny", that is not the words that are used. It is: "Feel as though ..." I am all right to talk about it? "Feel as though they are treated like children and not professionals due to an overall lack of trust" and if that comes from focus groups, that obviously would concern us and I hope would concern you in terms of what is happening in schools.

**Group Director, Education:**

I anticipate your report with great interest, and it may be offline, as you feel able to give particular examples that might not ... for reasons of individual dignity, but as I mentioned before, there is not a day go by I am not in meetings or working or talking with children, teachers, schools or about them,

pretty much every day this week, and I have not heard that from a teacher, that they have felt they are treated like a child.

[15:00]

Of course that would be deeply concerning. I want ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

But what about the overall feeling of the level of constantly having to prove something, maybe a pressure that is creating greater stress and may lead in the end to a problem with retention of staff, where they just think: "I may be better off elsewhere"?

**Group Director, Education:**

I am happy to address that, but I would flip it on the other way. I think we have heard from colleagues that compared to lots of other places, not just in London, across the British Isles, we do not have the massive retention and recruitment problem that other places have ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

No.

**Group Director, Education:**

... and then teasing out what within that. You know, we were due in Bel Royal today, I was in Les Quennevais yesterday or perhaps we have met Grand Vaux children coming into the States debate on Monday. Last Friday, a week ago, we were with children from 3 schools and their teachers. It does not feel that the phrase used of constantly trying to ... that is not the feel in our schools that I get. If you have had that feedback, then that is the perception of those people. I would not for a moment challenge that, but I do think I personally and professionally am delighted that the Jersey Government, the plan that has been endorsed by the States Chamber, is Putting Children First. We do genuinely have to know how well children are doing to know are we doing anything successfully. We have to monitor to know how well they are doing.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, but that does not mean constant scrutiny of minutiae and everything that a member of staff is doing. If you spend your entire time doing that, that creates huge pressure and I can see in a profession where autonomy ... which is an ironic word in a way, because what you need as a teacher in a class is someone who is autonomous in their professionalism as well. If they do not feel that is their role anymore, it may have the counter-effect of Putting Children First and putting systems first, tick-boxes, proving that I am doing something first beyond anything else. That is my concern here

and that is the concern I think that has come through from teachers. Stop me if I am wrong, Deputy, but I think that is what we have seen, that some of the work they are doing is to prove to management that they are doing it rather than it being necessarily good for children.

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Chair, if I could, and I am doing it with my One Government hat on, rather than a specific education lens, one of the programmes we have which is looking at how people are managed, how they are able to share their perceptions with their managers and improve their performance continuously is through our Team Jersey programme. Now, schools have been one of the hardest areas and this panel may consider about whether or not they encourage schools to participate more fully in this, because we have resources and we have investment and there are areas where we can support schools better if they participate in the Team Jersey programme.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Well, the participation in Team Jersey has been from the management of schools, is it not? It has not been from classroom teachers.

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

There are resources there for teachers and we can adapt it, because it is very difficult to take teachers out for these sort of programmes and say: "Let us do this" but there are resources there and the panel may want to examine them.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Sorry, I do not want to interrupt, but that is I think that really key thing that you said, it is difficult to take teachers out to do this, so you are reliant upon managers, who may be the ones who are under pressure for the scrutiny, but you are relying then on the Team Jersey programme to have to say: "You are missing out." Perhaps what you need to do is create the time for teachers to be there, to have a say, so you get a better view of what it means to be at the end of the scrutiny process that is constant, so you have a greater understanding of it. I think that is a theme that has come through, that ... let me put it this way: it can all be justified as you go up the leadership level, and if Team Jersey are interacting with the top of the leadership level, it can be justified. It is like Chinese whispers, it changes as you go up and I think you are only going to understand as you get to the bottom. Do you not think that is a really important H.R. function, to get right to the root of it and really open this up right at the bottom? I do not mean the word "bottom", I mean ... but you know what I mean.

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

Front line delivery.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Front line delivery.

**Group Director, People and Corporate Services:**

One of the things that we have identified is the importance of the line manager and how they do their jobs, how they talk to people, how they motivate people. That has been the first area of focus. The areas that you are discussing are common across a number of areas in government and where they have participated we are starting to see improvements. So I absolutely agree with you that it is a trickledown, it is a cultural programme that we are looking at and culture takes a while.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Okay. Did you have anything on that?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

No.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Now, the other thing that we talked about, the ... okay, we mentioned that. You recently provided information about changes to our newly qualified teacher pay over the last few years. Can you explain the rationale for the change? It is in a letter that we have got here. There we go, thank you. The changes were first proposed as part of the M.T.F.P. (Medium Term Financial Plan). I remember that well: "Most N.Q.T.s (newly qualified teachers) generally were paid at the first increment of teacher pay instead of previously using the third increment. This of course was the original intention of the pay scale and corrected a subsequent information policy." Do you think that has had any effect on recruitment and retention of N.Q.T.s, the fact that they are starting on a lower pay than they were, given the recognition a number of times in this discussion alone of the cost of living?

**The Minister for Education:**

Because I am not directly involved in recruitment, it is probably best for me to get Seán to answer this, but I understand that we have not had a drop-off, but he can explain it further.

**Group Director, Education:**

Yes. Like Deputy Ward, wearing another hat, or both wearing other hats, I lived through this. Just a short bit of context, in the M.T.F.P. to the Mid Term Financial Plan, the second of those for the previous States period, while there was significant growth accruing to education, including things like Jersey Premium, there were savings made and there was an initial more radical proposal to review starting salaries, not especially to take money out of the teaching workflow, but to start lower

and have a steeper rise to reward experience or higher responsibility. The States Chamber voted against that in that line of the M.T.F.P., so the saving that did accrue was by me setting the dial that while Jersey teachers were paid in the comparison the letter talks about, of starting salaries more than Wales, Scotland, Ireland, Northern Ireland, Isle of Man or Guernsey, and indeed for England and Wales there are 4 bands, inner London, outer London, fringe London and then the rest of England and Wales. Jersey teachers start above all of those other groups, but a practice had crept in over previous years that rather than start at point 1 in first year, point 2 in your second year and so on that some and then most and then I think probably all teachers had moved up to 3. The dial was reset. It was noted that certain people had started the part-time 2-year Jersey graduate teacher scheme with an expectation, so it was honoured for those individuals, but the pay scale did not change. The starting salaries remained above anywhere else. It was just a year 1 start at point 1 and year 2, that was the resetting.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

So is there a comparison with another jurisdiction in relation to point 1?

**Group Director, Education:**

Yes, it is above everywhere. I understand ... well, we discussed this previously from colleagues. There was no drop-off. We have still fully recruited, we filled all of our jobs. It has not caused anyone to ... well, no one would have left because of that because they are already being paid the level they were on, so it did not have any impact, in my understanding, on retention and it did not impact recruitment because we fully recruited in subsequent years.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Well, there was a saving there.

**Group Director, Education:**

Indeed.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I have noted that some of the savings currently on the gainshare - which let us not go into that - is on supplementary allowances, so it seems to be on more experienced ... from a question I asked, so it seems to be the other end of the scale there that is being looked at. Perhaps I think we are getting away from ...

**The Minister for Education:**

Supplementary allowances I think has been a question and an issue between unions and H.R. for an extremely long time.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, I think we are getting away from the retention and recruitment review. Yes, okay, fair enough. One of the biggest discussions in the focus groups, and you can probably ... if I can just ask you what the guess would be, you would probably say the word “workload”, and it was one of the biggest discussions. You yourself stated, I believe in one of our hearings, that the average teaching week is 60 hours. You know, how is that appropriate and what can be done to address that now? It is an issue and it does take an enormous toll on staff.

**The Minister for Education:**

I think one of the issues, it goes back to the duplication, whether there is any duplication in the system and making sure we are teasing that out of the system and there is ... you know, reducing that duplication and having better technology, improved governance around the H.R. system. Getting the clarification and desirability around what autonomy means and the expectations of that autonomy is important as well, because that goes with the governance, but the workload side of things is also a discussion around how we become more flexible and collaborate more across schools and what that looks like and what that means. But fundamentally, a lot of that will cost money.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I mean, one of the things I think that came up is that effectively the job has grown simply too much for the time available to do it. There are so many issues as the challenge of teaching has grown, as the challenge of society has grown. Sixty hours a week is an enormous amount. What is going to ... I mean, we all know about this. We all know the time that is spent in schools and you are probably going to say: “Well, you know, we do say to teachers but they still keep doing it” and I have heard myself this notion: “Why do it? You are making yourself ill.” “Because if I do not do it, it will not get done and I cannot do the job.”

**The Minister for Education:**

I know that feeling.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We need to address that.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Yes, but what has been your experience? You have the Big Education Conversation in train and you say that teachers are being honest with you. This is a big issue. What are the teachers saying to you?

**The Minister for Education:**

Well, not just workload. It is not the only thing that is said to me. It is because they do care so much about their profession and they do care about what they do, and it is like you say, they do it because it will not get done. Absolutely, but I think it is the emotional time and pressure that they feel when they are coming across the kinds of demands they are seeing in our schools with children who have got extreme behavioural issues, special educational needs, where we are not putting in the right investment where we should be. So the curriculum changed in the U.K. in 2014. We changed with it just automatically, but did not take into account the type of demand that that curriculum would have, in my view - this is my view, completely mine only - how that would then trickle down into the ability to put that through the education system. In conjunction with that curriculum came the demand from children, which has only ever been increasing. We do not have the types of ability to move out into other areas and share and collaborate and move things around or have ... not that I am suggesting it is the right thing to have, but pupil referral units and all those types of things, you know, there is a whole discussion about what an inclusion model looks like as well. But I think that is the real key thing, I feel, is that the emotional toll that a lot of these teachers are feeling is from those 2 demands that have come in parallel and not necessarily ... there have been things that have been put in place to try and assist, but like I say, I do not ... it is that plaster-sticking situation.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Yes, but it does beg the question, what are the support mechanisms available to teachers?

**The Minister for Education:**

The support mechanisms?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Education:**

So there has been a huge increase in terms of teaching assistance with regards to emotional literacy support.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

I am thinking more of emotional support for teachers.

**The Minister for Education:**

For the actual ... so the wellbeing side of things?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Education:**

Have we put those things in place, Seán?

**Group Director, Education:**

We are much more proactive with our occupational health provider in saying: “Here is a free confidential service. We will support you.”

**The Deputy of St. John:**

It is AXA?

**Group Director, Education:**

AXA happens to be the current, but going around doing schemes that I know were in schools this week.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Sorry, we are short of time and I want to get to the crux of this, absolutely, but that is after the problem has arisen. What we are talking about here is setting up a system within our teaching profession and our schools which means that teachers can cope, that they are not put under excess demands and so they do not get to AXA. That is good H.R., I would suggest. The problem being that we are seeing more evidence of the day being extended, so that lessons are happening after school with target groups, with extra classes after school and particularly in key subjects that improve the school’s results in English and maths, for example, which are key indicators for the new review system and staff are being “asked” to make themselves available more once the school day is over. We will not even talk at this stage about the effect on young people who have their days extended and are not being allowed to be young people anymore, because that ...

[15:15]

**The Minister for Education:**

That is a bigger discussion around inclusion, absolutely.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It is a much bigger decision and I think it is a real problem for our children.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

It puts more pressure on them. I think it comes from that point, where is that happening? Can you tell us where that is happening or not happening? What would your advice be to schools who want to say: "We are going to provide extra classes after school for students to help them catch up and so on and staff will be teaching them after a long day of teaching with more preparation and therefore the 60 hours is going to be the minimum"? Because it is not easy to do, it is really challenging. That does happen. There is a great deal of evidence that that is happening. I have got some ... sorry, I will let you ...

**Group Director, Education:**

I look at exactly the same issue and phenomena but maybe with a different lens. I do not know the number of hours each teacher works. I do not know that 60 is an average across, but the teachers I know are working incredibly hard. They are working really hard and it tends to be cyclical because of the nature of academic year and it is structured around children and children are not like the workforce, who have to work 48 weeks a year. Yes, teachers very often work incredibly hard and might even get ill, but then they have a week at half-term and then they have Christmas, then in February, then Easter and that cycle may not be very healthy. It would better to have a more steady workload through the year. Children and young people in Jersey, there has been quite a bit of focus on secondary and G.C.S.E.s are doing better than ever, but the drive to get better at marking an English exam or a maths exam I do not think is some obsession for the school to look great or to tick a box within a review. If you want to get to Highlands or to get to sixth form, whether it is vocational or academic or technical, whatever, you need some English and maths. If you want to be a mechanic, you need to get a 4 in your maths.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I absolutely get that.

**Group Director, Education:**

I think we should celebrate that teachers' work is getting better and better outcomes for Jersey children, for themselves to get into the world of work, rather than some ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I absolutely get that, and nobody in the profession or elsewhere, and certainly the Scrutiny Panel, would not say we do not celebrate that success, but if that success is the cost of we have a curriculum that simply we do not have the time to deliver and we have to deliver on top of it in order to show those improvements and that is burning teachers out as they do it, that is a genuine issue

when we have not got the sort of field for recruitment that we had, that we are finding all of these things about recruitment and retention and value ...

**The Minister for Education:**

I think there are a couple of things I will just add to this. So, one, I think we need to sort the inclusion model out, that is the first. We need the funding in order to invest because the less funding in terms of especially children who have got particular needs, they will need that extra support, maybe the one-to-ones or the 2-to-ones, but making sure it is within the right setting and whatever that setting looks like, whether it is a mainstream school. This is a big conversation that we need to have around what that inclusion model looks like for a small Island and how we support those children properly. The other point would be I think we need to have a discussion around things like the P.P.A. (planning, preparation and assessment) time, the collaboration between teachers, how and what that looks like. So I will give you an example of some good education systems around the world. You may not think they are good, but they are seen as those best practices, but Singapore gives 15 hours for their teachers a week to collaborate and they do all these research scientific things and they take them into the classroom and they teach. They have been seen to be not necessarily the culture, that they are quite pressured and expectations are extremely high, but giving them then 15 hours a week enables those teachers to work together and bring the best science projects, bring the best research and those types of things. China, although they have classes of, I think it is about 60, they get 50 per cent of their time to do planning and all those sorts of things. It is thinking different about the type of model we have, so that if the expectations are higher, we are living in an information age now, we are having to go 10 times faster, all of us. It is how we do things differently and better and I think that is the key point.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I think that what we are talking about here is that workload has not really been addressed in the U.K. and it is something that always comes up and it is always one of these things and certainly we know about workload, it is difficult.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes, absolutely.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

But at what point are we going to address it? At what point are we going to recognise that teachers working that number of hours is bad for their health? I obviously am not going to accept the holiday argument because I understand how it works and the fact that teachers today are in and out of holidays or they are recovering and so on; it should not be that way.

**The Minister for Education:**

I will give you an expectation of something that did happen more recently, which was where one of our art teachers put on like a planning, like a kind of learning/training offering to some of our teachers in the schools. The feedback that came from that was phenomenal. They said: "Not only did I learn different ways of taking that art into my classroom but I felt better. I left school here today and wanting to go to this."

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, and that is a very good point.

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Do you think that there are enough opportunities for teachers to do that, particularly teachers on the frontline?

**The Minister for Education:**

No.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I would say there is an opportunity for managers to do that, who perhaps do not teach as many classes ...

**Group Director, Education:**

All 100 per cent of this group.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

... do not have to be covered when they are not there. But in terms of teaching staff who may have 5 lessons in a day have to be covered, particularly if you cannot find cover staff.

**Group Director, Education:**

100 per cent of the teachers were from like classroom teachers if their ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, and that is great with them but is that happening across the board? Is that even across subject?

**The Minister for Education:**

It is not happening as often as it should be.

**Group Director, Education:**

We are looking to scale that up because of the feedback from teachers and also create ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

What would you need to do to enable that scaling up? What is the key thing that needs to happen to enable that?

**The Minister for Education:**

We need to put investment in our C.P.D., our training, our development and our support for teachers in that respect. We all know teachers will thrive learning and some of this can be very therapeutic. We have seen in terms of the art that went up and that feedback that came back from that was fantastic. They really felt not only were they learning things to take into the classroom, which they respected and valued, but it helped them in terms of their emotional health, their well-being. Not just some groups of teachers should be experiencing that, all of our teachers should be trying to experience that in some way. It is having the time, the resources and freeing up the teachers from other classes in order to be going and experiencing those types of things. I went back to it before, it is about that flexibility and governance around that and how we manage that.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

A lot of the training is, I would suggest, going towards dealing with the wider issues in education of the mental health of students and so on and so forth, which is a real issue and it goes hand in hand with that, well it is one of the pressures. What support do you think there is for teachers in dealing with mental health issues among ... which are growing, it seems, among our young people, which is a damning indictment of our society, I would say? They are, as we have heard the phrase before, they are on the front line and it is extremely challenging. What are we doing to help that, which is one of the issues with regards to recruitment and retention? "I cannot cope with the job anymore because I am dealing with issues that I am not trained to deal with and they are becoming overwhelming as well." Particularly as perhaps staff have to wait until they are in a bad place and then go to AXA, which is way too late and then their job is at risk.

**Group Director, Education:**

In November I was invited and delighted to address the 90 Emotional Literacy Support Assistants we have trained, teacher assistants specifically in this skillset. We have got mental health first-aid workers in all of our schools. But I think the investment ... we have a very strong, I would contend too small but social, emotional and mental health inclusion teams centrally who work at the sharp end with specialism.

**The Minister for Education:**

It is too small for that demand.

**Group Director, Education:**

Demand is rising. Is there a wider point about young people, compared to a generation ago with the generation being less resilient and more protected and finding it tough to deal with things? We can all debate that but in our lived reality every school has at least one, some have many more emotional literacy support; I have mentioned mental health first-aid. The training offer is exceptional from the Head of Psychology and Well-being. The very fact we have got a team called not just Education Psychology, Psychology Well-being, and the same problems you have raised, are enough teachers able to get out for a whole day and be covered? I would not detract from the challenge but nobody can say we have not got a focus and a deep concern for children ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I am sure the focus is there but is that the same challenge? They are not getting the support they needed, so they are just getting on with the job and they are getting on with the job: "Yes, I am too busy to do that." There is a blockage, someone has to grasp the nettle and say it is going to happen, what do you need to happen for that to happen?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

May I ask, what is the interaction between C.A.M.H.S. (Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services) and the support services in the schools?

**Group Director, Education:**

C.A.M.H.S. is coming under review. The Minister has been very clear right from early years onwards wanting to make clear that around the issue of mental health and more broadly well-being care, we get this right. C.A.M.H.S. is now, and there was quite a debate in the restructure of Government, part of Children, Young People, Education and Skills. It is in the early days of better incorporation but the fact that it crosses over to those who support children and families through a social care side as well as an education side, and we are coming together in one department. There is a challenge, we have got a new Head of Service, who I have met and presume is excellent and I am sure will help rapid improvement and the join-up is a big piece of work for us. But it is new, it was part of Health and now it is part of our same department.

**The Minister for Education:**

I think you would only want to interact with C.A.M.H.S. when it is the last resort. I think the types of programmes that we need to be looking at and having a huge discussion around is the universal

provision, new universal plus provision, a special provision and then your targeted. Your targeted would be and your special would be your C.A.M.H.S. area. You want to put in as much as you can down here in your universal and universal plus system to prevent them ever going into that area. You will always get some that will end up in that top area but I do not think we have been given enough in terms of the universal or universal plus and that is what we want to try and get right. That is themes that are coming out not just in terms of looking at the school funding review or the education conversation, it is coming out in the Early Years Policy Development Board as well.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Can I just go back briefly, you mentioned mental health first-aiders and I am aware of that and it is a great idea but do you think there is the support after that front line and mental health first-aiders to refer on to? Because one of the key things about being a mental health first-aider, I understand, is knowing where to signpost to and making sure that provision is there. We are very aware that the waiting times for genuine help is way too long. Could we have a problem there where it is identified for staff but there is no real help, then they have time off or H.R. become involved, we have H.R. policies on that, and staff are losing out? We are at a time when we want experienced teachers to be in the classroom and doing their job and they are certainly not. Is there somewhere ...

**The Minister for Education:**

There is a wider piece of work there because it is not just Education then would be involved. You would have to have, in terms of signposting, where to go and who to speak to. One thing that I will let you know is that there is a political oversight group, I think I have mentioned this before, looking around mental health, trying to bring it all together. Because it is coming up in regular pieces of work we are doing in Education. It is coming up, of course it will in Health and of course you have got your Customer and Local Services who are looking at that closer-to-home piece and how we have the right pathways and the signposting and all those bits and pieces. This political oversight group I am Chair of at the moment but Senator Pallett is due to take over Deputy Renouf's place on this. The point is is us overlooking the work that is happening in these various different departments, so what is happening in Health, what is happening in Education, what is happening in the closer-to-home piece, to make sure it is all joined up. It is an area where we can feed back as Ministers together the experiences we are seeing or we are hearing or touching on within our own areas. We try to join it all up.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Yes, it does rather beggar belief, so we are 9 by 5 and cannot get the act together and ...

**The Minister for Education:**

Yes.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Yes, absolutely.

**The Minister for Education:**

It is nothing new though.

**The Deputy of St. John:**

No, I know.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

We will finish off with a couple of things and that, hopefully, it can be a wish list.

**The Minister for Education:**

Hopefully.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

There is an overwhelming evidence growing about funding and I know the school review thing is coming through but if you can give a personal and a general view. What is the timescale for addressing that issue?

**The Minister for Education:**

They will get some money this September.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

In September, right.

**The Minister for Education:**

The Government Plan and this is going to be a thing that I am going to have to get Council of Ministers to agree to because in the Government Plan there was a paragraph in there and I cannot remember off the top of my head the page but it did say that there would be a commitment with the Council of Ministers to put funding in place for September 2020. The school funding ...

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Again, because he probably knows the page but he does not really answer it if he does.

**The Minister for Education:**

There is a series of work that is happening at the moment and, as you would expect, I am ensuring the objectives that were required under the school funding review are being met. We are due to have that report with us next month. Like I say, I want to bring that out with an action plan next to it, so everybody understands what is coming out of it. There is no point having a review and a report and then going: "Okay, Minister, that is great, what are you going to do about it?" Do have an idea, I want to get funding in place for September 2020 and particularly in some of these crucial areas in terms of special educational needs, record of needs, our educational psychologist side of things.

[15:30]

There is that demand there and knowing that demand that we want to get that in place. Other bits and pieces that we can address is things like the governance but this is a piece of work that has to be done in engagement with people, not put on top of them. Because there are some pieces here that some leaders may or may not like and what that looks like. There is going to have to be an engagement piece on how we put that in place. But my hoping is the funding will be September 2020.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Finally, because we have hit the time in the final 20 seconds, like just a minute but just 20 seconds, what is your overall assessment of the current retention and recruitment situation in Jersey? How would you characterise it, I suppose the phrase is?

**The Minister for Education:**

Recruitment wise I think we are probably fairly stable. We are lucky, we are better than some other areas that are experiencing some higher problems, the turnover and things like that, so I would say stable. The reason why I say stable at the moment, I think there is this constant negativity that is put against, whether it is the States Assembly or the Government or whatever it might be, that can always take everyone down and feeling like nothing is being done or nothing is being achieved. I like to hope that what we bring out in terms of the funding and the education conversation, by having that engagement with people and listening to what they are saying and what they are seeing. Putting a plan in place and knowing where they are going will help that retention piece and encourage them and enable them to work with us to improve the system. Because education is going to change, well it is changing, just like the economy is changing, just like the 21st century is changing. We have got to support them to do that and I do not think we have necessarily done that. Retention, we could be on a rocky path if we do not put something. The one thing that I think we could fix, which would probably help, would be the cost of living but that is not an overnight fixer unless something is going to happen to the housing market in the next week or so.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

I suppose it is “could do better” and ...

**The Minister for Education:**

I think it is always it could do better, is it not?

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Unless there is anything you want to mention or say or anything else, we have hit time. We have used the hour and we did not even get through all the questions but we did well. I would like to thank you for your time and call the hearing to an end.

**The Minister for Education:**

Thank you very much.

**Deputy R.J. Ward:**

Thank you very much.

[15:32]